

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

April 12, 2012

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann (arrived at 7:50 p.m.); Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present were; Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. James Sauer, Vice-Chair; and Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission were absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of the minutes of the meetings of March 22, 2012.

Mrs. Holcombe moved to approve the minutes, and Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. All members said “aye” to approve the minutes with the change that Mrs. Rodgers did not vote on any issues concerning the Municipal Planning Commission.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. New

- a. Fence & Landscape/Hardscape Plan – **701 Evening St.** (Ashley & Blair Fujii) **AR 18-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and explained there is a change in grade in the rear yard and the patio will have different levels as it steps down into the yard. Mrs. Bitar felt it would be a very attractive change to the yard. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mrs. Ashley Fujii approached the microphone and stated she and her husband live at 701 Evening St., Worthington, Ohio.

Mrs. Lloyd asked if the stones that were in the photograph would stay, and Mrs. Fujii said no, they will be replaced. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicants would like to make some changes to their property, including landscaping, hardscaping and fencing.
2. The existing concrete walk leading from the street to the front of the house is proposed for replacement with a new concrete walk in a different pattern, and with gray paver accents. Across the front of the house, a planting bed with various trees, shrubbery and grasses is proposed. The new walk is shown wrapping around the north side of the house to the driveway, and continuing on the other side of the driveway to the back of the house.
3. To the rear an existing chainlink fence extending north from the northwest corner of the house is proposed for replacement with a 3' tall cedar fence. The proposed fence has almost solid horizontal planks on the sides, with a chain-like look in the middle which is set in 5' further than the rest of the fence. At the west property line, the fence is proposed to connect to the existing chainlink fence which will remain on the west and south property lines.
4. Replacement of a wood deck with a concrete paver patio is proposed. A 15' x 15' area plus an extension along the back of the house is proposed, with a lower 12' x 10' area adjacent to the southwest. A variety of plant material is proposed around the patio area, and on the outside of the new fence.

Conclusions:

1. Implementation of the proposed plan will be an enhancement to the property.
2. While solid fences are not typically approved in the district, the proposed fence is attractive and will be largely screened with landscaping. In addition, this property is a corner lot which is very visible, so screening for the rear yard is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ASHLEY & BLAIR FUJII FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A FENCE AND A LANDSAPE AND HARDSCAPE PLAN AT 701 EVENING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 18-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 18-12, DATED MARCH 23, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- b. Addition & Renovations – 685 Morning St. (WMB Builders/Ross) AR 19-12 (Amendment to AR 63-11, 7/28/11)

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and referred to a new drawing at the Board's places showing 3 over 1 windows, and doors to the front porch. The applicant also wishes for approval to replace the front windows with the same, although the work may be done at a later date. An enhanced photograph showing what the windows would look like was displayed. Mr. Hunter asked for the applicant. Brendan and Laura Ross approached the microphone and stated they own the home at 685 Morning St., Worthington, Ohio. Mrs. Ross said they decided to paint the addition to match the house instead of using a different color. Mrs. Ross said she would like approval to replace the front windows, but the work may not be done for another five to ten years. Mrs. Holcombe asked Mrs. Ross to confirm which doors would be replaced and she said the door facing south and the one facing east will be replaced. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The ARB approved a second story addition for this property last July. The applicant is now requesting approval of some amendments to the previously approved plans.
2. Expansion of the addition 8' to the rear is proposed to allow for a walk-in master closet; a larger master bath; reconfiguration of the existing bathroom for the other three bedrooms; and the addition of a laundry room on the second floor. On the outside, the extra space is planned to have a lower hipped roof, and will make use of the same materials as previously approved including fiber cement board and batten siding and trim, Pella windows and doors, and matching roof shingles. The proposed window style for the addition is a 3 over 1 pattern, and the applicants would also like approval for the front windows. A bumped out area on the south side is no longer proposed.
3. In the previous approval, the existing chimney in the rear was proposed for removal only. Now, the applicant would like to construct a new chimney in its place.
4. An additional condensing unit is now proposed for the west end of the house.

Conclusions:

1. The proposed addition continues to be appropriate for this house and the district.
2. The proposed window style may be used to replace the other windows in the house.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY WMB BUILDERS TO MODIFY A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR A SECOND FLOOR ADDITION AT 685 MORNING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 19-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 19-12, DATED MARCH 27, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE

STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING AMENDMENT:

- **DOORS TO MATCH WINDOWS THREE OVER ONE**
- **OPTION TO CHANGE OTHER WINDOWS TO 3 OVER 1**
- **ADDITION TO BE THE SAME COLOR AS THE HOUSE**

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. **Fence – 242 E. Dublin-Granville Rd. (Trudeau’s Fence/Weiss) AR 20-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant would like to put up a six foot Stockade style privacy fence. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Sharon Weiss approached the microphone and stated she lives at 242 E. Dublin-Granville Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mrs. Weiss said she wants to screen the view of her neighbor’s yard because they park their cars in their back yards, and she is also concerned about the safety of her young grandchildren playing in the back yard. The neighbors also have a dog. Mrs. Bitar mentioned that a fence would need to be at least fifty feet from the front property line to avoid needing a variance. Mr. Hunter said solid six foot fences are not normally allowed in the District, but he does understand the need for safety. Mr. Hermann said the Board requires a more open view type of fencing. He asked if she could possibly use landscaping to block the view of the neighbor's yard.

Ms. Weiss said she has already spent thousands of dollars on landscaping, and she does not want to look at the neighbors cars in the back yard. She said she is open minded and would listen to the suggestions from the Board. Mrs. Holcombe asked if she could run an extension of the neighbor’s type of fence and use arborvitae; Ms. Weiss said that was not an option. Mr. Coulter said that a similar fence was approved on Evening Street that was intended to be used as a privacy fence. Mrs. Holcombe said another one was approved on St. Rt. 161 due to the high amount of traffic. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and Mr. Brian Yoss, Ms. Weiss’s neighbor, approached the microphone and stated he lives at 232 E. Dublin-Granville Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Yoss said he is the neighbor that sometimes parks his cars in his back yard. He said that he has not parked his cars in the back yard for quite a while, but assured the Board there is not a safety issue to be concerned with, although he does approve of the fence. Ms. Weiss said it has been only six weeks since Mr. Yoss parked in the back yard. She said she has a good relationship with her neighbors and would like to keep it that way, but she is truly concerned about the safety of her grandchildren playing in the yard. Mr. Yoss said he would like to extend his driveway to the back yard, but there is not enough room.

Mr. Bob Conway approached the microphone and stated his address is 242 E. Granville Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Conway said he works for Trudeau Fence Company. Mr. Conway said he is licensed and bonded, and would make sure the fence is built correctly.

Mr. Hunter said he was not sure if there would be enough votes to approve such a fence. Mr. Hunter asked Ms. Weiss if she would consider a slight alternative. Ms. Weiss said there is a house down the street from her that has the same fence. Mrs. Holcombe said that house is not located within the Architectural Review District, and the Board is against stockade style fencing. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Conway about the fence boards he plans to use. Mr. Conway said the fence boards would be three and a half inches with a flat top and curved corners. Mr. Coulter asked if Ms. Weiss would consider using a five foot fence. Ms. Weiss did not respond.

Mr. Hermann suggested screening the patio area with a solid fence, and using an open style or landscaping at the property line. He did not feel it would be acceptable to use the solid fence along the side property line. Ms. Weiss said it is intimidating to see trucks and cars parked in her neighbor's back yard. Mrs. Holcombe asked Ms. Weiss if she wanted to wait and come back to see the Board after she's come up with a different design. Ms. Weiss said no, she will just work on her landscaping. Mrs. Rodgers said there was a good suggestion of using a smaller fence but using larger plantings to create the privacy effect that she wants. Mr. Hunter asked Ms. Weiss if she would like to table the application until she has some time to look at some other designs and she said that would be fine. Mr. Coulter moved to table the application, Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion and all members voted aye thereon. Mr. Hunter said this matter has been tabled.

d. **Generator Modifications – 6830 N. High St. (Laurel Health Care of North Worthington)**
AR 21-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Matt Warren approached the microphone and stated he works at 8181 Worthington Rd., Westerville, Ohio. Mr. David Chen was also at the microphone and stated he is the Architect from PH7 Architects that has been hired and his address is 330 W. Spring St., Suite 265, Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Coulter asked if there would be bollards on both sides and Mr. Warren said yes, in the event a car might drive into the area. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Warren if they received a citation from the State Fire Marshall and Mr. Warren said yes. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Warren if the bollards would be the same color and if there would be a lock on the gate and Mr. Warren answered yes to both questions.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is required to bring the generator and its enclosure into compliance with State Code.

2. A 5 gallon fuel spill containment device is required to be added to the generator. A 2” diameter, 12’ high vent pipe is proposed for the existing diesel fuel tank. The proposal includes painting the pipe to match the employee break structure.
3. Ten bollards are proposed for the north and east sides of the existing enclosure. They are proposed to be 4’ apart and painted to match the break structure.
4. The addition of a metal gate is also proposed, and will match the style used at Primrose and be painted to match the break structure.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY LAUREL HEALTH CARE COMPANY OF NORTH WORTHINGTON FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MODIFY THE GENERATOR AND ENCLOSURE AT 6830 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 21-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 21-12, DATED MARCH 28, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

e. Generator Modifications – 1030 High St. (Laurel Health Care Company) AR 22-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, pointing out it is the same applicant as the previous matter, and the applicant needs to bring the generator and its enclosure into compliance with State Code. Mr. Coulter suggested having the gate swing out instead of in, but the architect said that it was not possible due to the grade of the property. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is required to bring the generator and its enclosure into compliance with State Code.

2. A 5 gallon fuel spill containment device is required to be added to the generator. A 2” diameter, 12’ high vent pipe is proposed for the existing diesel fuel tank. The proposal includes painting the pipe to match the surrounding area.
3. The addition of a metal gate and panel to the east is also proposed, and will be painted to match the surrounding area.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY LAUREL HEALTHCARE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MODIFY THE GENERATOR AND ENCLOSURE AT 1030 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 22-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 22-12, DATED MARCH 28, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

f. Fence – **1900 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (Lee’s Fencing Co./Perez) **AR 23-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Paul Rogers approached the microphone and stated his address is 1888 Tamarack Circle S., Columbus, Ohio, and introduced Mrs. Perez, the homeowner. Mr. Rogers said he works for Lee’s Fencing Company. Mr. Hermann asked if Mr. Rogers was aware the framing needs to be done on the inside and Mr. Rogers said he is aware of that. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is proposing a 3-rail wood fence with wire mesh backing to enclose a portion of the rear yard.
2. Visibility will be limited.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed fence is an open style and is appropriate for this property.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY LEE'S FENCING CO. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A FENCE AT 1900 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 23-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 23-12, DATED MARCH 29, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

g. Fence – **898 Oxford St. (Jesse Kwiek) AR 24-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, saying there is one change to the application. The picket width and spacing between the pickets will be 4" instead of 3.5". Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Jim Cartwright approached the microphone and stated he is the homeowner Jesse Kwiek's Father-in-Law. Mrs. Rodgers asked if the new fence will run into the old fence, and Mr. Cartwright said yes, it is a chain link fence. Mr. Cartwright said he is a licensed surveyor and will make sure the fence is built in the correct position. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A 4' tall cedar picket fence is proposed on the east side of the property to enclose the yard. The new fence will run to an existing chain link fence on the south. A gate is proposed near the garage.
2. The proposed fence consists of 4" pickets and 4" between pickets, and will be left natural in color.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed fence is appropriate for this house and the District.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JESSE KWIEK FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A FENCE AT 898 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 24-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 24-12, DATED MARCH 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE AMENDMENT THAT THE PICKETS WILL BE 4" WIDE AND BE SPACED 4" APART.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

h. Landscape/Hardscape Plan – **810 Oxford St.** (Louis Flocken) **AR 25-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked for the applicant and Mr. Louis Flocken approached the microphone and stated he lives at 810 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Flocken brought in a sample of the type of brick he plans to use for replacement of his side steps. He said the new steps will have a 3' ft. landing.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The homeowner is proposing an extensive plan to improve the entire property.
2. Front yard:
 - 2 ½' high dry laid stone retaining wall proposed near the sidewalk
 - Planting bed along the wall and wrapping to an area in front of the house; grass between the planting bed area
3. Side yard:
 - Remove existing planter and replace with larger version extending between the front and side steps
 - Replacement of side steps with brick
 - Brick paved area along driveway
 - New planting area adjacent to driveway
 - Replacement of front steps with new brick
4. Rear yard:
 - Brick paved areas extending to existing stone wall and pathways in south garden area
 - New garden areas
 - Replace steps at house and in rear yard
 - Remove fence along driveway
5. Almost the entire property will be irrigated. A mixture of plant material, including ground cover and evergreen shrubs will be added in the planting areas.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed plan will be an enhancement to the property and the District.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY LOUIS FLOCKEN FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO RENOVATE THE LANDSAPING AND HARDSCAPING AT 810 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 25-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 25-12, DATED MARCH 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- i. **Parking Lot Lighting – 50 W. Wilson Bridge Rd. (Binford Electric Co./Chase)**
AR 26-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, adding the parking lot lighting is mismatched and deteriorating. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Rick Burns approached the microphone and stated his address is 4522 Arrowhead Dr., Carroll, Ohio 43112. Mr. Hermann asked Mr. Burns if the bases of the lights will be painted too, and he said yes. Mr. Hermann asked Mr. Burns if he knew what the wattage of the bulbs were and he said 1000 watts, or possibly double 400's. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is proposing replacement of the parking lot poles with similar poles and fixtures. The fixtures on the poles at the east property line are fixed at an angle allowing the light to illuminate to a greater distance. The pole in the northwest area of the parking lot will have two fixtures that will point directly down. All poles and fixtures will be white.
2. Lighting levels as shown in the photometrics are typical for the District.

Conclusion:

1. New poles and fixtures will be an improvement.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY BINFORD ELECTRIC CO. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE THE LIGHT POLES AT 50 W. WILSON BRIDGE

RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 26-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 26-12, DATED MARCH 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

j. Satellite Dish – 687 Evening St. (Marcellina Mustric) AR 27-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Marcellina Mustric approached the microphone and stated she lives at 687 Evening St., Worthington, Ohio. Ms. Mustric said the satellite technician did not give her much choice as to where it would be placed. Mrs. Bitar said a variance would be needed to keep the dish in the side yard. Ms. Mustric said if the dish is not approved in its current location, she would like their support to go back to the company and have them relocate the dish. She said she was offered a promotion with limited time to make a decision. The contract is for 24 months, but she has 60 days for notice of relocation. Mr. Coulter mentioned he is her neighbor that lives across the street. Mr. Hunter said it is possible she might get better reception if its placed on the rear corner of the house below the roof. Mrs. Holcombe said that satellite dishes should not be visible in the front yards. Mr. Coulter said it could be placed in the back yard beyond the setback lines, or the backside of the house or roof, low enough to be screened from the front. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This is a request for approval to allow a pole mounted satellite dish to remain on the property. The dish was placed recently, located off the southeast corner of the house.
2. Variances for front and side yard setback would be required to leave the dish in its current location.

Conclusion:

1. It appears other options exist than to locate the dish in the front and side yard setbacks, and very visible from the front. Mounting on the lower part of the roof at the rear of the house seems to provide a viable alternative.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY MARCELLINA MUSTRIC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR INSTALLATION OF A SATELLITE DISH AT 898 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 27-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 27-12, DATED

MARCH 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, nay; Mrs. Holcombe, nay; Mr. Hermann, nay; Mr. Coulter, nay; Mrs. Lloyd nay; and Mrs. Rodgers, nay. Mr. Hunter said it has been not been approved, and the satellite dish will need to be relocated.

k. **Patio Expansion – 7227 N. High St., Suite 220 (M&A Architects/Amano’s) AR 28-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Lori Bongiorno approached the microphone and stated her address is 344 E. Dunedin Rd., Columbus, Ohio. Ms. Bongiorno stated all of the doors will be replaced. They will be white with mullions. Mrs. Bitar asked if the windows would be staying and Ms. Bongiorno said yes.

Mr. Hermann said he likes the idea of the patio expansion. He said the fence seems a bit residential and would like to see some other options, and instead of using arborvitae, suggested using burning bushes. Mrs. Holcombe said she would also like to see a different style of fence. Ms. Bongiorno said she would take a look at other fencing options. Ms. Bongiorno asked if it is okay to keep the spirea shrubs since they bloom in the opposite season, and Mr. Hermann said yes. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Currently, Amano’s has a small patio on the west side of the business. This proposal involves wrapping the patio around the corner to the north side of the building.
2. The resultant patio on the north side is proposed to be 57’6” wide and extend 25’ from the building. In addition to the patio area, a landscape bed is proposed around the outside. Two parking spaces will be retained adjacent to the east side.
3. While a metal rail to match the existing is proposed along the west side, a 6’ high wood fence is proposed on the north and east sides. Gates will be located on the east and west sides, and an existing service door on the north face of the building will be converted to an entry (exit) to (from) the interior space.
4. An awning is proposed above a portion of the outdoor space. A bar is proposed, as are 13 tables, a wood burning fire place, and 6 wall mounted televisions. Also, a sign is proposed above the bar area

Conclusion:

1. The proposed patio is in a good location and designed appropriately.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO EXPAND THE PATIO FOR AMANO'S AT 7227 N. HIGH ST., SUITED 220 AS PER CASE NO. AR 28-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 28-12, DATED MARCH 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE ARBORVITAE BE SWITCHED TO BURNING BUSHES OR TAXUS AND THE FENCE STYLE BE MODIFIED TO FIT BETTER WITH THE SHOPS AT WORTHINGTON PLACE AS APPROVED BY STAFF.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

1. Sign – 7170 N. High St. (Litech Lighting/T-Mobile) AR 29-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, and explained that T-Mobile's illuminated window signs are not allowed and enforcement actions would be taken. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present.

Mr. Peter Cobb approached the microphone and stated his address is 3549 Johnny Appleseed Ct., Columbus, Ohio. Mrs. Rodgers asked Mr. Cobb if the sign would only have the word "T-Mobile" on it, and Mr. Cobb said yes, and they will be using LED lights for the illumination. Mr. Hunter asked if the dots were going to be illuminated too and Mr. Cobb said yes. Mr. Hunter asked if there were any speakers that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. T-Mobile has moved into a space it previously occupied and would like to install a wall-mounted sign.
2. The proposed sign has 2' high letters spelling "•T• ••Mobile•" in raspberry colored internally illuminated channel letters. The previous sign had only the "T" in raspberry, with the other letters and symbols in black that illuminated white at night.
3. The other signs in the center consist of internally illuminated channel letters mainly in green, blue, red, black, and white.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed sign is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY LITECH LIGHTING FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A SIGN AT 7170 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 29-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 29-12, DATED APRIL 2, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

2. Unfinished

a. Demolition and New Building – 640 High St. (Dewey’s Pizza) AR 14-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and said clarification was needed as to what color the tables will be. She also said it is important to have bicycle racks that will accommodate as many bicycles as possible. A photometric plan was submitted but clarification is needed as to whether the wall sign will be internally illuminated. The applicant has decided on using decorative light poles similar to the ones already being used in the plaza area and in downtown.

Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Scott Rogers approached the microphone and stated his address is 6730 Main St., Newtown, Ohio 45244. Also present was Mr. Eric Kohl, and he stated his address is 2144 Riverhill Rd., Columbus, Ohio 43221. Mr. Rogers passed around the sample of brick pavers that will be used. He said they are experimenting with the exact use of the seating area adjacent to the restaurant. It can be used as an eating area, or possible waiting area, and it will be surrounded by connected planters and have a gate to allow service of alcoholic beverages. Mr. Hunter asked if there was a provision for using umbrellas, and Mr. Rogers said he was not sure. Mr. Coulter said it is important to make sure the area is ADA accessible.

Mr. Rogers said the lights will be ribbed glass and have a soft glow. They are experimenting with what would work best. Mr. Coulter asked if lighting samples were available. Mr. Rogers said he did not have samples with him, but the lights will be softly accented on the columns, and have low wattage. A post mounting will shine on the wall sign. Mr. Hunter asked what color the downspouts will be and Mr. Rogers said they will be a neutral color. Mr. Hunter said the Board would prefer the downspouts are painted to match the brick. Mrs. Holcombe asked what color the tables will be, and Mr. Rogers said the tables will be dark green aluminum.

Mr. Hermann asked if it was possible to have movable tables and Mr. Rogers said no because they would get stolen. Mr. Coulter said he likes the idea of the tables being fixed because it creates a burden for the business owner to chain the tables down every night and it looks horrible. Mr. Hermann suggested adding a signature tree that would provide some shade and act

as a screen, such as a sea green juniper. Mrs. Bitar asked if there would be trash receptacles in the plaza and Mr. Rogers said yes. Mr. Bitar asked for clarification of a box on the drawing, and Mr. Rogers said the boxes depict trench drains. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Dewey's Pizza is requesting approval to demolish the existing BP gas/service station at the southeast corner of New England Ave. and High St., and construct a new building on the site to house its restaurant.
2. Site:
 - A one-story building is proposed to be located in the southwest corner of the property. The building is wider in the rear than the front, with an entry area on the north side facilitating the transition. The front of the building is proposed in line with the Masonic Lodge to the south, which is approximately 10' from the sidewalk. Grass and shrubs are proposed between the building and the sidewalk.
 - Parking is proposed at the east end of the site, having two access drives from E. New England Ave. The plan assumes removal of two access drives on High St., and the existing drive closest to High St. on E. New England Ave. The area between the sidewalk and curb would include grass, brick pavers, and trees. Twelve spaces, including two handicapped spaces north of the east end of the building, are shown. The access drives to the parking lot are now shown as one way in and out. Decorative pole lights are now proposed to light the parking lot. Two styles are included in the packet, but only one will be used for the parking lot and plaza. A photometric plan is included. Removal of three mature trees at the east and south edges of the parking lot is proposed. The applicant is not proposing any new deciduous trees in the parking lot, but is showing four evergreen trees and other shrubbery at the perimeter of the parking lot. Variances for in lot landscaping and distance between drive entrances were approved by the Board of Zoning Appeals, as was creation of a new parking lot in the C-5 Zoning district.
 - A brick dumpster enclosure is proposed at the southwest corner of the parking lot and bicycle racks are proposed in the southeast corner.
 - To the north of the building, a public plaza is proposed with access from High St., E. New England Ave. and the proposed parking lot to the rear. The building entrance is also accessed from the plaza area. Plaza elements include a hard surface; low walls; planting areas with a mix of plant material; benches; pole lighting similar to the existing in downtown; trellises; and tables with chairs in a one-piece unit. The trellises are proposed at the corner and the east end of the plaza area. Both have planting areas shown adjacent. The opportunity for Farmer's Market vendors in the right-of-way as well as on the property is significant.
 - Low walls have been added at the perimeter of the plaza, and the pole lights will be mounted on the walls.
3. Building:

- The proposed building is approximately 19' high, with the top 3' being a parapet concealing a flat roof behind.
 - The entire building is proposed as red brick with stone caps. Columns are proposed at the western corners of the building, and pilasters are used to separate store fronts, all of which have stone bases. Other detail includes soldier courses at the top of the parapet; a soldier course and accent band above the storefronts; stone accents at the top of the pilasters; and inset areas on the brick columns.
 - The entry area is proposed to be 21'5" high with a cornice, and appears to be finished with a cementitious product. A small overhang with a cornice is shown above windows with transoms and the entry door.
 - The storefronts on the west and north sides (west of the entry area) are not as tall as the entry windows, and include divided light transoms above windows with a cementitious panel below. Awnings are proposed at the top of the windows.
 - Small light fixtures are spaced around the west, north and east sides of the building.
 - An area is proposed on the north side of the western part of the building, and will be partially cover by a trellis. Tall tables and chairs are proposed for this area.
4. Site line studies have been submitted showing the view of the rooftop equipment from different angles. Material samples were presented at the meeting.
5. Worthington Design Guidelines:
- Construction should be similar or compatible in scale, form and massing to the existing building designs.
 - Most buildings should be two stories in height.
 - Buildings should match the setback of adjacent buildings.
 - Roof shape and height, materials, windows, entries and ornamentation should take design cues from existing structures in Old Worthington.

Conclusions:

1. Although increased density by adding a second story may be desirable, keeping the building to one-story would allow some view of the Masonic Lodge from the north. The form and massing are similar to other buildings in Old Worthington. Placement on the site is appropriate.
2. A larger footprint may allow for multiple users, but the corner plaza area would create additional pedestrian and bicyclist gathering space. The brick walls will may provide additional seating. Maintenance of the plaza area will be by the property owner.
3. The architecture is compatible with other structures in Old Worthington.
4. Demolition of the existing building is appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DEWEY'S PIZZA FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO DEMOLISH THE EXISTING BUILDING AND CONSTRUCT A NEW BUILDING AT 640 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 14-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 14-12, DATED FEBRUARY 24 & MARCH 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

- **“LEANING BIKES” RACK ALONG NEW ENGLAND AVENUE AND THE INVERTED U BE AT THE SE CORNER**
- **METAL FURNITURE TO BE GREEN**
- **AT LEAST ONE TABLE IN THE ADJACENT OUTSIDE AREA WILL NEED TO BE ADA ACCESSIBLE**
- **DOWNSPOUTS & CONDUCTOR BOXES TO BE PAINTED NEUTRAL COLOR**
- **TRASH RECEPTICLES IN THE PLAZA TO COMPLIMENT THE OTHER FURNITURE**

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd Aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Conditional Use – Unfinished

- a. Restaurant in C-5 Zoning District – **640 High St. (Dewey’s Pizza) CU 01-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar said the impact on the utilities is positive, there are no health or safety concerns, and the site is offering useable public space and will be a great addition to the community. There were no additional speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. Please see the facts in ARB item c above.
2. Hours of operation are typically 11:00 am to 10:00 pm Monday – Thursday; 11:00 am to 11:00 pm Friday and Saturday; and 4:00 pm to 10:00 pm on Sunday.

Conclusions:

1. Traffic patterns may improve with the elimination of curb cuts and addition of the plaza for motor vehicles, bicycles, pedestrians and Farmer’s Market activities. The effect on public facilities would be positive.

2. Transition from a gas/service station to a restaurant use should positively impact sewerage and drainage facilities and utilities. Any safety and health considerations and noxious elements should be eliminated with the change. Hours of use are typical.
3. Appearance and compatibility with the general neighborhood and screening considerations have been finalized by the Architectural Review Board.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DEWEY'S PIZZA TO OPERATE A RESTAURANT IN THE C-5 ZONING DISTRICT IN A NEW BUILDING AT 640 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. CU 01-12, DRAWINGS NO. CU 01-12, DATED FEBRUARY 24 & MARCH 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

2. Conditional Use – New

- a. Pub & Office in C-5 Zoning District – **679 High St.** (Worthington Investment Group, LLC) **CU 02-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present.

Mr. Jim Uhlman approached the microphone and stated he lives at 2399 Collins Way, Worthington, Ohio; Mr. Bob Burpee stated he lives at 2377 Collins Way, Worthington, Ohio; and Mr. Scott Tedrick stated his address is 5940 High St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Coulter asked what type of games would be offered. Mr. Uhlman said they would offer board games such as chess, backgammon, and checkers. Mr. Hunter asked what hours the business would be open. Mr. Uhlman said they prefer to be open until midnight, unless there was a special event going on, such as a late OSU game, and in that case they would want to stay open until the game was over. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that was either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is proposing use of the first floor space at the west end of the building as a pub and office. The pub is proposed for approximately 450 square feet at the south end of the space, plus 250 square feet for restrooms, storage, and hallway; the office is proposed for 440 square feet on the north side of the building. Both uses are Conditional Uses in need of permits.

2. The pub is proposed with seating for 20 to 30 people. In an effort to keep the area quiet for the neighbors, the entrance will be located on the south side adjacent to the parking lot, and outdoor seating is not proposed. The hours of operation will generally be 4 pm – 12 am Monday thru Friday; 11 am – 12 pm Saturday; and 12 pm – 10 pm Sunday. Exceptions are expected for late sporting events.
3. Food service will mostly be by carry-in from other Old Worthington restaurants.

Conclusions:

1. The effect on traffic pattern will be minimal based on the previous use of this space as retail.
2. The effect on public facilities, sewerage and drainage facilities and utilities will be minimal.
3. No safety and health considerations, noise, odors or hazardous substances have been identified.
4. Both uses are compatible with the general neighborhood based on their location and hours of use. There will not be a change in appearance.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY WORTHINGTON INVESTMENT GROUP, LLC FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO OPERATE A PUB AND OFFICE IN THE C-5 ZONING DISTRICT AS PER CASE NO. CU 02-12, DRAWINGS NO. CU 02-12, DATED MARCH 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

There was no other business to discuss. Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. All members said, “aye”. The meeting adjourned at 10:13 p.m.