

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

April 14, 2011

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair, James Sauer, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann (arrived at 7:33 p.m.); Mikel Coulter, Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present was Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission. Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission, and Melissa Cohan, paralegal, were absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of minutes of the meeting of March 24, 2011

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes and Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. All members voted “aye”. Mr. Hunter said they have been approved.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses.

B. Architectural Review Board

1. Unfinished

- a. Addition, Garage Remodel, Siding & Windows – **784 Evening St.** (Tedrick Architects/
Kristopher & Heidi Anderson) **AR 18-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar said material samples and window details were requested at the last meeting and have been brought by the applicant this evening. Also, information about the tree near the proposed drive and the fence were requested. Finally, renderings were submitted that day, which show a stone water table at the rear of the house and solar thermal panels on the roof. Mr. Hunter asked for the applicant. Mr. Greg Delong, 552 Evening St., and Mr. & Mrs. Anderson, 784 Evening St. approached the microphone. The applicants explained the materials and spoke about the use of grass pavers for the drive to help protect the tree. Details of the windows, stone water course and other design details were discussed. Also, the applicant said the second floor railing would be wood.

Next, the fence was discussed, with the homeowner stating a preference to add material to the outside of the columns only. ARB members felt wood slats should also be added, because structural members on the outside are not approved in the district. Mr. Hunter asked for comments from the audience.

Findings of fact:

1. This house was built in 1949, and the style is of Colonial Revival influence.
2. The project involves the addition of a front porch; a two-story rear addition with second floor deck; garage renovation; and new siding and windows. Also, approval of a recently replaced fence is requested.
3. The proposed front porch is 10'8" wide x 6'2" deep, and is covered with a copper standing seam metal roof. The porch roof is supported by round columns.
4. To the rear, an addition extending a total of 24' from the existing house is proposed. On the first floor, 18'4" will be enclosed as living space. On the second floor, approximately 9' will be enclosed living space and 13'4" will house a "green" rooftop deck. The deck continues along the north side of the house. TimberTech decking with a railing are proposed. Due to the proximity to the south property line (closer than 20' to right-of-way (alley) on a corner lot), a side yard setback variance will be needed.
5. The roof of the addition will continue the rear gable to the east, and then drop down to the deck area. The deck will connect to the roof of the garage, creating a breezeway between the garage and addition. Also, the garage will be reconfigured to have the entrance on the east rather than south side. A circular drive is proposed to improve maneuverability. A City Council variance to allow two drive entrances may be necessary.
6. New siding and windows are proposed for the entire house and garage. The siding will be 7" Hardiplank lap siding. The roof shingles will match the existing.
7. Stone veneer is proposed for the existing chimneys and for a water table treatment on the south side and rear of the house. Also, copper chimney caps are proposed.
8. Several sections of solid fencing were installed to replace existing fencing around a patio. The supporting members are currently facing out from the property.

Conclusions:

1. The proposed front entry is appropriate for the house.
2. The addition to the rear is appropriate in design, massing and materials.
3. Reconfiguration of the garage is appropriate; the new circular drive should be low impact for the existing tree in that area because of the use of grass pavers.

4. Stone facing and copper caps for the chimneys will complement the existing house.
5. The replacement fencing must be altered to look finished on the outside.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY TEDRICK ARCHITECTS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MAKE RENOVATIONS AT 784 EVENING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 18-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 18-11, DATED FEBRUARY 25 & APRIL 14, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE DRAWINGS AND FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING, WITH THE FOLLOWING AMENDMENTS:

1. Stone added to south and east elevations as shown in new drawings
2. Second floor rail be wood
3. The fence must be finished on the outside with vertical members so horizontal members do not show

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll and all members voted aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

2. New

- a. Fence – **115 & 117 W. New England Ave.** (Jodi Marsh) **AR 25-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar only a small portion of the proposed fencing is on the property at 117, it is a 6' solid section between the garages. The majority of the project is 4' high open style picket fencing on 115, and the majority is replacement fencing. Mr. Hunter asked for the applicant. Mr. John Marsh, 115 W. New England Ave. added the 6' fence is to screen the trash cans. Mr. McCallister of 117 W. New England Ave. was also present. Mr. Sauer asked if the wood will be left natural in color and the applicant replied yes. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that would like to speak either for or against this application, and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is proposing replacement of wood picket fencing at 115 W. New England Ave., and an area between the garages at 115 & 117 W. New England Ave.
2. The fencing will be 4' in height with 3" dog-eared pickets and 3" spacing between pickets. Per Code requirements the supporting members must face into the applicant's property. A gate will be replaced toward the front of the house, and a new fence and gate are proposed between the house and garage. Along the east property line, some fencing will be replaced and a section will be added.

3. Between the garages at 115 & 117 W. New England Ave., a 6' high solid fence is proposed to replace the existing 4' high picket fence. The fence will act as a screen for trash cans, etc.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed fencing is appropriate for these properties and in the District.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JODI MARSH FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL FENCING AT 115 & 117 W. NEW ENGLAND AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 25-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 25-11, DATED MARCH 30, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll: Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers; aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- b. New Sign Faces – **1000 N. High St.** (Anthony Lordo) **AR 26-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar said the new sign faces meet Code requirements and will be externally illuminated. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. David Mayer, 7282 Innisfree Lane, Dublin, and Dr. Anthony Lordo, 134 Aldrich Rd., Columbus approached the microphone. Mr. Hunter said they do not usually see “New Patients Welcome” on permanent signs. Dr. Lordo said throughout his entire career he has welcomed new patient. Mr. Hermann said the repairs to the site look great. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that was either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Replacement of the sign faces on the existing freestanding sign is proposed.
2. Alupalite panels are proposed with a white background, black and burgundy vinyl letting, and a gold logo. There is also a gold box around one line of text
3. The text includes the names of Dr. Pardi and Dr. Lordo, and the phrases “Keep Smiling!” and “New Patients Welcome”.
4. There is only external illumination for this sign. The lights shine up from the pole.

Conclusion:

1. The design is clear and appropriate for the building.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ANTHONY LORDO FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE THE SIGN FACES AT 1000 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 26-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 26-11, DATED MARCH 30, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll: Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers; aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. Parking Lot Signs – **137 E. Granville Rd.** (Sharon Memorial Hall) **AR 27-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar presented the various signs proposed for the site: parking, grass and pets. She said the signs could not say anything about towing without including all of the requirements for towing signs. All will need to have a variance for height greater than 3'. The no parking on grass signs site an ordinance that cannot be enforced for this existing non-conforming property. Mr. Hunter asked the applicant's name and address for the record. Dr. Cal Taylor stated his address is 702 Morning St. and he is President of the Sharon Memorial Board. He stated the need for dedicated parking for tenants of Sharon Memorial Hall, stating the Legion and others use the property for parking. He also talked about the parking on the grass and pets roaming free without leashes, without anyone to clean up after them. Mr. Hunter said he felt signs for pets are not effective.

Mr. Hunter said the signs in the application do not meet Code requirements regarding towing and enforcement. Dr. Taylor said he would remove the towing language from the parking signs and Board members talked about the resultant design. Dr. Taylor showed samples of the proposed signs. Mr. Sauer asked about the post, preferring a non-galvanized, non-perforated post. He also asked if all signage could be the same color. He did not feel the grass and pet signs are appropriate for this location.

Mrs. Holcombe suggested landscaping rather than signage to preclude parking on the grass. Dr. Taylor agreed to that.

Mr. Hunter asked for comments from the audience. Mr. Tom Eshelman, Commander of the American Legion Post, said there was never a problem with parking until this year. He said he does not feel the sign appropriately says "Veterans Memorial" and Mr. Hunter said it is a veteran's memorial. He also asked the application be tabled for 60 days because he did not feel the issue was properly handled by the Sharon Memorial Board. Dr. Taylor said the Board's by-laws adopted in 2009 says the president shall ensure any real property of the Board is maintained. Mr. Hunter stated he appreciates both positions, but the ARB is charged with approving the signage only. He did not feel tabling would help.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant would like to add directional signage to the property to assure enough parking spaces for the tenants of Sharon Memorial Hall.
2. Proposed are 4 burgundy and beige 18" x 18" signs with a curved top to delineate the parking spaces for Sharon Memorial Hall. The towing language will be removed from the signs.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed signs are appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY THE SHARON MEMORIAL HALL FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL DIRECTIONAL SIGNS AT 137 E. GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 27-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 27-11, DATED MARCH 31, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING AMENDMENTS:

1. The grass and pet signs are not approved
2. Parking signs will have towing language approved
3. Posts must be metal (round or square), not perforated, and must be the same color as the signs

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll: Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers; aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

d. Garage – **59 W. New England Ave.** (Gary & Kathy Moore) **AR 28-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and showed pictures of the site. She said variances for setback and accessory structure area will be necessary. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Adam Moore, 403 Hickory Lane, Westerville, approached the microphone and added the windows on the south side are fixed and not divided light. Mr. Hunter asked if there was any plumbing and electrical and the applicant said no. He also addressed the need for variances answering a question by Mr. Sauer.

Mr. Hunter asked if anyone present wanted to speak for or against this application. Mr. Volzer of 126 W. Dublin-Granville Rd. spoke in support because he wants to building a structure like it.

Findings of fact:

1. This proposal involves demolishing the existing one-car garage that is in poor repair, and replacing it with a new two-car garage.

2. The proposed garage is 22' x 28' and will include a second floor 334 sf storage area. With total area being 950 sf, a variance is needed from the Board of Zoning Appeals for accessory structure area in excess of 850 sf. Also, side and rear setback variances are needed to place the garage 6' from the side and rear property lines.
3. The garage was designed to match the existing house in style and materials. Dormers project from the east and west sides of the roof gable to form the 2nd floor space.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed garage is appropriate at this location.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY GARY & KATHY MOORE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A NEW GARAGE AT 59 W. NEW ENGLAND AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 28-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 28-11, DATED APRIL 1, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll: Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers; aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

e. **New Sign Faces – 54 W. Wilson Bridge Rd. (Morrison Sign Company/Telhio) AR 24-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and showed pictures of the existing sign faces already in place by way of a Temporary Use Permit. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present and Ms. Karen Daniels, 6160 Apache Way, Grove City approached the microphone. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Telhio has changed its logo and would like approval to display the new logo at its current location until the credit union moves into the new location to be constructed in front of the Holiday Inn at 7007 N. High St. The move will probably take place before the end of the year.
2. Proposed are polymetal panels w/ digitally printed graphics, which will not be illuminated. The colors are black, gray, and white.

3. A Temporary Use Permit was issued to allow placement of the new sign faces before the ARB hearing date.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed sign faces are appropriate for this location.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY MORRISON SIGN CO. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL NEW SIGN FACES AT 54 W. WILSON BRIDGE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 24-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 24-11, DATED MARCH 29, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll: Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers; aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- f. Landscape & Signage – **7007 N. High St.** (Telhio Credit Union) **AR 29-11** (Amendment to AR 14-11)

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar introduced the amendment to the previous approval. A discussion was held regarding native plants versus sustainable plantings. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Bill Bily, 5181 Natorp Blvd., Suite 110, Mason OH said the plants were chosen because of low maintenance and there will be irrigation around the building.

Mr. Hermann recommended an evergreen hedge at the perimeter of the parking lot to screen the cars, including headlights. He feels this is a gateway area of the City. Other Board members disagreed with that landscape treatment at this site because of elevation, security and visibility.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The ARB approved construction of a new Telhio Credit Union building at its February 24, 2011 meeting. The approval was conditioned on the applicant submitting further information about signage and landscaping, which is the subject of the current application.
2. The proposed building sign consists of halo illuminated black and gray letters and logo, mounted on the front of the building on a cast stone panel. The freestanding sign consists of

the same letters and logo on a cast stone background, and includes a base constructed of brick to match the building. Both drawings show daytime and nighttime views of the signs.

3. A landscaping plan has been submitted. Existing and new tree islands will combine to meet the parking lot landscaping requirement. The plan includes shrubs and perennials at the entry, sign, and around the building.

Conclusions:

1. The signage is complementary to the building and location.
2. The landscaping plan is appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY TELHIO CREDIT UNION FOR APPROVAL TO AMEND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS NO. AR 14-11 BY ADDING NEW SIGNAGE AND LANDSCAPE PLANS FOR THE BUILDING PROJECT AT 7007 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 29-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 29-11, DATED MARCH 28, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll: Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, nay; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers; aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Amendment to Development Plan

- a. **New Sign Faces – 350 – 500 W. Wilson Bridge Rd. (Paradigm Properties/Officescape) ADP 01-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the sign new sign faces, including the need for a variance to have more than 3 business listings. The tenant names will all be the same font, size and color. Mr. Hunter asked for the applicant and Mrs. Lynda Gildea of Paradigm Properties came forward. A brief discussion about the design followed.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was any one present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Paradigm Properties would like to install new faces on the existing Officescape signs in order to allow several tenants in each building the opportunity to have their names along W. Wilson Bridge Rd.
2. Black panels with white lettering are proposed for both sides of the two signs, which are located at the two entrances for Officescape. One sign will identify 350 and 400 W. Wilson Bridge Rd., and the other 450 and 500 W. Wilson Bridge Rd.
3. The proposed faces would provide room for a potential of 6 tenant names (3 per side for each address), resulting in 6 tenant names on each side of the sign. Code allows only 3 tenants listed on freestanding signs, so a variance would be necessary. City Council may grant variances with the approval of the amendment.
4. Text size for the address is 5 ¾” and for the tenant names is 3”. The part of the signs with text is 30 sf in area per side.

Conclusion:

1. The text on these signs may be smaller than is easily readable.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY PARADIGM PROPERTIES FOR APPROVAL OF AN AMENDMENT TO DEVELOPMENT PLAN TO INSTALL NEW SIGN FACES AT 350 – 500 W. WILSON BRIDGE RD. AS PER CASE NO. ADP 01-11, DRAWINGS NO. ADP 01-11, DATED MARCH 28, 2011, BE RECOMMENDED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll: Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye. Approval will be recommended to City Council.

D. Other

Brief discussion of plant materials and Code requirements for parking lot landscaping was held.

E. Adjournment

9:19 p.m.