



MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION
January 26, 2017

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with the following members present: Mikel Coulter, Chair; Thomas Reis, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Edwin Hofmann; Amy Lloyd; and David Foust. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative to the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Planning Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Commission member James Sauer was absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:00 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of minutes of the January 12, 2017 meeting

Mr. Hofmann moved to approve the minutes and Mr. Reis seconded the motion. All Board members voted, "Aye." The minutes were approved.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Foust to explain the photograph on display. Mr. Foust said the building in the photograph was the original train station in Worthington. The building no longer exists, but was located off of Proprietors Rd. alongside the railroad tracks, immediately north of St. Rt. 161. Mr. Foust said the architecture was typical 19th century style which mimicked houses in the area built in the same time period. He was not certain when the building was torn down, possibly when passenger service stopped in the 1930's.

1. Unfinished

- a. Holiday Inn Site Redevelopment – **7007 N. High St.** (Alliance Hospitality, Inc.) **AR 32-16**
Remained tabled

2. New

- a. Freestanding Sign Revision – **6600 N. High St.** (Michelle Muchow/FC Bank) **AR 06-17**
(Amendment to AR 45-16)

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

Approval was granted on May 14, 2015 for demolition of the 3 buildings on the site, and construction of a new two story office building to serve as the corporate office and a bank branch with drive-thru for FC Bank. On June 25, 2015 lighting, landscaping and window details were approved. A permit was issued in October of 2015 to begin construction on the site. In February of 2016 amendments to the windows and roof screen, and a flagpole were approved. On May 12, 2016 the signage was approved. The building and site were substantially complete and the business opened in the middle of November, 2016

This application is a request for approval of additional text on the monument sign.

Project Details:

1. The freestanding sign location was approved centered on the building and 10' from the right-of-way line as is allowed by Code. The sign was approved to be surrounded by Big Blue Lilyturf plants. As installed, the sign consists of an 8' wide x 51" high cabinet faced with smooth cast stone, on an 8' wide x 2'8" high base with brick veneer to match the building. Dark green and gray painted aluminum reverse channel letters and logo are mounted on the sign faces. White LED illumination shines to the rear from inside the letters giving a halo effect. The depth of the characters is 3.5" and the distance between the back of the letters and the sign face 1.5".
2. In addition to the halo illuminated FC Bank letters and logo, a panel was placed at the bottom of the sign face saying "A DIVISION OF CNB BANK". The 3" high x 43" wide panel is comprised of 1/8" thick aluminum composite material.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

While the regulations permit a certain maximum square footage of signs for a business, try to minimize the size and number of signs. Place only basic names and graphics on signs along the street so that drive-by traffic is not bombarded with too much information. Free-standing signs should be of the "monument" type; they should be as low as possible. Such signs should have an appropriate base such as a brick planting area with appropriate landscaping or no lighting. Colors for signs should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings they serve, whether placed on the ground or mounted on the building.

Recommendation:

Page 2 of 9

ARB/MPC Meeting January 26, 2017

Minutes

Staff is recommending approval of this application. Although the sign seems clearer without the panel, the additional text is part of the business name and is small enough to be unobtrusive.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Andy Dale, of 6600 N. High St., Worthington, Ohio, did not have other comments. Mr. Foust asked Mr. Dale if this was a requirement by the parent company and Mr. Dale explained the wording is a legal name because they have four divisions in three states, so they need to identify the parent company under the divisional name. Board members did not have other questions or concerns. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Reis moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY FASTSIGNS ON BEHALF OF FC BANK TO AMEND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AR 45-16 WITH THE ADDITION OF TEXT ON THE FREESTANDING SIGN AT 6600 N. HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 06-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 06-17, DATED JANUARY 4, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

- b. Parking Lot Lights – **300 W. Dublin-Granville Rd. - Mirolo Pavilion** (Worthington City Schools) **AR 07-17**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

The Mirolo Community Pavilion, located in the flats at Thomas Worthington High School, was renovated in 2014 and is now used by the schools not only as an outdoor education center but also as a gathering space for community groups and events. The 2014 work included: the installation of new glass overhead doors, exterior doors and windows; the addition of lighting and landscaping; enlarged restroom facilities; kitchen renovations; and the addition of technology systems.

Lighting is proposed for the parking areas adjacent to the building with this application.

Project Details:

1. Two 12' high poles are proposed that would sit on 30" high concrete bases. One light pole would be north of the building near the south side of the parking lot and west of the

sidewalk. The other would be off the southern corner of the parking area west and south of the building.

2. The poles and LED fixtures are proposed as dark bronze, and the proposed light color is 3000k.
3. The lights are on a photocell, so will be illuminated when it is dark.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Avoid lighting fixtures mounted high above the ground and excessive brightness. Watch for excessive “spilling” of light onto adjacent properties. Typically, exposed bases are not desired. If they are necessary, the base should be a dark color to blend with the surroundings. The Board should review the exterior detail and relationship of the changes to an existing site.

Recommendations:

Staff is recommending approval of this application. The proposed light poles are appropriate for the site, except the exposed concrete bases should be eliminated or made a darker color (brown or black).

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Tim Gehring, Director of Facility Management for Worthington Schools, 200 E. Wilson Bridge Rd., Worthington, Ohio, said they noticed this past fall how dark the area was after sunset. The building has become increasing popular with other groups and they feel there is a safety issue, so they would like to install additional lighting. Mrs. Holcombe asked Mr. Gehring if they would be painting the concrete bases of the light poles and Mr. Gehring said if that is what the Board recommends. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Reis moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY WORTHINGTON CITY SCHOOLS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD LIGHT POLES AT 300 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD., AS PER CASE NO. AR 07-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 07-17, DATED JANUARY 10, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

c. Shed – 617 Hartford St. (Jim Roop) AR 08-17

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This Homestead style house was built in the early 1900's and is a contributing building in the Worthington Historic District. Since the current owners purchased the property they have made many modifications to the house and site. Last year, the Worthington United Methodist Church reclaimed some property at the rear of this lot, and installed a new fence along the property line which required removal of an existing shed.

The property owners are now seeking approval for installation of a new shed.

Project Details:

1. An 8' x 12' shed is proposed which would sit on a 10' x 14' crushed limestone pad. The proposed shed would be placed 5' from the north and west property lines.
2. The shed would be a Weaver Barns "Estate" style which has a 7/12 pitch gabled roof with asphalt shingles, wood siding and trim, and windows and doors with classic trim elements.
3. Charcoal gray and white trim are the colors proposed for the shed, to match the rear portion of the house.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

New outbuildings should use design cues from older nearby structures, including form, massing, roof shape, roof pitch and height, materials, window and door types and detailing. Try to create a new building compatible in appearance with the house it accompanies.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this application. The proposed shed style is compatible with the house.

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar explained there was a correction needed for the memo, the roof of the shed will not have asphalt shingles, but instead a metal roof in an effort to collect rain water to be used for the vegetation on the property. Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Jim Roop, of 617 Hartford St., Worthington, Ohio, did not have further comments. Board members did not have any questions or concerns. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JIM ROOP FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD A SHED AT 617 HARTFORD ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 90-16, DRAWINGS NO. AR 90-16, DATED JUNE 16, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF

FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

- d. Window Replacement – **956 High St.** (Worthington Historical Society/Orange Johnson House) **AR 09-17**

Findings of fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

The oldest portion of the Orange Johnson House was built in 1811 by Arora Buttles. The six-room house was on thirty-five acres, and part of a farm lot next to the village. Many interior and exterior elements reflect the pioneer architecture of the day. In 1816 Orange Johnson, a hornsmith who specialized in comb-making, bought the property. He added a Federal-style addition in 1819 highlighted by the entry with its curved fanlight, sidelights and pilasters leading to a center hall. The front door in the addition faced west toward the road that was becoming the main route (now High St.) between Columbus, the new state capital, and Lake Erie.

The Orange Johnson House was used as a residence and the adjacent farmland was split off and developed over the years. In 1962 the house had been vacant for several years and the Worthington Historical Society purchased the property. The society spent 9 years restoring the house and opened it to the public as a museum in 1972. Other improvements have been made since that time, including the roof being replaced in 2010. This is a request to replace the 13 windows on the front and south side of the 1819 addition.

Project Details:

1. The existing 6 over 6 wood windows in the Federal part of the house are not original to the structure. They were likely replaced in the early 1900's based on photographic evidence. The windows have deteriorated to the point of needing replacement. Late nineteenth century photographs show 9 panels over 9 panels in the windows. After consultation with the Ohio History Connection and the Cohee Preservation Company, the Historical Society plans to install new windows to match the original 9 over 9 style as closely as possible.
2. The new windows are proposed to be made of Honduran Mahogany which is rot and insect resistant. They would be fabricated to appear as seen in the late 1800's photo, matching the size and profile, and with Bendheim "Light Reproduction Glass" panes to give the look of 1800's glass. The sashes are proposed to be painted white to match the existing. Frames and sills would be repaired or replaced as necessary, with the exterior also painted white.

Land Use Plans:

Page 6 of 9

ARB/MPC Meeting January 26, 2017

Minutes

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Be sure that replacement window designs are appropriate for the style or time period of the house. Avoid enlarging or downsizing window openings to accommodate stock sizes of replacements.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of the application. Great care has been taken to replicate what is thought to be the original windows in the house, and would therefore be appropriate.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Kate LaLonde, Director of the Worthington Historical Society, of 6831 Meadow Glen Dr. S., Westerville, Ohio, explained the fan light above the door will stay the same, only the nine windows on the front and the four windows on the south will be replaced. Mrs. Holcombe said she was impressed the windows will be replaced with the same style and quality of windows that were there originally. Ms. LaLonde said they were delighted to find the 1880's original photograph of the building with what they presume was the original design of the building. Board members had no questions or concerns. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY THE WORTHINGTON HISTORICAL SOCIETY FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE WINDOWS AT 956 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 09-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 09-17, DATED JANUARY 13, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Conditional Use

- a. Restaurant in C-5 Zoning District – **656 High St.** (James & Kathryn Welte/Peace, Love & Little Donuts) CU **01-17**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

Page 7 of 9

ARB/MPC Meeting January 26, 2017

Minutes

This commercial building was originally constructed in the early 1900's and is a contributing property in the Worthington Historic District. Magic Cruises & Tours has been on the south side of the building since 1989. A flower shop had been on the north side of the building since the late 1980's, with Flowers on High operating there until last year.

This request is for a new business called Peace, Love & Little Donuts.

Project Details:

1. The proposed business is a retail shop selling donuts to the public. The applicant is requesting approval for seating inside the shop, so the business is also considered a restaurant which is a Conditional Use in the C-5 Zoning District.
2. Two tables with chairs are proposed toward the front of the space, and a stand up bar would be across the front of the store.
3. Wall and projection signs are proposed that would need approval from the ARB.

Basic Standards and Review Elements: The following general elements are to be considered when hearing applications for Conditional Use Permits:

1. Effect on traffic pattern – Additional foot traffic would be expected.
2. Effect on public facilities – No effect has been identified.
3. Effect on sewerage and drainage facilities – The effect would be minimal.
4. Utilities required – No new utilities would be required.
5. Safety and health considerations – None have been identified.
6. Noise, odors and other noxious elements, including hazardous substances and other environmental hazards – None have been identified.
7. Hours of use – Generally 6:00 am – 6:00 pm Monday through Friday; 7:00 am – 3:00 pm Saturday; and 8:00 am – 2:00 pm Sunday.
8. Shielding or screening considerations for neighbors – Not applicable.
9. Appearance and compatibility with the general neighborhood – The business would be unique in Old Worthington and should be compatible.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Conditional Use Permit Regulations

The following basic standards apply to conditional uses in any "C" or "I" District: the location, size, nature and intensity of the use, operations involved in or conducted in connection with it, its site layout and its relation to streets giving access to it, shall be such that both pedestrian and vehicular traffic to and from it will not be hazardous, both at the time and as the same may be expected to increase with increasing development of the Municipality. The provisions for parking, screening, setback, lighting, loading and service areas and sign location and area shall also be specified by the applicant and considered by the Commission.

Worthington Comprehensive Plan

A good mix of restaurant and niche retail shops are appropriate for Old Worthington. Market to desired retail users that are targeting the authentic town center with pedestrian-oriented store plans and products.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this applications. The proposed business is appropriate at this location.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. James Welte, of 8298 Harlem Rd., Westerville, Ohio, explained he has looked at the sign, but his sign will not be as colorful. He is considering a white background with black lettering. He said they want something traditional and are going to try to install an ADA approved bathroom, and some other upgrades to the property. Mr. Welte said he is excited because this is his first venture. Mrs. Holcombe asked Mr. Welte if the donuts would be made on site and Mr. Welte said yes. Mr. Reis asked if there would be a variety of donuts and Mr. Welte said yes, there will be around forty different flavors available, but the number one flavor currently is maple bacon. Mr. Welte said customers will be able to watch the fresh donuts being made. He plans to open by June 1, 2017. He is trying to keep things local. The architect and contractor he recently interviewed were both from the Worthington area.

Motion:

Mr. Reis moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JAMES & KATHRYN WELTE FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO OPERATE A RESTAURANT IN THE C-5 ZONING DISTRICT AT 656 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. CU 01-17 DRAWINGS NO. CU 01-17, DATED JANUARY 9, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE PLANNING GOALS OF THE CITY, AS REFERENCED IN THE LAND USE PLANS AND FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye. The motion was approved.

D. Other

Mrs. Bitar said the Community Relations Commission is inviting all of the Board & Commission members to the McConnell Arts on Wednesday, February 15, 2017, at 6:15 p.m. for a reception and a presentation will take place at 7:00 p.m. The presentation will be about understanding metropolitan change and the implications for Worthington. She asked the Board members to let Mr. Brown or Ms. Lori Trego know if they plan to attend.

E. Adjournment

Mr. Reis moved to adjourn the meeting at 7:29 p.m., and Mr. Hofmann seconded the motion. All Board members voted, "Aye." The meeting was adjourned.