

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

December 8, 2011

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann, Mikel Coulter and Jo Rodgers. Also present were Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Board member Amy Lloyd was absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Minutes were not received by Board members, and therefore not approved.
4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses.

B. Architectural Review Board

1. Unfinished

2. New

- a. North, Northeast and Southeast Facades and Courts – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/Worthington Place) **ADP 08-11**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, detailing the proposed work for The Shops at Worthington Place. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Lori Bongiorno approached the microphone and stated her address is 344 E. Dunedin Rd., Columbus, Ohio 43214. Ms. Bongiorno stated at the northeast service area near First Watch, a white fence will be attached to the currently existing brick wall. Mr. Sauer asked Ms. Bongiorno to clarify why they are installing new dark bronze doors. Ms. Bongiorno stated the color wears better, and it matches the color scheme of the bricks. They are trying to get away from the white trim. She said all of the new entry doors will be dark bronze.

Mr. Sauer asked if the Talbots entrance will be dark bronze and Ms. Bongiorno said no, the entrance to Talbots will be staying as is. Mr. Sauer asked what color the fence will be around the children's play area and Ms. Bongiorno said dark bronze. Mr. Sauer asked for clarification about the store fronts and Mrs. Bitar said they will be different based upon who the tenants will be. Mr. Myers asked if the storefronts will be reviewed by the Board and Mrs. Bitar said yes. Mr. Hunter said he liked the element of separation so all the stores will not look the same.

Mr. Coulter asked whether the brick wall by the service area was staying, and Ms. Bongiorno said yes. Mr. Coulter pointed out the east elevation does not show the brick wall. Ms. Bongiorno said the rendering is incorrect, the brick wall will be staying and the new fence will be attached to the brick wall.

Mr. Hermann asked if there will be a pedestrian connection between The Shops and Kroger. Mr. Coulter said pavers would be a more permanent solution than a painted crosswalk. Mr. Carter said he liked the idea of having a crosswalk there too. Mr. Sauer asked if the curbs will be designed to accommodate the handicapped and Ms. Bongiorno said yes. Mr. Myers asked if there was going to be an area for concerts. Ms. Bongiorno said early on a concert area was planned near the children's play area, but they felt it might be detrimental to cross shopping. Mr. Carter said the area between Kroger and the mall could be closed off for possible future events, such as a concert or craft show, and be a general gathering area.

Mr. Hunter asked about the metal work around the windows. Ms. Bongiorno said the metal is aluminum. Mr. Sauer asked what the commonalities were to tie things together, and what they should be basing their decision on. Ms. Bongiorno said that each tenant will be allowed to have some of their own elements for individualized storefronts, but the basic mall structure will remain the same.

Mr. Hunter said Panera Bread is the only tenant that has submitted details, and he does not have a problem with other storefronts being individualized. He said they will get to vote on storefronts as new tenants come into the mall. Mr. Sauer asked what would happen if they do not like the design. Mr. Hunter said each design will be discussed. Mr. Sauer asked if it will be a matter of personal preference. Mrs. Bitar stated the Design Guidelines for the property should be followed.

Mr. Coulter asked if Panera Bread provided any color samples. Ms. Bongiorno said not at this time, but she will bring color boards to a future meeting. Mr. Coulter asked if their sign will be internally illuminated, and Ms. Bongiorno said yes. Mrs. Rodgers said as the mall gets future tenants, she would like to see the larger picture of how the tenants will blend together. Mrs. Holcombe said she likes the transition of the bronze doors.

Mr. Myers asked the Board members if there is any architectural or historical significance with this building. He said it is the Board's duty to preserve and protect property according to the Code. Mr. Hunter said there is no architectural or historical significance to this mall. Mr. Myers said the new storefronts will bring in energy and encourage people to come and shop. Mrs.

Rodgers said she liked the combining of the more modern styles of architecture with the older styles.

Mr. Sauer expressed concern with the east façade, south of the northeast entrance. Mr. Carter said he was meeting with his team the following day and would discuss some different ideas. Mr. Coulter asked about a single tenant wanting multiple signs, and Mr. Carter said it is safe to assume tenants will be permitted one sign per façade.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak. Mr. Fred Yaeger approached the microphone and stated his address is 285 Bryant Avenue, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Yaeger discussed artistic bike racks as an option for this project. Mr. Coulter said he likes the artistic bike racks too and believes they are kid friendly.

Mr. Sauer asked what type of glass is being used in the windows, and Ms. Bongiorno stated they are using clear glass. There were no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. This application includes changes to the north, northeast and southeast areas of the building.

2. On the north side, the following is proposed:

Entrance:

- Dark bronze entry with two double doors replaces the existing white entry
- Existing service door removed
- Bike racks shown as bollards on plans will be artistic or inverted “U” style
- Additional wall sign allowed on gable

Children’s Garden and Play Area:

- New bronze entry with single door proposed west of the main entrance to connect the outdoor children’s garden to the inside of the building
- Existing brick service area wall used for west boundary of play area with lettering and photo-op cutout in a Johnny Appleseed theme added
- Black metal picket fence installed along north and east sides of the area.
- Wood playhouse placed on south side, in front of previous service door location in existing building
- Addition of trees and plant material; apple sculpture and paved feature; rail fence; boulders; flagstone steppers; synthetic turf; and benches

3. The following changes are proposed at the northeast entry area:

Courtyard:

- Roof removed approximately 75’ to the west to create new entry court
- Metallic entry feature added at end of court (facing east), including 4’ diameter Worthington Place logo wall sign

- Storefronts added along north and south sides of court with brick and limestone trim on the north side; on the south side a combination of masonry veneer that looks like stone, and earth tone shades of fiber cement; individual storefronts will be modified to accommodate individual tenants
- Low level lighting at piers
- Warm White colored LED lighting strung above courtyard area
- Retaining wall; metal picket rail; planters; trees with square grates; and seating areas

East end:

- Brick corner feature added to building with hipped asphalt shingle roof and round windows - will serve as entrance facing south for corner tenant; metallic colored vertical light fixtures
- Curbed planter with seat wall at corner including steps and ramp to courtyard level; trees with circular grates
- Storefronts along east face with fiber cement, brick and limestone finishes – south section of east face not approved
- Bike racks shown as bollards on plans will be artistic or inverted “U” style
- Screen fence added to brick wall; service gates; benches; and plantings at service area

Signs:

- Sign bands to allow wall signs facing north, south and east – 1 sign allowed per store per facade

Crosswalk:

- Added between Kroger and this entrance in a different material than asphalt

4. Panera is locating at the southeast corner of the building and requesting the following modifications:

- New retaining wall; stairs; ramp; handrails; and planter for seating and entry area
- Rectangular entry feature with “Mr. Green Jeans” colored square tiles and aluminum cap
- Wall sign with logo
- New storefront windows with “Caboose” colored tile below
- Awnings with Panera colors and wheat design
- Metallic gooseneck lamps
- Cedar louvered screen at top of ramp shown in drawings will not be constructed

5. Banners are proposed for the light poles previously approved at the main east entrance. Also, 4 poles with banners (no lights) are proposed in the median of the easternmost entrance to the parking lot from Wilson Bridge Rd.

6. Variances:

- Additional wall signs at northeast and north entries
- Tenant wall signage that may result in more than one sign per business (but allowed only one sign per façade), or signs for businesses without the necessary frontage

- Permanent display of banners

Conclusion:

1. The changes in this proposal maintain the character of the development and are appropriate.

Mr. Coulter made the following motion:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO RENOVATE WORTHINGTON PLACE AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 92-11, DRAWINGS NO. AR 92-11, DATED NOVEMBER 23, 2011, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING, INCLUDING THE FOLLOWING AMENDMENTS:

- East façade on south side of northeast entrance not approved
- Screening fence will be added to the brick wall at northeast service area
- Businesses allowed one sign per façade
- LED lighting to be warm white
- OK to put a sign on the north entry gable
- Add crosswalk between Kroger and Shops in different material
- Delete cedar screen fence at Panera
- Bicycle racks can be inverted “U” or “artistic

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Amendment to Development Plan

- a. North, Northeast and Southeast Façades and Courts – **7227 N. High St. (M&A Architects/Worthington Place) ADP 08-11**

See previous agenda item for discussion, facts and conclusions.

Mr. Coulter made the following motion:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS TO AMEND THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN FOR 7227 N. HIGH ST. BY RENOVATING WORTHINGTON PLACE AS PER CASE NO. ADP 08-11, DRAWINGS NO. ADP 08-11, DATED NOVEMBER 23, 2011, BE RECOMMENDED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

The motion was seconded by Mrs. Holcombe. Mrs. Bitar called the roll and all members voted aye.