CALL TO ORDER – Roll Call, Pledge of Allegiance

Worthington City Council met in Regular Session on Tuesday, November 13, 2018, in the John P. Coleman Council Chambers of the Louis J.R. Goorey Municipal Building, 6550 North High Street, Worthington, Ohio. President Michael called the meeting to order at or about 7:30 p.m.

ROLL CALL


Member(s) Absent:

Also present: City Manager Matthew Greeson, Assistant City Manager Robyn Stewart, Director of Law Tom Lindsey, Director of Finance Scott Bartter, Director of Service & Engineering Dan Whited, Director of Planning & Building Lee Brown, Director of Parks and Recreation Darren Hurley, Chief of Police Jerry Strait, Chief of Fire John Bailot, Clerk of Council D. Kay Thress, and Assistant City Clerk Ethan Barnhardt

There were 8 visitors present.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

President Michael invited all to stand and join in reciting the Pledge of Allegiance to the flag.

REPORTS OF CITY OFFICIALS

Policy Item(s)

- Proposed 2019 Budget – Presentations from Community Groups

Mr. Greeson explained how the 2019 proposed budget includes funding for community groups. Tonight we have representatives from the McConnell Arts Center and the Worthington Historical Society who will give presentations. The proposed budget includes a total of $220,000 related to the McConnell Arts Center that is separately budgeted for because it is a unique relationship. The City owns the building and we
essentially lease it to a non-profit to operate as the community arts center. The Worthington Historical Society is part of the larger special group allocation. There is approximately $111,250 in the current preliminary budget related to other community groups. One of the tasks in this budget process is to properly allocate that.

**McConnell Arts Center – Jon Cook, Executive Director**

Mr. Cook reported that the McConnell Arts Center (MAC) is coming up on their tenth year of operation. He mused upon the idea of the arts in our lives and in our community and what it means to us. He shared statistics detailing how surveys show that 81% of individuals believe that the Arts are a positive experience in our world and 90% of those people agree that arts institutions are important to quality of life. Institutions include museums, theatres, and concert halls, and the MAC is a microcosm of all these different institutions. The Center is one of a few facilities in the area that provides visual arts, performing arts, and educational opportunities under one roof.

He shared a story about how he was travelling and encountered a pilot who knew of Worthington and gave effusive praise to the community and the MAC.

Within the annual report, the impact within the community is measured. The MAC serves more than 85,000 people per year and annually supports 526 artists in paid and unpaid opportunities. Since 2010 MAC attendance has grown quickly, particularly since 2015. 38% of persons come to the MAC from within the Worthington School District which has been growing due to the influx of younger persons and families into the community.

The grant dollars from the City of Worthington leverages a significant amount of outside funding from other organizations. When people come to the McConnell Arts Center, the average patron contributes an additional $29.00 in the community.

The economic impact of the MAC has generated $11.5 million in new audience spending in Worthington since opening in 2009. This represents things such as restaurant receipts, gas purchases, clothing, lodging, and others. When someone comes to the MAC, they are actually spending another $30.00 within our community once they are here as a visitor. It is incredible to see what arts can do within our own community.

The grant money from the City of Worthington represents about 27% of the MAC’s budget, decreasing as an overall percentage over the past several years.

Program partners include organizations such as Ballet Met, Columbus and Franklin county metro Parks, Songs at the Center, Worthington Pools and more.

In 2018 there was an 8% increase in educational attendance. There was a record crowd of 27,000 attendees at the 26th Annual Arts Festival. This included nearly 130 artists that had average sales between $3,000 and $8,000 for the weekend. The Depth of Field photo exhibit in partnership with MetroParks was a great opportunity to be involved with something outside of the walls of the MAC. They are always looking at creating a larger,
more diverse audience with more family programming provided. Looking outside of the walls they continue to provide visual arts and orchestra masterclasses to primary and secondary schools at no cost. They produced a project book for the 4-H program at the state level and it won some national awards.

Mr. Cook described how they are in the midst of their third strategic plan and have met as a board to look at serving additional audiences in the future. They are well on the way to make that happen.

Ms. Brandt who is the Board President of the MAC described the transition period for the organization while Mr. Cook retires from the MAC. She described how Mr. Cook has laid an amazing foundation for the organization and how his leadership will be missed. The board is currently in the process of looking for a new Executive Director who will continue the success of the organization. Strategic planning for the next three years is currently being discussed. They have been conversing how they are refining and defining their audiences and create programming for that audience. There is also a continued focus on financial responsibility and fiscal stewardship that includes sharing measurements and engagement levels. There will be a 2019 fall celebration for the 10-year anniversary of the MAC in the Worthington community, with more details to come.

She remarked how the MAC considers themselves the leading arts center by offering a comprehensive arts experience for people when they come through their doors. Something like the MAC draws in smart people who want to have art and culture in their lives and that makes the community that much better.

Ms. Kowalczyk asked if there are challenges as the MAC strives to expand their reach and what still needs to be overcome. Mr. Cook responded that the physical limitation of the space is a major challenge. They need to look into how to serve the community outside of the physical walls of the building. Additionally, the continued sustainability of the organization should always be concerning. They started a reserve fund at the Columbus Foundation and have started an endowment for individuals who may have a planned or legacy gift for the organization. Finally, capital needs for the organization from the wear and tear on the building is concerning. There needs to be a program put in place to fund that over a 5-7-year period, so they can replace equipment as it ages out.

Ms. Kowalczyk wondered who they see as the MAC’s competitors. Ms. Brandt explained that they recently did a board exercise where they sat down and plotted out who they thought were potential competitors. This included other arts organizations in Columbus and surrounding communities. They discovered numerous specialists out there such as BalletMet, the Chamber, and others. The MAC is more of a generalist in a good way. People can come and experience art in a meaningful way while still keeping it accessible. Mr. Cook added that the competitors are from the entry level to the high end in different ways and different areas.

Mr. Myers inquired if there was any benefit from Songs at the Center. Mr. Cook said that public television market is a weird animal because they do not recognize revenue off of
that. But there is national recognition and people do connect it with the MAC. Mr. Myers asked how the delegation of funding for the community arts groups is going. Mr. Cook responded that they are waiting to hear back on the impact of those grants. These are small $1,000 to $2,000 grants. Measurement of success for those is something they are continuing to work on. In the past there has been support but there has been the question on what that means to us as a community. They are in the midst of the second round right now and hopefully it will expand. Mr. Myers asked for the next Executive Director to discuss this in the future because he can foresee a discussion about making sure the money is being directed in a way that Council would approve of. Mr. Cook responded that he would do that.

Mr. Foust thanked Mr. Cook and Ms. Brandt for the presentation and the statistical summary. He remarked that despite driving past the MAC multiple times a day it can be easy to forget what a gem it really is.

Ms. Dorothy said that Mr. Cook has been an inspiration in the Worthington community and beyond. To grow this from next to nothing into something known across the country, it is an amazing story she hopes continues for a long time to come. She thanked Mr. Cook for his service.

President Michael said she worked on the MAC starting 12 years before the doors opened and she never imagined we would have this great of a facility. How far Mr. Cook and the board have taken it is phenomenal.

Mr. Robinson quoted John F. Kennedy saying, “If art is to nourish the roots of our culture, society must set the artist free to follow his or her vision wherever it may take them.” He wished Mr. Cook the best of luck and expressed his thanks.

Worthington Historical Society – Kate LaLonde, Executive Director

Ms. LaLonde described many of the different things that the Worthington Historical Society (WHS) does on an annual basis, and some of the projects that they have going on. They are actively undertaking preservation of their properties including the Orange Johnson House, the Old Rectory, and the Jeffers Mound. They are also continuing preservation of all their collections including photographs, archives, objects, historic clothing, and the doll collection. Many of their programs will be continued including Pioneer Days for every third grader in the Worthington school district, the Ghost Tours at Walnut Grove Cemetery, and they are looking forward to the Home Tour in 2019. The Orange Johnson House will be celebrating its 200th anniversary and that will be the center piece of the Home Tour. There are also bus tours and walking tours. They expanded the bus tours to allow diving into the stories and the people a little more in-depth.

One big thing coming up in 2019 is the Orange Johnson House bicentennial. They have begun the Bicentennial Project and there is an ambitious fundraising effort underway. The replacement and restoration of the front entrance was done in July. They are hoping
in early 2019 to address all of the masonry that is on High Street, the planters, and the wall on the northside of the property which was all constructed during the restoration in the 1960s. That is a big undertaking that will cost close to $150,000 which is the same amount it cost for the previous restoration.

She explained how they have been working on improving community engagement, becoming more visible in the community, making sure people know how they can interact with the WHS, and how Worthington history fits into their lives. It is important people attend their events, that they are available for research, to help them learn about the place and people who were here before them. They worked with the City over the summer by doing some social media showing how places have changed over time. That helped the WHS increase their reach for their projects. Because their profile in the community is increasing, the board has decided to expand the role of the director and she will be increasing her hours from 20 hours per week to 30 hours per week.

President Michael explained how some older organizations, particularly historical organizations, have had trouble getting young individuals involved. She wants to know what is being done to get younger people involved. Ms. LaLonde explained that is something they have been working on. They have been working with different programs and the board and volunteers have been supportive of trying new things. Several years ago, they started having the farm animals at the Spring Opening and that event brings in families with preschoolers. Doing an event like that at a historical site has helped to bring people back. While everyone may not become members, they start watching their calendar. The Ghost Tour brings out a totally different demographic and those people are learning about history in a different format. They had a Lunch and Learn at the Worthington Inn and she was surprised at how many of her peers were at that luncheon.

Ms. Kowalczyk asked what the challenges are going forward. Ms. LaLonde said that a major problem is keeping up with the maintenance of buildings. They cannot use city funds for building maintenance, so they must be on top of how they are raising funds to take care of those properties. Once people get to their sites, they are impressed but it is all about getting them onto the site. Ms. Kowalczyk noted that their volunteers are really fantastic, knowledgeable, and interesting. Ms. LaLonde said it is important to get young volunteers involved. With her increased number of hours in the office they can be more flexible with how people can volunteer. They have 8-10 volunteers who are working at some level which is really exciting.

Ms. Dorothy asked what other areas have been expanded into as far as researching their properties. Ms. LaLonde said that if it falls within Worthington, they will do their best to help figure it out. Ms. Dorothy explained how Ms. LaLonde’s research has been outside of just the downtown area. Ms. LaLonde shared that if the area is outside of the Old Worthington area, they are excited to dive into those projects too. Ms. Dorothy said that they are becoming a go-to center that is something that does not have an equivalent in other communities.
Mr. Myers commented that the WHS is an incredible resource for research and is so helpful. It is a huge resource for the Worthington Community. Ms. LaLonde added that doing research is why they exist, to provide people with information that they are trying to learn about. It is fun to find the answers.

Mr. Smith reported that in the last meeting there was mention of a specific fund, the Bicentennial Fund, that has some money in it. He would not advocate for using that for many things, but it is fortuitous there is the bicentennial of the Orange Johnson House coming up. He thinks it may be appropriate to use some of that money to support the bicentennial of the Orange Johnson House. President Michael noted that City funds cannot be used for the capital improvements of a facility not owned by the City. Mr. Smith clarified that using the money for programming is appropriate.

Mr. Foust noted that Ms. LaLonde mentioned doing some programming with the schools. He asked if third grade is still devoted to Worthington history. Ms. LaLonde said that is correct. President Michael added that there has been a slight expansion in the past 20 year with the Live Government in the Worthington Municipal Building, giving students the historic as well as the current. Mr. Foust said that this ties in to the discussion about getting people engaged with Worthington history and that is a great step. He applauds what is being done.

Mr. Robinson said that he agrees with Mr. Smith’s idea for usage of the monies in the Bicentennial Fund.

Mr. Greeson detailed that the MAC’s request is the same from the previous amount of $220,000 appropriated in 2018 and is reflected in the 2019 preliminary budget. The WHS request was for $32,500 which reflected $5,000 more than the amount appropriated for 2018. We must discuss whether we increase the total pot or decrease funding to some of those groups that we allocate after the first of the year.

- Proposed 2019 Budget – Departmental Overview

Service and Engineering

Mr. Whited explained how the Service and Engineering Department is experiencing the largest turnover in staff since the early 1990s. This is largely due to retirement because we have had an aging workforce. The turnover requires an increase in their training budget and an increased focus on technology that helps with retention, succession planning, and strengthening our in-house capacity rather than hiring out contractors. Also, there has been a change in leadership and management philosophy to help maintain top-level performance in the face of a strain on the budget and infrastructure.

When discussing the Service and Engineering Department, it is difficult not to blend some of the discussion operating and capital budgets. One urgent need is to assess, repair, and replace our aging waterlines, as well as other aging infrastructure. The operating budget includes significant money for those assessments. Additionally, the idea of using
training and technology to increase our service capabilities and focus on understanding lifecycle and infrastructure.

We have a sustained need for continued accommodation in pedestrian and bicycle traffic. This includes working with the Parks and Recreation Department, working with MORPC and the Complete Streets policy, and incorporating that with the Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan. Also, in regard to infrastructure, there is a shifting of focus from reactive to proactive pavement preservation in the Street Improvement Program. Energy Efficiency initiatives will provide benefits such as increased energy savings with better, more efficient systems as well as the need for replacing aging equipment and infrastructure. Energy efficiency also includes replacing street lights with LED components.

Storm Water continues to be a growing concern with our residents and the Ohio EPA. They are starting work in the Rush Run watershed and addressing areas in the community that have encountered flooding issues. There are also some issues at the Service Complex that continue to be addressed. The Northeast Gateway continues to take a great deal of their time and effort. It is beginning to pick up momentum with the acquisition of 124 real estate parcels necessary for the project. They are close to being able to relocate some utilities and hope to initiate construction of a waterline replacement. They will start on the demolition of some of the structures out there and begin on the roadway upgrades.

Other projects include sanitary sewer upgrades, and there are some large projects with the Northbrook and Kenyonbrook sewers coming up. It is important from a sustainability perspective because they do things to increase the water quality in our community. We will also begin contracting soon for the East Wilson Bridge Waterline Replacement Project that will begin mitigating some of the breaks occurring out there. We are continuing the management of our solid waste and storm water programs. This includes looking to implement some new programs concerning food waste recycling. There is a SWACO grant available to begin piloting that project.

Steve Tennant, the Maintenance Superintendent has spearheaded a pilot program for a Direct Liquid Application program for snow and ice control. This program has significant sustainability advantages as well as operating advantages. We will be able to create our own liquid application of brine that we can use before and after a snow and potentially in lieu of salt during the snow. It cuts down on the use of salt by about 50%. This will be implemented on our mains before expanding it to other areas in the future. Mr. Tennant has been working with ODOT on this, and they have come in and done a regional training session.

The Complete Streets policy and Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan with guidance documents will be drafted and brought in early 2019. They are also organically upgrading the GIS system and project/permit tracking software systems.
Ms. Kowalczyk suggested that there are many things being worked on that incorporate sustainability and energy efficiency, including the City’s internal Green Team working on these issues. She asked how we can compile what is being done into a plan to show the community the initiatives we are undertaking because it is one of Council’s goals. If we can bring to light what we are doing, we can think about other things we can do. We are already doing a lot, but she does not believe people know about it. Mr. Whited shared that we are working with MORPC’s Sustainable 2050 program and have not had the time to put into that effort, but we need to. President Michael offered that maybe a story could be shared in the City’s newsletter and perhaps Anne Brown could write up what green things are going on in the community.

Mr. Foust said that he is looking at the general fund summary and the aforementioned loss of more experience staff. Looking at the budget and the forecast between 2019 and 2020, there is a 3% increase in personal services. But there is almost a 5% increase from 2018 – 2019. He is struggling to understand why it is up instead of being more level. Mr. Bartter responded that one thing that was done with this budget process was to consolidate some lines and make the budget document friendlier. Previously overtime was spread over 10 different lines and 4 different funds. All of those were put into one line that has spiked it for 2019. Mr. Foust asked if that was driven by overtime then. Mr. Bartter explained it is the same allocation for overtime, but it is now all in one line in the General Fund as opposed to ten lines. President Michael shared that previously some of the things were spread out over multiple accounts but were consolidated into each department. Personnel and overtime used to be in one place, and everything else was somewhere else. Mr. Foust asked if the way the ’18 and ’19 numbers were calculated were different from each other, or if it is truly a 5% increase. Mr. Bartter replied that they were different from each other.

Mr. Robinson asked in the final budget, if there are changes in the accounting procedures there be an asterisk put in to show that there is a difference and we are not looking at like to like. Mr. Bartter replied that is a good idea and we will make some kind of delineation to point that out. Mr. Robinson asked why supplies and materials bumped up between 2017 and 2018 before dropping back down. Mr. Bartter explained it is not an apples to apples comparison when looking at 2017 actual versus 2018 budgeted. Actual expenses are always going to be lower than budgeted. We do not spend everything that is budgeted. It is not an equal comparison. Mr. Robinson asked for further clarification for the difference and Mr. Bartter said that he would conduct research into it. Mr. Robinson asked about contractual services and how it increased in 2019 before going back down in 2020. Mr. Bartter explained that increase is for the Waterline Assessment and Traffic Signal Study which is a spike of one-time expenses. Mr. Robinson asked about the Complete Streets policy and Bicycle and Pedestrian initiatives and if there is a current dollar cost to doing that. Mr. Whited replied that the Complete Streets policy has been coordinated through the Service and Engineering Department and there are not costs other than internal costs for staff due to the grant from MORPC, supplying their professional services. He cannot speak for the Bike and Pedestrian and defers to Mr. Hurley about that. Mr. Robinson explained how he did not know of a plan being approved or of any funds committed in anticipation of or what the status was.
Mr. Bartter responded with additional information to a previous question by Mr. Robinson and explained how fuel was moved to a new fuel card which allows us to more accurately budget fuel costs. One of the things done with the fuel costs was to split it out between departmental usage. Previously it had all been allocated in the Fleet Department. So, the supplies line has dropped precipitously because we have spread that out to the appropriate departments.

**Parks and Recreation**

Mr. Hurley explained how most of the changes in Parks and Recreation Department were concerning the Revolving Fund costs being transferred into the General Fund. Most of that had been programming funds, whether that is instructors or other kinds of contractors. Those costs are going from a separate Revolving Fund into the General Fund. He noted that the Urban Forestry dollars were moved from the Capital Improvements Program into the Operating Budget.

In terms of management discussion, there are several initiatives going on outside of the department’s normal programming including the Parks Master Plan implementation and Bicycle and Pedestrian planning. The consultant team that has been working on the Bicycle and Pedestrian planning have been continuing the process of community input. The timeline for having the planning completed has been extended into the first quarter of 2019 in order to get additional community involvement. The consultant team will be back later in the month and we will get to see their ideas and drafted recommendations for the first time. In January they will come to Council and the community with some drafted ideas and recommendations for feedback.

Speaking of sustainability, there are a lot of facility renovations with the HVAC and energy conservation measures being implemented. We are just about at a point at the Community Center and Griswold Center to be able to start those measurements and see how those things are going to work. The South Building roofing project at the Community Center is just about completed.

2019 objectives include next steps on McCord Park, Bicycle and Pedestrian improvements, and a project reviewing Parks and Recreation Department fees. They are celebrating 15 years of the Community Center with the expansion that opened in 2003. They will work with outside help to look at fees, cost recovery, and how we sit in the market. There is also the anticipation of several key retirements in the department’s leadership in the next several years. In next year’s budget there may be a consideration of a slight reorganization.

Staff is working on many great things on a day to day basis when it comes to the general operating side. The department is putting a big focus on wellness and health, not only in the Community Center but out in the community with walking programs, nutrition, fitness challenges and things of that nature. Also, memberships at both of our facilities continues to grow.
The Parks and Recreation Department continues to grow when it comes to events and how they bring the community together. On average, nearly every month out of the year has an event that brings in over 1,000 people. The Marketing and Events team has continued to do an excellent job looking at opportunities. The most recent was the Paws in the Park event that despite the rain brought in a huge crowd with new people that have not been seen at other events. We are also seeing more and more interest in getting out into the parks and giving back with park clean-ups and invasive species removal. Sustainable Worthington is celebrating ten years at Moses Wright. We are seeing small groups doing really neat things in our parks and adding value while getting involved and educated.

Mr. Robinson asked about the Revolving Fund if you add the General Fund expenses to the Revolving Fund Expenses, comparing them year to year, you would be comparing like to like. Mr. Bartter said that is correct. Mr. Robinson said when you do that for 2018, total expenses are just shy of $6 million. In 2019 if you do the same thing, you come up with $6.3 million. He asked then in 2020, it dips back down to approximately $6 million, he wanted to know what causes that. Mr. Bartter replied that we have to appropriate in the Revolving Fund transfer, so $475,000 is appropriated in 2019 in Revolving Fund that is the transfer of any remaining balance in that fund. Mr. Hurley clarified that it is an expense, albeit an internal money expense.

Mr. Smith asked what the original debt amount was to pay for the Community Center and when that debt comes off of our plate. Mr. Bartter said the debt falls off in December 2021. He does not recall the exact amount of the debt, but it was between $7 -10 million.

Ms. Kowalczyk mentioned reaching out to hard to reach populations such as tweens and teens and asked what is being done to reach them. Mr. Hurley said it is not a new challenge reaching out to that population because they do not like a lot of structure. However, younger people have responded to scheduled open gym times that have advertised times blocked off. They are also continuing to work on what can be done considering the location of the Griswold and Library for teens and tweens to be able to drop in. Staff has been challenged to reach out to those partners to see what types of things could be done. They have had a lot of luck with teens who volunteer. Recently, the Halloween event had 100 high school and middle school students volunteer.

Mr. Robinson asked approximately what the percentage of the budget may to be attributed to the Community Center. Mr. Hurley said approximately 63% of the total budget went to the Community Center. Mr. Robinson asked how revenues compare to the total expenses of the Community Center. Mr. Hurley said that cost recovery is difficult with the consideration of allocating direct vs indirect costs and staff time. Broadly, we are recovering about 65% of those expenses, but that doesn’t include the Capital Improvement Program or a lot of expenses that may be attributed to the Community Center.
Information Item(s) - Financial Report – October 2018

Mr. Bartter provided the following highlights for the City’s financial report for October:

- The Fund balances for all funds increased from $26,697,378 on January 1, 2018 to $32,397,681 as of October 31, 2018.
- The Fund balances for the General Fund increased from $13,491,664 as of January 1, 2018 to $15,526,883 as of October 31, 2018.

MOTION

Mr. Myers moved, Mr. Foust seconded a motion to accept the Financial Report.

The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

Mr. Greeson said there have been questions about updated Investment and Fund Balance policies. The original thought was to bring these to Council for consideration next week, but we would like to discuss them during the meeting for the first week of December.

REPORT OF COUNCIL MEMBERS

Mr. Foust said that he attended another meeting of the Columbus Energy Special Improvement District (E-SID) with Mr. McCorkle. They approved four new projects and the E-SID is now up to 16 members with 19 projects approved in the three-year existence of the group. They are focused on PACE funding, energy efficiency, and several buildings in the Columbus area. It has been a successful effort so far and continues to expand.

Ms. Smith said there was a Community Investment Corporation (CIC) meeting last week and they discussed the future transformation of the ReCAP program.

Ms. Dorothy attended a MAC board meeting and reported that there were several resumes received for the Executive Director position. They hope to have a new Executive Director by December. They were happy with the resumes received and the candidates that are being interviewed. She explained how she enjoyed an evening with Ms. Kowalczyk and the Partnership. She also noted that she appreciates the lights that have been put up by the City and how beautiful it looks downtown.

Ms. Kowalczyk explained how the windows in Old Worthington have been decorated through a partnership between the Old Worthington Partnership and the Ohio State University’s Colleges of Interior Design and Fashion Retail. Students are receiving three credit hours of independent study to design these windows, working with the shop owners. There was a reception last week that was really a great event that was well attended. She was able to speak with representatives from Ohio State and they loved the idea. She was asked to encourage continued involvement with this idea. Students presented on their windows and they spoke about giving back to the community. She also had the opportunity to attend an event that was an overview of the recent election, Impact...
Ohio. It was encouraging to hear everyone talking about the Local Government Fund and restoring resources in some fashion to local governments. She is encouraged and hopes we can engage our Representatives in the State House to advocate for what we need to support the City.

President Michael said that the Ohio Municipal League sent out a summary encouraging people to be in touch with local governments and encourage the Local Government Fund. Also, to do what they can to help the infrastructure needed throughout the state of Ohio and not usurp anymore rights of local government. She also attended the CIC meeting and there are some interesting things coming. She attended the Partnership meeting and cannot say enough about how wonderful the downtown windows are. It was exciting to hear the students explain their windows and how the ideas came to them.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

MOTION
Mr. Foust moved, Mr. Smith seconded a motion to meet in Executive Session to discuss Collective Bargaining, Union Negotiations, and Board and Commission appointments.

The clerk called the roll on Executive Session. The motion carried by the following vote

Yes 7 Robinson, Kowalczyk, Dorothy, Myers, Foust, Smith, and Michael

No 0

Council recessed at 9:10 P.M. from the Regular meeting session

MOTION
Mr. Myers moved, Mr. Robinson seconded a motion to return to open session at 9:35 P.M.

The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION
Mr. Smith moved, and Mr. Foust seconded a motion to adjourn.

The motion carried unanimously by a voice vote.

President Michael declared the meeting adjourned at 9:35 P.M.

/s/ Ethan C. Barnhardt
Assistant City Clerk

APPROVED by the City Council, this 19th day of November, 2018.

/s/ Bonnie D. Michael
Council President