CALL TO ORDER – Roll Call, Pledge of Allegiance

Worthington City Council met in Regular Session on Monday, November 5, 2018, in the John P. Coleman Council Chambers of the Louis J.R. Goorey Municipal Building, 6550 North High Street, Worthington, Ohio. President Michael called the meeting to order at or about 7:30 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Douglas Foust, Beth Kowalczyk, Scott Myers, David Robinson, Douglas K. Smith, and Bonnie D. Michael, (Rachael R. Dorothy arrived at 7:45 p.m.)

Member(s) Absent:

Also present: City Manager Matt Greeson, Assistant City Manager Robyn Stewart, Director of Law Tom Lindsey, Director of Finance Scott Bartter, Director of Planning & Building Lee Brown, Director of Parks & Recreation Darren Hurley, Chief of Fire John Bailot, Chief of Police Jerry Strait, Clerk of Council D. Kay Thress, Assistant City Clerk Ethan Barnhardt

There were 4 visitors present.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

President Michael invited all to stand and join in reciting the Pledge of Allegiance to the flag.

VISITOR COMMENTS

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

• Regular Meeting – October 15, 2018

MOTION Mr. Robinson moved, Mr. Foust seconded a motion to approve the aforementioned meeting minutes as presented.

There being no additions or corrections, the motion to approve the minutes as presented carried unanimously by a voice vote.
NEW LEGISLATION TO BE INTRODUCED

Resolution No. 60-2018

Approving an Agreement and permit for and between Ohio Power Company, an Ohio Corporation, to Occupy and Use the Right-of-Way for an electric Distribution and Transmission System Within the City of Worthington Pursuant to and Subject to the Provision of Chapter 949 of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Worthington

Introduced by Mr. Smith

MOTION

Mr. Myers made a motion to adopt Resolution No. 60-2018. The motion was seconded by Ms. Kowalczyk.

Mr. Greeson detailed that this is a routine right-of-way agreement and permit renewal for American Electric Power.

There being no additional comments, the motion to adopt Resolution No. 60-2018 passed unanimously by a voice vote.

Ordinance No. 47-2018

Amending ordinance No. 41-2017 (As Amended) to Adjust the Annual Budget by Providing for an Appropriation from the Capital Improvements Fund Unappropriated Balance to Pay the Cost of Curb Improvements at Wilson Bridge Road & the Railroad Crossing for the NE Gateway Intersection Improvement Project and all Related Expenses with said Project. (Project No. 602-14)

Introduced by Mr. Robinson

Ordinance No. 48-2018

Amending Ordinance No. 41-2017 (As Amended) to Adjust the Annual Budget by Providing for an Appropriation from the Accrued Acreage Fund Unappropriated Balance in the Amount of $35,000.

Introduced by Mr. Foust

Ordinance No. 49-2018

Amending Ordinance No. 41-2017 (As Amended) to Adjust the Annual Budget by Providing for an Appropriation from the Capital Improvements Fund Unappropriated Balance to Pay for the Huntley Road Waterline Design as part of the NE Gateway
Intersection Improvement Project and all Related Expenses with said Project. (Project No. 602-14)

**Introduced by Mr. Smith**

**Ordinance No. 50-2018**

Amending Section 151.02 of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Worthington Concerning the Disposition of Records to be Consistent with Section 149.381 of the Ohio Revised Code.

**Introduced by Mr. Myers**

**Ordinance No. 51-2018**

To Amend Section 1123.762 and Section 1147.01 of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Worthington to Amend the Definition of Dog and Cat Day Care Center to Dog and Cat Care Center and Add Dog and Cat Care Center as a Conditional Use in the Neighborhood Commercial (C-1) District, Community Shopping Center (C-2) District and the Restricted Light Industrial (I-1) Zoning District.

**Introduced by Ms. Kowalczyk**

The Clerk was instructed to give notice of a public hearing on said ordinance(s) in accordance with the provisions of the City Charter unless otherwise directed.

**REPORTS OF CITY OFFICIALS**

**Proposed 2019 Budget – Departmental Overview**

Mr. Greeson explained the budget process and how that earlier in the budget season we talked at more of a high level, discussing trends and more recently presenting the five-year forecast. Now we are diving into the operating budget during the November meetings, going department by department.

The operating budget is affected by many things outside of this formal three- or four-month process. As we develop it, we take into consideration Council’s priorities expressed at the retreat and subsequent Council meetings. We take into consideration the adopted plans of the City which are an expression of priorities in a given area, based upon public input processes. Additionally, conversations and thoughts that are received year-round by
advisory boards, residents, and businesses are incorporated into the process. We do all of this mindful that cities do have some core services that continue year after year and must be continually invested in to ensure that we continue to provide exemplary services.

Often times requests exceed available revenues, and this creates the challenge of how we maintain a high level of service in our core areas while meeting new demands or inspirations of the community. In the operating budget we have sought to strike a balance between those things.

At Council’s request, we have highlighted on slides the objectives that tie into discussions had earlier in the year at the Council Retreat. We have added some information on things that are being worked on that may not have budget implications but are priorities that Council should be aware of. Also included are budget objectives as they are stated in the budget document, when the budget is adopted the objectives essentially become staff’s work plan for the year.

Items that are continued to be worked upon that were identified at the last Council Retreat include the top four priorities: Community Visioning and Strategic Planning, the United Methodist Children’s Home Site, Communication, and Sustainability. Age-Friendly/Livable Communities was something Council wanted to learn more about, while not ranked as a top priority, time from staff and the Community Relations Commission has been spent on this.

Additionally, there are other items that were identified as important efforts or issues that are, “On the Plate.” These are things that were being worked on or that were facing the City. They are issues of importance that will be highlighted.
The Mayor’s Court has no notable changes in the management discussion. The 2019 objectives include implementing new ways of accepting payments and implementing new case management software.

The Legislative, Clerk Administration, and Personnel budgets really have no notable budgetary changes. Economic Development is funded both in the General Fund and the Economic Development Fund. In the General Fund there are no notable changes. There are transfers from the General Fund to the Economic Development fund annually. If those funds are not fully spent, the balance in the fund carries over. We anticipate transferring less this year from the General Fund to the Economic Development Fund.

Mr. Robinson asked for clarification if all funds for the Economic Development Fund come from the General Fund. Mr. Greeson said that is correct, it is non-tax revenues. Mr. Bartter added that the repayment of ReCAP is the only other revenue other than the transfer from the General Fund.

In the Legislative and Clerk Department, the most important thing not included in the budget but listed is Community Visioning and Strategic Planning. We have recently enlisted a consultant to attempt to help frame that in relationship to the UMCH debate. We do not have funds allocated in the 2019 Operating Budget, but we may request an appropriation before the end of the year or seek to amend the 2019 operating budget. We want to further refine the scope and goals of that project before finalizing numbers.
Included in this portion of the budget are many of the areas where the staff are supporting the goals of the whole organization. Included are many of Council’s priorities including things such as Electric Aggregation, evaluation of the School Resource Officer, and redevelopment issues. In Personnel there are some policy and process improvement efforts that are underway.

Mr. Smith explained that Lean/Six Sigma was discussed last year, and he wondered if that reflected in this year’s budget as well or if it was not being done this year. Mr. Greeson replied that no one is currently scheduled, and specific funds have not been included. He shared that we do have two Lean/Six Sigma Black Belts on staff. There has been some discussion about spending some resources to bring in Lean consulting to review specific processes.

Mr. Myers asked if we currently have the ability to accept online payments for the Mayor’s Court. Mr. Greeson stated that we do not. Mr. Bartter explained that we are beginning to look into online payments for a variety of things. Mr. Myers replied at the state level that is beginning to be the only way to pay now.

Mr. Barter explained that there is an uptick in the consultant line to do a full examination of the Parks and Recreation fees. We will be looking at what our subsidy levels are and bring that information back to Council. We are also looking to convert our budget to a Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR), currently we do Basic Financial Statements. A CAFR is more robust and it would include an audit annually as opposed to biannually. However, this is something that we would be doing anyways as part of expending Federal
funds as part of the Northeast Gateway. It is not actually funded in the Finance Department budget, it is funded under County Auditor expenses. President Michael asked if this is additional funding that is coming from the City to pay for this or if it is offset by funds coming from the Auditor’s office. Mr. Bartter remarked that this is not being offset by funds from the Auditor’s office. It is not an increase, but it is not a reduction. Because in 2018 we had an audit, it would typically go down, instead we are keeping that funding the same. President Michael inquired about the average cost of the audits. Mr. Bartter replied they are between $12,000 to $15,000.

Mr. Bartter reported there being no major changes in the Law Department. The Law Department’s objectives are to continue to provide legal support to both Council and staff.

Mr. Oliver explained how the City engaged in an external IT assessment that was completed in 2017. We have taken action on the assessment and have begun focusing on three broad categories: People, Technology, and Process.

People

Under the people aspect, we have onboarded a new IT Director. The first year has focused on operational improvements and strategic priority development. The 2019 focus will be on sustaining operational excellence and better on strategy execution. We also onboarded a Help Desk Technician who has assisted to increase project capacity for the rest of the IT staff.
Technology

Mr. Oliver highlighted three of the technology improvements being focused on. First, the majority of our infrastructure was eight to ten years old and having service issues that impacted the reliability of systems used by Police and Fire, as well as employee productivity. We replaced most of the network security and storage infrastructure, secured maintenance and support contracts, and implemented server virtualization. These changes have stabilized the environment. We implemented Office 365, initially focused on email. The next steps include improvements to file sharing and collaboration. Lastly, we have improved our back-up and retention schedule while reducing costs.

Process

Regarding process changes, we are looking at becoming a more efficient and effective IT organization. We recently made improvements to project management and priority setting, security, PCI compliance, and the IT service desk.

### Information Technology: 2019 Objectives

- **OPERATIONS & SUPPORT: Operations**—improve service quality, reliability & security
  - Update the disaster recovery/business continuity plan, develop priorities for remediation, and begin implementation of improvements. This is expected to be a multi-year effort.
  - Continue to implement process improvements for managing risk and improving security.
  - Implement service desk system.
  - Implement password reset self-service.

- **STRATEGY: Data**
  - Develop a city-wide and integrated data model.
  - Use this model to develop descriptive (what has happened), predictive (what might happen next), and prescriptive (what should we do to prevent an occurrence) analytics reports.
  - Improve existing data reporting workflows and process.

- **STRATEGY: Employer Attraction and Retention**
  - Develop business models, partnership models, and implementation strategies for the use of fiber and complementary services as a tool for attracting and retaining new employers.

- **OPERATIONS & SUPPORT: Systems**—improve systems used by other departments to deliver city services
  - Coordinate implementation of Telestaff, a scheduling tool used by Police and Fire.
  - Analyze, plan and coordinate implementation of Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) and Records Management System (RMS) replacement as well as other ancillary services requested by Police and Fire Departments.
  - Coordinate implementation of Permitting system.
  - Improve adoption of document management system.

Mr. Oliver detailed how the 2019 budget is flat year after year. There is an approximately $100,000 reduction of phone system costs that is not reflected in this budget. This occurred
due to the adoption of a different technology for call delivery. This process started in October 2017 and took longer than expected due to issues working with the incumbent carrier. The Internet Expense line item increased by approximately $6,000 due to improvements in call delivery and additional internet capacity that primarily benefits the Community Center.

Mr. Oliver explained how his focus is to shift from operational to strategic. There are a couple programs he would like to provide a brief overview for. The overarching goal of data is to provide better data to decision makers. The outcomes for this program are to develop an integrated data model, to assess what data do we have, how can it be integrated and synthesized to help prevent unfavorable outcomes. For employer attraction and retention, how can we leverage technologies such as fiber and access to regional data and cloud resources to build and sustain a competitive workplace. Operations is still important including updating the IT component of the disaster recovery and business continuity plan. Lastly, we want to coordinate improvement to systems used by other departments, including implementation of TeleStaff, changes in dispatch and records management, and the permitting system.

Mr. Robinson explained that the email interface being used currently is dreadful and he wanted to know if that is an Office 365 product. Mr. Oliver replied it was. Mr. Robinson wanted to know how the decision was made to acquire that particular platform and if in the future when such a major decision was being made if there was a way for Council to look at it and comment on it before the decision is made. Mr. Oliver explained that the decision was made because we currently use the Exchange environment which has been in use for many years. We thought it was best to maintain continuity, so essentially, we changed it from being hosted on premises to moving it to the cloud. There are multiple interfaces available with Exchange and there are other ones that may provide better functionality. Mr. Robinson asked how the decision was made and if it was circulated with staff or was it an industry standards-based decision. Mr. Oliver replied that the focus was to maintain the look and feel that staff and users were familiar with, then we looked at the costs and benefits of outsourcing that infrastructure and other capabilities.

Ms. Kowalczyk commented on the references to retention and attracting of employers. She wanted to know if there were any specific examples being investigated regarding this. Mr. Oliver replied that fiber has been deployed as an asset to different companies to reduce their communication costs. Once you can put in fiber, in addition to reducing costs, you can also get access to other data centers and cloud services with greater bandwidth. Ms. Kowalczyk asked if the fiber technology was something we would initiate. Mr. Oliver emphasized that we would be more of a facilitator/business partner instead of putting our own fiber in the ground.
Chief Strait explained that the costs for the Division of Police remain flat other than there have been some shortages which have led us to look for some new personnel. We have expended a lot of money into backgrounds. One item that was on the retreat agenda was job transition and that is currently what the Division of Police has been trying to overcome in 2018 and will continue into 2019. It takes an average of nine months for a new officer to be trained.

We spend quite a bit of time and money to get to that point in backgrounds and polygraphs, so we did add some funding to our Administrative Support line in anticipation of new officers in transition. Part of that is uniform allowance as well as items that are included in the collective bargaining agreement. Because of aging equipment, we have been working with IT and the Division of Fire to come up with a new solution. We are also in the midst of looking at consolidation again. This is not just a Worthington issue, it is a broader issue with CAD/RMS entities being bought up.

Objectives in 2019 include maintaining communications staffing through full time and part time positions during the consolidation examination and implementation. We are also looking at integration with our Lexipol so that we get both our policies and procedures updated to meet the needs of the City and reduce risk. Our big focus is to maintain a professional appearance and an exceptional level of service to the City, meeting both our training and technology needs. We are also focusing on maintaining partnerships with entities such as the Worthington Board of Education, the Northeast Regional Emergency Communications Center, the Central Ohio Interoperable Radio System, and the Columbus Board of Health. Also, our communications outreach with our Citizens Academy, the National Night Out, mentorships, and ALICE training.

Mr. Robinson inquired about the Personal Services numbers and the Additional Personal Services. He assumes by Personal Services we mean wages and salaries. Mr. Bartter said that was correct. Mr. Robinson then clarified that Additional Personal Services includes benefits. Mr. Bartter again agreed. He explained that it encompasses health insurance contributions, pension, Medicare, and fringe benefits. Mr. Robinson noted that there are variations between departments of the increases to those categories. He then questioned whether the increases in benefits would be proportional to the wages and salaries, but between departments it varies quite a bit. Mr. Bartter reported the difference, particularly with Police, is because many employees are at a lower step so that is causing the lower jump year-to-year. Mr. Foust shared that 7% is reasonable for health insurance.
Chief Bailot explained that the Division of Fire & EMS also have a sizeable budget wrapped up in Personal Services. Their primary goal is the safety and security of Worthington’s citizens and businesses. Their lines are flat as well, but there are some relatively minor increases. His division is very busy with approximately 5000 runs per year and 80% of those are medical. It takes many people to manage those runs. In 2019, the Division is continuing their forward progression with the administrative team and filling important vacancies due to retirement. Their main focus is maintaining high quality employees to meet the needs and expectations of the community.

Chief Bailot explained how the Fire Station is like a second home and there are some comforts that are not found in other departments throughout the City. One focus is trying to do minor renovations over a period of time, updating the building which was built in the early 1990s. We want to build a good working atmosphere for our quality employees. Additionally, we want to maintain and enhance our partnerships with Perry Township, Sharon Township and the Village of Riverlea.

Objectives in 2019 include promotions, establishing a new policy and rules manual, and improved community involvement. We are also capitalizing on improved technology with the support of the IT team including new scheduling software, online training, and report writing and various equipment tracking.

Mr. Robinson asked to be educated about what is included under Contractual Services and specifically what was the cause of the bump from 2017-2018 of over 20%. Chief Bailot said that he could not speak specifically to the aforementioned bump in 2017-2018. However, he explained that Contractual Services includes things such as, repairs, fueling, EMS billing, building maintenance, and other things needed to operate the Division. Mr. Robinson stated that it is a curious description for those expense items.

Mr. Brown detailed how there is a slight increase of $30,000 under Contractual Services associated with the new work management software that will accept online payments to provide better service for residents, property owners, and businesses wanting to come to Worthington. It will allow for all of our application submittals to be done online and we will
have better interaction with applicants missing documentation. This goes towards Council’s goals of communication, outreach and transparency. The Department processes over 1,200 building permits a year, over 200 complaints due to property maintenance, handles code enforcement with a response time of 24-48 hours, permits working with the Service and Engineering Department, and over 200 MPC, ARB, and BZA applications. Much of that work will be more easily tracked and the ultimate goal will be to click on a property and see the history and materials associated with that property.

Other focuses throughout the year in addition to the software rollout and board and commission meetings is related to redevelopment opportunities within Worthington, whether that is the Stafford Village redevelopment, the Holiday Inn redevelopment, UMCH, the Harding site, Anthem, or the Wilson Bridge Corridor. Additionally, there will be the continuation of the Wayfinding program and the streetscape improvements throughout the City.

Mr. Brown explained how under their Additional Personal Services portion of the budget, things such as conferences, dues, local meetings and training are included. The reason for the big increase in Contractual Services is due to the software rollout which is an additional $36,000 per year.

Ms. Dorothy commended the new work management software, in her experience working with municipalities that utilize similar software, it makes interactions much smoother. Mr. Brown shared that it helps us be more competitive with our peers and neighbors. Other jurisdictions they have talked to have seen a decrease of people coming into the office, getting more things completed on-time, and have had the ability to allocate more time for other projects and initiatives in the office.

Mr. Robinson asked what Mr. Brown’s current understanding is about the status of the Comprehensive Plan and the UMCH update from 2014 as it pertains to UMCH. Mr. Brown stated that it is an adopted policy document that was adopted by the City Council. Mr. Robinson asked for clarification if it remains in force the same as it did a year ago. Mr. Brown responded that we would review any applications that came through our boards and commissions, ultimately to the City Council for any development that would occur on the site.
Mr. Bartter went over the status of other accounts. County Auditor Deductions are where the CAFR funding is contained. The Board of Health account will need to be increased slightly due to mosquito spraying. Transfers include the funding of the upcoming 27th pay in 2021, so there will be a transfer to fund that. In the Lodging Tax account, there will be a reduced amount with the reduction in Hotel/Motel tax collections from the current status of the Holiday Inn. The Cultural Arts Center is the McConnell Arts Center, who will be in next week to discuss their funding request.

Mr. Robinson asked Mr. Bartter about all the other funds, because the General Fund accounts for approximately 61.7% of total City revenue. The other 38.3% encompassing all the other funds, he wondered if there is a place in the budget where the revenue can be seen and where it comes from. Mr. Bartter replied that currently there is not, but the final produced document will incorporate revenue for all funds. Ms. Dorothy stated she would like to see where we get the gas tax from the state and actual revenues from that. They have been over estimated, and she would like to see it actually reflect more of what we get.

Ms. Kowalczyk asked for more information on what the Bicentennial Fund is, she knows there are some funds in there and would like to know what might happen to those funds. Mr. Bartter said it was established for the Bicentennial and it is currently sitting to be used for the next celebration. Those funds are at Council’s discretion to spent. Mr. Greeson explained that those dollars were raised and were not completely used for the Bicentennial. The organizers of that event benefitted from some dollars that were raised for a previous event, so the original intention was for them to pay it forward a little bit for a future event of that sort. Ms. Dorothy asked if that account accrues interest. President Michael asked how much is currently in the account. Mr. Bartter responded that there is approximately $71,536.32 in the account.

Mr. Robinson asked about Income Tax revenues and the assumptions that are used to develop those projections. Mr. Bartter stated the big one is a 4% spike in 2019 that reflects the re-filling of the Anthem Building. That is the equivalent of $40,000,000 in wages if all that revenue is generated from Income Tax withholding. He goes month by month and applies a three-year average to each month. There are adjustments made for any significant outliers such as the bonus that was paid in 2017. Mr. Robinson asked if he
spoke with any major employers or consult with Mr. McCorkle. Mr. Bartter stated that he and Mr. McCorkle for the first time this year reached out to and met with some of our largest withholders so that we could get a feel for what they had going on in their industry.

REPORT OF COUNCIL MEMBERS

Ms. Dorothy thanked the Parks and Recreation Department for their help planting trees at Park Boulevard Park.

Mr. Smith said that he represented the City at the Ohio Municipal League conference last week. It was a good event as always. The Ohio Department of Transportation has a new program where they provide training assistance specifically for projects like Complete Streets Programs. They will provide the training for free, help us set up those policies, and is one example of a dozen different programs they have. He will collect those documents and bring them to staff.

President Michael asked if the City was doing something with MORPC regarding Complete Streets projects. Mr. Greeson responded we have a technical assistance grant from MORPC which Mr. Whited is working on and we are trying to marry it with our Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan process. Mr. Whited said that he would be meeting with MORPC within the week to discuss some of the classification of streets. President Michael requested an update on this, detailed where we are on it and where we are headed.

Mr. Robinson thanked Anne Brown for getting Issue 39 into the national press about what a municipal government is doing regarding clean energy and cost savings.

President Michael mentioned that it looks like there are some interesting thoughts coming up from the Visitor and Convention Bureau regarding consolidation and community members working together. She stated she believes this is going to be a good plan that is going to be brought forward. The community is working together in a really good way.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

MOTION

Mr. Myers moved, Ms. Dorothy seconded a motion to meet in Executive Session to discuss compensation of employees, the appointment of public officials, and conference with an attorney for the City concerning disputes involving the City that are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

The clerk called the roll on Executive Session. The motion carried by the following vote

| Yes  | 7    | Robinson, Kowalczyk, Dorothy, Foust, Smith, Myers and Michael |
| No   | 0    |

Council recessed at 8:32 P.M. from the Regular meeting session.
MOTION
Ms. Dorothy moved, Mr. Foust seconded a motion to return to open session at 9:19 P.M.

The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION
Mr. Myers moved, and Ms. Kowalczyk seconded a motion to adjourn.

The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

President Michael declared the meeting adjourned at 9:19 P.M.

/s/ Ethan C. Barnhardt
Assistant City Clerk

APPROVED by the City Council, this 19th day of November, 2018.

/s/ Bonnie D. Michael
Council President