

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

November 8, 2012

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann; Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present were: Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission, and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Board member James Sauer, Vice Chair, and Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission were absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of the minutes of the meetings of October 25, 2012.

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes, and Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. All members said “aye”.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. Unfinished

- a. New Residential Buildings – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/Crawford Hoying Development Partners) **AR 110-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed changes to the townhouse elevations, and presented site and landscape drawings. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Nelson Yoder approached the microphone and stated his address is 555 Metro Place, Dublin, Ohio.

Mr. Yoder explained that three of the townhouses have been eliminated and a street will go through that area. There will be a buffer between the townhouses and the road. There will be man doors on the backs of the townhouses. Mr. Yoder introduced Mr. Steve Kolwicz and said he would be explaining more details about the streetscape. Mr. Kolwicz said his address is 100 Northwoods Blvd., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Kolwicz explained that the western area of the mall would have a walkway to the apartments made out of a permeable stamped pavement which will

look more pedestrian friendly, and there will be several pockets of landscaping. Sample photographs were projected to the Board and audience. Mr. Yoder discussed that the townhouses will have sliding glass doors in the back and that some will have private patio areas, and planter boxes. Outdoor furniture similar to that of Old Worthington will also be placed in various areas. Bike racks will also be installed close to the roadway. There will be plenty of outdoor seating and an overhead canopy of trees. Mr. Hermann asked how the units will address the street and Mr. Yoder said they will resemble those units similarly found in neighborhoods such as Lincoln Park in Chicago. They will also have decorative fencing. There will be eighteen townhouses instead of twenty-one.

The plans show angled parking and each unit will have their own private space out front. Mr. Yoder said they have added hips to the roof line to break up the massive amount of roof top. Mr. Hunter asked if there would be extra parking spaces and Mr. Yoder said yes, but only one car will be garaged, the second car will have to park outside of the garage. Mrs. Holcombe said she liked this type of parking better and the building elevations.

Mrs. Rodgers asked if the traffic flow will be one-way going east because it may be difficult for people to get out. Mr. Yoder said people will be able to turn around in the cul-de-sac. Mr. Tom Carter approached the microphone and stated his address is 7227 N. High St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Carter said he has had that discussion with the developers, and there are arguments for both strategies. Mr. Coulter that he had several items that he wanted to discuss:

1. If the air conditioning units would be located on the roof top?
2. Will there be any changes to the larger building, or any elevation changes to it?
3. What kind of materials will be used for the exterior?
4. Will there still be a pool?
5. Will there be problems with cars backing out into traffic?
6. Concerns with traffic flow.

Mr. Yoder said the condensing units will be screened. He also said they are still working on plans for the amenity deck. Mr. Coulter asked if there would be windows in the corner 2-bedroom apartments and Mr. Yoder said no, they will have transoms to allow light in.

Mr. Hunter said he is glad the developers are taking the time to look at the major plan of traffic flow. He said he really likes the townhouses, and hopes that the pool does not go away. Mr. Hunter said it is important to use quality materials and the buildings will need to be able to stand the test of time, not just ten years. Mr. Hermann thanked the developers for listening to the Board's comments and concerns. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

The applicant requested the application be tabled until more information is ready. Mr. Coulter moved to table the application and Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said this matter has been tabled.

2. New

a. Reroof – **654 Hartford St.** (J.F. Baker & Sons Roofing/Alexander) **AR 115-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Brad Baker approached the microphone and stated his address is 5852 Baronscourt Way, Dublin, Ohio. Mrs. Bitar asked Mr. Baker if the garage roof was included with the application and Mr. Baker said no, the original slate roof will be staying on the garage. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. New roof shingles are proposed for this house.
2. The existing roof consists of gray 3-tab shingles; proposed are “Heatherblend” dimensional shingles.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed roofing is appropriate for this house and the District.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY J.F. BAKER & SONS ROOFING FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE THE ROOF SHINGLES AT 654 HARTFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 115-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 115-12, DATED OCTOBER 29, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

b. Storefront Changes – **5625 N. High St.** (Gerald Sutton/Verizon) **AR 111-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant would like to make some changes to the storefront due to new branding for the tenant, Verizon Wireless. Staff has concerns with the proposal to paint the window sills red. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Gerald Sutton approached the microphone and stated his address is 205 E. South St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Sutton passed out materials for the Board members to view. Mr. Sutton said stone on the front was already painted white when he purchased the building six years ago, and now they would like to paint it a darker shade. He also said he would like to paint

the rest of the building to match at some point. He said they would not be painting the sills. Mrs. Lloyd said she was concerned with the amount of black color - it seemed very heavy at the top. Mr. Sutton said the color choice was due to Verizon's branding colors. Mrs. Holcombe and Mr. Hunter both said there were okay with the black color. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Verizon would like to change its storefront colors, add an awning on the north side, and a canopy above the entry door.
2. The existing storefront is stone with an off-white stucco parapet that matches the rest of the building. The stucco is proposed to be painted black, with the top trim piece painted red. The stone walls are proposed to be painted khaki.
3. New red fabric is proposed for the front awning. Also, a new red awning is proposed along the north side of the store.
4. A new metal canopy is proposed above the store entrance.
5. Color samples have been provided. The red for the building is a slightly different shade than the red fabric for the awnings.

Conclusions:

1. Differentiation of the retail storefront from the rest of the building is appropriate.
2. The addition of an awning on the north side, and a canopy above the entrance is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY GERALD SUTTON FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MAKE CHANGES TO THE STOREFRONT AT 5625 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 111-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 111-12, DATED OCTOBER 25, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING AND THAT THE WINDOW SILLS WILL NOT BE PAINTED.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, nay; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. Four Season Room – **601 Oxford St.** (Andrew & Melissa Smullen) **AR 112-12**

Discusson:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Andrew Smullen approached the microphone and stated his address is 601 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Smullen said the windows and other materials will match what exists on the house. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. In 2010, a rear addition was constructed and this house was remodeled. The project included a deck at the southwest corner of the house, above the garage. The homeowners would now like to construct an 11' x 16' four season room on much of the deck, and extend the deck 5' to the west.
2. The proposed room will have a low sloping rubber membrane roof that connects to the house below the rear dormer. Large windows are proposed on both exterior walls, and a door is proposed on the south elevation. The window and door trim will be white to match the house.
3. Hardiplank siding is proposed to match the existing siding in color and style. The trim color will also match the house.
4. Exterior lighting is proposed on the west side.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed addition is appropriate for the house.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ANDREW & MELISSA SMULLEN FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A FOUR SEASON ROOM AT 601 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 112-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 112-12, DATED OCTOBER 26, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

d. Signage – **9 W. New England Ave.** (Diane Hunter) **AR 113-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Diane Hunter approached the microphone and said her address is 1959 Ramblewood Dr., Columbus, Ohio 43235. There were no questions and no speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. A new projection sign is proposed on the north side of this building. A bracket still exists that previously displayed the Anne Bownas sign, and will be reused.
2. The proposed sign is 27” wide by 35” high, and will be made of a MDO (medium density overlay) panel.
3. The design is proposed with a logo, and text reading “Rejuvenating Therapeutic Massage, LLC” on a white background. The proposed logo is white, green and burgundy and the lettering is also burgundy.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed sign is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DIANE HUNTER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A NEW SIGN AS PER CASE NO. AR 113-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 113-12, DATED OCTOBER 26, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

e. HVAC Relocation & Patio – **123 W. Stafford Ave.** (BlackRock/Williams) **AR 114-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Phil Markwalder approached the microphone and stated his address is 3407 Piatt Rd., Delaware, Ohio. Mr. Markwalder brought in a sample of the material he will be using to show the Board members. He said the material is very heavy and very durable, and is actually stronger than poured concrete. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Installation of a two level patio is proposed. Due to the placement of the patio, a heat pump and condensing unit are proposed to move from the rear to the east side of the house.
2. Shale gray block is proposed for the patio, which begins 12” above grade, and steps down to grade. Landscape beds are proposed near the house, and at the outside edge of the patio.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY BLACKROCK FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MOVE HVAC EQUIPMENT AND CONSTRUCT A TIERED PATIO AT 123 W. STAFFORD AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 114-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 114-12, DATED OCTOBER 26, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- f. Railing – **649 High St. (649 High St.) AR 116-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The Worthington Inn would like to add rails to their steps in the front of the building that are similar to the rails that exist around the patio. Mrs. Bitar explained that staff had no concerns. Mr. Coulter asked if the rails were ADA approved. He said that the rails will need to extend a bit further in order to be in compliance with ADA Guidelines. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. No one was present to represent the Worthington Inn. Mr. Hunter said that typically the Board does not approve applications without the applicant being present but felt this matter was small enough to go ahead and approved the application with the ADA amendment.

Findings of fact:

1. Wrought iron decorative railings are proposed for the front steps of the Worthington Inn, and for the north side steps leading to the patio. Two rails are proposed for the front; one for the side steps.
2. The proposed railing is black, and complimentary to the existing railing around the patio.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed railings are appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY 649 HIGH LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL RAILINGS AT 649 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO.

AR 116-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 116-12, DATED OCTOBER 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE OVER RUN AT THE TOP AND THE BOTTOM OF THE STAIRS MEET ADA GUIDELINES.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

g. Signage – 6699 N. High St. (Advance Sign Group/Schoedinger) AR 117-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant would like to replace the freestanding externally illuminated sign in the front of their business. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Bob McCollum from Advance Sign Group approached the microphone and stated his address is 5150 Walcutt Rd., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. McCollum said he was representing Mr. Schoedinger because he was unable to attend the meeting. Mr. McCollum said the sign will have a new foundation and will be back filled with landscaping. Mr. Hunter asked if Mr. McCollum wanted to make any changes to the directional signs, saying they could be a part of the same application and Mr. McCollum said yes, they would like to possibly paint the directional signs. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Replacement of the existing externally illuminated wood freestanding sign for Schoedinger is proposed.
2. The proposed sign is internally illuminated, with light shining through the lettering routed in aluminum sign faces. The external light fixtures will be removed.
3. The sign measures 50 sf in area per side, which will require a variance for exceeding the 60 sf total limit (see Amendment to Development Plan application – agenda item C. 3.a.).
4. The proposed opaque background is blue; lettering and trim pieces are white.

Conclusions:

1. The size of this sign is appropriate for the size of the property.
2. Internally illuminated signs with opaque backgrounds have been used elsewhere in the High St. corridor.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ADVANCE SIGN GROUP FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A NEW SIGN AT 6699 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 117-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 117-12, DATED OCTOBER 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING AND THAT IF THE OWNER WANTS, THE DIRECTIONAL SIGNS CAN BE PAINTED TO MATCH THE NEW SIGN.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Conditional Use Permit

- a. Automotive Services – Major in I-1 Zoning District – **460-480 Schrock Rd.** (Michael Liscano) **CU 10-12 (470 Schrock Rd.)**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant would like to be permitted to repair and recondition motor vehicles at this site. All of the repair work would be done inside the building. Staff did not have any concerns. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Michael Liscano approached the microphone and stated his address is 2185 Cambridge Blvd., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Coulter asked if there was plenty of parking and Mr. Liscano said yes. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Automotive Services - Major means the repair, rebuilding or reconditioning of motor vehicles or parts thereof, including collision service, painting and steam cleaning of vehicles, and is a Conditional Use in the I-1 Zoning District. The business, Schrock Road Auto Repair, operates in accordance with that definition excluding collision service, painting and steam cleaning. All work will be completed inside the building.
2. This location is in the westernmost of the two buildings at the rear of the site. The railroad right-of-way and a considerable amount of landscape screening exist between this property and the single-family residential to the west.
3. Parking is sufficient for that suite of the building. There will be no long term storage of inoperable vehicles.

Conclusions:

1. The effect of the traffic pattern of this multi-tenant site should not change with the inclusion of this business.
2. The effect on utilities is minimal
3. No safety and health considerations, noise, odors and other noxious elements have been identified.
4. The use is generally compatible with this property.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY MICHAEL LISCANO FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO OPERATE AN AUTOMOTIVE SERVICES – MAJOR BUSINESS IN THE I-1 ZONING DISTRICT AT 460 SCHROCK RD. AS PER CASE NO. CU 10-12, DRAWINGS NO. CU 10-12, DATED OCTOBER 26, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- b. Residential uses in C2 Zoning District – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/Crawford Hoying Development) **CU 09-12**

Mr. Hermann moved to table this application and Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. All members voted “aye” to table the application.

2. Amendment to Development Plan – Unfinished Business

- a. New Buildings – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/Crawford Hoying Development) **ADP 11-12**

This application remained tabled.

3. Amendment to Development Plan – New

- a. Signage – **6699 N. High St.** (Advance Sign Group/Schoedinger) **ADP 13-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar referred to the facts presented in the ARB case for the same request. The Board members discussed the variance and made the decision to recommend the application for approval by the Worthington City Council.

Findings of fact:

1. This proposal requires an Amendment to Development Plan application because the proposed sign is larger than is allowed by Code. The proposed variance exceeds the allowable sign area by 40 sf.
2. The findings of fact in agenda item A.2.g are true for this application.

Conclusions:

1. The size of this sign is appropriate for the size of the property.
2. The sign is appropriate for the site and the District.

Mr. Hunter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ADVANCE SIGN GROUP FOR APPROVAL TO AMEND THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN AT 6699 N. HIGH ST. BY INSTALLING A NEW FREESTANDING SIGN AS PER CASE NO. ADP 13-12, DRAWINGS NO. ADP 13-12, DATED OCTOBER 30, 2012, BE RECOMMENDED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; and Mr. Coulter, aye.

4. Subdivision – Unfinished Business

- a. Preliminary Plat – 7227 N. High St. (M&A Architects/Crawford Hoying Development)
SUB 03-12

This item remained tabled.

Mr. Coulter moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:20 p.m. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. All members said aye. The meeting adjourned at 9:20 p.m.