

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

December 9, 2010

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann; Mikel Coulter, and Jo Rodgers. Also present were Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission, and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Absent were Amy Lloyd, from the Architectural Review Board, and Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of Minutes for the meetings of January 14, 2010; April 22, 2010; October 28, 2010; and November 11, 2010.

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the Minutes for the January 14, and the April 22, 2010 meetings, and Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. All members said aye. Mr. Hermann moved to approve the Minutes for the October 28, and November 11, 2010 meetings, and Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. All members said aye.

4. Affirmation/Swearing in of Witnesses

Mrs. Bitar swore in those who planned to speak.

B. Architectural Review Board

1. Unfinished

- a. Addition Details – **692 High St.** (WJI Enterprises Ltd./Worthington Jewelers) **AR 77-10**
(Amendment to AR 71-10)

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application and that the applicant will be presenting the newest plans that show more detail of how the building will look when it is completed. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Joe Davis approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 127 E. Wilson Bridge Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Davis said that he has taken into consideration all of the details that the Board has recommended, and presented the new

images on the overhead projector. Mr. Sauer stated the survey implies that the stairs of the house next door (to the east) are over the northern property line. Mrs. Bitar said yes, the stairs are over the property line, and an easement will need to be granted by City Council. Mr. Sauer asked Mr. Davis if the footprint has gotten bigger. Mr. Davis said that yes, the footprint has gotten bigger in order to accommodate all of the Boards suggestions.

Mr. Hunter asked Mr. Davis if he had any more details concerning the entry way to the building, and Mr. Davis said no, not just yet. Mr. Davis said that he is still doing some research as to what the best options are, because his store will be limited to one entrance for security reasons.

Mr. Sauer asked Mr. Davis if the front door could be recessed, to keep pedestrians from slamming into the doors as they swing outward. Mr. Hunter said that he would like to see the arched entry way stay in tact in its original design. Mr. Sauer said that he didn't want to Mr. Davis get rid of the door, but asked if a metal gate could be used. Mr. Coulter said that a metal gate would just add difficulty to the maintenance of the building. Leaves and trash would get stuck inside the gate and create a mess. Mr. Coulter told Mr. Davis he appreciated the details and wished that they could have been this far in the presentation of the details about a month ago.

Mr. Coulter also said that he liked the subtle signage, and the entry way on High Street.

Mr. Sauer said he would like to see some kind of safety measures taken so that the doors that swing open are not slammed into the pedestrians as they walk by, and he also did not like the pagoda on top of the building.

Mrs. Holcombe said that she likes the pagoda on top of the building, the windows, and was happy to see more wood being used.

Mr. Hermann said that he agrees with Mr. Sauer about the recessed door idea.

Mr. Sauer asked how water will be handled. Mr. Davis said that they plan to use concealed downspouts, and at that time introduced one of the architects helping him with his project. Mr. Peter Macrae, AIA, approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 74 Orchard Drive, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Macrae explained the details concerning concealed downspouts.

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Davis if he still plans to have a back door for the garden, and Mr. Davis responded yes.

Mr. Hunter asked the audience if there was anyone present that would like to speak either for or against this application. Mr. Brett Holland approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 243 Franklin Avenue, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Holland stated that any distance Mr. Davis recesses the door, will result in a loss of square footage. Mr. Holland advised the Board to take a look at the entrance ways of Greater's Ice Cream, and the Old Bag of Nails, which currently have similar entrance ways. Mr. Holland hoped the Board approves the plans for Mr. Davis, because he thinks they are just phenomenal. There were no other speakers

Mr. Hunter said that he likes the way the doors are now. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Davis if he plans to use LED lighting, and Mr. Davis said yes. Mr. Davis said that he plans to use more incandescent lighting because it's warmer, and jewelry looks better with that type of lighting.

Mr. Hermann asked if the sidewalk is four feet wide, and Mr. Davis said yes.

Findings of fact:

1. An addition is proposed for the north side of the Worthington Jewelers building. The new structure is designed as a conservatory that allows a view of the existing north side of the building, as well as into the new retail space which will include plant material. The addition will add much needed retail space, as well as a handicap access for the jewelry store. The existing Worthington Jewelers front façade will remain unchanged.
2. Architectural lighting is proposed at the front columns and corners of the addition. Internally illuminated signs with a gold metal background and clear letters are proposed for the west and north faces.
3. The exterior space around has been designed with landscape and hardscape elements to complement the existing and new structures, and the business. A bridal garden is proposed between the addition and existing rear structure.

Conclusions:

1. The proposed will be an attractive and interesting new element in Old Worthington..
2. The proposed outdoor space will be an enhancement to Old Worthington.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY WJI ENTERPRISES FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT AN ADDITION AT 692 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 77-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 77-10, DATED DECEMBER 3, 2010, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the role. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, nay; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

b. Addition & Renovation – 849 Oxford St. (Terry Boling) AR 84-10

Mrs. Bitar said that the applicant would like to table the application. Mr. Coulter moved to table the application. Mr. Sauer seconded the motion and all members voted aye thereon. Mr. Hunter said it has been tabled.

2. New

a. Signage – 5617 N. High St. (Kelma LLC) AR 86-10

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Timothy Hotz, AIA, approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 1821 Wagner Rd., Butler, Ohio 44822. Mr. Hotz said that size of sign is roughly the same; it will just be turned on its side. The name of the center will be put on the top, and it will be double sided, as to be seen by both north and southbound traffic. Mrs. Bitar mentioned that a variance will be needed to add the fourth tenant to the sign. Mr. Joel Mazza approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 155 W. Southington, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Mazza explained that the fourth tenant will be located downstairs. The steps leading to the location will be in the front of the building. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant will need to go to the Board of Zoning Appeals for variances, and Mrs. Bitar said yes. Mr. Hermann said that the proposed sign looks better. Mr. Hunter asked the audience if there was anyone present that was either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A new sign box and pole cover are proposed for the existing pole at this site. The Vet Clinic and three other tenants are planned for this location.
2. The proposed sign box is 8'4" high by 6'4" wide for total area of 53 square feet per side. The overall height is 15'.
3. The name of the center and 4 tenant names are proposed for the internally illuminated sign box, which will have an opaque white background with bronze letters.
4. Variances will be needed for this sign's location, size, and listing 4 tenants instead of 3.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes will improve the existing sign.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY KELMA LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL SIGNAGE AT 5617 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 86-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 86-10, DATED NOVEMBER 2, 2010, BE APPROVED ON THE CONDITION THAT THE SIGNS BACKGROUND WILL NOT BE LIT UP BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the role. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

b. Signage – **650 & 652 High St. (DeRoberts Family Partnership) AR 87-10**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Paul Lyda approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 4740 Cascade Dr., Powell, Ohio 43065. Mr. Lyda showed the photograph of his sign on the overhead projector. The name of the restaurant and the olive branch underneath the name are both part of the restaurant's logo. It has a tan background with olive green lettering. Mrs. Bitar said that the other store already has their sign up. Mr. Sauer said that he liked the sign for Little Tree Studios. The business owner apologized for not getting the Board's approval first. Mrs. Holcombe also thought that the sign looked very nice. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that was either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This application represents the sign requests for 2 businesses: Little Tree Studio's sign is already in place; a sign is proposed for Trio Mediterranean Grill.
2. Both signs are designed in basically the same manner as the rest of the center, with logos and business names. The sizes and colors are meant to complement the existing building and storefront.

Conclusion:

1. Both signs are appropriate for this building.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY THE DEROBERTS FAMILY PARTNERSHIP FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR NEW SIGNAGE AT 650 & 652 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 87-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 87-10, DATED NOVEMBER 24, 2010, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the role. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. Shed – **232 E. Granville Rd. (Colleen McCotter) AR 88-10**

Mrs. Bitar said the applicant asked to table the application. Mr. Hermann moved to table the application. Mr. Sauer seconded the motion and all members voted aye thereon. Mr. Hunter said it has been tabled.

- d. New Deck, Window & Door Alterations – **48 E. New England Ave.** (Robert Bloomer)
AR 89-10

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Robert Bloomer approached the microphone and said he owns the house at 48 E. New England Avenue, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Bloomer said he is converting the house back to a single family home. The Board viewed the photographs of the house on the monitors. Mr. Sauer asked Mr. Bloomer if the door on the east side will remain, and Mr. Bloomer said yes. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone that would like to speak either for or against the application, and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is planning to convert this structure back to a single-family home. The work includes: replacing a rear window (already removed) with a sliding glass door; adding a 12' x 8' porch to the rear of the house; installing the removed window on the east side of the house; removing a door on the west side of the house; and replacing the door on the east side of the house with an octagonal window.
2. The work on the doors and windows will include patching any new holes with siding to match the existing.
3. The rear porch will have a white painted rail and composite decking for the floor.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY THE ROBERT BLOOMER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MAKE ALTERATIONS TO THE HOUSE AT 48 E. NEW ENGLAND AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 89-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 89-10, DATED NOVEMBER 24, 2010, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the role. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- e. Addition and New Garage – **115 W. New England Ave.** (Steve Copeland/Marsh & Utterback) **AR 90-10**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Steve Copeland approached the microphone and stated that his office address is 1515 W. Lane Ave., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Sauer asked Mrs. Bitar if the applicant had to be at least three feet away from the side property line. Mrs. Bitar said yes, and mentioned the Board of Zoning Appeals typically does not allow a setback variance closer than three feet from the property line. Mr. Hermann said that he is not worried about the variances unless the neighbors are. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was combining the parcels at this time, and Mrs. Bitar said no. The applicant said there is a major power line that runs through the middle of the two properties, and that is one of the reasons they are not interested in combining the parcels at this time.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that was either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The homeowners wish to construct a small mudroom addition to the rear portion of the house on the west side. The addition will match the existing house in style and materials, and is designed with a porch area that will allow existing bedroom and bathroom windows to remain.
2. Demolition of the existing garage and construction of a new two-car garage are proposed. The new garage will be larger and set back further than the existing. Variances for location in the side and rear setbacks will be necessary.
3. The garage is designed with a gable to match the rear addition on the house, and will make use of the same materials and detailing as the house. The door is proposed to be offset from center to facilitate access and storage.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed addition and garage are appropriate for this home and in the neighborhood.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY THE STEVEN COPELAND FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT AN ADDITION AND NEW GARAGE AT 115 W. NEW ENGLAND AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 90-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 90-10, DATED NOVEMBER 24, 2010, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT

THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the role. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

f. Signage – **33 E. North St.** (Medsave Clinic) **AR 91-10**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar said the applicant would like to add a wall sign to the building, and reface the existing freestanding sign. Two versions of the wall sign have been presented. The sign box version would need an opaque background. The drawing presented for the freestanding sign is difficult to decipher. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Sheereen Jaulim approached the microphone and stated that her business address is 33 E. North St., Worthington, Ohio. Ms. Sheereen stated that she is the Director of the Medsave Clinic that has just moved into the building behind CVS. Mr. Hermann said that he is concerned that the sign facing the parking lot might encourage people to park next to it, and wondered if Medsave Clinic had an agreement with the CVS to use the parking lot. Mr. Hunter stated that there is an island in between the CVS and Medsave Clinic. Mrs. Bitar stated that the Medsave Clinic and CVS property are owned by the same entity. Mr. Sauer asked the applicant if she is applying for one wall sign and one free standing sign, and she said yes.

Mr. Coulter suggested that the sign company make a presentation with the applicant so that the Board can understand exactly what is being proposed. Mr. Hunter agreed, and said that it would be best to table the application for now, and have the sign company present how the sign will conform to the City's Code. Mrs. Rodgers said that she didn't think the stark white sign with glaring red letters fit in the character of the area. Mr. Sauer asked the applicant if her business will occupy both floors of the building and she said yes. Mr. Hermann welcomed the Medsave Clinic to the City of Worthington.

Mr. Coulter moved to table the application. Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion and all members voted aye thereon. Mr. Hunter said it has been tabled

Mr. Coulter moved to adjourn the meeting. Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion and all members voted aye thereon. Mr. Hunter adjourned the meeting at 8:49 p.m.