

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

June 23, 2011

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair, James Sauer, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present were Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Commission member Chris Hermann was absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of minutes of the meeting of June 9, 2011.

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes and Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. All members voted “aye”. Mr. Hunter said they have been approved.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses.

B. Architectural Review Board

Due to a lengthy discussion about the Renovation of Worthington Place, Chairman, Richard Hunter, said that the order of discussion would be reversed, and that the new business would be discussed first.

1. New

- a. Fence – **653 Oxford St.** (Eric & Jaelith Hoover) **AR 45-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant would like to add to an existing white picket fence in the rear yard. The fencing between the house and garage will require a variance. The applicant is scheduled to appear before the Board of Zoning Appeals on July 7th, 2011. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mrs. Jaelith Hoover approached the microphone and stated that she lives at 653 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio. Mrs. Hoover said her yard is near a busy intersection and is not child friendly. She has two children, ages one

and three years, and wants to protect them by completely fencing in her yard. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. In 2008 the applicants gained approval from the ARB and Board of Zoning Appeals to install a white picket fence in the rear yard for this house, near W. New England Ave. With this application, approval is sought to add to that fencing.
2. The new area to be enclosed is 4' from the north property line, extending to the rear corner of the house. Also, connections are proposed between the house and garage and to the back corner of the garage, which would enclose the area. The section between the house and garage will require a variance for placement closer than 20' to the side property line on a corner lot.
3. The style is the same as existing, with 4" wood pickets and 4" gaps between, and 42" in height.
4. The applicant would like to move the fence to the north property line, including the existing portion.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed addition of fencing is appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ERIC & JAE LITH HOOVER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD FENCING AT 653 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 45-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 45-11, DATED JUNE 9, 2011, AMENDED TO MOVE THE EXISTING AND NEW FENCE ON THE NORTH SIDE OF THE PROPERTY TO THE PROPERTY LINE, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers; aye;. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

b. Addition – **119 E. Granville Rd.** (J.C. Rice) **AR 46-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. This house was originally built in the 1800's, and the applicant wants to add on to the rear of the house. A new family room, mudroom, bathroom and fireplace will be added. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. J.C.

Rice approached the microphone and stated she lives at 119 E. Granville Rd. Ms. Rice stated she is a single parent raising two girls, and she wants to bring the house up to date and have more living area. The kitchen looks like it was remodeled in the 1950's but needs to be updated with more modern conveniences. Mr. Sauer asked if the new chimney addition will have real stone. Mr. Jeffrey Brown, the contractor for the project, said the material will be a cultured stone. Due to the cost of real stone, the cultured stone was a preferred alternative. Mr. Coulter said that there should not be a problem matching the existing stone to the other chimney, he has worked with similar material before. Mr. Hunter said that he would like to see the cultured stone match as close as possible.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A 400 square foot addition is proposed for the rear of this house. The addition will accommodate a family room, mudroom and full bath.
2. Construction of a new rear gable extending to slightly lower than the peak of the existing north/south gable of the house is proposed. The pitch will match that of the existing side gable. The new roofline will extend across the rear of the south end of the north/south gable, but will be notched out to accommodate an existing window. A new one-story gable is proposed for the west side of the south elevation, with roof pitch to match the existing north/south gable. A rear entry door with a coach lamp is proposed.
3. A fireplace similar to the existing on the front of the house is proposed for the west side of the addition. It will be made with cultured stone to match the existing.
4. Siding, roofing and windows are proposed to match the existing house as closely as possible.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed addition is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY J.C. RICE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT AN ADDITION AT 119 E. GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 46-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 46-11, AND THAT ALL NEW MATERIALS WILL MATCH EXISTING AS CLOSE AS POSSIBLE AND THAT THE PITCH OF ROOF FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION WILL MATCH EXISTING DATED JUNE 9, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye;. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

2. Unfinished

a. Renovation of Worthington Place – 7227 N. High St. (M&A Architects) AR 85-10

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the preliminary plans for the Shops at Worthington Place. The roof on the northeast corner of the mall will be removed to open up the store fronts, and the roof structure will extend out from where First Watch is located, and the space across from it, to create a cover for outdoor seating. The north side of the mall will have a children's area and an indoor park. There will be changes to the south side entry and common areas, and tenants will come back to the Board for approval of specific improvements. The Board will have the final say.

Mrs. Bitar stated the signage package, including freestanding, wall and tenant signage, will need variances. Guidelines for tenant spaces are also proposed.

Images and drawings from the application were shown. The applicant also brought material samples for the Board to review.

Mr. Myers asked about the Wilson Bridge Road Corridor Study and the cut through area, and if the bike route and walking path will be behind the mall, and Mrs. Bitar said yes, the bike and walking paths are proposed behind the mall, and will then extend through the mall property.

Mr. Hunter asked if Kroger was still planning a drive-thru pharmacy. Mrs. Bitar thought the plan was to keep the walk up window and have designated parallel parking spaces nearby.

Mr. Hunter asked for the applicant. Mr. Tom Carter approached the microphone and stated he lives at 2178 Castle Crest, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Carter said he has hired Corna/Kokosing to start the construction in July 2011. The first phase will involve the renovation of the new Talbot's location and interior remodeling. Mr. Carter said he would like to install project signs to convey to the public that the shops will all remain open during construction. Mr. Carter said he is proposing to create vinyl murals for the east side of the mall that will show what the building will look like when it is completed. Mr. Myers asked if this was just temporary art work, and Mr. Carter said yes, the vinyl rendering will be mounted on a hard surface, such as plywood. Mr. Carter would also like to install two signs near the building to generate energy and graphic interest.

Mr. Carter indicated there will be three parking spaces for the walk up pharmacy at Kroger. Mr. Sauer asked if the area between Kroger and the mall will be cleaned up soon. Mr. Carter said yes.

Mr. Coulter said he believes the sizes of the signs are appropriate for this project.

Mr. Sauer asked Mr. Carter to discuss the new look of Talbots and mentioned the railings were in bad shape. Mr. Carter said it will have a standing seam roof, panels, and hardy materials. Mr. Carter presented photographic renderings of the Talbot's renovation, and passed around material samples to the Board members. Mr. Carter said two of the entrances to the mall will be brought up to ADA compliance, but the ramp will be removed from the south side. Mr. Coulter said it should be documented which entrances will be ADA compliant.

Mr. Myers asked about the fascia board. Mr. Carter said the fascia board will be replaced and the tenant will be providing black awnings. More columns will be added, and a Juliette style balcony where a band can play or it can be a venue for public meetings. It might also be a good area for a public event like Rally in the Alley.

Mr. Sauer asked about the black band proposed for the rest of the building versus what is proposed for Talbots. Mr. Carter said it helps give the building a clean fresh identity, and allows Talbots to have its look. Mr. Sauer said he likes the new look and windows for Talbots, but not the proposed awnings. He would like to see the windows similar to the other entrances around the corner. Mrs. Holcombe said she likes the awnings. Mr. Hunter said that it is a signature element of the retailer. Mr. Coulter said the awnings provide shade which will help with utility costs.

Mr. Carter began discussing the monument sign and said the sign will have lit letters, but they will not be blaring. Mrs. Bitar asked Mr. Carter if he had samples of the colors, and the architect Lori Bongiorno, said she would get samples of the colors to Mrs. Bitar. Mr. Myers asked for clarification of what needed to be approved. Mr. Hunter said that approval could be for the overall design of the pylon sign. Mrs. Bitar said the signs need variances because they do not meet Code requirements for size and number of businesses. Mr. Myers asked how things were going to proceed. Mr. Coulter said that maybe the matter would be better off tabled until more details are known. Mr. Hunter said in terms of the overall picture, he has no objection to the overall design.

Mrs. Bitar mentioned the sign that faces W. Wilson Bridge Road, and Ms. Bongiorno said it will be exactly the same as the other sign, but likely with different tenant names. Mrs. Holcombe asked if Mr. Carter will be bringing back guidelines with consistent colors. Mr. Carter said that he will use similar guidelines to those used for the Easton shopping district.

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Carter if he plans to close up the loading zone areas to create retail space, and Mr. Carter said yes. Mr. Coulter said that he would like to see some outdoor seating that has heat lamps in the winter time, so people can sit outside all year round.

Mr. Carter said that he would like to have the Boards approval for the demolition of the east entrance. He also said that if he can get the approval from Kroger for the three parking spaces for the walk up pharmacy, he can get the bulldozers to prepare the area. He would also like to keep the curb cut the way it is. Mr. Sauer asked if Mr. Carter was asking for the Board's approval for the stretch of area between the two buildings, and Mr. Carter said yes. Mr. Carter said that he has looked at several traffic scenarios and he wants to keep people moving.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this matter and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Preliminary plans for The Shops at Worthington Place (formally Worthington Square Mall) were discussed by the ARB late last year. More detailed plans are now being presented for approval by the Board. While a comprehensive view of the proposed changes is included in this submittal, a phased approval process of the details will be necessary to accommodate timely redevelopment. Construction will begin as soon as possible, but will not continue through the holiday shopping season.

Phase 1 of construction will include demolition of the existing east entry feature; existing site signage changes; site work to accommodate the extension of the entry drive from Wilson Bridge Rd. to Old Wilson Bridge Rd., between Kroger and the main building; and interior modifications which will be shown but are not subject to review. Any information regarding items to be reviewed in this phase that is not already in the packet will be presented before approval is sought.

2. At the east entrance, removal of the gazebo and existing window structure is proposed. Roof structures are proposed to extend out from First Watch and the space to the south of the entry area to create cover for outdoor seating. The black band at the top of those structures will extend across the main building, and provide a background for signage. The trim and columns supporting the roof structures will be white. Retail storefront windows are proposed for the restaurant spaces, and will be laid out as a curved outside wall for the restaurants.

New pavers are proposed for the entry area. Patterns will be inserted in a different color paver, including a circular outline around a fire pit in the middle. Details of materials, lighting, benches, and landscaping are forthcoming.

3. The change to the site plan includes creating a smoother transition for those entering the property and heading north. The curb at the entry to the first parking aisle in the east parking lot will be modified to allow northbound vehicles to continue straight in a one-way lane; and the angled parking on the west side of that aisle will be converted to parallel parking. Travelers in that aisle will then be able to continue north between Kroger and the main building to the parking on the north side and to Old Wilson Bridge Rd. The area between the buildings will allow two-way traffic and have angled parking on the west and parallel parking on the east. The roadway adjacent to the east entry area of the building will be lined with parallel parking and accommodate southbound one-way traffic.
4. In addition to the first phase work, the entire plan at this time involves changes to the south, northeast and north entrances; creating a retail presence for tenants; and the addition of public space on the north side. Removal of existing trim elements and roof structures, and the addition of new detailing (matching the east entrance) are proposed at the south and northeast

entrances. Also, awnings, trim and storefront windows will be changed at those entrances and on the southwest and north sides of the building.

5. New building signage is proposed for the entrances. In some cases Worthington Place will be spelled out and the logo “W” will be used, and in other cases it will be just the “W”. Also, there will be an envelope created that will represent the maximum area allowed for each retail operation. The design of signage, awnings and individual storefronts will meet the guidelines created for the center, but also be subject to ARB approval. A final version of those guidelines will be submitted in the future.
6. A new look for site signage is proposed, and will eventually include better wayfinding information in the way of new monument signs at the entrances, and permanent banner poles. For the first phase, changes are proposed to the existing freestanding signs, but drawings are not included in the application material yet. Also, two 8’ x 8’ construction signs are proposed for placement on the site near the south and northeast areas of the building.
7. Some type of artwork for the unfinished side of the building is proposed, and will be identified before approval is requested.

Conclusions:

1. The comprehensive plan for the site is appropriate, and approval of the details in phases is acceptable.
2. Phase 1 approval includes:
 - Demolition of the existing east entry feature
 - Construction of the drive between the buildings
 - Artwork on the unfinished wall
 - Construction signs
 - Talbots

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT PHASE 1 IMPROVEMENTS TO WORTHINGTON PLACE AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 85-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 85-10, DATED JUNE 10, 2011, INCLUDING THE FOLLOWING:

- Demolition of the east entrance feature;
- The roadway between Kroger and the mall building be allowed with parallel parking on the east side (and no drive-thru), and angled parking on the west side, and the Old Wilson Bridge Rd. entrances stay as is;
- Temporary wall murals be installed on the east face of the building across from Kroger and at the south end of the building;
- Two construction signs;

- Talbot’s entrance as in rendering except: No rails or brick piers allowed except black rails at steps;

BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Sauer, aye; Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; and Mr. Coulter, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Amendment to Development Plan

a. Renovation of Worthington Place – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects) **ADP 05-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar said that variances are needed for the total signage and temporary construction signs. The Board determined not enough information was available and the applicant asked to table the application.

Findings of fact:

1. Amendment to Development Plan approval will cover the changes to the entire site (as in Case #85-10 above), and any necessary variances.
2. The following variances are requested as part of the approval:
 - Total signage for the site
 - Erection of temporary construction signs for a period not longer than 2 years.

Conclusion:

1. This proposal represents an appropriate modification to this site.

Mr. Coulter moved to table the application.

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS TO AMEND THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN FOR 7227 N. HIGH ST. BY RENOVATING WORTHINGTON PLACE AS PER CASE NO. ADP 05-11, DRAWINGS NO. ADP 05-11, DATED JUNE 10, 2011, BE RECOMMENDED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. All members voted “aye” thereon and Mr. Hunter said this matter has been tabled.

Other business that was discussed was the scoreboard at Thomas Worthington High School. Mrs. Bitar said that the Board had approved for the back of the sign to be painted green to blend in with the trees, but the applicant would like the to leave the back metal, or have it painted blue to go with school colors. The ARB said it would like the applicant to come with a formal request.

Mrs. Rodgers said she liked the idea of putting in new trees, such as twelve foot trees, in the event the old trees die from the installation of the new scoreboard; that way the trees will have time for growth, and could also make the area denser.

Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. All members said aye. The meeting adjourned at 9:42 p.m.