



MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION
February 9, 2017

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with the following members present: Mikel Coulter, Chair; Thomas Reis, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Edwin Hofmann; Amy Lloyd; and David Foust. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative to the Municipal Planning Commission; Lee Brown, Director of Planning & Building; Lynda Bitar, Planning Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Commission member James Sauer was absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:00 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of minutes of the January 26, 2017 meeting

Mr. Reis moved to approve the minutes and Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. All Board members voted, "Aye." The minutes were approved.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Foust to explain the photograph on display. Mr. Foust said the location of the photograph was West Granville Road, looking east towards the hill from the corner of Evening Street. Mr. Foust pointed out some unique features in the photo. He said the photo looks as if it were taken in the past thirty to forty years, but the postcard has an original date of 1910. The house on the corner had a tile roof which was eventually replaced but looks similar. The lamp post out front, which is pre 1920's, was powered with gas. All of the original houses are still standing and remain largely unchanged, and one house was erected shortly after the photo. Mr. Foust believed 1910 was too early for sidewalks, but said they could have been a new innovation for the time period. The street looked pretty much the same as it did one hundred years ago.

Mr. Coulter said the applications for 666 High St. and 1033 High St. will not be heard this evening.

1. New

- a. Window Changes & New Front Door – **686 Greenwich St.** (Miller Troyer Custom Homes/Graupmann) **AR 10-17**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

In 1989, the 2 lots at the southeast corner of E. Granville Rd. and Greenwich St. were re-subdivided to create 4 lots with frontage along Greenwich St. At the time, all 4 lots were required to remain part of the Architectural Review District. This application is for the house on the southernmost lot which was constructed in 1992. The house is two stories with a gabled roof. The applicant plans to remodel the kitchen, which requires some exterior changes.

Project Details:

1. With installation of new cabinets and the sink on the south wall, the existing double hung windows would be relocated to the east to be part of the family room. A smaller casement window is proposed above the sink. The window style and trim would match the existing.
2. Approval of a new front door is also requested. The new fiberglass door would have 3 lights above 2 tall narrow panels, with near full height sidelights. The existing has 2 lights over 2 panels of about equal height.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Be sure that window designs are appropriate for the style or time period of the house. It is important that any doors and the entrances in which they are set should be compatible with the style and period of a building. Compatibility of design and materials and exterior detail and relationships are standards of review in the Architectural District ordinance.

Recommendations:

Staff is recommending approval of the application. The proposed window changes and new door are appropriate for this house.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Bill Horn, of 12685 Gorsuch Rd., Columbus, Ohio, said he was representing Miller Troyer Custom Homes. Mr. Horn said they will be lining up the step for the front porch and the sidewalk with the front door since the door will have two sidelights. Board members had no questions or concerns. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present who wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Reis moved:

Page 2 of 11

ARB/MPC Meeting February 9, 2017

Minutes

THAT THE REQUEST BY MILLER TROYER CUSTOM HOMES ON BEHALF OF BRAD AND KATHY GRAUPMANN FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CHANGE SOUTH SIDE WINDOWS AND THE FRONT DOOR AT 686 GREENWICH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 10-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 10-17, DATED JANUARY 23, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe; aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

b. Shutter Removal – **666 High St.** (Gloria Yonadi) **AR 11-17**

Mrs. Bitar said the applicant requested to have this item tabled. Mr. Reis moved to table this application and Mr. Hofmann seconded the motion. All Board members voted, “Aye.” The application was tabled.

c. Fence – **820 Morning St.** (Mahlon & Cindy Nowland) **AR 12-17**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This property at the northeast corner of Morning St. and Franklin Ave. has a two-story house that was constructed in 1993 with a deck to the rear. A screened porch was added to the south in 1997. This application is a request to enclose the rear yard with a fence.

Project Details:

1. The owners would like the fence to extend 11’ south of the room addition to the 20’ setback line for Franklin Ave. At the north end the fence would connect to the house near the rear.
2. The proposed black metal picket fence would be 4’ tall.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Fencing should be open in style; constructed with traditional materials; 3’ to 4’ in height; in the back yard; and of simple design, appropriate for the house style. Design and materials should be compatible with the existing structure.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this application, as the style and placement of the proposed fence meet the Design Guidelines.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mrs. Cindy Nowland, of 820 Morning St., Worthington, Ohio, showed a fence panel. Board members had no concerns. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present who wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Foust moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY MAHLON & CINDY NOWLAND FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A FENCE AT 820 MORNING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 12-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 12-17, DATED JANUARY 25, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

d. Addition – **614 Oxford St.** (Sean Kocheran/Senff) **AR 13-17**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This farmhouse was constructed in the late 1800's, and there have been modifications and additions over the years. The house is a contributing building in the Worthington Historic District. Last year, the owners received approval to remove the porch railings, and the house was painted white. This request would allow for construction of an addition to the rear.

Project Details:

1. The 837 square foot rear one-story addition would allow the owners to expand the kitchen.
2. A gabled roof is proposed in the same pitch as the garage, extending up from and to the rear of that gable. The peak of the new gable would be visible from the front of the house.
3. The materials are planned to look like the existing house, with the siding being fiber cement.

Land Use Plans:**Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance**

Residential additions are recommended to maintain similar roof forms; be constructed as far to the rear and sides of the existing residence as possible; be subordinate; and have walls set back from the corners of the main house. Be sure that window designs are appropriate for the style or time

period of the house. Design and materials should be traditional, and compatible with the existing structure.

Recommendations:

Staff is recommending approval of this application, as the addition is compatible with the existing house and meets the recommendations of the design guidelines.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Sean Kocheran, of 351 W. South St., Worthington, Ohio, did not have any comments. Mr. Foust said he had no problem as it was on the rear of the house. Mr. Coulter concurred. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present who wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Reis moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SEAN KOCHERAN ON BEHALF OF A.J. & KRISTEN SENFF TO CONSTRUCT AN ADDITION TO THE REAR OF 614 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 13-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 13-17, DATED JANUARY 27, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

e. Roof – **867 High St.** (Able Roof, LLC/867 High Street Condominium Association) **AR 14-17**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This building was constructed in 1954 and houses 4 office condominiums. The brick building is two stories with a hipped roof. On the south side are 2 shed roof additions, and replacement of the roof is proposed for these structures.

Project Details:

1. The existing shed roofs are metal and the wood structure underneath has considerable damage to the wood.
2. Repair and replacement of the roofs are proposed, with asphalt shingles to match the black shingles on the roof of the main building.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Compatibility of design and materials and exterior detail and relationships are standards of review in the Architectural District ordinance.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this application, as the proposed material is appropriate for this building.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Todd Cannon, of 4777 Westerville Rd., Columbus, Ohio, did not have any comments. Board members did not have any questions or concerns. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present who wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Reis moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ABLE ROOF, LLC ON BEHALF OF THE 867 HIGH STREET CONDOMINIUM ASSOCIATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE ROOFING AT 867 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 14-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 14-17, DATED JANUARY 30, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

- f. Modifications to Proposed Gasoline/Convenience Store Station – **2182 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (United Dairy Farmers, Inc.) **AR 15-17** (Amendment to AR 128-16)

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

A new UDF convenience store and gas station at the northeast corner of W. Dublin-Granville Rd. and Linworth Rd. was approved by the Architectural Review Board in September of 2014. In December of 2016 an extension of the previous approval was granted, with the bollards by the building, the front elevation, and light poles and fixtures needing to come back for further approval.

Project Details:

1. With the last submittal, 29 bollards were to be placed along the front of the building, lining up with building and window features and spaced about 3'11" apart. This proposal would extend the distance between bollards to 5'3", reducing the number to 22, and they would no longer line up with building and window features. The color was to be bronze with silver reflective stripes at the top, but can be discussed at the meeting.
2. The front of the building had been modified from the original approval to accommodate a coffee station, and the Board felt the exterior was not acceptable. The proposed elevation now would have full height windows adjacent to the east of the door, and 4 adjacent windows ending at the water table.
3. The proposed light poles and fixtures are proposed to be an aluminum color, as the applicant feels that would be less noticeable than a darker version. The fixture height would be no more than 15' above grade. Lighting levels were approved to be ≤ 0 footcandles at the east property line and ≤ 30 footcandles under the canopy. The lighting color has not been identified, but was previously shown as available in 5000k or 4000k.
4. A new version of a freestanding sign has been presented, with a sign cabinet 30 square feet in size. The shown base is stone, but the base would include brick to match the building. The base is about 30" in height.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Comprehensive Plan Update & 2005 Strategic Plan

A neighborhood retail service center should be established at the West Dublin-Granville Road and Linworth Road intersection to create a commercial node for the community.

Worthington Design Guidelines

Windows: Use traditional sizes, proportions and spacing for windows. Doing so will help link Old Worthington and newer areas through consistent design elements.

Signage: While the regulations permit a certain maximum square footage of signs for a business, try to minimize the size and number of signs. Place only basic names and graphics on signs along the street so that drive-by traffic is not bombarded with too much information. Free-standing signs should be of the "monument" type (standing vertically, mounted on a ground-level base and not on a pole); they should be as low as possible. Such signs should have an appropriate base such as a brick planting area with appropriate landscaping or no lighting.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this application with the followings considerations:

- The bollards by the building may be less noticeable in the previous configuration, lining up with architectural and window features.
- The window tinting should be non-reflective and as light in color as possible to achieve the desired interior effect.
- Color temperature for the lighting is typically approved to be no greater than 2700K. Selection of different fixtures may be necessary.
- The freestanding sign size and design are now appropriate.
- The transformer must be screened with landscape material and be a color to blend in with the screening.

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar explained the transformer has been proposed to be located at the northeast corner of the property, but the applicant still needed approval from the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. John Johnston said he is the architect for United Dairy Farmers. Mr. Johnston said they have applied for a variance for the transformer with the Board of Zoning Appeals, and have already spoken with AEP (American Electric Power) about having the transformer be green. Landscaping will be planted around the transformer. He said the original intent was to place a bollard in front of every mullion in the window, but since he was asked to reduce the number of bollards he spaced them apart with a dimension he was comfortable with to inhibit a vehicle from damaging the storefront. Mr. Johnston suggested the bollards could be bronze as was originally proposed, or a complimentary color to the storefront of the building such as gray with white striping. Mr. Johnston said he did not have a preference if the Board wanted to go with the number of bollards as originally presented, or as presented at this meeting.

Mr. Johnston said the lighting company did not recommend using 2700k, they suggested using 3500k to 4000k. He said either way if the Board recommended using 3500k or 2700k that would be a special order. Mr. Foust asked if the lighting would all be the same Kelvin rating and Mr. Johnston said yes. Mr. Foust said he would prefer the wider spacing of the bollards and the bronze tone for the light posts as opposed to silver and Mrs. Lloyd agreed. Mr. Reis asked the Board members what their preference was for the Kelvin rating and Mr. Myers suggested using the same Kelvin rating approved for the Telhio project. Mr. Coulter thought if everyone was comfortable with what Telhio used, the motion could reflect matching that lighting temperature. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present who wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Reis moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY UNITED DAIRY FARMERS, INC. TO AMEND AR #125-16 TO CONSTRUCT A NEW GASOLINE/CONVENIENCE STORE STATION AT 2182 WEST DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD., AS PER CASE NO. AR 15-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 15-17, DATED JANUARY 27, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING AMENDMENTS:

- **THAT THE POLES AND BOLLARDS BE OF A SIMILAR BRONZE COLOR**
- **THAT THE LAMP RATING BE SIMILAR TO WHAT WAS APPROVED FOR THE TELHIO PROJECT.**

Mr. Hofmann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hofmann, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Subdivision without Plat

- a. Lot Split – **128 Highland Ave.** (John Hitzemann) **SWOP 01-17**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This lot is 0.92 acres at the northeast corner of Highland Ave. and the Westview Dr. right-of-way, which is unimproved at that location. The property is in the R-10 Zoning District. When originally platted as part of the Northhigh Acre subdivision in 1923, there were 2 separate lots (100' & 111' wide) that extended approximately 380' north to south. At some point, the lots were re-divided so the division was east-west rather than north-south, creating two 211' wide x 189' deep lots. A 1596 square foot house constructed in 1968 sits on the eastern part of the southern lot, with access to Highland Ave. The owners would like to construct a second single family house on the property, and are asking for approval to subdivide the property again.

Project Details:

1. Division of the parcel would be by way of a new north to south property line, creating a 100' wide lot to the west, and a 111' wide lot to the east, matching the widths of the original platted parcels. The new lots would be 18,900 square feet and 20,979 square feet, exceeding the Code requirement for minimum lot width of 10,400 square feet in R-10. Required setbacks would be 30' in the front and rear; 20' for the west side adjacent to the Westview Dr. Right-of-way; and 8' on the east side.
2. One-family dwellings must be a minimum of 1600 square feet in area in the R-10 Zoning District. A sample floor plan is included with the application materials showing a >2000 square foot ranch house.
3. When subdividing property, sidewalks are required along public streets, whether improved or unimproved. The applicant will construct sidewalks along Highland Ave., but is requesting a variance to eliminate the requirement along Westview Dr. as it is unimproved. The City has discussed a path for bicycles and pedestrians in this area, but does not have plans at this point for construction of either.
4. Street trees are required to be planted as part of subdivisions. Coordination with the City's arborists would be required.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Subdivision Regulations

"Subdivision" means the division or combination of any parcel or parcels of land shown as a unit or as contiguous units on the latest tax roll. A proposed Subdivision of a parcel of land along an existing Public Street in any R-16 or R-10 Zoning District, not involving the opening, widening or extension of any street, road or access point and involving a tract of land from which no more than five Lots can be created after the original tract has been completely subdivided may be submitted to the Municipal Planning Commission for approval without Plat. The Commission may establish reasonable necessary procedures and requirements to be met by the owner desiring to subdivide property.

Whenever any new single-family lots are created in accordance with the provisions of this Code in any residential zoning district, then the subdivider, developer or owner, as the case may be, shall make a cash payment to the City of five hundred dollars (\$500.00) per each new lot created for deposit in the Special Parks Fund. Such deposits shall be used for the capital costs associated with the City's parks, playground and recreation areas.

Sidewalks shall be provided on both sides of all streets in any Subdivision, except that along streets without curb and gutter either Recreation Paths or Sidewalks shall be constructed, and none are required in Alleys. Monuments and stakes, and street trees shall be required.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this application be recommended to the City Council, with the following items being required as part of the subdivision:

- A variance be obtained from the City Council so a sidewalk would not have to be constructed along the Westview Dr. Right-of-way.
- A public area payment of \$500 be made to the City for the Special Parks Fund.
- Installation of street trees and survey stakes.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. John Hitzemann, of 107 Mariemont Dr. N., Westerville, Ohio, said he was representing his parents who own the property. Mr. Hitzemann said he was requesting not to construct the sidewalk along Westview Drive because they have had problems in the past with trash and do not want to encourage more foot traffic to the area. Board members had no questions or concerns. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present who wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Reis moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JOHN HITZEMANN FOR APPROVAL OF SUBDIVISION WITHOUT PLAT TO SPLIT THE PROPERTY AT 128 HIGHLAND AVE. INTO TWO LOTS, AS PER CASE NO. SWOP 01-17, DRAWINGS NO. SWOP 01-17, DATED JANUARY 27, 2017, BE RECOMMENDED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL

BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hofmann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; and Mr. Hofmann, aye. The motion was approved.

B. Architectural Review Board (continued)

2. Unfinished

- a. New Medical Office Building & Building Demolition – **1033 High St.** (United Methodist Children’s Home) **AR 114-16**

Remained Tabled

&

C. Municipal Planning Commission (continued)

1. Amendment to Development Plan - Unfinished

- a. New Medical Office Building - **1033 High St.** (United Methodist Children’s Home) **ADP 06-16**

Remained Tabled

D. Other

Mr. Brown said the Community Relations Commission is inviting all of the Board & Commission members to the McConnell Arts on Wednesday, February 15, 2017, at 6:15 p.m. for a reception and a presentation will take place at 7:00 p.m. The presentation will be about understanding metropolitan change and the implications for Worthington. He asked the Board members to let him or Lori Trego know if they plan to attend.

E. Adjournment

Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting at 7:55 p.m., and Mr. Foust seconded the motion. All Board members voted, “Aye.” The meeting was adjourned.