

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

June 28, 2012

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann; Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Board member James Sauer, Vice Chair was absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of the minutes of the meetings of June 14, 2012.

Mrs. Rodgers moved to approve the minutes, and Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. All members said “aye”.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. New

- a. New Restaurant – **7227 N. High St.** (Thomas Beery Architects, Inc./Piada) **AR 49-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, pointing out the effect of translucent panels behind the sign letters may look like a sign box instead of individual letters. Mrs. Bitar passed around the sample EIFS, and expressed concern about the use of the material. She also mentioned that corner suites have approved variances to have two wall signs but the applicant may need approval for a third. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Thomas Beery approached the microphone and stated his address is 1890 Northwest Blvd., Columbus, Ohio.

Mr. Beery said Piada is a very young company with young owners and they are still forming the branding. They are trying to figure out how to take the branding and marry it to where the restaurant is going. He said the focus of the restaurant is on the food so they pay very special

attention to the lighting. Mrs. Lloyd asked for clarification about the canopy and how big it was. Mr. Beery said the canopy will be directly below the lettering on the signage and in the areas where the storefront is. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Beery to discuss the illuminated panel. Mr. Coulter also said he liked it. Mr. Beery said he had not worked out the specifications yet, but it would be one continuous piece of material, no seems, and white in color. Mr. Hunter asked how bright the sign would be, thinking it may appear like an internally illuminated background. Mr. Hunter also said the Board prefers not to have back lit signs, but he understands the light might be even brighter if it were glass behind the letters. Mr. Beery said the light will not be as bright since they will be using the panel. He said there will be less light than the store on Sawmill Rd. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Beery if he would be replacing the tree that will be lost and if there would be any plantings on the south corner.

Mr. Tom Carter approached the microphone and stated his address is 7227 N. High St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Carter said that is part of the common area and will be planted similarly to the existing. He said the sidewalk will continue past the loading zone towards Orvis for a continuous pattern of walkway.

Mr. Hermann said he would like the size of the plants to be installed as shown in the plan. Mr. Beery assured Mr. Hermann they would be planting large shrubs. He said the boxwoods will be between 18" to 24" inches when planted.

Mrs. Rodgers said she likes the plan but is concerned with the amount of darkness. She said she liked the black around the windows but would like to see more blending with the walnut brown flooring. She said the location is a prominent corner and she would like to see the materials softened a bit. Mr. Coulter asked what color the fence would be and Mr. Beery said it will be black. Mr. Hunter said he was very happy to see the plans for an outdoor patio. Mr. Hermann said he hopes the lighting is not so bright that it catches your attention as you are driving down the road. He said he would like it to be more of a warm welcoming light. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A new building to house Piada Italian Street Food is proposed for construction at the southeast corner of the Shops at Worthington Place building. The 2950 square foot building will be attached to the main building only by gates allowing entrance to a utility area to the north, and an exterior access corridor to the west.
2. The building is designed with outdoor seating on the east and south sides. A canopy will extend from the seating on the east side around the corner to also cover part of the seating on the south side. The metal canopy is proposed to be flat in design and black in color. At the seating areas, the top of the building walls will consist of an internally illuminated white translucent panel. Below, black metal panels are proposed; black storefront systems with glass windows and doors separated by painted black brick are at ground level. The remainder of the wall is proposed to be gray horizontally scored EIFS.

3. Freestanding black metal letters are proposed for signage on both sides of the canopy, with the letters placed at the outside edge. Illumination will come from the wall panel behind the signs. A wall sign in the shape of a crest is proposed on the west end of the south elevation. The material is proposed to be metal, and the photograph indicates internal illumination.
4. The southern patio will be enclosed by a 36" high black metal fence. Trees and shrubs are proposed to surround the patio. Black metal furniture and white canvas umbrellas will be used in the patio areas. Trees are also proposed along the solid east elevation.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed building is appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY THOMAS BEERY ARCHITECTS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A NEW RESTAURANT AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 49-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 49-12, DATED JUNE 15, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

- **THAT THE BACK PANEL BEHIND THE SIGNS WILL BE CONTINUOUSLY LIGHTED WITH NO HOT SPOTS**
- **THAT THE LOGO SIGN WILL NOT BE A PART OF THIS APPROVAL BUT CAN BE BROUGHT BACK AT A LATER DATE**
- **THAT THE PLANTS BE INSTALLED AT THE SIZE DESCRIBED AT THE MEETING**

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

b. Addition - **135 W. Clearview Ave.** (Brett & Kay Holland) **AR 50-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Brett Holland approached the microphone and stated his address is 135 W. Clearview Ave., Worthington, Ohio.

Mr. Holland said he recently purchased this home and it is the third home he has owned in Worthington. He said the house was built in 1934 and they are going to reuse what materials they can. He said they are relocating the garage to the side of the house. Only the red house next door will be able to see the garage. Mr. Holland said the trees that will be removed are a

spruce that is not in good health, a sweet gum tree, and a pine. He said one tree in particular is causing foundation problems for his neighbor's house and with a lack of water the tree will die, so they are removing it.

Mr. Holland passed samples of the materials, including polymer shake siding to the Board members. Mrs. Bitar asked if there would be a new roof on the entire structure and Mr. Holland said yes, and he showed the Board members a sample of the black and gray shingles that will be used. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Holland to discuss the new garage door. He said it will be very simple, just basic white. He brought a picture of what the door will look like and placed the photo on the overhead projector for everyone to see.

Mr. Hermann said he is always excited to see new additions in the neighborhood but he is concerned about the mass of the addition behind the house without a break. Mr. Holland said the architect added a triple window and a bump out to help break it up. Mrs. Lloyd suggested lowering the roof pitch to balance the elevations, or adding metal to the other side to try to balance the new build into the existing house.

Mr. Coulter said it makes sense to match the pitch of the roof. He asked how tall the ceilings would be, and if they would be flat or cathedral. Mr. Holland said that the ceiling will be 9 feet in the bedroom and 10 feet in the great room. Mrs. Rodgers said a lot of people walk in that area and she would like to make sure the hedge remains intact. She said it would be okay to trim the hedge below the window but wants to make sure that the air conditioning units and the generator remain covered. Mrs. Holcombe said she likes the addition, and has no problem with the materials. She said she was disappointed to see the trees going but understood.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and two people came forward.

Mr. Scott Caine approached the microphone and stated he lives at 123 W. Clearview Ave., Worthington, Ohio. He said he lives in the red house next door and moved there about eleven years ago. He said he moved there because he likes walking through the historic community and the spirit and integrity of the neighborhood. He said he is very happy with the new neighbors, but concerned about the large amount of concrete being laid, due to the loss of lawn area, and because of drainage; and the loss of the trees. He feels the proposal will change the neighborhood, and he would like to see the neighbors preserve the historic nature.

Mrs. Rodgers asked Mr. Caine why he was concerned about drainage because it appeared that Mr. Caine's house was on a higher elevation. Mr. Caine said his house actually sits lower. Mr. Myers explained the City Engineer will look at the plans to check for drainage issues.

The next speaker was Mr. John Wheatley. Mr. Wheatley approached the microphone and stated his address is 702 Evening St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Wheatley said he was concerned about the mass of the structure. He said the addition would dwarf the house next door. Mr. Wheatley suggested having the west elevation imitate the salt box design. He said it seems to be a total disconnect.

Mr. Holland said he will be working with the City Engineer to make sure there are not any drainage issues, and he is exploring other ideas such as an exposed aggregate concrete driveway. There were no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. The homeowners would like to construct an addition to accommodate additional living and garage space. Also, re-alignment of the driveway; a new patio; and landscaping modifications are proposed.
2. On the west side of the property, an addition is proposed that will step in 2' from the existing house initially and then again after 26'. Two air conditioners and a generator are proposed for the west side of the house. The driveway will curve to save an existing tree.
3. The addition will be one-story with a cross-gabled roof. A dormer and bay window are proposed on the west elevation. The existing one-car garage will be expanded to create a side-loading three-car garage.
4. The homeowners plan to remove a piece of the existing siding to determine the condition of the siding beneath, and will then choose the width of the proposed cementitious lap siding. Also to be determined is the width of the polymer shake siding proposed for the gables.
5. New windows will match the vinyl-clad wood windows in the existing house, and some of the existing windows will be reused. The existing garage door is proposed for re-use on the south side of the garage as a design feature.
6. Two shades of gray are proposed for the lap siding and shakes; all trim will be white.
7. Removal of six trees is proposed. A number of significant trees, as well as the hedge along Evening St. will remain. A walkway from the driveway to the house and a paver patio behind the garage are proposed.

Conclusions:

1. The proposed changes are complimentary to the house. The additions maintain similar roof forms and are subordinate to the existing house as seen from the front.
2. Existing vegetation will screen the house addition and mechanicals from the street.
3. Although the materials are modern, they will appear as though they are traditional materials.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY BRETT AND KAY HOLLAND FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT AN ADDITION AT 135 W. CLEARVIEW AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 50-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 50-12, DATED JUNE 15, 2012,

BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

- **STANDING SEAM METAL ROOF BE ABOVE BEDROOM WINDOW, AND TO THE RIGHT AND LEFT**
- **RAISE THE GREAT ROOM WINDOW TO SAME HEIGHT AS BEDROOM WINDOW**

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. Window and Door Replacement – **605 Evening St. (John Wheatley) AR 51-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. John Wheatley approached the microphone and stated his address is 702 Evening St., Worthington, Ohio, and he is representing the applicant for 605 Evening St. Mr. Coulter said it will be a distinct improvement. There were no other questions or comments.

Findings of fact:

1. This is a request to replace the existing aluminum windows with new aluminum clad wood windows. The exterior will be white. The size of the windows is not changing and the window pattern will stay the same, achieved with muntins between panes of glass.
2. A rear storm door is slated for replacement.
3. Block windows on the south elevation are proposed

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JOHN M. WHEATLEY FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE WINDOWS AND A DOOR AT 605 EVENING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 51-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 51-12, DATED JUNE 15, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

d. Signage – **890-A Proprietors Rd.** (DaNite Sign Co./S & G Worthington Venture) **AR 52-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts of the case, pointing out an additional freestanding sign at the development may not be appropriate. If other office condominium owners wanted the same, there would be too many. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Bill Schiffman approached the microphone and stated he lives at 452 Overbrook Dr., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Schiffman said he owns the CPA and Financial Planning firm that just moved into the building. He said most of their clients during the winter season have night time appointments and it is important for them to find the building. He said he is bringing in 13 new jobs to the city with the possibility of 10 more positions in the future. Mr. Schiffman said he has spoken with the condominium association and they are okay with the new sign and do not feel a need for the same signage. Mr. Hermann asked Mr. Schiffman if there would be any other tenants in the building. Mr. Schiffman said no, they will occupy the entire building. He said they own 890 A through D on Proprietors Rd.

Mrs. Bitar said the application will need to go to City Council for Amendment to Development Plan approval. Mr. Coulter said he likes the sign, its brick base, and its simple design. Mr. Hunter agreed and said this sign could be a benchmark for others that may want a sign down the road. Mr. Hermann agreed that it is a good model sign. Mr. Schiffman said he appreciated the compliments. His business is currently located in Clintonville in a house built in the 1920's. He said he wanted to maintain the character of the house so he modeled the new sign after the one he is currently using in Clintonville. Mr. Hunter suggested the street number would be easier to read if it was white instead of black. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A new freestanding sign is proposed for the Worthington Station property. Previously, two freestanding brick signs, one for each entrance, and some directional signs with addresses were approved. Also, several of the office condominiums have wall-mounted signage.
2. The proposed sign is 6' wide and 4.5' high with an 18" high brick base. The aluminum sign will be internally illuminated with light only shining through the logo and lettering. A gable at the top will have the address and be painted to match the building. The proposed sign has 5 colors, so will need a variance.
3. Placement is proposed 20' from the right-of-way.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed sign is complimentary to the building.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DANITE SIGN CO. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A NEW FREESTANDING SIGN AT 890 PROPRIETORS RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 52-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 52-12, DATED JUNE 14, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Conditional Use

- a. Material Storage in I-2 Zoning District – **6282-6386** Proprietors Rd. (Lynn Sullivan)
CU 05-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Peter and Mrs. Lynn Sullivan approached the microphone and stated their address is 1886 Jewett Rd., Powell, Ohio. Mr. Sullivan said their tenant is an engineering firm that has an unusual business. They specialize in defects in underground piping. Their business is expanding and they are about ready to sign a three year lease, but need to be assured they can have more space and secure the piping which is subject to vandalism as is sits out in the open. The fence would provide security. Mrs. Holcombe said she understood the fence was necessary for security purposes and the other Board members agreed. There were no other questions, and no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. A business located in this building requires more outside storage for pipes that are being inspected, and Sullivan Builders would like an area to store small construction equipment.
2. Two enclosed areas are proposed to be fenced in using a 6' high chain link fence with privacy slats.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed use is appropriate for this site.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY LYNN SULLIVAN FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO EXPAND MATERIAL STORAGE SPACE AT 6282-6386 PROPRIETORS RD. AS PER CASE NO. CU 05-12, DRAWINGS NO. CU 05-12, DATED JUNE 15, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; and Mr. Coulter, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

b. Office Expansion in C-5 Zoning District – **679 #F High St.** (Real Living HER LLC)
CU 06-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mrs. Holcombe said she would be abstaining from comments and voting. Mrs. Bitar explained that Real Living HER has been a great downtown business and corporate citizen, and the community appreciates the involvement in activities. This business would like to expand their square footage and use the lower level of the building. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Ron Hildebrand approached the microphone and stated his address is 77 E. Nationwide Blvd., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Hildebrand did not have any comments and the Board did not have any further questions. There were no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. Real Living HER is currently located at 681 High St., operating with Conditional Use Permit approval. This application would add to the square footage of the operation by allowing expansion of the business into the lower level of the building.
2. The office has participated in downtown events by opening the door, serving refreshments, and providing music and information, and will continue to do so.

Conclusion:

1. The addition of space for this office use is appropriate for this location.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY REAL LIVING HER LLC FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO EXPAND THE OFFICE SPACE AT 681 HIGH ST. IN 679-F HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. CU 06-12, DRAWINGS NO. CU 06-12, DATED JUNE 19, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, abstained; Mr. Hermann, aye; and Mr. Coulter, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

2. Amendment to Development Plan

- a. Signage – **890-A Proprietors Rd.** (DaNite Sign Co./S&G Worthington Venture)
ADP 06-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The matter was already discussed with Mr. Schiffman earlier in the evening. The applicant would need a variances to add a third freestanding sign to the property, and for 5 colors. Mrs. Holcombe asked Mr. Schiffman to tell the condominium association that the Board is very disappointed that the trees were removed. Mr. Schiffman said that he would relay the message, but he plans to beautify their piece of Worthington Station, and a sprinkling system is already in place. There were no other questions.

Findings of fact:

1. In addition to the facts in the ARB agenda item, variances will be needed to add a third freestanding sign to the property and for having 5 colors on a sign.

Conclusion:

1. An additional freestanding is appropriate at this location.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DANITE SIGN CO. FOR APPROVAL TO AMEND THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN FOR 890 PROPRIETORS RD. BY INSTALLING A NEW FREESTANDING SIGN AS PER CASE NO. ADP 06-12, DRAWINGS NO. ADP 06-12, DATED JUNE 4 2012, BE RECOMMENDED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; and Mr. Coulter, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

There was no other business to discuss. Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting and Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. The meeting adjourned at 9:38 p.m.