

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

April 26, 2012

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann; Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Board member Amy Lloyd was absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of the minutes of the meetings of April 12, 2012.

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes, and Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. All members said “aye”.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. New

- a. Rear Door – **151 E. Granville Rd.** (Gunton Corporation/Wells) **AR 30-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, adding the house is adjacent to the American Legion and Sharon Memorial Hall. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Elizabeth Orr approached the microphone and said she represented the home owner of 151 E. Granville Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Ms. Orr said the door is very similar to the original door, but with a little less glass. When asked why the color red, Ms. Orr said her client has always wanted a red door. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This is a request for approval to replace the rear entry door of the house.

2. The proposed door is fiberglass with four panels and glass panes at the top, and will be red.

Conclusion:

1. The door change is appropriate.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY GUNTON CORPORATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A NEW REAR DOOR AT 151 E. GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 30-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 30-12, DATED APRIL 2, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- b. Sign – **918 Proprietors Rd., Suite A** (Columbus Sign Company/Ohio Soybean LLC) **AR 31-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, indicating the proposed sign is in the same train station style as the others in the Worthington Station development. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Kirk Merritt approached the microphone and stated he is with Ohio Soybean LLC at 918 Proprietors Rd., Worthington, Ohio 43085. There were no questions asked. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A sign is proposed to be suspended from the front of the building. This building is part of the Worthington Station project; therefore the sign will match those previously approved for other buildings on the site.
2. The 20” x 102” cedar sign will be sandblasted to say “Ohio Soybean”. The frame and lettering are proposed to be white; the background will be gray.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed sign is appropriate for this building and development.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY COLUMBUS SIGN COMPANY FOR A CERTIFICATE

OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A NEW SIGN AT 918 PROPRIETORS RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 31-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 31-12, DATED APRIL 5, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. Rear Entry & Signage – 5617 N. High St. (Kelma LLC/Natalie’s Pizza) AR 32-12

The applicant was not present at the time this application was to be heard. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak about this application and Mr. Andrew Ross of 5594 Emerson Ave., Worthington, Ohio approached the Board. Mr. Ross stated his home is directly behind this property and he is the closet neighbor. He told the Board he is very happy about the renovation of this property and it is pleasingly acceptable. Mr. Hunter thanked Mr. Ross for his time and comments.

Mr. Coulter moved to table the application and Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. All members said “aye”. The applicant arrived at approximately 8:30 p.m. Mr. Coulter moved to review the application now that the applicant was present and Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. All members said “aye”. Mr. Joel Mazza approached the microphone and stated he is the owner of the property at 5617 N. High St., Worthington, Ohio.

Mr. Hunter said he did some research on coal fired pizza, and discovered these particular coal fired ovens use the world’s cleanest burning coal, and it is very environmentally friendly. He welcomed the business to the neighborhood.

Mr. Hunter asked Mr. Mazza if the outward double doors on the back of the business were operational. Mr. Mazza said the doors were built that way because they needed a way to bring in the 8,000 pound coal fired oven. The other reason was because this establishment will have live musicians unloading and loading their musical instruments, and he wanted to make it easier for them to do that. Mr. Sauer asked if the doors swing outward, and Mr. Mazza said yes. Mr. Coulter felt there may be a building code violation. Mr. Hunter said Mr. Mazza is working with the City’s Building Department, and the Board was just to approve the architectural aspects of the building. Mr. Sauer asked Mr. Mazza if he would paint the doors and the downspout on the back of the building and Mr. Mazza said yes. Mr. Mazza said he intended to paint the new doors and he wants this building to be nice and tidy. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the new railing would match what was on the side of the building and Mr. Mazza said yes. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A business called Natalie’s is planning to locate in the south end of this recently renovated building which houses The Vet Clinic at the north end. Natalie’s will be serving coal fired

pizza and have live music. The sign on the front of the building is proposed as an internally illuminated cabinet sign which has white lettering with a black opaque background. The sign will be similar to the other sign on the building

2. On the back of the building a double door for deliveries and an entry door with steps have been added. The steps will need a railing, which will match other railing on the property.

Conclusion:

1. The sign and building changes are appropriate.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY KELMA LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A SIGN AND ADD A REAR ENTRY AT 5617 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 32-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 32-12, DATED APRIL 12, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE STEEL RAIL WILL MATCH THE OTHER RAILING ON THE SITE, AND THE NEW DOORS AND DOWNSPOUT WILL BE PAINTED TO MATCH THE BACK OF THE BUILDING.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, no; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- d. Display Window – **692 High St.** (Worthington Jewelers) **AR 33-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Joe Davis approached the microphone and stated his address is 127 E. Wilson Bridge Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Davis said he has tried to find the least intrusive way to camouflage the lift. He said he wanted to keep the original façade. Mr. Sauer asked if light would shine through the leaded glass. Mr. Davis said yes, the light should fill the archway. Mr. Coulter asked if the lift will be located behind the door and Mr. Davis said yes. Mr. Sauer asked Mr. Davis what people would see when they looked through the door if a display was not there, and Mr. Davis said they would just see black. Mr. Sauer asked if the transom could be made wider to match the width of the leaded glass and Mr. Davis said yes, that is possible.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. In order to make the building accessible, a lift is proposed to be added in the original entry area for the building. The entry previously consisted of steps leading to the front door in an arched, covered area.
2. With this proposal, the applicant would like approval to move the front door to the outside wall of the building. The door is proposed to be the outside door for a 3” deep display cabinet. The back of the cabinet will be solid to conceal the lift. A leaded glass window is proposed above the door in the arch.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed change is appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY WORTHINGTON JEWELERS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A DISPLAY WINDOW AT 692 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 33-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 33-12, DATED APRIL 13, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITION THE TRANSOM LIGHT WILL HAVE THE SAME WIDTH AS THE BEVELED GLASS WINDOW ABOVE.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- e. Window Replacement & Skylights – **107 W. Stafford Ave.** (Sullivan Builders/Narazaki & Ushiba) **AR 34-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, and showed a request for additional windows. Mr. Hunter asked for the applicant. Mr. Glenn Sullivan approached the microphone and stated his address is 107 W. Stafford Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Sullivan said they are converting attic space into more livable space. Mr. Sauer asked if the home will have three stories. Mr. Sullivan said yes. Mr. Sauer asked why Mr. Sullivan would be moving the window eighteen inches. Mr. Sullivan said it is necessary to move the window in order to stack the stairs. Mr. Myers asked if Mr. Sullivan would be painting the house after patching in shingles because the paint is old and will be very difficult to match. Mr. Sullivan said yes, he intends to paint the house to have everything match. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is proposing replacement of windows on the front, placement of new windows on the east and west sides, and movement of a window on the east side. Also proposed are half moon windows in the gables.
2. Two skylights are proposed for the rear portion of the main house gable.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SULLIVAN BUILDERS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL NEW WINDOWS AND SKYLIGHTS AT 107 W. STAFFORD AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 34-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 34-12, DATED APRIL 13, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITION THE WINDOWS ON THE EAST AND WEST ELEVATIONS ARE CENTERED ON THE GABLES, AND THE SIDING ON THE ENTIRE HOUSE BE REPAINTED SO THE PATCHES DO NOT SHOW.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- f. Northeast Entry Feature and East Side Addition – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/The Shops at Worthington Place) **AR 35-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The new tenant, Orvis, needs high ceilings to display sporting equipment. Mrs. Bitar added it will be the only location in Central Ohio. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Lori Bongiorno approached the microphone and stated her address is 775 Yard St., Columbus, Ohio 43212. Ms. Bongiorno stated they studied moving the wall further away from the east entrance, but they would have had to move a transformer and other mechanicals and it would have increased renovation costs over \$250,000.00 dollars. Mr. Hunter said he did not think that Orvis would need three wall signs and Mr. Coulter agreed. Mr. Coulter said he would like to see more detail. He said he thinks this is a great store. Mrs. Rodgers felt the area looks rather stark and said she would like to see a little more wood and more details. Mr. Hunter and Mrs. Holcombe agreed they like the building as presented. Mr. Myers said he has heard a lot of comments from other men and they are very excited to see this sporting goods store come to the Worthington area. Mr. Coulter suggested using a color that is a couple of shades darker for the columns and cornice. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and one person came forward.

Mr. Joel Mazza approached the microphone and stated his address is 5617 N. High St. Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Mazza said he thinks it is great that Orvis is coming to the Worthington area. He said this shopping center has failed over the last twenty years and he is glad to see that it is finally being renovated. He said the Board should not get caught up with such small details and should welcome the new tenants. He said that he likes it the way it has been presented and agrees with Mr. Myers, Mr. Hunter and Mrs. Holcombe. There were no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. This request is for approval of the entry feature at the northeast entry, and demolition and construction of a new structure immediately south of the east entry.
2. The entry feature is a metal tower and includes the Worthington Place logo. Placement will be in the main circular area at the northeast.
3. South of the east entrance the existing structure will be demolished and replaced with a larger and higher building. The tenant space is slated for Orvis, an outdoor sporting store, and will be the company's only retail location in Central Ohio. The building will have a flat roof matching the height of the cornice on the existing adjacent building entry. There will be a fiber cement cornice in Ramie (neutral color-2 shades darker than proposed); fiber cement siding in Runyon Canyon Tan; trim in Crisp Romaine; and light colored (2 shades darker than proposed) masonry columns at the corners. The glass entrance for the store will be at an angle at the corner, and glass storefront windows and green awnings above are proposed for the east and north sides. Although signs were originally proposed for the north east and south sides of the building, only the north and east are allowed.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed entry feature and new store space are appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO PLACE AN ENTRY FEATURE AND CONSTRUCT A NEW TENANT SPACE AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 35-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 35-12, DATED APRIL 13, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITION THE BUILDING WILL BE PAINTED TWO SHADES DARKER, THE BRICK WILL MATCH THE WOOD AND TRIM AND THERE WILL BE NO THIRD SIGN.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Amendment to Development Plan

- a. Northeast Entry Feature and East Side Addition – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/The Shops at Worthington Place) **ADP 02-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the variance requested for the sign on the entry feature. Ms. Bongiorno was still standing at the microphone after having the previous application approved (AR 35-12). There were no other questions asked, and no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. In addition to the facts in the ARB case above, a variance will be needed for the additional sign proposed.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes keep the character of the development.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS TO AMEND THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN AT 7227 N. HIGH ST., SUITED 220 AS PER CASE NO. ADP 02-12, DRAWINGS NO. ADP 02-12, DATED APRIL 13, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye. Mr. Hunter said the recommendation has been approved.

- b. Sign – **535 Lakeview Plaza Blvd.** (SuperGames) **ADP 03-12**

Mrs. Bitar said the application was withdrawn because the proposed sign was substantially compliant with a previous approval.

Other

Mrs. Bitar mentioned storefront design for a tenant vs. the elevations previously approved by the Board. Mr. Sauer asked if awnings were new for this elevation. Mr. Hunter explained there will be some level of changes when the new tenants come in to the shopping center. Mrs. Rodgers said it is difficult to make a decision without seeing what will be in a certain location. Mr. Hunter asked about the colors of the awnings. Samples of the awning colors were displayed.

Mr. Coulter said he would like to see the final tenant manual when it becomes available and Mr. Hunter agreed. Ms. Bongiorno stated they do not want all the awnings to be the same. She said it depends on the branding as to what style and color a tenant may want to have. Mr. Myers mentioned that Swan Cleaners will not be allowed to have a neon sign in the window. The Board agreed to review guidelines again at a future meeting.

Mrs. Bitar said the artistic bike racks for the MAC and near House Wine have arrived, and showed pictures. The Board voiced approval for the racks.

Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:15 p.m. Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. All members said "aye".