CALL TO ORDER – Roll Call, Pledge of Allegiance

Worthington City Council met in Regular Session on Monday, November 20, 2017, in the John P. Coleman Council Chambers of the Louis J.R. Goorey Municipal Building, 6550 North High Street, Worthington, Ohio. President Michael called the meeting to order at or about 7:30 PM

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Rachael R. Dorothy, Douglas Foust, Scott Myers, Douglas K. Smith, Michael C. Troper, and Bonnie D. Michael (David Norstrom arrived at 7:31 p.m.)

Also present: City Manager Matthew Greeson, Assistant City Manager Robyn Stewart, Director of Finance Scott Barter, Director of Service & Engineering Dan Whited, Chief of Fire & EMS Scott Highley, Director of Parks & Recreation Darren Hurley, Director of Law Tom Lindsey, Chief of Police Jerry Strait, Clerk of Council D. Kay Thress

There were approximately forty seven visitors present.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

President Michael invited all to stand and join in reciting the Pledge of Allegiance to the flag.

VISITOR COMMENTS

No visitor comments

SPECIAL PRESENTATION

Resolution No. 70-2017

Expressing the Congratulations and Best Wishes of Worthington City Council to the Thomas Worthington High School Varsity Boys Water Polo Team for Winning the 2017 State Championship.

Introduced by Mr. Troper.

MOTION

Ms. Dorothy made a motion to adopt Resolution No. 70-2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Myers.

There being no additional comments, the motion to adopt Resolution No. 70-2017 carried unanimously by a voice vote.
Vice Mayor James Lorimer offered remarks in recognition of the achievements of the Thomas Worthington High School Varsity Boys Water Polo Team which included a State Team Championship. His remarks included information about the sport as well as specific individual recognition of the members of the team. Mr. Lorimer also recognized the team’s coach and assistant coach. Head coach, Rick Yurick, accepted the recognition on behalf of the team and offered his comments on the season and the team. Mr. Lorimer also recognized the representatives from Worthington City Schools which included Superintendent Trent Bowers, Thomas Worthington High School Principal Pete Scully, and Thomas Worthington High School Athletic Director Jen Goebble.

PUBLIC HEARINGS ON LEGISLATION
President Michael declared public hearings and voting on legislation previously introduced to be in order.

Ordinance 31-2017
Amending Ordinance No. 45-2016 (As Amended) to Adjust the Annual Budget by Providing for an Appropriation from the Capital Improvements Fund Unappropriated Balance to Pay the Cost of the Community Center South End Roof Replacement Project and Determining to Proceed with said Project (Project No. 650-17)

The foregoing Ordinance Title was read.

MOTION
Mr. Smith made a motion to remove Ordinance No. 31-2017 from the table. The motion was seconded by Mr. Norstrom.

The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

Mr. Whited provided information about the bid results. The project was originally bid in September and the bids came in significantly over the engineer’s estimate so the plans were revised and the project was re-bid. The low bidder was K&W Roofing, who had stellar references. Staff is requesting award to K&W Roofing and an appropriation of $667,582 which includes a ten percent contingency.

Ms. Dorothy asked if this work would be excluded from the energy project at the Community Center, for example will they look at insulation? Mr. Whited responded it is a separate project but the evaluation and work will be coordinated. Ms. Dorothy asked about the timeframe for the work. Mr. Whited said they will coordinate a schedule with the contractor once the project is awarded.

Mr. Smith asked about the original timeframe for the project. Mr. Whited responded the original timeline was as soon as possible. We originally bid it in September.

MOTION
Mr. Foust made a motion to amend Ordinance No. 31-2017 in Section 2. to add the firm of K & W Roofing and in Section 1. to insert the amount of Six Hundred Sixty Seven Thousand Five Hundred Eight Two Dollars (667,582.00). The motion was seconded by Mr. Troper.
The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

There being no additional comments, the clerk called the roll on Ordinance No. 31-2017 (As Amended). The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes 7 Foust, Troper, Norstrom, Dorothy, Smith, Myers, and Michael

No 0

Ordinance No. 31-2017 (As Amended) was thereupon declared duly passed and is recorded in full in the appropriate record book.

Ordinance No. 40-2017 Amending Ordinance No. 45-2016 (As Amended) to Adjust the Annual Budget by Providing for an Appropriation from the Capital Improvements Fund Unappropriated Balance to Pay the Cost of Community Center Energy Conservation Report and to Proceed with said Project. (Project No. 658-17)

The foregoing Ordinance Title was read.

Mr. Greeson indicated this is the item referenced by Ms. Dorothy. It looks at energy conservation possibilities for the Community Center. This is the first time the City has used the energy conservation process in the Ohio Revised Code. Mr. Whited indicated this is the energy conservation report portion of the process. He reported staff received a number of proposals, then the list of potential firms was narrowed to three which were interviewed, and staff is recommending ABM to complete the energy study of the Community Center. They will also conduct energy benchmarking at ten other community buildings in conjunction with a consultant who is doing work with MORPC as part of a pilot program. This initial phase will include evaluation of the equipment and its energy usage, identification of potential energy savings, and benchmarking of those savings. The City is not required to implement the recommended items. If the City chooses not to implement them, then the City will owe ABM for the cost of the report.

Ms. Dorothy asked when the evaluation will start. Mr. Whited responded it has already started – they met with the consultant last week to kick off the work and to begin coordination with MORPC. Ms. Dorothy indicated she is glad the evaluation is moving forward and it is a great opportunity to improve conditions and save money. She likes this new method that allows for a guarantee of energy savings.

There being no additional comments, the clerk called the roll on Ordinance No. 40-2017. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes 7 Troper, Norstrom, Dorothy, Smith, Myers, Foust, and Michael

No 0

Ordinance No. 40-2017 was thereupon declared duly passed and is recorded in full in the appropriate record book.
NEW LEGISLATION TO BE INTRODUCED

RESOLUTION NO. 68-2017
Amending the Position Title and Position Description for Fire Chief.

Introduced by Mr. Norstrom.

MOTION
Mr. Smith made a motion to adopt Resolution No. 68-2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Myers.

Mr. Greeson indicated this resolution and the next one amend the job descriptions for the Fire Chief and Assistant Fire Chief. The primary change to the Fire Chief job description is the addition of the title of Deputy Director of Safety which moves the position from a classified position to an unclassified position. The changes to the Assistant Fire Chief job description include elimination of the requirements for a Master’s Degree and for the Executive Fire Officer certification. This will allow for a broader pool of applicants when the City next advertises for and hires an Assistant Chief. The person could pursue one or both of those qualifications over time.

There being no additional comments, the motion to adopt Resolution No. 68-2017 carried unanimously by a voice vote.

RESOLUTION NO. 69-2017
Amending the Position Description for Assistant Fire Chief.

Introduced by Ms. Dorothy.

MOTION
Mr. Troper made a motion to adopt Resolution No. 69-2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Foust.

Mr. Myers asked to clarify that the Master’s Degree and the advanced chief training would not be required but could be preferred. Once employed, the expectation would be that they obtain them. Mr. Greeson concurred that they would be expected to pursue at least one of them. Mr. Myers commented that he has been impressed with the number of advanced degrees held by the leadership of the public safety divisions.

There being no additional comments, the motion to adopt Resolution No. 69-2017 carried unanimously by a voice vote.

ORDINANCE NO. 41-2017
Providing for the Adoption of the Annual Budget for the Fiscal Year 2018 and Appropriating Sums for Current Operating Expenses.

Introduced by Mr. Norstrom.

ORDINANCE NO. 42-2017
To Continue the Allocation of the Six Percent (6%) Hotel/Motel Tax as it Relates to the Operation of
the Worthington Area Convention and Visitors Bureau.

**Introduced by Mr. Smith.**

**ORDINANCE NO. 43-2017**

Authorizing the City Manager to Enter into a Contract with the Village of Riverlea for the Provision of Police Protection.

**Introduced by Mr. Myers.**

**ORDINANCE NO. 44-2017**

Authorizing the City Manager to Execute a Contract Between the City of Columbus Board of Health and the City of Worthington for Health Services.

**Introduced by Ms. Dorothy.**

**ORDINANCE NO. 45-2017**

Approving the City Manager's Appointment of the Franklin County Board of Health as the Provider of Plumbing Inspection Services in the City of Worthington.

**Introduced by Mr. Troper.**

**ORDINANCE NO. 46-2017**


**Introduced by Mr. Foust.**

The Clerk was instructed to give notice of a public hearing on said ordinance(s) in accordance with the provisions of the City Charter unless otherwise directed.

*Ms. Michael indicated each of these ordinances will be heard on December 4th and asked that a consent agenda be utilized for the routine items.*

**REPORTS OF CITY OFFICIALS**

**Policy Item(s)**

**Proposed 2018 Budget – Presentations from Community Groups**

*Mr. Greeson indicated it is customary to hear presentations from the community groups that receive more significant levels of funding during the budget discussions. The smaller grants are considered after budget adoption.*
• The Convention & Visitors Bureau

Bill Purpura offered comments on behalf of the Convention and Visitors Bureau (CVB). Mr. Purpura indicated the CVB provided a three year budget last year that indicated their plans for operations while the Holiday Inn is in flux. The plans included moving the executive director to a part-time status. That change was implemented. A delay in the closing of the Holiday Inn has resulted in a full year of revenue, which has allowed them to tweak some of their activities and they placed an extra ad, but they continued with much of their plan. He referred to their proposed budget for 2018 and indicated that while they are scaling back some of their activities, they are planning to help with the re-launch of a new hotel on the Holiday Inn site. They are fully engaged and ready to help with the next hotel. Mr. Purpura highlighted activities from 2017 that were included in the report provided to City Council. He highlighted the partnerships they have forged, including with the Old Worthington Partnership and the Worthington Area Chamber of Commerce. They all have different missions, but their goal is to get the groups together to make big things happen. An example of this was the new website launched a year or more ago.

Mr. Norstrom asked about the advertising placed with AAA. Ms. Mace indicated they did that because when the Holiday Inn indicated they were not closing yet, this was one of the few publications for which they hadn’t passed the deadline. Mr. Purpura clarified the process for any advertisement with AAA. Typically, the CVB does not have any advertising in the AAA publication. When it does occur, it is handled by other people at AAA and he does not discuss it with them or with Ms. Mace. He is completely out of the process and feels that is important given his role with AAA. He believes Home and Away is completely left out for 2018. They are investing heavily in the Columbus Visitor’s Guide. They have very few funds and are trying to make the best use of their funds.

Ms. Dorothy commented she thinks the coordination among groups has improved and she appreciates it. Mr. Purpura said they have made a large effort to enhance that coordination, due in large part to pushing by Mr. Norstrom to do so.

Mr. Myers asked about the additional funds from the Holiday Inn since they have been open all year. Mr. Purpura said the funds are down from a typical year because their visits are down since people have heard they are closing. He said the additional funds have allowed them to build their surplus a bit to help them get through the time when the Holiday Inn will be closed. Mike Clevenger with the CVB confirmed they have built their surplus and currently anticipate having about 30 months of scaled back activities that can be funded which is about the timeline suggested for the demolition and construction of a new hotel. Mr. Bartter indicated he has more detailed financial statements from the CVB.

Mr. Foust asked about social media activity. Ms. Mace indicated they have almost 2,100 followers on Facebook.

Ms. Michael wished the CVB luck during the transition with the Holiday Inn site.
Mr. Greeson indicated the McConnell Arts Center provides arts programming in a City-owned building. The City provides grant funds for help with the operations of the MAC.

Jon Cook offered comments on behalf of the MAC. He expressed thanks for support from the City and thanked Mr. Norstrom for his involvement. He indicated they continue to explore and embrace the impact the arts can have on the community. He cited information from the Americans for the Arts, which has looked at this topic.

He reported they saw about 84,000 visitors in this past year. The activity is highlighted in the illustrations below.
Mr. Cook stated that in the planning stages of the MAC, it was anticipated 25,000 would be a good number. They have obviously significantly exceeded that. They continually get comments about the parking lot and how full it is. They’ve had 431,371 visits since the MAC opened in November 2009. They’ve seen a big increase in visits from the 43085 zip code and from Clintonville and the campus area. They’re seeing many people from north (Powell/Lewis Center) and from south of Worthington in Clintonville. He shared the following information:

Where are they coming from?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zip Code</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>43085</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43235</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Powell/Lewis Center</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Westerville</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dublin</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UA</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Columbus</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remaining OH</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outside state</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In looking at the economic impact, they’ve contributed back an economic impact of $14,605,000 since their opening. MAC patrons spent an average of an additional $15.29 per person, per event within the City of Worthington. Almost half of that spending is on food and beverage.

Mr. Cook highlighted Juliette Montague and her connections to the MAC. She is an example of what the MAC does for the artists in our community.

They have no admission fee for the building so people can come in and view the art in the building, which is changed out every six weeks.

Mr. Cook shared the following information on their budget. The City funding has stayed level. They have big fluctuations in the public support revenue which come from grants which may be special projects that are not renewable. Their earned revenue sources have grown from $176,000 in 2012 to $358,000 in 2017.

The MAC collaborates with many partners in Worthington and around the region. They have their own chamber orchestra, which recently kicked off the season. Many of those musicians live and work in our community. Other accomplishments included 225, 30% and 40% increases in educational attendance over the last three years. He does not expect to see that large of an increase next year because they are at capacity for evening and weekend performances in their building. One of their challenges is to move outside of their building and look at how they can use programming outside their building to provide services. He is calling this MACreach. The Schools have offered high school spaced in the evenings, which would be right across the back parking lot.
Mr. Cook highlighted their goals for 2018, which include:

- Increase visits to the MAC to 90,000. Another 10% over last year, with an additional economic impact 230,000
- A continued focus on financial responsibility and fiscal stewardship that includes sharing measurements and engagement levels.
- The increased engagement of youth, teens and young families within the immediate area in programs, with a focus on underserved.
- Continued expansion of the Worthington Arts Festival, and contribution of more than 10K to the Old Worthington Partnership.
- A commitment to distribute and evaluate Creative Culture funding on behalf of the City of Worthington for calendar year, 2018.

Mr. Cook indicated he is approached by other communities to learn how they can create an arts center in their community. He recommends a strong group of volunteers first to work on making it happen. Mr. Cook concluded by introducing the MAC board members that were present.

Mr. Norstrom asked about the size of the MAC staff. Mr. Cook responded they have six people. He thanked Mr. Cook for the work they do and commented he thinks one of the best decisions the MAC board has made was hiring Mr. Cook.

Mr. Myers asked about the funding for arts groups in the community. Mr. Cook said it isn’t going very well. He reached out to many groups and they only received two applications for a total requested amount $2,600. Mr. Myers asked if Mr. Cook could come back to City Council after the first of the year to discuss this funding.

Mr. Myers noted the MAC has two endowments now. Mr. Cook commented that they have created a permanent endowment at the Columbus Foundation which will create a legacy fund. They are also working to create an operating reserve fund; they have set that as a goal in this budget.

Mr. Myers asked if they have plans within the next four years for a capital campaign for expansion of the Center. Mr. Cook said they haven’t held that discussion with the board but he thinks they should first look to expand offerings outside of the Center.

Mr. Troper asked about the pre-paid rent on the balance sheet. Mr. Cook responded it is the value of the rent that they would pay to the City if they had to pay rent. It ties to the work the MAC did on the building that is owned by the City.

Ms. Dorothy thanked Mr. Cook for coming to the City Council meeting. It is great to see the numbers of people visiting the MAC and she appreciates the coordination and cooperation with the Old Worthington Partnership. Ms. Michael also thanked Mr. Cook and the MAC Board for the work they’re doing.

- Old Worthington Partnership

Aaron Brown, the Chairman of the Old Worthington Partnership, provided the presentation on behalf of the Partnership. He indicated they’ve brought forward several new ideas over the past
year and the Board of Directors continues to grow. They identified some areas of need and they’ve sought to fill them. They added someone from Worthington Industries (Joe Giannetti). They appreciate having Dave Norstrom and David McCorkle from the City on their Board. They have two staff members, Annina Parini and Jaime Moore.

The City has provided $50,000 from the past two years to support a variety of efforts. They’ve worked to support the merchants and are keeping an eye on their economic impact and they seek out innovation. Mr. Brown reported on the revenue sources for the Partnership:

- 50% - Farmers Market
- 20% Events (Picnic, Chocolate Walk, Wedding Walk)
- 23% City Grant
- 7% Other Contributions

They are not solely funded by the City and they have worked hard to diversify their revenue sources. They follow the best practices of the National Main Street organization which recommends 33% each from the City, events and other fundraising.

They created a new event in 2017 which was the Chocolate Walk, which sold out. A significant number of the attendees were not from Worthington.

The Farmers Market turned 30 this year and they celebrated that anniversary this year.

Mr. Brown highlighted their social media activities and shared his perspective on the importance of it. He highlighted the economic impact of their activities. On average, a Farmer’s Market guest spends $15 in merchant shops while at the market. Merchants make more during the market than the rest of the week combined. The Designated Outdoor Recreation Area (DORA) brings more proceeds to merchants. Community events bring positive attention and repeat business. They have collaborated with other Worthington organizations such as Parks & Recreation and the Concerts on the Green.

They’ve had a number of virtual activities. The CVB highlighted the changes to the website. More than 16,000 people have explored experienceworthington.com. They have almost 2,500 Facebook fans, and are growing their Instagram feed every day. They have more than 1,700 newsletter subscribers with a 19% higher open rate than other non-profit newsletters.

Mr. Brown reported on the training they have offered to merchants. They surveyed the merchants on topics they found relevant and useful and planned quarterly workshops to educate them on a range of topics. These workshops were: Social Media 101; Marketing in Traditional Mediums; Retail Trends for the Future; Succession Planning for Small Businesses.

They work on new ideas and an example of this was the Designated Outdoor Recreation Area (DORA). They have received very good feedback. The merchants are seeing increased revenue. Another example is the candidate forum – town hall meeting – they hosted. They have also worked hard over the past year on a mural in Old Worthington. They believe strongly that a mural is a good idea. They were following the suggestions of the Architectural Review Board when they appealed their decision so that City Council can talk about a policy and/or guidelines.
Pending movement forward on guidelines, the Partnership does not anticipate moving forward with the appeal and they will instead re-file next year.

They are creating a short video based on It’s a Wonderful Life and filmed it overnight in Old Worthington. They think it will be great to promote Worthington and it will be unveiled on Sunday.

Another focus of the Partnership has been to harness the potential of volunteers to help support Old Worthington. They are involved in a volunteer drive with the lofty goal of getting to 500 in 30 days. They’re near 200 names to date.

Mr. Brown reported on another activity of the Partnership which is the formation of a Business Advisory Council which will have various areas of expertise and skills that will be a resource for merchants. Skills include such areas as real estate, accounting, liquor law, project management, food safety, employment law, training, marketing and communications, construction, and social media.

Mr. Brown encouraged the City to get engaged in the Smart Columbus activities as he sees it as a great opportunity for Worthington. He reported they are also looking at fundraising for their organization and want to work with an experienced professional in this area. Mr. Norstrom commented that the Partnership obtained 501(c)(3) status which should help with fundraising.

Mr. Brown noted there was a slight increase in their request for funding to cover the cost of the City services that are provided for the Picnic with the Partnership. There were increased expenses associated with safety at the event which cut into their profit from the event. They are asking to be treated in the same way other groups are treated.

Mr. Foust asked about the sponsorship of the concerts. Mr. Brown said it supports the fans.

Mr. Myers commented he thinks the group is moving forward in the right direction. He wants to group to be about more than events and he appreciates the support provided to merchants. He asked about the Partnerships activities to retain merchants. Mr. Brown replied it involves one to one engagement to understand their thinking. Secondly, they have made a concerted effort to engage property owners. The response has not been where they would like it to be. Finally, they are creating events that draw in people to the businesses. The merchants experience more revenue during the Farmer’s Market than they do all week. Mr. Myers asked how that is distributed because some merchants complain they are negatively affected. Mr. Brown said it is an average and the restaurants may be doing better than others. They encourage businesses to plan activities that engage and draw in people visiting the event.

Mr. Myers offered the additional comments that he appreciated the candidate event they held and that he was one of the people that encouraged the ARB appeal for the mural.

Mr. Myers asked for suggestions of how to more effectively reach out to a younger demographic. Mr. Brown suggested more activity on certain channels by Council members and connecting their involvement in their discussions and decisions.
Ms. Michael commented that she appreciated one of the training programs she attended for the merchants. She also noted she has already attended a Smart Columbus presentation and it’s good to hear. It will be a challenge to figure out how Worthington connects but it is something we should look to do.

Ms. Michael asked how many groups have a waiver for costs associated with events. Mr. Greeson replied that about a decade ago, there was a list of events that were grandfathered and new events were charged the cost of the City services. About the only event still in existence from the list is Market Day. Farmer’s Market was probably on the list but the City support is minimal. Other events on the list were the Arts Festival, which has been shifted to the MAC and doesn’t require much support from the City, and the Pooch Parade. Mr. Norstrom asked if Memorial Day is included. Mr. Greeson replied it is, for probably a hundred years.

Ms. Dorothy thanked the Partnership for their collaboration with other groups and their investment in our community.

Mr. Troper asked whether they plan to implement his suggestions for the candidate’s night. Mr. Brown replied they aren’t yet ready to say.

Mr. Foust asked about outreach to neighbors immediately surrounding the area, in particular about events and the impacts of the events. Mr. Brown replied they have done such outreach, including reaching out to the Old Worthington Association and flyers to neighbors. There is more they plan to do in that area.

- Worthington Historical Society

Kate LaLonde provided comments from the Worthington Historical Society. She highlighted how they serve the community and what they have done over the past year. They have the sites of the Orange Johnson House, the Old Rectory and the Jeffers Mound. They sponsor a number of programs, including Pioneer Days which served almost 1,200 third graders this year. They also had walking tours, bus tours in collaboration with the Griswold Center, ghost tours in collaboration with the Cemetery and the Home and Gardens tour which serves as a fundraiser for them. Ms. LaLonde reported they respond to many research requests on property, building and individuals. This year they’ve already fielded over 65 research requests. They also serve as a repository for Worthington history items donated by people. They ensure people have access to them and they maintain the stories of the people connected to the items. The funding from City Council this year was used for staff salaries (60%) and this is anticipated to be used for next year. She spends her time coordinating volunteers and making people aware of the activities of the Historical Society. Projects they achieved this year included the replacement of 14 windows on the Orange Johnson house and the digitization of archival records related to the Johnson Sessions collection for placement on the Worthington Libraries’ Worthington Memory website. The staff facilitated the movement of the ghost tour to Walnut Grove Cemetery and they were able to bring in actors to portray the various individuals buried at the cemetery. They are thankful for the support from the City.
Mr. Greeson added that the Historical Society is a resource for staff. We utilize them for information about buildings in our community and Ms. LaLonde presented to the Citizens Academy.

Mr. Foust expressed appreciation for the Historical Society and their work which serves as a resource for our identity. He knows it can be challenging to coordinate volunteers and he appreciates their efforts.

Mr. Smith commented on the purchase of the Ozem Gardner House by the Cemetery Board and asked if they are involved. Ms. LaLonde indicated she is aware of the purchase and has spoken with Courtney Chapman. The role of the Historical Society with that property is unclear but they are pleased to know it will be owned by the Cemetery Board.

Ms. Dorothy, as a member of the Cemetery Board, mentioned they are trying to weather proof the building now and they are exploring what they can do with the property from the public perspective as there are limitations on the use of the cemetery funds.

Ms. Dorothy commented on her appreciation for the work of the Worthington Historical Society and their work with people from around the country. Mr. Myers commented on the research by the Historical Society for the solar discussions and he expressed his appreciation. Ms. Michael also expressed her appreciation for the Historical Society and the other groups that have presented.

**Discussion Item(s)**

- Follow Up - Proposed 2018 Operating Budget & Proposed 2018-2022 Capital Improvements Program

Mr. Greeson indicated staff wanted to follow up with City Council on the requests for information earlier in the budget process and wants to receive direction on the special groups. The budget ordinance has been introduced with blanks and will be set for public hearing at the first meeting in December. The numbers will be filled in at the public hearing. The numbers will be the ones previously proposed by Mr. Greeson unless City Council indicates they want changes. The Proposed Operating Budget accommodates the requests from the groups that presented this evening except for the additional support request from the Old Worthington Partnership which would increase the City’s overtime, particularly in the Police Division.

Staff distributed a memorandum that follows up on questions posed by City Council, including related to trees, playgrounds, strategic planning, efforts related to opioids, and employee contributions to health insurance. Ms. Michael indicated she would like to take the items one by one.

- Additional Funding for New Trees

Ms. Dorothy commented that the memo states there is a deficit of about 50 trees since 2010 so she would support the inclusion of the suggested $5,000 annually for more trees. Mr. Myers asked if it is an easy move to make. Mr. Greeson replied that staff is suggesting it be added to the operating budget rather than the CIP and would allow the City’s arborists to move forward
with accomplishing the goal of eliminating the deficit. Mr. Hurley commented that the $5,000 would go to trees and staff has some ideas about leveraging the program in which residents pay a little less than half of the cost of the new trees which would leverage the $5,000 with additional funds. Mr. Greeson commented that since there appears to be consensus from City Council on this addition of funds, these numbers will be included in the amounts presented at the next meeting.

» Acceleration of Playground Replacement

Ms. Michael asked about the impacts of accelerating the playground replacement on the budget. Mr. Greeson replied that when developing the proposed Capital Improvements Program, the staff attempted to balance a number of interests, included the priorities indicated by City Council to advance the Parks Master Plan, so the proposed CIP includes a number of additional park improvements efforts. That includes an increase in the number of playgrounds replaced, advancing from an every other year cycle to four over the five year period. So when the questions was posed as to whether any of the playgrounds in the plan can be moved up but not incur any additional debt, it would be at the expense of other programmatic areas or investments. After reviewing the ideas that were developed, staff came to the conclusion that it wouldn’t recommend a change particularly in light of the fact that there are more replacements in this five year period than in the past.

Ms. Michael asked City Council if they supported any of the five options suggested by staff. Mr. Myers commented he is supportive of the proposed CIP because he wants to wait for the Parks Master Plan and he wants to consider our replacement of playgrounds. He mentioned Delaware’s Slate Hollow which is a natural playground with a creek, makeshift wooden structures, a lean-to, and an embankment. East Granville Road Park is a place in Worthington where we might be able to do something similar. It gets kids out in a more natural environment and it is less expensive than our traditional approach to playgrounds. Given no additional comments, Ms. Michael asked City Council if it was the consensus to leave the CIP and its playground schedule as it was proposed. City Council concurred.

» Funding for a Strategic or More Comprehensive Planning Process

Ms. Michael said the City Council has had discussions about placing money aside to pursue strategic planning and comprehensive planning. Mr. Greeson indicated he is suggesting the funding be identified through a supplemental appropriation after the City Council retreat after there is more discussion regarding the scope and approach. City Council concurred with the suggested approach.

» Opioid Addiction Programs, Strategies & Actions

Mr. Greeson indicated Ethan Barnhardt has cataloged the efforts that have occurred by the City and its partners to try to address the culture of drug, alcohol and tobacco consumption in our community. He indicated he is suggesting additional work with Drug Safe Worthington as part of their planning efforts that are occurring and will occur after the first of the year to identify the manner in which the City can most effectively partner and work in this area.
Mr. Norstrom commented that he and Mr. Greeson have talked and Mr. Greeson thinks the City could come up with $100,000 in this area if needed. Mr. Greeson added that whether it is strategic planning or this, which are potentially one-time issues, the City would have to use the unappropriated fund balance. He would typically only suggest using unappropriated fund balance for one-time expenses. Mr. Norstrom stated that City Council could put efforts into video or other media that could be put in every household so they have information about how bad the situation is and what can be done about it.

- Health Insurance for City Employees

Mr. Greeson stated that staff was requested to provide information about the cost of health insurance and the employee’s share of the cost. The information was included in the memorandum. Mr. Troper commented that he requested the information and thanked staff for it. Since health insurance is such a big part of the City’s budget, he thinks this information shouldn’t need to be requested; it should be provided each year. It is going up 14% this year and it’s projected to go up five percent in the next two years. There is a projected deficit in 2019 and he thinks health insurance costs will go up more than five percent. Mr. Troper thinks City employees should pay more for their health insurance. When the costs go up in the private sector, employees are asked to pay more. The City’s providing a 2.5% raise to employees and he thinks they should share a greater burden of the health care costs. Ms. Michael asked the amount he thinks employees should pay. Mr. Troper replied what he thinks doesn’t matter unless three other Council members think the same. Ms. Dorothy commented that this issue is something the City should look at. City employees have received a memo that includes information about everything the City provides, so the information is available.

Mr. Foust stated that this is an instance where he thinks he is an expert as he has spent four decades operating in the human resource arena and specifically benefits. The City has a very good situation and arrangement now. Mr. Foust stated that the State Employment Relations Board has just posted the 2017 report which includes about 350 cities that report what their employees pay. The average is right around 10 to 11 percent. You can also see the information for counties, villages and townships. As for the 2.5% increase, that is barely or not quite CPI. He doesn’t think it should be viewed as any kind of windfall or related to how much they ought to pay for health insurance. Mr. Troper asked for Mr. Foust’s comments on the private sector. Mr. Foust replied that he is looking at the public sector since that is the sector in which the City exists. Mr. Greeson commented that based on previous conversations with City Council on this topic, the City has started open enrollment for insurance and as part of that process has communicated the cost to employees. He acknowledged that nothing is final until City Council officially adopts the budget.

Mr. Myers stated that people shouldn’t forget the steps the City has taken to control costs. The City engaged a consultant to look at options and the costs of each two or three years ago. Mr. Greeson said the City recently asked Wells Fargo to review the costs given the City’s claims experience and the costs the City is incurring though the consortium as compared to what the City would experience if it were self-insured or if it went into the private market. The City will conduct another review later this upcoming year as the three-year trust cycle with the consortium concludes. The City will implement a number of efforts to enhance employee wellness and control expenses. Mr. Myers commented that the entire workforce is on a high
deductible plan and the City no longer bargains health insurance with the bargaining units. Mr. Greeson confirmed those statements.

Mr. Foust stated he ran the numbers of the difference between the 10% and the 12% that employees pay depending on whether they participate in the wellness program. The difference equates to about $500 per year. Based on what he knows from his work, $600 is probably right about where you want to be with a wellness incentive. So the City’s right in line, but could increase it a bit. He is very comfortable with what he sees.

Ms. Dorothy offered comments related to the opioid conversation from earlier in the meeting. She suggested the Worthington Resource Pantry might be a good partner and location to tie into those conversations and efforts.

Ms. Michael summarized the discussion that the only change to the proposed Operating Budget and Capital Improvements Program is the $5,000 for trees.

- Funding for Community Groups

Mr. Greeson asked for any changes for the community groups. Mr. Norstrom stated that as in past years, he suggests reducing the funding for the Convention and Visitors Bureau. Based on what was said last year, they have been primarily using funds to keep an individual working rather than pursuing promotional activities. The Partnership, working with the CVB, dramatically changed the website and made it much more effective. The Partnership worked with the MAC (McConnell Arts Center) and the CVB to change things. He thinks the City is over-funding the CVB and the funds would be put to better use with the Partnership.

Mr. Myers asked if Mr. Greeson wanted comments on the request for additional financial support by the Partnership. Mr. Greeson stated he would like the comments today if City Council has them. At this point, the Proposed Budget does not accommodate that request. Mr. Myers stated that at this time, he doesn’t support the additional request. Mr. Norstrom suggested charging the Chamber of Commerce for Market Day if the City’s going to continue to charge the Partnership. Mr. Myers replied that he stands where he is.

Mr. Troper asked the amount of the additional request. Mr. Greeson replied it is a little over $6,000. Mr. Troper stated he is in favor of providing the additional support. Ms. Michael commented she is concerned about the precedent of not charging. Mr. Foust expressed the same concern and stated he struggles a bit with the Partnership at this point because the City is using public funds to support a small subset of Worthington businesses not the entire business community. A thriving downtown is key to who we are as a city, but he is not in favor of increasing the funding and if anything, he would like to see it go the other way over time.

Mr. Norstrom commented that Mr. Greeson added new information tonight and asked whether Council approved this. Mr. Greeson stated it is his understanding that City Council had a robust conversation, which pre-dated his time with the City, about how to approach whether to charge for events and the decision was made to charge all new events on a going forward basis and events that were already receiving City support were grandfathered. Some of the grandfathered events either changed and require less support or no longer exist. The most substantial of those
events that still exists is Market Day. As a result, for many years the City has provided Police, Fire and Service Department support to that event. Any new events are charged for the cost of what is primarily overtime for City employees. Examples of events that are charged are the OSU Tri-Fit, Swiminc’s Triathlon, and the Gary Smith Classic. Mr. Norstrom stated he thinks the situation should be re-visited and the Chamber should be charged. The Partnership is new, young, and dynamic and they are penalized and it makes a major difference in their income. Mr. Myers replied he doesn’t think they are penalized; they are given $50,000 from the City. Mr. Norstrom stated and the City takes $6,000 or $7,000 back. Mr. Myers replied that is the case if they choose to do that event.

Ms. Michael asked for a motion regarding the funding so that staff has direction on how to bring back the amounts for the public hearing on the budget.

**MOTION**

Mr. Myers moved that the City deny the additional funding for the Old Worthington Partnership. The motion was seconded by Mr. Foust.

There being no additional comments, the motion carried by a 5-2 voice vote, with Mr. Norstrom and Mr. Troper voting against the motion.

**REPORTS OF COUNCIL MEMBERS**

Ms. Dorothy reported on her attendance at the National League of Cities’ City Summit along with Ms. Michael. She sent out emails about information she gathered and would like to discuss it later in the year next year.

Mr. Troper commented he would not be able to attend the next Council Meeting because he will be visiting his mother and brother in Israel.

Ms. Michael asked for consensus from City Council to send a letter to Congress about the tax reform bill and the removal of the state and local government deduction. Mr. Norstrom commented he thinks Ms. Michael can write it as President of Council. Ms. Michael replied that she wants to make sure Council doesn’t have any concerns. Mr. Myers asked about the status of the bill. Ms. Michael replied it has passed the House, but the Senate version has not been passed yet. Mr. Myers stated then it will go to conference and will be around for a while so he is supportive of the letter.

Ms. Michael asked City Council members and City Council members elect to reply to the Doodle poll that was sent out seeking availability for the City Council Retreat.

Mr. Greeson and Mr. Hurley reminded City Council of the tree lighting on Sunday following the Open House. Mr. Greeson stated they put a memorandum on the airport at their places. Mr. Greeson also reported that the law suit on the tax issue was filed.

**EXECUTIVE SESSION**

**MOTION**

Mr. Foust made a motion to meet in Executive Session to discuss Appointments to Boards and Commissions and Appointment and Compensation of Personnel. The motion was seconded by Mr. Norstrom.
The motion carried by the following voice vote:

    Yes  7   Dorothy, Smith, Myers, Troper, Foust, Norstrom, and Michael
    No    0

Council recessed at 9:56 p.m. from the Regular meeting session.

MOTION       Mr. Troper made a motion to return to open session at 10:16 p.m. The
              motion was seconded by Mr. Myers.

The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

MOTION       Mr. Norstrom made a motion to recommend the appointment of Kathy
              Holcombe and Matt Greeson to the Community Improvement Corporation
              Board. The motion was seconded by Mr. Myers.

The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION       Mr. Myers made a motion to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Ms.
              Dorothy.

The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

President Michael declared the meeting adjourned at 10:17 p.m.

_/s/ D. Kay Thress_________________
Clerk of Council

APPROVED by the City Council, this
4th day of December, 2017.

_/s/ Bonnie D. Michael________
Council President