

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

October 11, 2012

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Chris Hermann; Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Commission members Richard Hunter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice Chair; and Kathy Holcombe, Secretary were absent. Mr. Hermann made an announcement to the audience that there would not be a Municipal Planning Commission meeting due to a lack of a quorum. Those individuals hoping to participate in the MPC meeting were asked to come back to the next meeting which will take place on October 25, 2012.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of the minutes of the meetings of September 27, 2012.

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes, and Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. All members said “aye”.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. Unfinished

- a. Directional Signage – **300 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (Worthington Schools/TWHS) **AR 64-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, and discussed the variances granted by the Board of Zoning Appeals. Mrs. Bitar said the signs will be made out of fiberglass and aluminum rather than the MDO board and wood posts shown in the packets.

Mr. Hermann asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Tim Gehring approached the microphone and stated his address is 200 E. Wilson Bridge Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Byron Manchester also approached the microphone and stated his address is 890 Clubview Blvd., Columbus, Ohio.

Mr. Coulter mentioned that some of the shrubbery needs to be removed near the west entrance so the sign would be visible. Mr. Hermann asked if there was any discussion about placing signs on the east end of the site. Mr. Gerhring said not at this time because it is restricted during school hours, and people that come in that way at other times know where they are going. Mr. Hermann asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This request is for approval of new directional signage at Thomas Worthington High School. Eight signs are proposed: two at the W. Dublin-Granville Rd. entrances and six internal to the site. All signs are proposed to be constructed of fiberglass and aluminum, and will have two posts. The bottom of the signs will be about 2' from the ground.
2. The signs proposed at the site entrances are 50" high x 36" wide and double sided. Both have white lettering saying "Thomas Worthington High School" and the Cardinal logo on a red background at the top part of the sign. The bottom consists of a blue background with white directional information.
3. The other six signs are proposed with blue backgrounds and white lettering. Placement is proposed at the parking lot and drives on the northern portion of the property.
4. Removal of existing directional signage, both permanent and temporary, is assumed with this proposal.
5. Variances have been approved by the Board of Zoning Appeals to allow excess directional signage area, and for design elements that do not meet Code requirements.

Conclusions:

1. New directional signage will be beneficial to the site.
2. Use of the school name and logo is appropriate for the main entrances to the site.
3. The proposed coordinated design for the signs is appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY WORTHINGTON SCHOOLS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL DIRECTIONAL SIGNAGE AT 300 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 64-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 64-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 26, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hermann said it has been approved.

b. Building and Site Changes – **940 High St.** (Shawn McAllister/Ace Hardware) **AR 79-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, and said a variance will be needed to approve the five colors that will be on the freestanding sign as well as the reduction in parking spaces and lack of in-lot landscaping. Street trees are also planned for the site. It is likely the trees recommended will be the same as those recommended for Natalie's because of the harsh conditions and small planting area. Mrs. Bitar showed a photograph of standing water in the rear of the property.

Mr. Hermann asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Jim Ryan approached the microphone and stated his address is 380 Tucker Dr., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Ryan was accompanied by Mr. Shawn McAllister who said his address is 1679 Henderson Rd., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Ryan distributed a sample of the proposed building color. He also showed the Board members drawings of the proposed garden center. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Ryan if he knew there was a water problem in the back, and Mr. Ryan said no. Mrs. Lloyd asked if the roof over the Fed Ex will be painted too and Mr. Ryan said yes. She also asked him if the sign face will be painted as well, and Mr. Ryan said yes.

Mr. Coulter said he did not have a problem with the five colors in the sign; he felt they were appropriate. Mr. Hermann agreed. Mr. Myers asked Mr. Ryan if he would be selling any hardscape materials and Mr. Ryan said no. He would be selling just flowers, mulch, seasonal items like pumpkins and straw, etc... Mr. Coulter asked if the wall sign would be internally illuminated and Mr. Ryan said yes, it will use an LED light source. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Ryan if the street sign would be internally illuminated and Mr. Ryan said he was not sure if the street sign was working. He said it would be considered if the sign is working, but he would not rip up the parking lot to run an electrical line if the sign illumination is not working. Several members felt landscape timbers should be added to frame the planting bed along High St.

Mr. Hermann asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and three people came forward. Mr. Thomas and Mrs. Angela Strous approached the microphone and stated they live at 58 E. North St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. and Mrs. Strous thanked Mr. Ryan for opening up a new store near their home. They were glad to see someone take an interest and clean up the property. Mrs. Strous said the area behind the store floods a couple of time a year when it rains really hard. She said there is a manhole cover for a sewer but there is no drain. She said there are four gutters around the building and three of the four gutters push water directly onto the pavement. Mrs. Strous asked if anyone knew who owned the brick wall or aluminum fence between the properties but no answer was given. Mrs. Strous asked if any lighting would be in the back of the building and Mr. Ryan said no. There will be lighting on the side of the building but it faces downward and is adjustable. The third person that wanted to speak was Dr. Sarah Conroy. Dr. Conroy stated she lives at 3 Edge of Woods, New Albany, Ohio. Dr. Conroy thanked Mr. Ryan for moving into the neighborhood and opening up a new store. She looks forward to seeing the site improved. Her only concern was with lighting. There were no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. An Ace hardware store is proposed in the space south of FedEx Kinko's, formerly occupied by CVS.
2. Previously the application was only for approval of a new double door on the south side of the building, and a new overhead door on the east (rear) side of the building. Both doors were proposed to be metal, and painted to match the adjacent walls. Additional information about site and building changes were requested by the Architectural Review Board before approval of the doors would be granted.
3. The application now includes the following:
 - Re-painting the front metal roof across the entire building
 - Re-painting the entire back building wall
 - Installing a 6' high black aluminum picket fence to enclose a 25' x 100' area on the south side of the building for a garden area; installing dark bronze light fixtures and electric outlets with covers along the south wall
 - Sealing and restriping the entire parking lot; re-arranging the parking in the south lot to allow for the garden center
 - Planting street trees along the south property line
 - Installing a new storefront system similar to the existing, except with a sliding door
 - Installing a new wall sign above the entrance
 - Adding the store name to the existing freestanding sign; re-landscaping the area around the freestanding sign.
4. Variances will be needed for reduction in parking from 83 to 71 spaces; lack of in-lot landscaping on the south lot (west lot not changing); and too many colors on the sign.

Conclusions:

1. The proposed changes will be an enhancement to the building and site.
2. The small reduction in the number of parking spaces should not be a problem at this location.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SHAWN MCALLISTER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MAKE CHANGES TO THE BUILDING AND SITE AT 940 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 79-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 79-12, DATED OCTOBER 4, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITIONS THAT THE HIGH ST. PLANTING BED WILL BE EDGED WITH LANDSCAPE TIMBERS AND THE STREET SIGN IS TO BE APPROVED AS SHOWN THIS EVENING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hermann said it has been approved.

2. New

- a. New Roof – **688 High St.** (Sheppard Development Group/US Bank) **AR 99-12** (Extension of AR 65-10, 10/14/10)

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. She explained this project had been previously approved but the permit is about to expire. Mr. Hermann asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Terita Sheppard approached the microphone and stated her address is 7140 E. Main St., Newark, Ohio. Mr. Coulter asked Ms. Sheppard if asphalt shingles will still be used in the rear and on the drive-through and Ms. Sheppard said yes.

Mr. Coulter also asked Ms. Sheppard why the project had not started yet and she said the funding was delayed. She said it is now a safety hazard and needs to be done as soon as possible.

Mr. Hermann asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. In October of 2010, approval was gained to re-roof the US Bank roof. The minutes from that meeting are included with the application. Certificates of Appropriateness are valid for 18 months.
2. This request would extend the approval that allowed replacement of the slate roof with a synthetic product made to resemble slate. The product, Ecostar Majestic Slate, is made of recycled rubber and plastic.
3. The rear of the building roof and drive-through were approved to be re-roofed with dimensional asphalt shingles.

Conclusion:

1. The previous approval should be extended.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SHEPPARD DEVELOPMENT GROUP TO EXTEND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS NUMBER AR 65-10 TO INSTALL A NEW ROOF AT 688 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 99-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 99-12,

DATED SEPTEMBER 17, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hermann said it has been approved.

b. Garage Door & Window Removal – 58 E. North St. (Michael E. Jones/Strous) AR 100-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hermann asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Thomas and Mrs. Angela Strous approached the microphone and stated they live at 58 E. North St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Myers asked if the gravel parking pad would need some grading because it appears the yard is higher than the driveway. Mr. Strous did not feel that re-grading was necessary. Mrs. Lloyd asked why vinyl was proposed for the wall and not brick. Mr. Hermann felt brick should be used to match the house. Mr. Strous said he had not checked into the brick option yet because he figured it would be too expensive. He pointed out the existing shrubs that screen the view of the wall. Mr. Hermann said he could not support the application with vinyl siding.

Findings of fact:

1. The homeowners would like to convert the existing two-car attached garage into living space. A detached garage was constructed in 2007.
2. Removal of two single garage doors on the east side of the house is proposed. In their place, vinyl siding to match the siding on the freestanding garage will be placed. Also, two sets of two double-hung vinyl windows to match those on the front of the house are proposed.
3. On the front of the house, an existing rectangular window is proposed for removal. The plan shows filling the opening with salvaged brick removed from the side of the house.

Mr. Strous asked the Board members to table the application until there will be a full Board to participate in voting. Mr. Coulter moved to table the application. Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. All members voted aye and Mr. Hermann said this application has been tabled.

c. Front Porch & Rear Additions – 59 W. New England Ave. (Adam Moore) AR 101-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hermann asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Adam Moore approached the microphone and stated his address is 59 W. New England Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mrs. Lloyd asked what color the porch roof would be. Mr. Moore said he will be installing a black metal roof. Mr. Hermann asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This application is a request for approval of a new porch in the front, and a two-story addition and covered porch in the rear.
2. The proposed front porch will have a gable roof with decorative wood brackets. Brick piers are proposed adjacent to the stoop and steps. The proposed materials and colors will match the existing house.
3. In the rear, removal of a one-story addition and replacement with a two-story gabled addition with dormers is proposed. The addition will extend from the east-west gable of the house. Materials, including windows, are proposed to match the existing. On the east side a porch with a railing is proposed as an entrance to a mudroom. It appears a sidewalk will connect this entrance to the garage.
4. At the rear of the addition, a porch with a sloped black metal roof is proposed. Wood columns with brick bases are proposed to support the roof. Coach lamps are also proposed.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are in character with the house and neighborhood.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ADAM MOORE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT ADDITIONS AT 59 W. NEW ENGLAND AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 101-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 101-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 26, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hermann said it has been approved.

- d. Retaining Wall – **849 Oxford St.** (Terry Boling/McGarry) **AR 102-12** (Amendment to AR 84-10, 2/10/11)

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant would like to place precast concrete steps in 8” increments. Mr. Coulter asked how the existing permit would be affected. Mrs. Bitar said the Board of Zoning Appeals will be reviewing a request to extend the construction completion period. The contractor was originally required to be finished with the project by December 15, 2012, but is hoping to extend the date to February 15, 2013. Mr. Hermann asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The retaining wall along the north property line was originally proposed with a continually sloping cap.
2. This amendment is a request for approval to place a precast charcoal colored cap that steps down with the slope of the land in 8" increments.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed change is not substantial

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY TERRY BOLING TO AMEND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AR 84-10 BY MODIFYING A RETAINING WALL CAP AT 849 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 102-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 102-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 28, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hermann said it has been approved.

e. Signage – **7227 N. High St., Space 84** (Carter Bean Architect/Pies & Pints) **AR 104-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, and displayed a new version of the wall sign. She said the applicant will no longer need a variance since the number of colors in the sign was reduced to four. Mr. Hermann asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Rob Lindeman approached the microphone and stated his address is 8462 Grennan Woods, Powell, Ohio. Mr. Myers wondered if the sign should be located at the entrance rather than the corner. Mr. Lindeman said he likes the exposure of the corner feature, and did not think people would have trouble finding the entrance. Mr. Tom Carter approached the microphone and stated his address is 7227 High St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Carter said they may use some directional signage to ensure people will know where the entrance is. Mr. Coulter asked when the business will open and Mr. Lindeman said they are hoping to open around November 25, 2012. Mr. Hermann asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Two signs are proposed for Pies & Pints – a wall sign and a projection sign.
2. The wall sign is proposed to be on the south side of the corner feature, which has a sign for FrontRunner on the east side. The sign is proposed with an internally illuminated slice of

pizza and “Pies & Pints.” A non-illuminated tag line “HANDCRAFTED PIZZA & PREMIUM BEER” is proposed below. The colors are brown, gold, orange and white.

3. The projection sign is an internally illuminated oval-shaped sign, in the same design as the wall sign but without the slice of pizza.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed signs are appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY J. CARTER BEAN ARCHITECT, LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL SIGNAGE AT 7227 N. HIGH ST., SPACE 84 AS PER CASE NO. AR 104-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 104 -12, DATED OCTOBER 11, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hermann said it has been approved.

- f. Storefront, Awning & Signage – **7227 N. High St., Space 85** (Carter Bean Architect/Naticakes) **AR 105-12**

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, and presented revised drawings for the signage. Mr. Rob Lindeman was still present at the microphone and reiterated his address as 8462 Grennan Woods, Powell, Ohio. Mr. Lindeman’s architect Mr. Gavin Jones approached the microphone and stated is address is 4400 N. High St., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Jones discussed the finer details and materials to be used. Mr. Hermann asked if there was anyone present either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Naticakes, a cupcake and frozen yogurt shop, is proposed for the space adjacent to Pies & Pints on the east side. The business will have two entrances, one on the south face and one on the east face beneath the corner element. The proposed storefront system consists of glass framed in black aluminum.
2. A canvas awning is proposed above the storefront. .
3. Three signs are proposed:
 - Awning sign with a cupcake logo and text “frozen yogurt & cupcake shop”
 - Wall sign above the awning with internally illuminated “naticakes”
 - Internally illuminated projection sign with cupcake logo and “naticakes”

Conclusion:

1. The storefront system and proposed signage are appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY J. CARTER BEAN ARCHITECT, LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL SIGNAGE AT 7227 HIGH ST., SPACE 84 AS PER CASE NO. AR 104-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 104 -12, DATED OCTOBER 11, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hermann said it has been approved.

Since there was not a quorum for the MPC meeting, there was no other business to discuss. Mr. Coulter moved to adjourn the meeting and Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. The meeting adjourned at 9:00 p.m.