

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING  
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD  
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

January 12, 2012

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: James Sauer, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann, Mikel Coulter and Jo Rodgers. Also present were Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Richard Hunter, Chair was absent.

**A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.**

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Oath of Office

James Sauer was sworn in for a three year term as a reappointed member of the Municipal Planning Commission. Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers were sworn in for one year terms as reappointed members of the Architectural Review Board.

4. Election of Officers

Mr. Coulter moved to elect the officers to remain in their same positions. Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mr. Sauer called for a vote and all members voted “aye”.

5. Approval of minutes of meetings of November 10, 2011 and December 8, 2011

Mr. Hermann moved to approve the minutes from both dates, and Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mr. Sauer called for a vote and all members voted “aye”.

6. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

**B. Architectural Review Board**

1. **Unfinished** – No Business

2. **New**

- a. Air Conditioner Replacement – **659 Oxford St.** (Patrick Porter) **AR 01-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and photographs were shown to portray the area where the air conditioning unit has been relocated. Mr. Sauer asked if the applicant was present.

Mr. Patrick Porter approached the microphone and stated his address is 659 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Hermann asked Mr. Porter if he considered planting boxwood hedge or something similar to help hide the unit. Mr. Porter said yes, he is considering more vegetation to screen the unit. Mrs. Holcombe said another recent application was approved to move an air conditioning unit and the board members approved the application with the condition of vegetation screening. Mr. Porter said he is very willing to plant more vegetation to screen the unit.

Mr. Sauer asked if there were any speakers that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no speakers came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The homeowner has placed a new air conditioning unit at the northwest corner of the house.
2. The unit is mostly screened from view by an evergreen tree and shrubs. Additional evergreen vegetation will be added for screening.

Conclusion:

1. Replacement of the air conditioner is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

**THAT THE REQUEST BY PATRICK PORTER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE THE AIR CONDITIONER AT 659 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 01-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 01-12, DATED DECEMBER 2, 2011, BE APPROVED WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE APPLICANT WILL PLANT SCREENING TO BLOCK THE VIEW OF THE AIR CONDITIONING UNIT, AND BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. All members voted “aye” and Mr. Sauer said it has been approved.

- b. Deck – **779 Oxford St.** (Jeremy Brofford) **AR 02-12** (Amendment to AR 10-11)

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and showed pictures of the completed, revised deck. Mr. Sauer asked if the applicant was present. Mrs. Clare Brofford approached the microphone and stated she lives at 779 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio.

Mrs. Brofford explained the footprint is very similar to the original deck and patio plans. Mrs. Brofford said the house sits on a very steep hill and the deck would have been too high and she would not have been able to see her children playing in the back yard so they reduced the level of the deck. Mrs. Holcombe said it was quite obvious the house sits on a very steep hill. Mr. Hermann asked if it was possible to make the lattice a darker color. Mrs. Brofford said she is waiting for better weather to landscape the area with arborvitae so the deck blends better. Mrs. Holcombe said the plantings will cover the lattice, so changing the color should not be necessary. Mr. Sauer asked if there were any other speakers that wanted to speak for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The homeowners received ARB approval last January to construct an addition which included a deck and patio to the rear.
2. During construction of the deck, the homeowners felt the configuration would not allow a view of the rear yard, so decided to change the layout. The deck now extends to the rear in place of the previously approved patio. Patio space has been eliminated, and stepping stones will connect the deck steps to the driveway.
3. The previously approved design and materials have been extended to the new area including white square rails, Timbertech deck flooring and lattice skirting.

Conclusion:

1. The deck is appropriate at this location.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

**THAT THE REQUEST BY JEREMY BROFFORD TO AMEND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS NUMBER AR 10-11 BY MODIFYING THE DECK PLANS AT 779 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 02-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 02-12, DATED DECEMBER 27, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll and all members voted "aye". Mr. Sauer said it has been approved.

- c. Artistic Bicycle Racks – 777 Evening St. & E. New England Ave. (Fred Yaeger) AR 03-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, and discussed a letter from House Wine asking for a color other than red by the store. Mr. Coulter said he likes the idea of different colors of the bike racks around town. Mr. Sauer asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Fred Yaeger approached the microphone and stated his address is 285 Bryant Avenue, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Yaeger said the bike racks are being paid for with private funds.

Mr. Sauer asked if the inverted u-shaped bike racks that are being replaced with the artistic racks could be used elsewhere and Mr. Yaeger said yes. Mrs. Lloyd said she liked seeing the color red used for the bike racks at the McConnell Arts Center. Mrs. Holcombe agreed and said she liked the color red being used for the bike racks at the McConnell Arts Center. Mrs. Rodgers said green would be okay next to the House Wine location as long as its not bright lime green.

Mr. Coulter liked the idea of having the donor choosing the color of the bike rack as long as it is not a distracting color. Mr. Sauer asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak. Mr. Patrick Porter approached the microphone and stated his address is 659 Oxford Street, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Porter asked the Board if the new bike racks will all be similar colors, or if they can be contrasting. Mr. Coulter said contrasting is okay because it would be difficult to match otherwise. Mrs. Brofford approached the microphone and stated that her address is 779 Oxford Street, Worthington, Ohio. Mrs. Brofford said she also supported the idea of having the entity donating the money for the bike racks picking out the color.

Mr. Yaeger said the Old Worthington Business Association donated the funds for the rack near House Wine and the Worthington A.M. Rotary donated the funds for the rack by the MAC. Mr. Hermann said he would like to thank both associations for donating the funds to purchase bike racks. There were no other speakers.

#### Findings of fact:

1. Artistic bicycle racks in the shape of four leaning bicycles are proposed for the installation at McConnell Arts Center (MAC) and on the north side of E. New England Ave., south of House Wine. The color proposed for the MAC is red; the color for the other rack can be determined by the purchaser and approved by staff.
2. At the MAC, the bicycle rack is proposed on the south side of the main entry on the east. Placement will be on existing concrete.
3. On E. New England Ave., the rack will be on the concrete apron next to house wine where older racks were recently replaced with inverted "U" racks. At least two of the four inverted "U" racks will be relocated to accommodate the new rack.

#### Conclusion:

1. The proposed bicycle racks will add interest to those locations, and help draw attention to biking in the community.

Mr. Coulter moved:

**THAT THE REQUEST BY FRED YAEGER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL ARTISTIC BICYCLE RACKS AT 777 EVENING STREET AND ON E. NEW ENGLAND AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 03-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 03-12, DATED DECEMBER 19, 2011, BE APPROVED, AND THAT THE COLOR PRESENTED TO CITY STAFF FOR APPROVAL, WITH A VARIETY OF COLORS THROUGHOUT THE CITY BEING APPROPRIATE, AND BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll and all members voted “aye”. Mr. Sauer said it has been approved.

- d. Amendments to Northeast Entry – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/Worthington Place)  
**AR 04-12** (Amendment to AR 92-11)

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and showed the drawings and pictures from the site. Mr. Sauer asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Tom Carter approached the microphone and stated his address is 7227 N. High Street, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Carter said the trees being removed from the plan were located in awkward areas. He said a new higher brick wall will be constructed because the old one is in disrepair, and the height of the new wall should help screen the utilities in the area. Mr. Myers asked Mr. Carter if the conduit will still be able to be seen, and Mr. Carter said they have already planned to paint the area to blend into the brick building. Mr. Hermann asked if brick columns could be constructed at the end of the gates. Mr. Carter said yes, that can be done, and it would help the structure look like a real gate. Mr. Sauer agreed that columns at the end of the wall would be good support for the structure.

Mr. Hermann asked Mr. Carter what was decided about the paver sidewalk. Mr. Carter would like to use stamped asphalt. Mr. Sauer asked if there were any speakers that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. At the last ARB meeting, the Board approved changes to the northeast entry, except for the elevation on the south side and south of the courtyard area. This application address changes to the south side design, as well as several other changes in that vicinity.
2. The 6’ high screening wall for the service area south of the northeast entry and north of First Watch has been modified to be all brick instead of a composite extension on the top. The entire wall will be new red brick, with brick columns at the gate, and the gate will continue to be a board and batten style composite material. The utilities and conduits on the wall will be painted to match the wall.

3. The east elevation north of the service area has been simplified by removing the vertical elements in the cornice, and the pilasters below. As before, three storefronts are indicated for this area, each with fiber cement cornices and sign panels above. The south elevation in the courtyard area has similarly been changed with removal of the vertical elements in the cornice. A continual sign band across three storefronts with room for three separate signs is proposed for this area. On the east façade, the existing masonry will be painted; on the south façade in the courtyard, new masonry painted in the same color is proposed.
4. On the north side of the courtyard, the corner element has been moved to the east to be slightly beyond the plane of the northern section of the east facade, creating more interior square footage. The architectural detailing, materials and colors are the same as before in this area.
5. One tree at the west end of the courtyard has been deleted. Also, one near the service area will be removed.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate.

Mr. Hermann moved:

**THAT THE REQUEST BY M & A ARCHITECTS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO RENOVATE WORTHINGTON PLACE AT 7227 N.HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 04-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 04-12, DATED DECEMBER 21, 2011, BE APPROVED WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE UTILITIES AND CONDUITS ON THE SERVICE AREA WALL BE PAINTED TO MATCH THE BUILDING AND THE GATE WILL BE ATTACHED TO BRICK COLUMNS, AND BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll and all members voted “aye”. Mr. Sauer said it has been approved.

#### **D. Other**

There was a brief discussion of the Olentangy Watershed Balanced Growth Plan.

Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. All members said “aye”. The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.