

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING  
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD  
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

February 24, 2011

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice-Chair; Mikel Coulter, Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present were Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission, Bill Watterson, City Engineer, filling in for Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission who was on vacation and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Kathy Holcombe, Secretary, was not present and Board member Chris Hermann arrived at 8:20 p.m.

**A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.**

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. There were no minutes to approve
4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses.

**B. Architectural Review Board**

**1. New**

**a. Sign, New Gutters & Repaint Exterior – 615 High St. (Doug Meyers) AR 15-11**

Discussion:

Mr. Watterson reviewed the facts from the application. The application is for a new sign, new gutters, and repainting the former Maple Lee Florist building. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Doug Meyers approached the microphone and stated that his address is 615 High St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Meyers passed sample materials around to the Board members. Mr. Meyers said he plans to use tan gutters in the back of the building, and will also repaint the concrete block tan as well.

Mr. Sauer asked Mr. Meyers if the framing will remain the same green color, and Mr. Meyers said yes. Mr. Scott Myers asked the applicant if would also be repainting the electrical conduit that can be seen from the sidewalk, and Mr. Meyers said yes. The video screen visually demonstrated what the new sign will look like. The color of the letters will be gold on a black background. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Meyers if the photograph of the sign is the same one that he

will be using and Mr. Meyers said yes. The gold letters will be raised and state Financial Management Group 615 High Street, Suite 200.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either in favor or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This property owner would like to add a new sign to identify the entrance for the second floor of the building. The proposed sign will be 10" x 14" with gold letters on a black background, and placed to the left of the door which is north of the storefront entrance to the building.
2. Replacement of the gutters is also proposed. The existing are half round and the proposed are ogee. The color of the gutters on the front and south side will be the same dark green as the existing gutters and trim. On the north and west sides of the building, the existing gutters will be replaced and new will be added where missing. The color on these sides will be tan. Gutter and color samples have been submitted.
3. The trim along the concrete block portions of the building will be painted tan.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate for the building.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

**THAT THE REQUEST BY THE DOUG MEYERS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MAKE EXTERIOR RENOVATIONS AT 615 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 15-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 15-11, DATED FEBRUARY 10, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mr. Watterson called the role. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers; aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- b. Carport – **779 Oxford St.** (Stephen Dempsey Design Consulting/Brofford) **AR 16-11**

Discussion:

Mr. Watterson reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant was previously approved for renovations to the house at the last meeting, but not the carport due to neighbor concerns. A smaller version of the carport is being proposed. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Stephen Dempsey approached the microphone and stated that his address is 5623 Dumfries Court W., Dublin, Ohio, 43017.

Mr. Sauer asked if the applicant will need a variance for the side yard, and Mr. Watterson said yes.

Mr. Dempsey said that the size of the carport has been reduced, as well as the side entry, the columns, and the rake size, which were suggestions that Board made at the last meeting. Mr. Dempsey said the carport will have the same finishes as the rest of the new structure.

Mr. Myers asked Mr. Dempsey if he has talked with the next door neighbors yet. Mr. Dempsey said that he has spoken with the neighbors about the changes, and that they discussed colors, and gables, etc. Mr. Myers asked if the neighbor was happy with the new changes, and Mr. Dempsey said that he was not sure if the neighbor is completely happy.

Mr. Coulter told Mr. Dempsey that he appreciated the fact that he had taken the Boards' suggestions into consideration. Mr. Coulter felt that the architectural features were well addressed, taking away some of the massiveness, and that the entry way was pulled back. Mr. Coulter said that he believed Mr. Dempsey did the best that he could do while leaving reasonable access space.

Mr. Hunter asked if there were any speakers that would like to speak either for or against this application. Mr. Bruce Messenger approached the microphone and stated that his address is 771 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Messenger said that he appreciated the design consultant's effort to address some of their concerns. He also said that the Boards suggestions did help. Mr. Messenger said that he is still concerned with the height of the structure because his kitchen windows will be facing the carport structure. He was wondering if the roofline could be brought down a little, and make the structure more open instead of closed in. Mr. Messenger also asked the Board if they had any other suggestions.

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Dempsey what the roof pitch was and Mr. Dempsey said the roof's pitch is four over twelve. He said if he lowered it any more he would have to use a rubber roof. Mr. Coulter asked what the height of the structure is now, and Mr. Dempsey said nine feet, six inches. Mr. Coulter said that it would not be a good idea to go lower. Mr. Dempsey said they are already protecting some of the existing windows. If the roof was lowered, his client would lose two important features, the other windows.

Mr. Sauer asked if the gable is open. Mr. Dempsey said that he would then have to consider ridge beams, reduce the opening and use two by ten foot rafters.

Mr. Sauer asked why a variance would be granted if it was not a hardship for the owner if it violates the set back.

Mr. Hunter said that it will be up to the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Mr. Dempsey said that his client has young children and they would like to safely get them into the house without having to drive all the way to the end of the steep driveway, especially in the

cold winter months. Even with four wheel drive vehicles, he said that his clients cannot get back out of the driveway due to ice and snow and they would like to utilize the side entry to the house. He also stated that there is a carport on Stafford Street that is very similar. Mr. Hunter said that the photograph that was presented clearly showed how steep the applicant's driveway is, and that he understands their concern for safety.

Mr. Hunter asked how the large window near the stairwell, on the side of the house, would fit in with the existing plan, and Mr. Dempsey said it is being removed.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone else that would like to speak, and Mrs. Clare Brofford approached the microphone and stated that she lives at 779 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio. Mrs. Brofford said that she and her husband plan to live in the Worthington area a long time, and raise their children. She said they are putting their heart and soul into the house to make it look nicer. Mrs. Brofford said she has a young child and it is difficult for her to get out of her steep driveway, even with a four wheeled vehicle. She said that she and her husband plan to utilize the side entry of the house because it is safer to unload the children there from the car. Mrs. Brofford feels that the new addition will look much nicer than what it there now.

Mr. Myers asked to make a statement. He said after reading Ordinance number 1129.05, of the Codified Ordinances for Worthington, that the Board of Zoning Appeals "may grant a variance in the application of the provisions of the Zoning Ordinance when it is determined that practical difficulty exists based on the following factors" and that it lists seven different criteria, but not the term hardship.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone else present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one else came forward.

#### Findings of fact:

1. At its January 27, 2011 meeting, the ARB approved an application for additions/renovations at this address, but the approval did not include the carport due to neighbor concerns with the size and placement. This application represents an amended version of the plan.
2. Due to the use of narrower columns and the reduction of the rake size, the distance from the roof overhang to the south property line has been increased from 3.1' to 4. 8'. The new side entry on the house has also been reduced in size, so the width for the cars to travel through between the columns and the house is the same as was previously proposed.
3. The roof form, trim and materials are as on the existing house. The column width matches the existing front porch columns. The bottom 3'6" will be brick and the top portion will be round PVC painted white.

#### Conclusions:

1. The design of the carport is complementary to the existing house.

2. Placement further from the property to the south is an improvement.

Mr. Coulter moved:

**THAT THE REQUEST BY STEPHEN DEMPSEY DESIGN CONSULTING FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CONSTRUCT AN ADDITION AND MAKE RENOVATIONS AT 779 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 16-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 16-11, DATED FEBRUARY 11, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND THE DISCUSSION AT THE MEETING.**

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mr. Watterson called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers; aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. New Building – **7007 N. High St.** (Telhio Credit Union) **AR 14-11**

Discussion:

Mr. Watterson reviewed the facts from the application. Telhio Credit Union will be constructing a new building in the parking lot that belongs to the Holiday Inn in Worthington. It will be located in the portion of the lot that faces High Street. The landscaping has not been identified.

Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. William Bily approached the microphone and stated that his address is 5181 Natorp Blvd., Mason, Ohio 45040. Mr. Bily discussed the photographs of what the proposed building will look like. It will be brick with limestone accent. It will have three drive thru lanes, one of which will have an automatic teller machine. The right turn curb cut will remain off of High Street. There was a drafting error on the proposed drawings. Mr. Bily said that they chose a portion of the lot that will maximize parking and not interfere with conference area parking. He also said it will have double hung windows and traditional brick with limestone accent.

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Bily about the E.I.F.S. Mr. Bily said that the drive up area will have an E.I.F.S. ceiling, and it will be a high quality building. Mr. Sauer asked if they will be using stone or cast stone, and Mr. Bily said that they will be using cast stone.

Mr. Hunter asked Mr. Bily if any additional staff members will be added when the bank moves to the new location. Mr. Bily introduced the Telhio Manager to answer Mr. Hunter's question. Ms. Karen Daniels stated her address is 96 N. 4<sup>th</sup> Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215. Ms. Daniels said that only one new position will be added and that is a Wealth Management Advisor.

Mr. Sauer asked why the bank is moving. Ms. Daniels said that the bank's lease is ending, and it is difficult for customers to get in and out of the current location.. She said they have been at that location for the past ten years, and in the Worthington area for the past twenty five years, so they would like to stay in the same area to maintain service to their members in the community.

Mr. Bily said that Telhio plans to fully comply with the green space guidelines, and they will be using the existing lighting.

Mr. Hunter asked if it was possible to use brick for the building, all the way up to the top, instead of part of it being cast stone. Mr. Bily said yes, it is possible to use brick for the entire structure.

Mrs. Lloyd agreed that brick all the way to the top of the building would look nice. She also asked if Telhio explored other ideas of placing the building in different spots on the site, making it more pedestrian friendly, instead of being so close to the hotel.

Mr. Bily said yes, but they chose the portion of the site where parking could be maximized. After normal banking hours, the conference portion of the hotel will have more parking spaces.

Mr. Sauer mentioned that the bank will not be very large, and is set back further than the gas station next door. He asked if it would be better for business to move the bank closer to High Street.

Mr. Hunter said that he thinks the bank will be fine at the location that has already been picked out.

Mr. Coulter said that he would like to see brick used all the way up, and likes the limestone accent pieces used for horizontal detail. He also asked if the sign will be illuminated. Mr. Bily said that the sign will be halo lit, using LED lights. The surface behind the sign will be lit up.

Mr. Hermann said there have been issues before concerning grade. He mentioned the big drop in the elevation. Mr. Bily said that the drop will be leveled out, and made to look nice. Mr. Hermann also asked about having more green space up front near High Street, and if it's okay for Telhio to have two signs. Mr. Watterson said they have already applied for a variance for the additional free standing sign.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone else that would like to speak for or against this application and no one else came forward.

#### Findings of fact:

1. Telhio Credit Union is proposing construction of a new building in a portion of the High St. parking lot for the Holiday Inn, to move to from its existing location on the Worthington Square site. Telhio plans to make use of the existing drive entrances from High St. and Caren Ave. The proposed building is set back more than 100' from both streets, which exceeds Code requirements.
2. Drive-thru lanes are proposed for the north side of the building, with traffic flow from east to west. The building has grass areas and sidewalks on the east and south sides, with a striped crosswalk connecting to new sidewalk at the southeast corner of the site. Those new walkways then connect to the existing sidewalks on High St. and Caren Ave.

3. The proposed building is 3115 square feet in area, with a cross hipped roof. The larger portion of the roof runs east-west over the main building, and a shorter arm extends north to cover the drive-thru area. A third hipped gable extends east from the front of the building to create the entrance. Driftwood colored fiberglass dimensional shingles are proposed for all roof surfaces.
4. The red brick building and drive-thru columns also include a buffstone colored stone water table and accent bands. Prefinished aluminum gutters, downspouts, fascia and soffits, and an EIFS trim panel on the drive-thru are also proposed in the same buffstone color. A metal handrail is proposed along the ramp and steps on the west side of the building. Double hung windows in a 4 over 1 pattern are proposed. The window and door trim are proposed as dark bronze. Samples of all materials have been submitted.
5. Both a wall sign and freestanding sign with the same text and logo are proposed for the site. A variance is required to allow an additional freestanding sign on the Holiday Inn parcel. The total sign area is less than the Code maximum of 100 square feet allowed per business.

Internally illuminated acrylic black letters, and black and gray logos, mounted on stone, are proposed for both signs. The freestanding sign has a brick base and stone trim.

6. A dumpster enclosure is proposed on the southwest corner of the site
7. Detail is needed regarding any new landscaping proposed. The plan does indicate the reuse of the existing parking lot light poles at the north and south borders of the lot.
8. No external building lighting is shown.

Conclusions:

1. Proposed placement of the building meets Code requirements and seems to allow for easy circulation around the site. The pedestrian connection should be helpful.
2. The proposed plan maintains the current location of parking on the site.
3. The proposed building is not of the same scale as the others at this intersection, but is comparable to BP, Chase, and the current Telhio building.

Mr. Coulter moved:

**THAT THE REQUEST BY TELHIO CREDIT UNION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A NEW CREDIT UNION AT 7007 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 14-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 14-11, DATED FEBRUARY 4, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING AND WITH THE FOLLOWING AMENDMENTS:**

- **THAT A LANDSCAPE PLAN BE PRESENTED TO THE ARB FOR APPROVAL**
- **THAT BRICK BE CARRIED ALL THE WAY UP TO THE UNDERSIDE OF THE SOFFIT EXCEPT THE SIGN AREA WOULD BE STONE**
- **THAT THE CURB CUT ALONG NORTH HIGH STREET WILL REMAIN AS IS BOTH IN DESIGN AND AS IT FUNCTIONS**
- **WALL SIGN NEEDS TO BE PRESENTED TO ARB FOR REVIEW APPROVAL**

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mr. Watterson called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, nay; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers; aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

**C. Municipal Planning Commission**

**1. Conditional Use Permit**

- a. Credit Union with Drive-Thru in C-4 Zoning District – **7007 N. High St.** (Telhio Credit Union) **CU 02-11**

Discussion:

Mr. Bily stated that his address is 5181 Natorp Blvd., Mason, Ohio 45040. Mr. Bily did not have a customer count, but said that he feels that there will be adequate parking. The bank will be open on Mondays and Fridays from 9:00 a.m. to 5:30 p.m., Tuesdays through Thursday from 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., and Saturdays from 9:00 a.m. until 2:00 p.m.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that was either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Mr. Sauer said that he supports the Credit Union’s business he just did not agree with the layout.

Findings of fact:

The following information is in addition to the facts in the above case (AR 14-11).

1. Both the credit union office and drive-thru are Conditional Uses in the C-4 Zoning District, which is Highway and Automotive Services.
2. Telhio does not anticipate an adverse impact on the surrounding area. The parking requirement for the credit union is met with this plan. While the Holiday Inn occasionally fills this parking lot during events, there are routinely empty parking spaces toward the west end of the site during such occasions.

3. Proposed business hours are 9:00 am – 5:30 pm, Monday and Friday; 9:00 am – 5:00 pm Tuesday thru Thursday; and 9:00 am – 2:00 pm on Saturday. At other times, all parking around the building would be available for Holiday Inn use.

Conclusions:

The following information is in addition to the conclusions in the above case (AR 14-11).

1. Traffic patterns will not be greatly affected with this development.
2. Negative effects on public facilities and utilities have not been identified.
3. There should not be any noises and odors, or safety and health considerations.
4. The hours of use are typical of an office, and will allow the hotel to utilize the parking during evenings and weekends.
5. The use is compatible with the general area.

Mr. Sauer moved:

**THAT THE REQUEST BY TELHIO CREDIT UNION FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO OPERATE A CREDIT UNION WITH A DRIVE-THRU IN THE C-4 ZONING DISTRICT AT 7007 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. CU 02-11, DRAWINGS NO. CU 02-11, DATED FEBRUARY 4, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND THE DISCUSSION AT THE MEETING.**

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mr. Watterson called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; and Mr. Hermann, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

Mr. Coulter moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. All members said aye. The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.