



MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION
September 12, 2019

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with the following members present: Mikel Coulter, Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Edwin Hofmann; David Foust; and Amy Lloyd. Also present were Lee Brown, Director of Planning and Building and Lynda Bitar, Planning Coordinator. Commission member Thomas Reis, Vice-Chair; Board member Richard Schuster; and Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative were absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:00 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of the minutes of the July 25, 2019 meeting

Mrs. Holcombe moved to approve the minutes, and Mr. Hofmann seconded the motion. All members voted, “Aye,” and the minutes were approved.

4. Affirmation of witnesses

B. Architecture Review Board – Unfinished

1. Façade Modifications – **5625 N. High St. (Gerald Sutton) AR 82-19**

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This commercial building was constructed in 1959, having a one-story structure in the front and two levels in the rear. Verizon was the most recent tenant in the front part of the building, but no longer occupies the space. The property owner would now like to refurbish that portion of the building.

Project Details:

1. The stucco parapet was painted black to accommodate Verizon. The owner plans to repair

and refinish the stucco and paint it Ivory as it was previously. The coping and windows would be painted brown.

2. Replacement of the red awning with a blue fabric awning is also proposed.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Commercial sites should be developed in a way that is complementary to the architecture and land uses around them. Compatibility of design and materials, exterior details and relationships are standards of review in the Architectural District ordinance.

Recommendation:

Staff recommended approval of this application, as the modifications would be complementary to the building.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Gerald Sutton, 5625 N. High St., Worthington said he would like to re-stucco the entire façade and take the building back to the original off-white color. The red awning would change to Mediterranean blue. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present to speak for or against this application, but no one came forward.

Motion:

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY GERALD SUTTON FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MODIFY THE BUILDING AT 5625 N. HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 82-19, DRAWINGS NO. AR 82-19, DATED JULY 18, 2019, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hofmann seconded the motion. Mr. Brown called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mrs. Lloyd, aye. The motion was approved.

2. Fence – **135 W. Clearview Ave.** (Robert & Amy Morgan) **AR 83-19**

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This Colonial Revival style house was originally built in 1934, with a major addition and renovation constructed in 2013. At the time of the addition, a large hedge was adjacent along the west side that was to be retained to help soften the look of the addition and screen the mechanicals. In 2018 the homeowner removed the hedge and put up a ~6' high, mostly solid, white vinyl fence to screen the mechanicals and a window well from view. Due to the style, material and placement of the fence in the right-of-way, staff advised using an alternative method of screening, rather than

seeking approval of the existing fence. Approval was received in January of 2019 to plant eight 5' – 6' high Hicks Yews for screening, and the shrubs were planted in the spring. Most of the Hicks Yews have already died and the new property owners are looking for a more permanent screening solution.

Project Details:

1. Proposed is 4' high cedar fencing with French gothic tops. The 4" wide pickets would have 4" spacing between pickets. The owners would like the option to leave the cedar natural in color or paint it white in the future.
2. A variance was granted to locate this fencing at the property line by the Board of Zoning Appeals at its September 5, 2019 meeting.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Keep functional items such as trash containers and mechanical equipment well screened with fences or plantings.

Recommendations:

Staff recommended approval of this application. The proposed fencing, either natural or painted, would help screen the condensing units and is an appropriate fencing style for the District.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Robert Morgan, 135 W. Clearview Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Coulter asked if there would be gate on the south side of the fence and Mr. Morgan said yes. Mr. Brown reminded Mr. Coulter that the Board of Zoning Appeals approved of the location of the fence in the side yard setback. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present to speak for or against this application, but no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Foust moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ROBERT & AMY MORGAN TO AMEND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS NO. AR 114-18 BY INSTALLING FENCING TO SCREEN THE MECHANICALS ON THE WEST SIDE OF 135 W. CLEARVIEW AVE., AS PER CASE NO. AR 83-19, DRAWINGS NO. AR 83-19, DATED AUGUST 15, 2019, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mr. Brown called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mrs. Lloyd, aye. The motion was approved.

3. Patio and Canopy – **849 Oxford St.** (Singleton Hicks/McGarry) **AR 84-19**

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This Colonial Revival style house was originally built in 1938 and went through an addition and renovation project from 2011 – 2013 that considerably modified the look of the house and property. At that time a patio was proposed and installed on the south side of the property at the rear of the house. This application is a request to resurface and extend the patio and add a canopy structure above a portion of the patio for shade.

Project Details:

1. Due to the change in grade, the existing patio is supported with retaining walls in the rear yard. The proposed addition to the patio would be 14' x 14' and to the west of the existing at a lower level.
2. New porcelain tiles are proposed to replace the concrete pavers on the existing patio and would also be used for the new section. Seat walls and retaining walls would be faced with Endicott Clay Manganese ironspot smooth modular brick to match the house.
3. A 14' x 14' matte tan canopy mounted on Western Red Cedar beams is proposed over a portion of the existing patio. The height would be in line with the bay windows on the house. A variance would be required for placement closer than 8' from the property line. The drawing shows a 4' wide section of plant material along the south property line that would remain.
4. LED string lights are proposed around the edge of the canopy.

Land Use Plans:Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Decks and patios should be limited to the rear of buildings. Patios may be constructed of concrete, stone or brick. Consider the style of the house when designing decks and patios, since some styles and some designs are not compatible.

Recommendation:

Staff recommended approval of this application. The proposed modifications were appropriate for the rear yard.

Discussion:

The applicant, Mr. Singleton Hicks, 1791 Staffordshire Rd., Columbus, Ohio, came forward. Mr. Hicks said the canopy style matches the style of the home. He said the connector pieces would be matt black and the beams would be natural cedar color. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present to speak for or against this application, but no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Hofmann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SINGLETON HICKS ON BEHALF OF BRIAN MCGARRY & ALLISON GENTILE TO EXPAND AND RENOVATE THE PATIO AND ADD A CANOPY WITH LIGHTING AT 849 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 84-19, DRAWINGS NO. AR 84-19, DATED AUGUST 29, 2019, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mr. Brown called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mrs. Lloyd, aye. The motion was approved.

4. Carriage Barn Renovation – 675 Oxford St. (David G. Foust) AR 70-19

Mr. Coulter stated for the record that Mr. Foust recused himself from the dais to be the presenter.

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

A Victorian style house was constructed on this property in 1892, as was the 20' x 30' Carriage Barn to the rear on the north half of the property. Both are contributing buildings in the Worthington Historic District. The Carriage Barn was reportedly leaning within three years of construction. The structure was renovated in the 1930's to accommodate automobiles by adding doors and relocating the interior stairway. New corrugated metal roofing was added on top of existing standing seam metal at some point mid-century.

This application is a request to stabilize and renovate the carriage barn.

Project Details:

1. The owner would like to raise up and level the building, installing foundation piers beneath the support posts. A concrete floor is proposed.
2. New standing seam metal roofing is proposed that would match the original roof. The color would be Dove Gray or Slate Gray.
3. The doors are to be rebuilt and used as sliding doors.
4. A ventilator or cupola consistent with the period of the building is proposed to be added.
5. The entire structure would be painted light green with dark green trim to match the house.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Older outbuildings, sheds, and garages should be retained and repaired. They add variety and visual interest to the streetscape and are part of Worthington's character.

Recommendation:

Staff recommended approval of this application. Renovation of the carriage barn is ideal, as these structures are an important part of Worthington's character.

Discussion:

Mr. David Foust, 675 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio stepped to the podium as the applicant. Mr. Foust said his plan is to stabilize the building and restore the barn to its original condition. The

building has never had any footings and has continued to shift and settle over the years. He said there was no intended use for the barn. Mrs. Lloyd asked for further details on the size of the ventilator and Mr. Foust said the ventilator is about six feet tall. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present to speak or against this application, but no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Hofmann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DAVID G. FOUST FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO RENOVATE THE CARRIAGE BARN AT 675 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 70-19, DRAWINGS NO. AR 70-19, DATED JUNE 18, 2019, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mr. Brown called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mrs. Lloyd, aye. The motion was approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

Mr. Coulter stated Mr. Foust returned to the dais.

1. Amendment to Development Plan

- a. Wall Sign – **6999 Huntley Rd., Suite M** (Granite Direct/Huntley Corporate Center, LLC)
ADP 06-19

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This building is a multi-tenant commercial/industrial property that was constructed in the early 1970's. The applicant's storefront is located at the west end of the building which is not adjacent to any right-of-way. A business in this location would only be allowed a professional nameplate not exceeding two square feet in area. This request is for a larger sign.

Project Details:

- 1. The proposed 4' x 8' sign would be on the west end of the building in the northwest corner.
- 2. The sign would consist of an aluminum panel with black vinyl lettering saying "Granite Direct" and identifying the phone number and suite. A logo is proposed in the upper left corner of the sign in orange.

Land Use Plans:

Development Plan Amendment Ordinance

If an amendment does not conflict with the character or integrity of the development, but an additional variance is required, the approval must be by City Council.

Worthington Comprehensive Plan Update & 2005 Strategic Plan

An area plan focusing on the Proprietors/Huntley Road corridor should be developed that makes recommendations for repositioning it in the market place to make it attractive and competitive in the region. Because of the age and types of uses located here, this compact area is experiencing significant change and has the opportunity to reinvent itself. Issues such as building renovation, aesthetics, and possible road and infrastructure improvements should be addressed.

Recommendation:

Staff recommended approval of the application, as the proposed sign would be in character with the development.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Robert Ryan Burk, 6099 Huntley Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Hofmann asked if the landlord was okay with the project and Mr. Burk said, "Yes, pending City approval." Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present to speak for or against this application, but no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Hofmann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY THE GRANITE DIRECT LLC TO AMEND THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN FOR 6099 HUNTLEY RD., AS PER CASE NO. ADP 06-19, DRAWINGS NO. ADP 06-19, DATED AUGUST 8, 2019, BE RECOMMENDED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL BASED ON THE PLANNING GOALS OF THE CITY, AS REFERENCED IN THE LAND USE PLANS AND THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mr. Brown called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

D. Other

Mr. Brown discussed the Eggs & Issues event will be held at J. Lui's restaurant and the speaker will be the C.E.O. of Jobs Ohio on Thursday, October 3, 2019, with the networking portion of the meeting beginning at 7:00 a.m. and the presentation will begin at 7:30 a.m.

On Tuesday, September 17, 2019, and Tuesday, September 24, 2019, there will be tours of the Boundless site for the MPC and the City Council.

Adjournment

Mr. Hofmann moved to adjourn the meeting and Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. All Board members voted, "Aye," and the meeting was adjourned at 7:40 p.m.