



MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION
February 23, 2017

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with the following members present: Mikel Coulter, Chair; Thomas Reis, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; James Sauer; Amy Lloyd; and David Foust. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative to the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Planning Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Commission member Edwin Hofmann was absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:00 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of minutes of the February 9, 2017 meeting

Mr. Reis moved to approve the minutes and Mr. Foust seconded the motion. All Board members voted, "Aye." The minutes were approved.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Foust to discuss the photograph that was on display. Mr. Foust replied the building in the photograph was the same building as the address of the first applicant, 666 High St. He explained he was not endorsing the absence of shutters on the second floor, the building at the time was a different style. The 1920's street lights had globe style lamps. Mr. Foust believed the photograph was taken in 1953 during the parade for the 150th anniversary of Worthington.

1. Unfinished

- a. Shutter Removal – **666 High St.** (Gloria Yonadi) **AR 11-17**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This commercial building was constructed in 1964, with the first floor for shops and restaurants and the second floor for offices. The more recent approvals were for the Whitney House on the first floor, Rolls Realty on the second floor, and joint identification signs for all of the second floor tenants. Approval is sought with this application to leave shutters off of the front of the building

Project Details:

1. Shutters were originally in place for the second floor windows in the front part of the building, and the first floor windows at the rear of the building. The shutters were blue in the early 1990's and early 2000's and then painted black when P.K. O'Ryan's opened for business in 2002.
2. The shutters were removed from the three second floor windows on the front of the building due to poor condition, and the building owner prefers not to replace them. The shutters are still in place on the north side of the building.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Shutters should be installed if they are appropriate to the character of the building. Compatibility of design and materials and exterior detail and relationships are standards of review in the Architectural District ordinance.

Recommendations:

Staff is recommending denial of this application. The shutters add to the character of this building and should be replaced and maintained as necessary.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mrs. Gloria Yonadi said she is the owner of the building and the shutters were originally installed in 1964 when Dr. Harding built the building. She said the shutters became rotted and could not be saved. The shutters are no longer available. Mrs. Yonadi said when they took the shutters down they decided they liked the look of the clean lines without the shutters. She made reference to the CVS building located on North Street, and said her building is very similar to that building, and the CVS building does not have shutters. She took the shutters down because of their deteriorated condition and she did not want the shutters to fall down on anybody. Mrs. Yonadi requested to not have to replace the shutters. Mr. Sauer said he liked the building without the shutters, but whatever is decided, he would like both sides of the building to look the same. Mrs. Yonadi said having shutters custom made would be very costly and she cannot afford to have custom shutters made. She said she purchased vinyl shutters but they looked cheap up against the building so she took them back to Lowes. Mrs. Bitar asked Mrs. Yonadi if she had looked at fiberglass shutters. Mrs. Yonadi replied no, but said she prefers the look without the shutters.

Mr. Reis believed the shutters are important to the finish of the building and he is in favor of having the shutters replaced. He said fiberglass shutters could be fitted for the windows without having to order custom made replacements. Mrs. Yonadi said the shutters have been down for two years, but no one noticed until now. Mrs. Holcombe said she is also in favor of having the shutters replaced. She believes the shutters do affect the character of the building, and both neighboring buildings also have shutters. Mr. Foust said he believed there is something written in the architectural review standard that if a building originally had shutters then the shutters should be replaced to keep the character of the building. Mrs. Bitar referred to the Design Guidelines indicating shutters should be replaced if they are appropriate to the character of the building. Mr. Reis explained that Mrs. Yonadi should have asked for permission to take the shutters down in the first place. He feels the shutters should be replaced and the new shutters should be painted to match the original ones. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Foust moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY KERBYS LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO LEAVE SHUTTERS OFF OF THE BUILDING AT 666 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 11-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 11-17, DATED JANUARY 23, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, nay; Mr. Reis, nay; Mrs. Holcombe, nay; Mr. Sauer, yea, Mrs. Lloyd, nay; Mr. Foust, nay. The motion was denied.

2. New

- a. Awnings, Signage, Patio Seating & CO₂ Tank Enclosure – **7166 N. High St. (WT Development Corp./Blaze Pizza) AR 16-17**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This commercial building was constructed in 2002, and the last original tenant, COSI, closed last year. The current tenants are Starbucks, Immediadent, Jimmy John's and SportClips. At the time of development, the building owner agreed to a unified theme for signage and awnings which included similar sizes, coordinated colors, and internally illuminated channel letters. Text styles were allowed to be different. As tenants have changed over the years, the basic premise of the sign package has been followed, except a larger variety of colors has been allowed. Currently, the signs are red, blue, green, white and black. The awnings, which are light and dark shades of burgundy, have not changed.

This application is a request for Blaze Pizza to locate in the former COSI space at the south end of the building. Approval is sought to change the signage, awnings, and outdoor furniture; add parking signs; and add a carbon dioxide tank with enclosure to the rear.

Project Details:

1. The proposed sign on the front of the space (facing N. High St.) would consist of what appear to be individually mounted, internally illuminated channel letters. It is not clear if a power source would be run for each letter and the logo, or if the wiring would be exposed between the characters. The drawing incorrectly refers to the existing wall being stucco over wood frame. The “BLAZE PIZZA” letters would be 2’ 3 ½” high, fitting between the horizontal trim pieces on the sign band. The returns would be white, and the faces would be covered in orange vinyl. An orange logo is proposed next to the name, and 10 ½” letters saying “FAST-FIRE’D” would be to the right. A color sample is needed.
2. A 3’ diameter projection sign is proposed for the south side of the building. The sign would also be orange and internally illuminated, with white lettering saying “BLAZE PIZZA”. For internally illuminated signs, light is only allowed to pass through the lettering, not the background.
3. The applicant would like to change the awnings from two-toned burgundy to black.
4. Four square aluminum tables with 4 chairs each are proposed along the storefront. Each would have an orange fabric umbrella. What appears to be a trash receptacle is also proposed beside the front door. The style is unknown. Round burgundy trash cans are present elsewhere along the front of the building.
5. An enclosed CO₂ tank is proposed to the rear. The enclosure would be 6’2” high, constructed of metal tubes and slats, and be finished in black.
6. Directional signs are proposed designating 2 spaces in front of the store for “BLAZE TO-GO PICKUP ONLY”. The proposed signs would be 12” x 18”, with the bottom of the sign at 4’ above grade. Per the Code, directional signs must be no higher than 36”.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

The Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance recommend signs be efficient and compatible with the age and architecture of the building. Colors for signs should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings they serve, whether placed on the ground or mounted on the building. Signs must be distinctive enough to be readily visible, but avoid incompatible modern colors such as “fluorescent orange” and similar colors. Exposed raceways or wiring are not desirable. The Worthington Design Guidelines recognizes outdoor seating and tables for use by patrons as giving an open feel and being pedestrian-friendly. The Architectural District Ordinance calls for design and materials to be compatible.

Recommendations:

1. If the wall sign is installed without an exposed raceway or wiring, and the shade of orange is acceptable, the style would be appropriate.
2. The projection sign should not have an illuminated background.
3. This building has always had a unified look with the matching awnings. If black is

approved for this business, it should be continued for the rest of the building.

4. The furniture and umbrella styles are appropriate. Coordinated trash receptacles have been part of this development from the beginning.
5. The preferred location for a CO₂ tank is on the inside of the building. If the tank must be on the outside, the enclosure should blend in with the building colors and not be black.
6. Directional signs of this style would only be permitted with a variance, and should not be approved.

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar explained she spoke with the building owner prior to the meeting this evening and the owner said he would speak to the other tenants to see if they would be willing to change all of the awnings to black. She said the returns on the wall sign would be a silver color instead of white as mentioned above. Mrs. Bitar said the background of the sign cannot be illuminated so the applicant has agreed to an opaque background with the light only shining through the letters for the projection sign. The umbrellas for the outside tables would be plain and not have any graphics.

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Bill Beckett, 10223 E. Cherry Bend Rd., Traverse City, MI, said he was representing WT Development for Blaze Pizza. He said Blaze Pizza is a fast casual concept pizza. There will be five or six standard pizzas or you can build your own, and the cooking time is only two and a half to three minutes. Mr. Beckett said the concept started on the west coast and moved east. There are about one hundred Blaze restaurants in the country, including one that was opened on the Ohio State University campus last year. He said he spoke with the owner of the building who has agreed to work with the tenants on getting all the awnings switched over to black. Mr. Beckett said they prefer using the Blaze trash receptacle because there is a place for the tray on top. He said the deep orange color is part of Blaze Corporations registered trademark.

Mr. Reis said he did not have a problem with anything that was presented except that the enclosure for the tank should be painted to match the brick on the building, and all the trash receptacles should be painted the same color. Mr. Beckett said he would prefer all of the receptacles to be painted black. Mrs. Holcombe agreed the awnings should all be black and in doing so, that might dress up the building. Mr. Myers agreed. He did not want to see what happened to the original Linworth Center where signage and awnings were no longer cohesive. Mr. Sauer agreed the receptacles should all match. He also said he was having trouble understanding the need for a blade sign because blade signs are typically used for pedestrian traffic and there is not a lot of pedestrian traffic along Wilson Bridge Road. Mr. Sauer also felt the wall sign letters were too large. Mr. Coulter asked Mrs. Bitar if the size of the sign was in compliance and she replied yes, but only the sign box was measured not the size of the individual letters. Mr. Coulter said one thing they are trying to do with the Wilson Bridge Road Corridor development project is to encourage people to walk. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Reis moved:

Page 5 of 9

ARB/MPC Meeting February 23, 2017

Minutes

THAT THE REQUEST BY WT DEVELOPMENT CORP. ON BEHALF OF BLAZE PIZZA FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL SIGNS & AWNINGS, AND ADD FURNITURE AND A CO₂ TANK WITH ENCLOSURE AT 7166 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 16-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 16-17, DATED FEBRUARY 8, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING AMENDMENTS:

- **THAT THE TANK ENCLOSURE IN THE REAR MATCH THE COLOR OF THE BRICK;**
- **THAT THE AWNINGS AND TRASH CANS BE THE SAME COLOR FOR THE ENTIRE COMPLEX AND COORDINATED WITH THE OWNER OF THE CENTER.**

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

b. Outdoor Lighting – **70 W. North St.** (Neil & Nancy Gant) **AR 17-17**

Findings of fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This house was built in 1933 and is on a property that includes two 50' wide lots that are both 412.9' deep. The house is a contributing building in the Worthington Historic District and listed as Colonial Revival Influence in style. It spans the width of the eastern 50' lot, sitting about 30' from the front property line, and a one-car freestanding garage is on the west side and is further back than the house. The entire property has been landscaped, including rock features and art, and is maintained by the property owners. This application is a request to add lighting around the site.

Project Details:

1. Low wattage LED lights (generally 2-4 watts) are proposed at locations around the property to highlight various features. Eight different styles of brass fixtures are proposed in 55 locations around the site, including illuminating the house and trees in the front and side, and trees, rock features, pathways and art sculptures in the rear. The light would not spill onto neighboring properties.
2. A small transformer would plug into an existing outlet on the east side of the house, and be screened with existing ground cover.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

In selecting new light fixtures, simple designs are usually the best. Avoid overly ornate fixtures and ones that are out of scale with the building or property. Use as few fixtures as are necessary to provide adequate light for walks, yards and driveways. Avoid overly bright lights. Locate and orient fixtures to minimize light “spill” onto adjacent properties. Keep functional items such as mechanical equipment well screened with fences or plantings.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this application. The proposed lighting design should provide an attractive addition to the property.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Neil Gant, of 70 W. North St., Worthington, Ohio, introduced his contractor Mr. Mike Imondi, the owner of LDF Outdoor Lighting, who will be doing the work. Mr. Gant said they have lived in their house for more than twenty years and have spent that time trying to get their landscaping the way they want it to be. He said they only want to highlight the important features of their yard. The lighting will be very low wattage. Mr. Foust asked if the lights will be on all night, and Mr. Gant replied, yes. Mr. Foust asked if Mr. Gant talked with the neighboring properties about his project and he replied, yes, his neighbors are in favor of his project. Mr. Sauer said he has seen the back yard and the yard is gorgeous, but he was not sure about the lighting being on all the time. Mr. Gant said they have talked with the neighbors extensively on both sides, and all are in favor of the project. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY NEIL & NANCY GANT FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD LIGHTING TO THE PROPERTY AT 70 W. NORTH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 17-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 17-17, DATED FEBRUARY 17, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Reis seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

c. Signage – **1020 High St.** (O’Reilly Family Pharmacy, LLC) **AR 18-17**

Findings of fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

In 1994 a variance was granted allowing three 25 square foot signs on this building. The original signage was for Spare Parts for the Home. In 2004, Columbus Prescription purchased the building and erected signage under the previously granted variance and in a similar style with freestanding text above and below an illuminated bar. In May of 2015, signs were approved for The Medicine Shoppe Pharmacy and Prestige Dining Club. Those signs were metal with acrylic faces, externally illuminated with gooseneck lamps. Some of the brick veneer came off with removal of the Columbus Prescription signs.

This application would allow signage to be installed for a new business, O'Reilly Family Pharmacy.

Project Details:

1. The proposed signs would be in the same locations on the north and south sides of the building as the existing, and within the 25 square foot limit, being 42" x 72" or 21 square feet in area each. The shape would be mainly rectangular with rounded corners and extending down to a point at the bottom. Proposed are signs that would be constructed of a composite material which is routed to allow the lettering, logo and edge trim to stand out. Two shades of blue would make up the background, and the lettering would be white spelling "O'REILLY FAMILY PHARMACY". Below the lettering would be a logo with a mortar and pestle and "EST. 2017". Illumination would be with the two existing gooseneck lamps.
2. On the front of the building, the applicant is proposing a projection sign rather than another wall sign. The sign would hang from a black metal bracket with scroll work, and be the same style as the wall signs. The proposed size would be 36" wide x 21" high.
3. The applicant will try to repair or replace the damaged brick veneer.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Guideline recommendations for signage include being efficient in using signs. Try to use as few and as small signs as are necessary to get the business message across to the public. Signage, including the appropriateness of signage to the building, is a standard of review per the Architectural District ordinance.

Worthington Comprehensive Plan Update & 2005 Strategic Plan

The plan calls this area the "Old Worthington Transition Area", and recommends the creation of an additional pedestrian-oriented neighborhood retail node, and targeting desired retailers.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this application, as the proposed signs are appropriate for this building and in this location.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mrs. Aimee O'Reilly, and her husband, Mr. Brendan O'Reilly, of 5600 Hardwell Dr., Hilliard, Ohio, stated she just purchased the pharmacy

and will be renaming and rebranding the building as O'Reilly's Family Pharmacy. Mrs. O'Reilly said she will be fixing the damage that was done to the building. Mr. Coulter asked if the building was built with thin brick and Mrs. Bitar replied, yes. Mrs. Holcombe asked Mrs. O'Reilly if all of the signage would be taken off of the windows and Mrs. O'Reilly replied, yes. Mr. O'Reilly said he was interested in learning about the property and asked if this property previously had a railroad easement. Mr. Foust replied the property was the right-of-way for the CD&M (Columbus Delaware & Marion) urban rail line which used to run up to where the railway museum is now. He said until a few years ago it curved across Proprietors Road and came down to High Street and there used to be a section there until the neighbors complained and they took out the line. Mr. Foust said the line was in place from 1903 until about the 1930's. He said the line came up from Columbus and used to bring groceries to the schools. Mr. Foust said the line also went up to Camp Mary Orton, then proceeded up to Delaware and Marion, Ohio. He said before the building was rebuilt in 1985, the Snouffer brothers used to have a lawn mower and small engine repair business in the back, and they had a dry cleaning business in the front. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Reis moved:

THAT THE REQUEST O'REILLY FAMILY PHARMACY, LLC FOR APPROVAL OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE SIGNAGE AT 1020 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 18-17, DRAWINGS NO. AR 18-17, DATED FEBRUARY 10, 2017, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Reis, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

There was no business to discuss.

D. Other

There was no other business to discuss.

E. Adjournment

Mr. Reis moved to adjourn the meeting at 7:58 p.m. and Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. The meeting was adjourned.