WORTHINGTON DESIGN GUIDELINES
Publication Credits

Text prepared by
Benjamin D. Rickey & Co., 593 South Fifth Street, Columbus, Ohio 43206
Schooley Caldwell Associates, 300 Marconi Boulevard, Columbus, Ohio 43215

Photography by
Benjamin D. Rickey & Co., 593 South Fifth Street, Columbus, Ohio 43206

Book design and drawings by
Schooley Caldwell Associates, 300 Marconi Boulevard, Columbus, Ohio 43215

Cover engraving of the Worthington Female College provided courtesy of the
Worthington Historical Society

Acknowledgements

This publication was made possible by the hard work and dedication of a number
of people in the Worthington community. The following people and organizations
deserve praise for the time, talent and expertise they gave to this publication:

Worthington Design Guidelines Steering Committee:
Robert F. Chosy, City Council
David G. Foust, Municipal Planning Commission
    Nicki Budin
    Jane Trucksis
    James Ventresca

Worthington Municipal Planning Commission and Architectural Review Board:
    David Norstrom, Chair
    Richard H. Hunter, Vice-Chair
    Kenneth T. Pearlman, Secretary
    James D. Sauer
    David G. Foust
    Arthur J. Scott
    Scott Myers

City of Worthington Staff:
Paul J. Feldman, Assistant City Manager and Economic Development Director
    Lynda B. Bitar, Development Coordinator
    William W. Watterson, City Engineer
    Robert Wetmore, GIS Manager
    Donald L. Phillips, Jr., Chief Building Inspector
    Steve Seaburn, Planning Consultant
# Worthington Design Guidelines

## Table of Contents

**Introduction**  
The Purpose of the Guidelines  
Worthington Architectural Review District Map  
Timeline  

**The Worthington Context**  
Worthington Architectural Style Guide  
Environmental Features  

**Residential Guidelines**  
Introduction  
Existing Residential Sites Introduction  
Parking  
Landscaping  
Fences  
Lighting  
Sidewalks  
Residential Rehabilitation  
Foundations  
Exterior Materials  
Wood Siding  
Masonry  
Windows  
Doors  
Porches  
Roofs, Gutters and Downspouts  
Outbuildings  
Building Color  
Residential Additions  
New Residential Sites  
Existing Development Sites  
New Development Sites  
New Residential Construction  
Form, Massing and Scale  
Setbacks  
Roof Shapes  
Exterior Materials  
Windows  
Entries  
Ornamentation  
Color  

**Commercial/Institutional Guidelines**  
Introduction  
Existing Commercial/Institutional Sites  
Parking  
Landscaping  
Fences and Walls  
Streetscape and Street Furniture  
Lighting  
Commercial/Institutional Rehabilitation  
Storefronts  
Windows and Doors  
Awnings  
Upper Facades, Parapets and Cornices  
Roofs, Gutters and Downspouts  
Building Color  
Commercial/Institutional Additions  
New Commercial/Institutional Sites  
Existing Development Sites  
New Development Sites  
New Commercial/Institutional Construction  
Scale, Form and Massing  
Setbacks  
Roof Shape  
Materials  
Windows  
Entries  
Ornamentation  
Color  
Signage  

**Moving/Demolition Considerations**

**Appendix**  
A. Glossary of Terms  
B. Worthington Architectural Review Ordinance  
C. Application and Review Process  
D. Sources of Information and Assistance  
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation  
Plat of Worthington  
Sustainability
Worthington, which celebrated its Bicentennial in 2003, has a long history of appreciation for its cultural heritage. Established in 1803, its settlers brought with them from Connecticut the plan for an orderly community based on a New England model. The Village Green, which still forms the heart of Worthington, was at the center of the plan. It was surrounded by a grid pattern of lots and streets bounded by North Street, South Street, Morning Street and Evening Street with 100-acre farm lots surrounding the village.

Today, Worthington is a mature community of 14,125 residents and a strong community identity. Its expansion, which was gradual throughout much of its history, accelerated between the 1960s and the 1980s with extensive residential, office and industrial growth. Worthington, which now encompasses six square miles, is surrounded by Columbus, and its boundaries are well established for the future. Worthington is known for its high quality of life, its vibrant commercial district, its attractive residential areas, its historic buildings, its schools and its numerous recreational facilities. It is also well located to take advantage of amenities available elsewhere in Central Ohio.

The citizens and City Council of Worthington recognized that the community was special some four decades ago, when Council established the Architectural Review Board in 1967. As specified in Chapter 1177 of the Codified Ordinances of Worthington, the purpose of the Architectural Review Board is "to maintain a high character of community development, to protect and preserve property, to promote the stability of property values and to protect real estate from impairment or destruction of value for the general community welfare by regulating the exterior architectural characteristics of structures and preservation and protection of buildings of architectural or historical significance throughout the hereinafter defined Architectural District. It is the further purpose of this chapter to recognize and preserve the distinctive historical and architectural character of this community which has been greatly influenced by the architecture of an earlier period in the community's history." The Code further states, "These purposes shall be served by the regulation of exterior design, use of materials, the finish grade line, landscaping and orientation of all structures."
Thus Worthington established a process for the exterior architectural review of all structures to be altered, constructed, reconstructed, erected, enlarged, remodeled, removed or demolished to preserve and enhance the unique physical environment of the community.

The Architectural Review Board has always taken its responsibilities very seriously. It has assisted hundreds of property and business owners in making decisions about their properties that will reinforce the character of the community and the value of properties located within the Architectural Review District.

The Worthington Design Guidelines serve the building owner, developer, architect, and contractor who are pursuing the construction or modification of any property in the historic community of Worthington. They guide all City officials in their deliberations and decisions and are a resource for all interested in the improvement of the quality of life in this community.

The guidelines were prepared to guide rehabilitation and new construction in the Architectural Review District, which includes the area of the original village plat, known as Old Worthington (bounded by North Street, South Street, Morning Street and Evening Street), High Street within the City of Worthington and Granville Road (Rt. 161) within the City of Worthington. While the guidelines apply specifically to the Architectural Review District, the information contained here is appropriate for rehabilitation of existing buildings or new construction elsewhere in the community.

The guidelines are organized by property type - residential or commercial - and within those divisions are guidelines for rehabilitation and additions and new construction. The guidelines recommend treatments that are appropriate for the context of Worthington, while allowing for creative solutions for future development in the community. The guidelines provide the framework to manage change in a way that will be positive for the entire community.
1802 Planning for the settlement of Worthington began in Connecticut by The Scoss Company. Based on a New England village design, it was to consist of one-acre lots around a village green, with hundred-acre farm lots surrounding the village. The Federal style of architecture was prevalent in New England during this period and was a familiar architectural form to the early Worthington settlers. Glass was brought from the east, and the smaller the pane, the less breakage. Early Worthington buildings had multiple-pane windows.

1803 First group of settlers, numbering 99, arrived with James Kilbourne.

1805 First mill in Worthington was established.

1808 Worthington Academy was founded in a new brick community building.

1811 The first newspaper, the Western Intelligencer, was printed by Ezra Grosswold.

1811-20 Worthington Manufacturing Company, at the foot of South Street, was active. Among the items manufactured was wool used in soldiers’ and sailors’ uniforms during the War of 1812.

1812 Worthington lost its bid to become Ohio’s state capital.

1815 President Monroe visited Worthington.

1816 Orange Johnson purchased property at 956 High Street for $1,500.

1816-19 Ezra Grosswold printed paper currency used in Worthington.

1823 The Methodist Church was built in 1823 at the northwest corner of South and Harford Streets. Bishop Philander Chase went to England to raise funds for Kenyon College. While there he saw Gothic architecture and proposed the idea of installing pointed-arch Gothic windows in St. John’s Church at least a decade before the style became widely popular in the United States.

1830 Central Ohio became easily accessible by road. The National Road (later U.S. Route 40) passed through downtown Columbus, bringing many travelers from the East. High Street (later U.S. Route 23) was a major north-south route through Worthington. Hocking Canal entered downtown Columbus, providing another form of transportation to Central Ohio.

1831 The population of Worthington was 317.

1832 Founding of the Worthington Historical Society.

1833 Asher Benjamin, a young Connecticut architect, published a number of builders’ guides including The American Builder’s Companion (1827), The Practical House Carpenter (1830), and The Builder’s Guide (1835). These were widely available to builders in Ohio and provided invaluable information about classical detailing used in Federal and Greek Revival architecture. By this time Greek Revival replaced Federal as the preferred style for domestic, commercial and institutional architecture.

1835 Worthington was incorporated. A plank road replaced the dirt road on High Street. It took approximately 90 minutes to travel to Columbus. It was a trip taken only a few times a year by the average Worthington citizen.

1836 An Anti-Slavery group was formed and participated in the Underground Railroad begun.

1837 The first of a number of books were published that contributed to the widespread use of the Gothic Revival and the Italian Villa/Italianate styles just as the Greek Revival style was waning in popularity. Included were Andrew Jackson Davis’s Rural Residences (1837), Andrew Jackson Downing’s Cottage Residences (1842) and Architecture of Country Houses (1850) and Richard Upjohn’s Rural Architecture (1853). The use of jigsaws and lathes made it possible to create intricate wood patterns used as decorative trim on buildings. Ohio had 2,000,000 residents.

1850 The first railroad in Worthington connected Cleveland, Columbus and Cincinnati. This new transportation system quickly made the canal system in Ohio obsolete.

1851-55 The Civil War was fought.

1860s Free Black families owned property and lived in Worthington.

1860s The English Revival styles started to gain popularity.

1866-9 The Revival styles continued in popularity. Worthington took a new look at its heritage and its Village Green.

1870 The Civil War was fought.Returning veterans were starting new families and there was a housing shortage throughout the country.

1874 The Ranch style home was introduced and was immediately popular. The first house was built in Rush Creek, beginning a community of farm lots surrounding the village. The Federal style of architecture was prevalent in New England during this period and was a familiar architectural form to the early Worthington settlers. Glass was brought from the east, and the smaller the pane, the less breakage. Early Worthington buildings had multiple-pane windows.

1876 Founding of the Old Worthington Association.

1880s Worthington’s population grew to 15,326 as it was thoroughly integrated into the greater Columbus area.

1880s Worthington lost its bid to become Ohio’s state capital.

1880s Worthington Academy was founded in a new brick community building.

1885 Worthington Manufacturing Company, at the foot of South Street, was active. Among the items manufactured was wool used in soldiers’ and sailors’ uniforms during the War of 1812.

1886 Worthington lost its bid to become Ohio’s state capital.

1889 Worthington Academy was founded in a new brick community building.

1890 Electric streetcars connected Worthington to Columbus, making the trip fast and affordable.

1890s Worthington had established its water system.

1898 Worthington established its Architectural Review Board to protect and enhance the community’s physical environment.

1898 Worthington had established municipal boundaries with limited area for expanded new development and its population was 14,125 residents.

1900 The Columbus Delaware and Marion interurban railroad connected the three cities and stopped in Worthington on the east side of town. This vastly improved inter-city transportation options. Revival styles, including Colonial Revival and Georgian Revival, became popular throughout the nation. American Four-Squares and Bungalows started to appear during the first decade of the 20th century. Worthington underwent a decade of very rapid growth and the population reached 6,063.

1900s Worthington’s population exceeded 8,200 residents.

1901 erste Stirkley began publication of The Craftsman, which promoted the American Arts & Crafts movement. The magazine was published until 1916. The first decade of the 20th century also saw the introduction of the Prairie style as espoused by architect Frank Lloyd Wright.

1903 Founding of the Worthington Historical Society.

1903 The Ranch style home was introduced and was immediately popular. The first house was built in Rush Creek, beginning a community of farm lots surrounding the village. The Federal style of architecture was prevalent in New England during this period and was a familiar architectural form to the early Worthington settlers. Glass was brought from the east, and the smaller the pane, the less breakage. Early Worthington buildings had multiple-pane windows.

1904 The first railroad in Worthington connected Cleveland, Columbus and Cincinnati. This new transportation system quickly made the canal system in Ohio obsolete.

1905 Worthington Academy was founded in a new brick community building.

1811 The first newspaper, the Western Intelligencer, was printed by Ezra Grosswold.

1811-20 Worthington Manufacturing Company, at the foot of South Street, was active. Among the items manufactured was wool used in soldiers’ and sailors’ uniforms during the War of 1812.

1812 Worthington lost its bid to become Ohio’s state capital.

1815 President Monroe visited Worthington.

1816 Orange Johnson purchased property at 956 High Street for $1,500.

1816-19 Ezra Grosswold printed paper currency used in Worthington.

1823 The Methodist Church was built in 1823 at the northwest corner of South and Harford Streets. Bishop Philander Chase went to England to raise funds for Kenyon College. While there he saw Gothic architecture and proposed the idea of installing pointed-arch Gothic windows in St. John’s Church at least a decade before the style became widely popular in the United States.

1830 Central Ohio became easily accessible by road. The National Road (later U.S. Route 40) passed through downtown Columbus, bringing many travelers from the East. High Street (later U.S. Route 23) was a major north-south route through Worthington. Hocking Canal entered downtown Columbus, providing another form of transportation to Central Ohio.

1831 The population of Worthington was 317.

1832 Founding of the Worthington Historical Society.

1833 Asher Benjamin, a young Connecticut architect, published a number of builders’ guides including The American Builder’s Companion (1827), The Practical House Carpenter (1830), and The Builder’s Guide (1835). These were widely available to builders in Ohio and provided invaluable information about classical detailing used in Federal and Greek Revival architecture. By this time Greek Revival replaced Federal as the preferred style for domestic, commercial and institutional architecture.

1835 Worthington was incorporated. A plank road replaced the dirt road on High Street. It took approximately 90 minutes to travel to Columbus. It was a trip taken only a few times a year by the average Worthington citizen.

1836 An Anti-Slavery group was formed and participated in the Underground Railroad begun.

1837 The first of a number of books were published that contributed to the widespread use of the Gothic Revival and the Italian Villa/Italianate styles just as the Greek Revival style was waning in popularity. Included were Andrew Jackson Davis’s Rural Residences (1837), Andrew Jackson Downing’s Cottage Residences (1842) and Architecture of Country Houses (1850) and Richard Upjohn’s Rural Architecture (1853). The use of jigsaws and lathes made it possible to create intricate wood patterns used as decorative trim on buildings. Ohio had 2,000,000 residents.

1850 The first railroad in Worthington connected Cleveland, Columbus and Cincinnati. This new transportation system quickly made the canal system in Ohio obsolete.

1861-65 The Civil War was fought.

1860s Free Black families owned property and lived in Worthington.

1860s The English Revival styles started to gain popularity.
Worthington is a historic community located at the northern edge of Franklin County. Recognizing its historic significance, the community has celebrated and protected its heritage for many years. As a result, the community today reflects its growth and development since its earliest days. Worthington’s heritage is best reflected in its built environment.

Worthington has a rich architectural heritage with fine examples of architectural styles spanning a period of 150 years from the time the first settlers arrived in 1803 to the post-World War II period when portions of the original town plat were finally developed. In addition to “textbook” examples of architectural styles, there are also a number of vernacular buildings lacking the distinctive character-defining features of popular styles.

Before beginning a project that will require review by the Architectural Review Board, property owners should carefully study the architectural style guide that follows to determine the type of property they have, as well as that of surrounding properties. An understanding of the character-defining features of each style will assist the applicant in developing plans that preserve and respect these features.

Although there is tremendous architectural diversity in the Architectural Review District, the overall visual character is very high in quality. In the residential and in the historic commercial areas this is largely due to consistent use of compatible scale, setbacks, and building materials. Other factors include spatial relationships between buildings; front and side yards and gardens; sidewalks; and mature street trees that provide an intimate, cohesive and pedestrian-friendly environment.

An understanding of Worthington’s architectural legacy will assist property owners, designers and Architectural Review Board members in making sound decisions about changes to the community to ensure that this high-quality physical environment is preserved and enhanced.
Federal (1800-1830s)

The Federal style derived its name from its association with the formation of the American Republic in the late 18th century. The style is known for its formality, symmetry and the use of classical detailing. This style was brought to Ohio based on late 18th century examples found in Connecticut, and it is the earliest architectural style found in Worthington.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Three- or five-bay facades
2. Gabled or hipped rooflines
3. Flemish bond brickwork on facades
4. Beveled siding with corner boards
5. Entrances with sidelights
6. Entrances with semi-elliptical fanlights or rectangular transoms
7. Multiple-paned 12 over 12, 9 over 9 or 6 over 6 windows
8. Brick jackarches (flat arches) over the windows
9. Multiple-panel wood doors
10. Classical detailing

Orange Johnson House  956 High Street

41 West New England Avenue
Greek Revival (1830-1850s)

The Greek Revival style was popularized through the widespread publication and use of builder’s guides by Asher Benjamin (The American Builder’s Companion, 1827; The Practical House Carpenter, 1830; The Builder’s Guide, 1839) and Minard Lafever (Modern Builder’s Guide, 1833; Beauties of Modern Architecture, 1835) that made it possible for carpenter-builders to duplicate classical detailing accurately.

The Greek Revival also reflected the American fascination with the democratic ideas of ancient Greece. Worthington examples of the style are typically wood frame construction.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Three- or five-bay facades
2. Gabled or hipped roofline
3. Gable end facing the street
4. Beveled or smooth board siding with corner boards
5. Entrance with transom, sidelights and entablature
6. Columns or pilasters used on entrances and porches
7. Multiple-paned 9 over 6 or 6 over 6 windows
8. Cornice with returns
**Gothic Revival** (1840-1870)

*Popularized by the publication of several books by Andrew Jackson Davis (Rural Residences, 1837), Andrew Jackson Downing (Cottage Residences, 1842 and Architecture of Country Houses, 1850), and Richard Upjohn (Rural Architecture 1852), this style represented a departure from classical ideals and returned to the inspiration of the medieval Gothic architecture of Europe. This style was popular for homes and churches. Worthington has excellent examples of each.*

**Typical character-defining features:**

1. Irregular massing
2. Steeply pitched gabled & intersecting gabled rooflines
3. Board and batten siding on frame buildings
4. Pointed (Gothic) arch windows with 4 over 4 or 2 over 2 sash
5. Decorative hoodmolds surrounding windows & doors
6. Decorative bargeboards in the gables
7. Decorative porches
8. Square towers on churches
The Italianate style and its variations were very popular for residential, commercial and industrial architecture in Ohio during the mid-19th century. Although it was not widely used in Worthington, some examples do exist.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Vertical proportions
2. Low-pitched hipped rooflines
3. Round and segmental arched windows and doors, often with hoodmolds
4. 2 over 2 or 4 over 4 window sash
5. Decorative porches
6. Projecting bays
French Second Empire (1850s-1880s)

Influenced by developments in France and the popularity of the “mansard” style, the French Second Empire began to appear in the United States in the mid-19th century. The unique characteristic of this style is the mansard roofline. This style was especially popular for large public buildings. Worthington has a fine example of a Second Empire home, and the historic Worthington Inn shows some influences of the Second Empire with its slate mansard roof.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Mansard roofline, often with dormers & decorative slate
2. Bracketed cornice
3. Decorative window lintels
4. Round and segmental arched windows and dormers
5. Multiple-paned 4 over 4 or 2 over 2 windows
6. Decorative front porches
The Queen Anne style was a major architectural trend in the last decades of the 19th century. It was inspired by late Victorian British architecture. As a reaction to the ordered, classically-inspired styles of the first half of the century, the Queen Anne style featured lively forms and a variety of materials and textures. Worthington has several examples of the style.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Irregular massing and floor plans
2. Square or round towers or turrets
3. Irregular roofline with decorative slates and ornamental cresting
4. Variety of materials, including brick, horizontal wood siding, shingles, and decorative brickwork
5. Variety of window shapes and sizes
6. Stained or leaded glass windows
7. Wrap-around porches
Craftsman/Arts & Crafts (1905-1925)

The Arts & Crafts movement swept the United States during the first few decades of the 20th century. Adhering to the philosophy of simpler design, natural materials, and fine craftsmanship, the movement was popularized through the publication of Gustav Stickley’s magazine, The Craftsman, from 1901 to 1916. Houses, furniture and gardens were designed following the Craftsman philosophy. It was not uncommon to find Craftsman characteristics on Bungalow and Four-square house forms. Several Worthington Bungalows feature the knee-braces common to the style.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Gabled (sometimes low pitched) rooflines
2. Wide overhanging eaves
3. Knee-braces & exposed rafter ends under the eaves (not shown)
4. Windows with multiple-paned upper sash over single-paned lower sash windows
Prairie (1905-present)

Frank Lloyd Wright made a lasting contribution to American architectural history through his introduction of the Prairie style of architecture. In a departure from revival styles that were popular during the early 20th century, he promoted an aesthetic based on honest house forms blending with nature. Worthington is unusual in that it has an entire community of homes inspired by this aesthetic -- Rush Creek -- although it is not within the Architectural Review District.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Horizontal lines
2. Low pitched or flat rooflines
3. Use of natural materials including stucco, Roman brick, wood siding and trim and modern materials such as concrete block
4. Banded casement windows
English Revival (1900-1935)

The early 20th century was marked by the popularity of a variety of revival styles. Just like the Colonial Revival, the English Revival styles looked to the past for inspiration. Included in this trend were the Tudor Revival, the Late Gothic Revival and a vernacular version of an English cottage. All are represented in Worthington.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Steeply pitched gable roofline
2. Stone, brick, stucco, and shingle materials
3. Half-timbering
4. Towers or turrets
5. Multiple-paned casement or double-hung windows
6. Round, pointed or Tudor-arched windows or doors
7. Stone coping around windows, doors and on parapets
8. Prominent chimneys
Colonial Revival
(1920–Present)

Although the Colonial Revival style began to appear around the turn of the 20th century in America, when Americans were looking at their own past for architectural inspiration, examples in Worthington began to appear in the 1920s, following the celebration of the nation’s sesquicentennial in 1926.

The architecture of the early colonies -- including the vernacular, Georgian and Federal styles -- provided inspiration. One of the variations of the Colonial Revival style is the Dutch Colonial Revival, identified by the use of a gambrel roofline. The later Cape Cod house is also a variation of the earlier Colonial Revival style. There are a number of Colonial Revival houses in Worthington that span several decades of the 20th century.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Three- or five-bay facades
2. Gabled or hipped rooflines
3. Brick with corner quoins
4. Beveled siding
5. Double-hung windows (sometimes multiple-paned) with shutters
6. Entrances with fanlights or transoms
7. Porches with columns
8. Cornices with modillions or dentils
9. Classical decorative motifs
Vernacular Building Forms

Vernacular building types are common throughout Ohio. This isn't a style per se but includes buildings that follow traditional forms and have little extraneous ornamentation. These building types sometimes have a few elements of the architectural styles that were popular when they were constructed, although these elements are usually simpler than those found on “high-style” buildings.

I-House (1820-1880s)

This is one of the most typical house forms in Ohio, and it is found in Worthington among its earliest buildings, as well as in later 19th century examples. The recent name given to this form was based on the fact that these buildings were commonly found in states beginning with an “I” - Indiana, Illinois and Iowa, although they are also common in the upper Ohio Valley.

Many of these buildings were rural Ohio’s version of the Federal style.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Three- or five-bay facade
2. One or two rooms deep
3. Two stories
4. Rectangular form
5. Gabled roofline
6. Multiple-paned 12 over 12, 9 over 6, or 6 over 6 windows
7. Plain entrance or with a simple transom
Upright and Wing (1830-1880s)

Named for its form, this building type consists of a two-story portion with a gable end facing the street and a one or two-story side wing. Worthington has an example that dates from the mid-19th century.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Gabled roofline
2. Brick or frame construction
3. Multiple-paned windows

48 West South Street
Gabled Ell (1860s-1880s)

Appearing after the Civil War and named for its shape, this form is found in both one- and two-story versions, with an irregular plan and an intersecting gabled roofline. It is not uncommon to find this form with some Italianate elements such as a bracketed cornice, that style and this form reached their heights of popularity at the same time.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Intersecting gabled roofline
2. Brick or frame construction
3. Porch in the recess formed by the intersection of the two wings
The American Foursquare is more of a building type than an architectural style. The term was recently coined to refer to a common early 20th century house form. These homes were two or two and one-half stories, square in plan with hipped roofs and front porches. Easily and affordably constructed, they appear in a variety of materials and as both single-family and two-family versions in Worthington.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Boxy form
2. Roof dormers
3. Simple ornamentation
4. 1 over 1 or single paned windows
5. Front porches
**Bungalow**

*(1905-1930s)*

This is another example of a building type rather than an architectural style. Influenced by the ideals of simplicity and natural materials, these buildings tended to be one and one-half to two and one-half stories in height with gabled rooflines, dormers and front porches. Worthington Bungalows reflect a wide variety of treatments of this common building form.

**Typical character-defining features:**

1. Gabled or hipped rooflines, sometimes steeply pitched and forming the roof of the front porch
2. Roof dormers
3. Combination of building materials (wood siding, shingles, brick, concrete block)
4. Squat, tapered columns on front porch
5. Wide overhanging eaves, frequently with exposed rafters
6. Multiple-paned over 1 or 1 over 1 windows
Cape Cod
(1920s -1950s)

This building form refers to a one- or one and one-half story version of the Colonial Revival that was introduced in the 1920s and continued in popularity in the immediate post-World War II period. Worthington has a number of examples of this form.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Three-bay facade
2. Rectangular form
3. Gabled roofline with roof dormers
4. Brick or wood siding
5. Central entrance
6. Multiple-paned windows with shutters
7. Classical detailing around entrance and in cornice
**Ranch**  
(1940s - 1970s)

*This building form became ubiquitous in American communities in the period following World War II when there was a housing shortage for returning veterans and their families. The ranch is a single story house with a low, horizontal profile. The northeast quadrant of the original plat of Worthington has a number of ranch houses from this period.*

**Typical character-defining features:**

1. Horizontal lines
2. Shallow pitched hipped or gabled rooflines
3. Wood, brick, stone and/or stucco facing materials
4. Asymmetrical facades
5. Large picture windows
6. Attached garages
Another post World War II form popular in growing suburban areas was the split level home. It was not as popular as the ranch home in Old Worthington, but there are some examples of the type.

Typical character-defining features:

1. Two or more floors with entrance usually on middle level
2. Large picture windows
3. Attached garage
4. Shallow pitched gabled or hipped roofline
5. Brick or stone facing with stucco
Outbuildings

In the residential areas of Worthington, there are a number of outbuildings, including detached garages, old barns, garden sheds or other support buildings. They are typically small in scale and constructed in wood with gabled rooflines; there are some mid-20th century brick garages. Although simple in design, they contribute to the architectural and residential character of the area.
Village Green

The most distinctive environmental feature in Worthington is the Village Green. It was designed as the central public space in the new settlement and has continued to hold a central place, both physically and symbolically, for the last two centuries. In spite of development and increased traffic at the intersection at High Street and Dublin-Granville Road, the community has fiercely guarded and protected this significant public space. While the Village Green is actively used for community events, the placement of temporary art, and other activities, it is also a peaceful park that establishes a "sense of place" for the entire community. The "New England" Village Green makes Worthington unique among central Ohio communities.

Layout of Streets/Lots

Old Worthington, which encompasses the original town, retains the physical plan brought with the earliest settlers from Connecticut. It exhibits a straightforward and sensible approach to establishing a community based on New England communities in the late 18th and early 19th centuries. The grid pattern of streets extends around the Village Green with a commercial core of narrow lots on High Street and a regular pattern of lots for the residential areas. The historic institutional buildings -- churches, lodges, schools -- are scattered along High Street and Granville Road, the main north-south and east-west thoroughfares. In recent years, further commercial development has been concentrated along High Street from the southern to the northern edges of the City, while Dublin-Granville Road has largely retained its residential quality with institutional buildings interspersed at intervals along the street.

The grid pattern of streets is also what distinguishes Old Worthington from late 20th century developments which tend to be self-contained and characterized by curvilinear streets, cul-de-sacs and just a few feeder streets that connect with the established pattern of development.
Setbacks

Uniform setbacks in Old Worthington have created an intimate character. The buildings in the commercial district are close together and located along the public sidewalk, creating a dense and pedestrian-friendly commercial area. The homes in the residential area maintain a fairly constant setback from the street. Although the architecture varies within this framework, the uniform setbacks and compatible building scale contribute to visually interesting and pleasant streetscapes.

The setbacks vary along the High Street and Dublin-Granville Road corridors, with newer buildings generally set back further from the street than those pre-dating World War II.

Spatial Relationship of Buildings/Green Space

The relationship of buildings to one another and the green spaces in between are extremely important in establishing interesting streetscapes. The small side yards, front yards, gardens, sidewalks and mature street trees that typify Old Worthington are essential to creating a distinctive sense of place. The landscaping is the common element that ties the diverse architectural styles together.
Introduction

Worthington’s residential neighborhoods have a pleasant character and a strong sense of place. They form a cohesive community that “feels like home.” At the same time, these neighborhoods are rich and varied, with diverse architecture, a wide range of building construction dates and a great variety of architectural forms and details.

The city’s neighborhoods grew over two centuries and represent virtually the entire panorama of American residential architecture, from modest cottages, to large Colonial Revival style mansions, to small post-World War II “starter” homes. Within this diversity, however, certain other features tend to be similar from block to block and neighborhood to neighborhood. These include setback from the street (often very generous); large, mature shade trees; well-kept landscaping; and an inviting human scale.

It is the blend and balance of both architecture and site elements that gives Worthington’s neighborhoods their charm. This section of the design guidelines is concerned with maintaining that balance.
Existing Residential Sites
Parking

Cars are a necessity of modern life, but where we put them can have a significant impact on our neighborhoods. Residential parking in Worthington is handled in several ways: on the street; in driveways that extend from the street into the property; and in driveways and parking areas accessible from alleys.

Recommendations

A. Whenever possible, parking, driveway and garage access should be from the side or rear of a property so that front lawns and associated plantings remain undisturbed by a driveway.

B. Driveways coming from the street should be as narrow as possible, to minimize the width of curb cuts and to preserve green space.

C. Parking areas should be located as far to the rear of a property as possible. Avoid locating parking in front yard areas. Side yards may be appropriate for parking, but it should be located as far to the rear as possible and screened from the street with landscaping, fencing or walls.

D. Consider small-sized “pea” gravel, brick or simulated brick or stone as paving materials. These generally have a more compatible look than asphalt or concrete. Note that gravel is permitted by city ordinance for parking areas holding five vehicles or fewer. Also, it is important that any surface of small gravel be supported by a solid base such as larger gravel or concrete and that there be adequate drainage to avoid pooling or flooding of the smaller gravel.
Existing Residential Sites

Landscaping

Worthington’s mature shade trees are the primary landscaping feature throughout the community. They are a major contributor to its character and help define its neighborhoods as stable, desirable places to live. They can be found in both the oldest and the more newly-developed parts of town.

Other landscape elements include lawns, planting areas, gardens, bushes and shrubs. In general, lawns are generous but not overly large, which contributes to the sense of human scale that is one of Worthington’s important attributes. Other landscaping elements tend to be properly scaled and well-tended, which also tends to enhance neighborhood character.

Recommendations

A. Maintain and nurture mature trees to prolong their lives. Opening of the leaf canopy to reduce potential wind damage may be appropriate, and sometimes it is necessary in order to avoid interference with overhead wires. This pruning should be done by a professional or in accordance with recommended practice. Regular tree feeding may also be necessary to ensure longevity; there are various commercial services that can provide this at a reasonable cost.

B. Plant and maintain street trees in planting areas between the street and sidewalk. Road segments should be planted with the same species and approximately the same spacing, to create rhythm and balance.

C. Paving can sometimes reduce water absorption of the soil so much that trees do not get the moisture they require. Get professional advice before re-paving parking areas or installing new paving (refer also to the guidelines on parking, above). Tree experts can advise how to do paving without threatening trees. Whenever possible, reduce the amount of paving and install lawn areas and landscaping. One useful product may be concrete pavers that have openings to permit grass growth, creating a much “softer” look for a paved surface.

Brick pavers can help maintain trees and plantings because gaps between the bricks allow moisture to penetrate the soil.
Existing Residential Sites
Landscaping Recommendations Continued

D. Quickly replace lost trees with new ones appropriate to the climate and the space in which they will grow. Not all species are suitable. Again, tree experts can be very helpful in making such decisions. Consider only native and non-invasive species. Mature trees should be removed only if they are fatally diseased or damaged; get expert advice, since many “sick” trees can be saved at less cost than removing them.

E. Keep landscaping materials at least a foot or more from any building. This will help avoid accumulation of moisture that could damage paint surfaces or encourage wood deterioration and penetration of moisture into the interior. Fast-growing plant materials may have to be trimmed regularly.

F. Refer to Chapter 1149 of the Codified Ordinances of Worthington, which discusses yards, setbacks and other site features. In accordance with the city ordinances, be sure that any trees and plantings do not hinder traffic visibility, especially on corner lots where streets and sidewalks intersect.

G. Decks and patios should be limited to the rear of buildings. Decks should be built of wood and kept low to the ground. Finishes should be either paint or an opaque stain to match the color of the building or its trim. Patios may be constructed of concrete, stone or brick. Consider the style of the house when designing decks and patios, since some styles and some designs are not compatible.
Existing Residential Sites

Fences

Fences have long been used to mark property boundaries, to restrict access to properties by people and animals and for decorative purposes. They serve these traditional purposes in Worthington and can add to the character of a neighborhood when they are well executed and properly cared for.

The Codified Ordinances of Worthington do not allow front yard fences, with the goal of maintaining an open, friendly feel and avoiding barriers between neighbors. However, there are many other kinds of fences, both natural and man-made, that can be used to protect and enhance a property.

Recommendations

A. Many traditional fence types are appropriate for use in Worthington. Earlier examples, typical of early- to mid-19th century homes, include rail fences, vertical board fences, and low masonry walls. From the mid-19th century into the early 20th century, cast and wrought iron fences were very popular, especially in side yards. After about World War II, newly-built homes often had metal "cyclone" type fencing or wood stockade fences, but these would be appropriate only for back yards of homes from this period. In some locations, vinyl may be a suitable substitute for traditional fence materials. It is best used in simple designs without extensive ornamentation.

B. Select fencing appropriate for the house’s period and style. As noted, front yard fences are not permitted by city ordinance. Side yard fences should be open in style (avoid solid, opaque fences that block all views) and three to four feet in height. In the back yard, generally avoid fences over four feet in height; higher fences are discouraged but may be appropriate where a commercial use abuts a residential property. In all cases, no fences higher than six feet are permitted. Brick masonry walls should use the best quality of brick, since they are so exposed to weathering. Avoid salvaged brick that may include "interior wall" brick that can disintegrate rapidly.

These traditional types of painted wood fence are appropriate designs for side and rear yards in Worthington.
C. Consider using natural plant materials instead of fences. Various bushes and shrubs can be used to mark property lines or to set off private areas such as rear patios. Some of these may be evergreens; some may lose their leaves in the fall. Get good advice from a nursery or professional arborist about plant size, shape, rate of growth and care before choosing a natural fencing material.

D. Whether natural or man-made, all fencing materials require maintenance. Do not let plants get overgrown or full of litter; keep wood fences painted or coated with opaque stain; keep metal fences from rusting; and watch for mortar loss and other deterioration in masonry walls.
Existing Residential Sites

Lighting

Residential lighting includes lights mounted on the building next to entrance doors; lights on poles in the yard or along walks; low-level lights marking walks and paths; and higher-level area lights on poles or mounted on the house or garage.

Two design issues are associated with this kind of exterior lighting: appropriateness of the fixtures; and the amount of light output and its “spill” onto adjacent properties.

Recommendations

A. Retain historic light fixtures to the extent possible, especially those original to the house. These can be re-wired and re-lamped for safety and efficiency.

B. In selecting new light fixtures, simple designs are usually the best. Avoid overly ornate fixtures and ones that are out of scale with the building. Select fixtures appropriate to the building’s character or that are similar to those used on buildings from the same period or style.

C. Use as few fixtures as are necessary to provide adequate light for walks, yards and driveways. Be sure house numbers are well-lighted at night and at least three inches high.

D. Avoid overly bright lights. Try to use traditional long-life incandescent or compact fluorescent fixtures. High-pressure sodium and similar light sources generally are not appropriate for residential areas.

E. Locate and orient fixtures to minimize light “spill” onto adjacent properties. Try to avoid placing lights so they shine directly into nearby windows, or provide trees or bushes that can block the light.

F. Strive to minimize uplighting, and choose fixtures that prevent light from escaping into space and contributing to light pollution.
Sidewalks have long been a traditional neighborhood feature, though not all Worthington neighborhoods have them. Where they are present, they provide an important element of pedestrian safety, but they also lend a sense of scale and order that increase a neighborhood’s appeal.

**Recommendations**

A. Sidewalks do not have to be very wide in order to be useful. Avoid excessively wide walks; when building new ones or replacing old, maintain widths already typical of the area.

B. Traditional walk materials include stone flags, brick, and poured concrete. Concrete is the most common and is the most appropriate for newer neighborhoods. Historic materials such as stone and brick should be retained where they exist and repaired as required.

C. Where sidewalks do not exist along public streets, they should be added wherever possible. Sidewalks encourage a human presence in a community. When people get out of cars and walk, the neighborhood benefits from increased social interaction and from the better security that results from more "eyes on the street."

D. New walks built of traditional materials may be appropriate, depending on the neighborhood and on the materials of nearby walks. Proper construction and good maintenance will be very important, especially for brick walks, which by their nature can become rough and irregular over time.

*In addition to poured concrete, Worthington sidewalks include brick and also older stone “flag” paving. They are functional but also lend a sense of quality and texture to the city’s neighborhoods.*
Most older residential building foundations in Worthington are made of stone, either rough coursed rubble or quarried and shaped cut stone, which had a more finished look. Newer structures often can have foundations of rock-faced concrete block, brick, or poured concrete. All these materials were designed to carry the weight of the building down into the soil and to spread that weight out so it did not exceed the bearing capacity of the soil.

On some buildings, the foundations rose only slightly above ground level and often were concealed by the building’s siding. On others, higher foundations were intended to be part of the building’s visual character.

Builders set the footings of foundations below the frost line to help ensure that walls would stay plumb and that different parts of a building would not settle at different rates, and so they would not heave and crack in freezing soil.

**Recommendations**

**A.** Be sure that downspouts are either connected into underground drain lines or that they empty onto splashblocks that carry water away from the building. Be sure that both the downspouts and any underground drains are free-flowing. If they leak or are plugged, they can concentrate so much water around the foundation that the soil liquefies and loses its bearing capacity, possibly resulting in settling or cracking of the foundation.

**B.** Watch for areas where a build-up of soil, old plantings or paving materials may have created a slope that lets water flow toward the foundation rather than away from it. There should be a positive slope away from the foundation -- city code requires a minimum fall of six inches in ten feet for the grade away from a foundation. Try to increase this slope a little for better drainage.
C. Avoid piling mulch, firewood or other materials against foundation walls; be sure that vines and plantings don’t grow on or too close to the foundation, causing moisture retention. Allow a space of at least a foot from plantings or other materials to provide air circulation.

D. Avoid cutting openings in foundation walls to create basement windows or doors. If such openings really are necessary, get good advice from an engineer, architect, contractor or mason about how to do this work without weakening the foundation.

E. Avoid painting or stuccoing the exterior of a foundation, which can significantly change the appearance and character of your building and can trap moisture behind the new surface. Previously-painted or -stuccoed foundations, however, should be kept that way, as long as they do not show evidence of moisture retention.

F. Avoid covering or blocking in ventilation openings that help keep foundations and crawl spaces dry.
Residential Rehabilitation

Exterior Materials

Exterior building materials on historic Worthington buildings include brick, stone and wood. These materials also are typical of newer buildings up through the World War II period.

Most of the older buildings have retained their original exterior materials. In some cases, original wood siding has been replaced with compatible new wood siding that has faithfully duplicated the appearance of the original. There is some use of replacement materials such as vinyl or aluminum siding. Older wood siding is found most commonly as beveled siding, but it appears in other forms such as shiplap, shingle and board-and-batten. Newer materials include cement-asbestos shingles, which have been common for over 50 years.

Brick is the most common type of masonry in Worthington, with stone used primarily for trim elements. Masonry buildings, like those of frame construction, have retained their exterior materials largely intact, and they generally have avoided damage from abrasive cleaning or improper tuck-pointing. Many brick buildings have been painted, some for a very long time.

Newer buildings (generally built around and after World War II) reflect the designs and materials of their time. Brick, stone, stucco and various types of wood and other siding have been widely used, and generally these buildings fit into the streetscape very well in terms of the color, texture and detail of their exterior materials.
Wood Siding Recommendations

A. Existing historic wood siding should be retained and repaired as required. Such siding gives historic buildings a texture and appearance important to their character. Most siding is painted to weatherproof it, and keeping the paint in good shape is very important.

B. If paint consistently blisters or peels off wood siding, look for moisture coming from leaking gutters or downspouts; leaking supply or drain pipes on the interior; wall insulation that has collected moisture; or ground moisture rising into the siding. Correct these conditions and dry out the siding before painting again.

C. Repairs to damaged siding should be done with new wood that exactly matches the appearance of the existing. Historic wood siding should not be covered over or removed if it is repairable.

D. Wood siding is the preferred exterior material for new buildings, additions to existing buildings, or new garages and outbuildings. The siding should be used in one of its traditional forms: shingle, board-and-batten, shiplap or beveled siding.

E. If replacement siding is installed over or in place of wood siding, it should be located only where the original siding was used. Avoid removal of or damage to window and door surrounds, ornamental elements such as eave brackets, and decorative panels or shingled areas. The new siding should match the thickness and width of the old as closely as possible. Consider removal of existing replacement siding, including cement-asbestos, but only if the underlying original siding is in good condition or can be repaired.
Residential Rehabilitation
Exterior Materials Continued

Masonry Recommendations

A. Historic brick and stone should not be cleaned unless it can be shown that the soil on the masonry surface is actually causing damage or moisture retention. Not cleaning will help ensure that original masonry surfaces and details are not damaged.

B. If the decision is made to clean a masonry building, use the gentlest effective means. Hand-scrubbing with a natural bristle brush and plain water may be effective, as may gentle detergents. For stubborn dirt, chemical cleaners may work but should be tested in an inconspicuous area. To avoid abrasive damage to masonry from any cleaning method, avoid application or wash pressures over 300 pounds per square inch.

C. In general it is best to avoid sealers such as silicone or any treatment intended to "waterproof" the masonry. The absorption and evaporation of moisture during varying weather conditions is natural for a masonry wall.

D. Masonry which has been painted in the past should remain painted, since removal of paint can be difficult and damaging. However, walls that have not been painted in the past should remain unpainted.

This extruded brick, which has never been cleaned abrasively, has a distinctive texture. The recessed mortar joints emphasize the brick. Both the surface of the brick and the special joint tooling should be carefully protected during cleaning and pointing.
Masonry Recommendations Continued

E. Pointing of masonry should be done in a way that duplicates the color, texture, joint tooling, and physical composition of the building’s historic pointing. Avoid high-cement mortar (more than about 1/2 part of cement, by volume), since it can create a rigid framework that can cause cracking and spalling of soft brick and limestone. A good starting point for re-pointing mortar is to use, by volume, one part lime, three to five parts sand, and as little Portland cement as is needed to make a durable mortar -- but no more than 1/2 part, as noted above. This should create a sufficiently “soft” mortar for typical older masonry, but the proportions may have to be varied a bit to get the right color, texture, and hardness. Tooling or finishing of mortar joints should match the original tooling as closely as possible. Be especially careful that historically recessed mortar joints remain recessed, and that flush joints are truly flush, without excess mortar smeared on the surfaces of the bricks or stone.

F. Historically-stuccoed surfaces should remain stuccoed. Removal of stucco usually is not recommended, since it is difficult to do so without damaging the underlying masonry. In addition, masonry walls, especially brick, often were chipped and gouged to enable the stucco to adhere, and removal of stucco reveals this damage. Application of stucco is not appropriate for a wall which has not been previously stuccoed, since this significantly alters the character of the wall.
Certain window designs are appropriate for specific architectural styles. Multiple-paned windows, for example, are typical of early styles such as Federal and Greek Revival and were used again in the early 20th century in Colonial Revival style buildings (refer to the style guide for more information on appropriate windows for each style). 4-over-4 windows could be found in Gothic Revival style houses and some earlier Italianate buildings. Later Italianate buildings often had 2-over-2 and 1-over-1 windows, the result of glass technology evolving in the 19th century so that large panes were readily available later in the century. 1-over-1 windows were original features of Four-Square, Bungalow and other 20th century styles, though sometimes special 3-over-1 or similar designs could be found.
A. Retention and repair of existing historic windows is always preferable to replacement. Because they usually comprise so much of a building’s exterior surface, windows are a major part of its character. Keeping them is one of the most important ways to protect that character. Even non-original windows may be of sufficient age and design quality to warrant their retention.

B. If energy efficiency is a concern, interior or exterior storm windows can greatly increase the insulating quality of windows. Some interior storm windows are held in place by magnetic strips and are easy to remove for cleaning and maintenance; many exterior storm windows slide in tracks and include screens so windows can be opened in warm weather. In some thicker window sash it may be possible to re-glaze with insulated panes -- but avoid removing historic "wavy" glass to do so; use storm windows instead. If these measures do not provide adequate energy efficiency, new replacement windows may be appropriate. Refer to recommendations D and E.

C. If historic windows are too deteriorated to repair cost-effectively and replacement is justified, the preferred option is an in-kind replacement in the same material and design. This usually means real wood windows with true through-the-glass muntins (if appropriate) in dimensions and profiles that duplicate the originals. Window suppliers have become very good at doing such work at reasonable prices, but this still may take some persistence and hunting around.

D. New windows made of substitute materials such as aluminum, vinyl, or clad wood can be an acceptable second choice if they provide a reasonably good match for the windows being replaced. Number of panes, real muntins, and correct profiles still are important.
E. Refer to the style guide and be sure that window designs are appropriate for the style or time period of the house. Multiple-paned windows, for example, are not appropriate for a Four-Square house or a Ranch, but they are fine for a Colonial Revival style house. Avoid use of inappropriate window designs.

F. Some earlier houses may have been re-done with later windows -- 1-over-1 sash in a Federal style house, for example. In general, it is better to retain the older non-original windows (since they probably are quite old themselves, even if not original) than to replace them with new ones. If the non-original windows are deteriorated and require replacement, it would be appropriate either to return to an original window design (with true muntins; again, refer to the style guide) or to install new 1-over-1 windows.

G. Avoid enlarging or downsizing window openings to accommodate stock sizes of replacements. Also avoid permanent blocking in of windows; the original window pattern of a house is part of its overall design.

H. Install window shutters only if they are appropriate to the style of the house and are sized and placed properly.
Doors (and the entrances in which they often are placed) are major architectural elements that define the points at which one enters and leaves a building. Federal style buildings tended to have very plain doors and entrances, with little or no ornamentation. Transoms over the doors, and sometimes sidelights, were common entrance treatments. Greek Revival style designs placed much more emphasis upon door and entrances, almost always including sidelights and transoms.

Other styles, especially in the Victorian period, drew attention to doors and entrances through use of carved and paneled wood doors; ornate sidelights and transoms, sometimes with frosted or colored glass; and entrance ornamentation such as columns, pilasters, brackets and other elements. This continued until the Colonial Revival style period in the early 20th century, when architects returned to somewhat simpler door and entrance designs. From that point on, doors and entrances became much more simple in both residential and commercial buildings. In the period after World War II, doors commonly had little or no glazing, and entrances were little more than unornamented rectangular openings.

It is important that any doors and the entrances in which they are set should be compatible with the style and period of a building (the style guide will provide help in this regard).
Residential Rehabilitation

Door Recommendations

A. Historic doors or entrance elements should not be removed, covered over or otherwise receive major alterations, since they can be important character-defining features of a building (refer to the style guide for more information). This is true for both primary and secondary entrances. Deteriorated or damaged elements should be replaced with new ones that match the originals as closely as possible.

B. If interior alterations make an existing entrance unnecessary, an appropriate approach is to leave the door and entrance intact on the exterior while covering it over with drywall or other material on the interior; avoid removing doors and entrances and placing siding over the opening.

C. Avoid treatments to “dress up” a door or entrance, giving it a character it never had. New ornamentation; stained or patterned window glass; treatments that simulate a multiple-paned appearance; and salvaged older doors of inappropriate design all can change the character of a building. Generally, ornate doors are not appropriate for simple house forms.

D. Retain historic storm doors; these typically were made of wood and had one or two areas of glazing which sometimes could be removed and replaced with screens during the summer. When installing new storm doors, select ones of simple design and made of wood, if possible. The most appropriate design is one with a full-height glass section that permits viewing the main door. The simplest, least decorated design is usually the best. The storm door and the door it covers should be the same color. Screen doors should be similarly compatible.
Porches are important features on many Worthington houses. Some porches were very simple, consisting of just a stoop and a handrail at the front entrance, sometimes with a roof or canopy. These can date from any period and can be found on both old and some recent houses.

From the mid-19th century into the 20th, porches could be considerably more ornamented and decorative than the house itself, thus becoming major character-defining features. Columns, panels, brackets and other elements, often turned on large lathes or cut out with band- or scrollsaws, became common on many porches.

From about 1915 on, porches generally were simplified and more integrated into the design of the house. Simple square or tapered columns were common, as were simple paneled handrails or handrails with balusters and rails. It was common to find such porches added to older houses that either did not have porches originally or had lost their original porches.

Some 20th century porches were recessed under the slope of the roof or into the mass of the house, which made the porch an integral part of the house’s design rather than an added feature. This was common with Bungalow and Craftsman style houses and in some vernacular designs.
Residential Rehabilitation

Porch Recommendations

A. Original porch elements should be retained to the maximum extent possible and should be duplicated in the same design and materials if deteriorated or missing. Original elements such as turned columns, decorative elements, or tongue-and-groove ceilings should stay in place.

B. Wrought or cast iron or aluminum supports and railings should not replace original elements unless the originals were made of these materials (this typically was true primarily of post-World War II houses).

C. Porches tend to project from a house and are exposed to the weather. Watch for signs of deterioration caused by moisture such as streaking, staining, mildew, dry rot, moss growth and peeling paint. Be sure there are no gaps or leaks in the flashing at the point where the porch roof joins the house wall. Watch for overflowing gutters or leaking downspouts that might spill water onto the porch and its foundation.

D. It is not recommended that porches be enclosed to create permanent interior space. This alters the open character a porch is intended to have. Such work also often results in loss of or damage to decorative porch elements which are an important part of a house’s architectural character. Enclosing of side porches should also be avoided. Enclosing rear porches may be appropriate but must be evaluated on a case-by-case basis.

E. New porches (located where one is missing or there has not been a porch in the past) should be built in a simple, contemporary design. Look at original porches on similar buildings -- height, materials, roof slope, width -- and use these to develop a design. Avoid ornamentation such as spindles and scrollwork unless they were traditionally used on the porches of similar buildings. Be sure that a new porch is large enough to accommodate furniture, swings, or other elements.

F. Decks should be kept at the rear of a house and kept as low to the ground as possible to minimize their visibility.
Roofs, gutters and downspouts are an integrated water-removal system that gets rain- and meltwater away from a house as fast as possible. In addition, they are highly visible parts of a building’s character.

Various roof materials can be found in Worthington. Asphalt shingles are most common, with a considerable amount of slate still in service; there also are some wood shingles. Metal roofs generally are not common but can sometimes be found on small porches and additions. Asphalt shingles usually are a modern replacement of an earlier material, except on more recent buildings, where they may be original. Wood shingle roofs were common early but tended to deteriorate rapidly and were replaced fairly early. The existing wood shingle roofs probably are recent in date.

Gutters catch water as it flows off the edge of the roof and usually have one of two designs: semi-circular “half round” gutters, consisting of troughs suspended on straps or wires that run under the roofing material; and “ogee” gutters with a flat back and an S-curve front profile, attached by long nails to a vertical fascia board below the edge of the roof. Both types usually are made of either painted galvanized metal or aluminum with a factory-applied paint finish, though copper also is used and tends to be the most durable material.

Downspouts have round or rectangular cross-sections, and the gutters drain directly into them: they usually are attached to the wall of the building with straps or hooks. At ground level they drain either into underground drain lines or onto splashblocks which direct the water away from the building.

Dormers, chimneys and skylights create interruptions in the roof surface. They can catch leaves and branches and create a debris pile that retains moisture, and they require flashing (usually made of sheet metal) to provide a moisture seal where they penetrate the roof. Valleys, where different roof angles meet, usually are lined with flashing under the roofing material.
Residential Rehabilitation

Roofs, Gutters and Downspouts

All parts of this water removal system must be in good condition or they cannot do their job.

A roof and its parts should be inspected regularly, especially when it is actually raining. Water should drain quickly from the roof; there should be no open joints or loose pieces in any flashing; all the water should be collected by the gutters; and the water should drain out of the gutters through the downspouts.

Recommendations

A. Watch for roof problems such as bulges or dips in the roof (older roofs often have some simply from age, but such areas can cause open joints in metal roofing or lifted shingles); and interior stains around chimneys, dormers and skylights (these usually are symptoms of a flashing problem).

B. Repair and retain existing traditional roofs such as wood shingle or slate. Roof materials often were intended to add to a building’s character (especially slate) and should be retained for that reason.

C. Chimneys are a defining feature of a building and should be repaired and maintained. Chimneys on frame buildings should not be covered with siding.

D. When installing a new roof on a building that currently has asphalt shingles, avoid the uneven, “staggered-but” design or other shingle patterns that try to create an older look; a medium gray color generally is appropriate on an older building if it originally had a slate roof. Green, red or black shingles may also be appropriate, depending on the building’s predominant colors. Avoid very light-colored shingles.

E. Check to see if gutters are catching water pouring off the roof; look to see whether it is overshooting the gutters or dripping down behind them. Overflowing gutters could be caused by plant debris or by a sag or low spot where the gutter
supports have failed. Watch for gutters twisted or bent due to a load of snow or ice. Better-quality gutter systems today avoid long nails and use screws and brackets to resist wind and ice damage.

F. Peeling paint, stains or moss growth near downspouts may indicate an obstructed downspout where water leaks out through a joint, or a seam pushed open by freezing debris inside.

G. If downspouts do not drain into underground lines or onto a splashblock, be sure there is an extra “elbow” at the outlet, directed away from the building’s foundation.

H. When replacing gutters or downspouts, duplicate the existing as closely as possible. As with other building elements, the simplest design is usually the best.

Once downspouts carry water to the ground, it must be drained away in order to avoid damage to the building. Splashblocks and underground drains are the most common methods. Note how a clean-out has been added to the underground drain to facilitate removal of leaves and other debris that can block water flow.
Residential Rehabilitation

Outbuildings

Here and there in Worthington’s neighborhoods are outbuildings of various kinds -- garages, storage sheds, workshops, small barns -- that are part of the fabric of the community.

Outbuildings typically are frame buildings, modest in scale and simple in design. Sometimes they had features similar to those on the houses they accompanied. Common exterior materials included wood shingles, beveled siding, and board-and-batten or flush siding.

Recommendations

A. Older outbuildings, sheds, and garages should be retained and repaired. They add variety and visual interest to the streetscape and are part of Worthington’s character.

B. For repair work on older outbuildings, use new materials that match the old as closely as possible. Avoid modern materials that are incompatible with the original designs of these structures. When in doubt, use materials that match those on the house, as was often done historically.

C. New outbuildings should use design cues from older nearby structures, including form, massing, roof shape, roof pitch and height, materials, window and door types and detailing. Try to create a new building compatible in appearance with the house it accompanies.
Residential Rehabilitation

Building Color

Color is a major design element with significant impact upon a building’s character. In Worthington some colors are more appropriate than others, depending upon a building’s age, style, and setting. The city has flexible policy giving building owners freedom in color selection but recommends avoiding colors inappropriate for Worthington’s architecture.

In the past, color use varied with time period. Early- and mid-19th century buildings often were painted white, but fairly bright colors such as red, blue, yellow, dark green and even orange were used, sometimes as body colors for buildings and sometimes as trim. After about 1860, typical colors included greens, reds, oranges, and olives that were fairly dark and rich. The body color was usually lighter, with trim painted in darker compatible colors; sometimes the opposite was true. Color patterns were simple, usually with only two different colors used for body and trim. Traditionally, bright colors were not used in Worthington.

In the years between about 1880 and 1900, when architectural designs became more complex and ornamental, color followed suit. Three colors on a single building became more common, and there was a re-introduction of lighter colors such as pale yellow or light green that had seen less use during the 1870-1880 period. When combined with darker colors, this created a more varied visual effect that complemented the generally more complex building designs. Blues and grays saw some use as trim colors but generally were not used as body colors.

After about 1900, architectural design entered a period of reaction to the heavy, ornate compositions of the late 19th century. Architects used simpler, plainer designs and turned to the classical forms and ornamentation of the past. In the Colonial Revival and other styles of this period, colors tended to be lighter and cooler, including creams, yellows, grays, and white.
Residential Rehabilitation

Building Color

This trend generally continues today. People often prefer lighter rather than darker colors for both body and trim. Indeed, the brighter colors sometimes used in the past often do not seem "right" for today's tastes. Even on older buildings that might have used brighter colors in the past, lighter color schemes can be appropriate.

In many cases, the colors of unpainted brick walls are the base colors, and trim colors should be selected to be compatible with them. In general, on buildings with dark red brick walls, darker trim colors such as maroon or dark green are appropriate, while for lighter tan or buff-colored brick, and for stone of similar color, consider yellow, cream, or white trim colors. One long tradition in Worthington has been the use of white or cream-colored trim on red-brick houses. On more recent buildings follow these same rules of thumb, depending on the basic wall material color.

Recommendations

A. Before re-painting, research original paint colors. It is possible to chip or scrape down through paint layers to expose earlier colors. However, remember that older exterior paint can contain lead and should be considered hazardous, especially if it is powdery or dusty. Always observe safety precautions such as safety eyewear and protection from paint dust and paint remover fumes; it is best to have a qualified contractor do this work. Once historic paint layers are exposed, match current color chips for color selection (most paint stores and manufacturers have "historic" paint palettes designed for older buildings). If original colors can't be discovered or are unacceptable, then consider alternate colors chosen according to the time-period guidelines above or from color palettes developed for use on historic buildings.
B. Paint only surfaces that have been painted before. Stone surfaces were seldom painted originally; brick surfaces sometimes were but usually were not. Poor weather resistance or damage to a wall were the usual reasons for painting brick, though sometimes it was just to change the building’s look. Very old Federal or Greek Revival style brick buildings were often painted to protect their soft handmade brick. Brick red or white were typical paint colors.

C. While unpainted brick or stone should not be painted, if such a surface has been painted in the past, consider repainting rather than removing the old paint. Paint removal can be difficult, expensive and can damage the masonry.

D. Avoid using too many colors on a building. Late 19th century buildings should have a maximum of three different colors (the body color and two trim colors); those from earlier and later periods should have no more than two. Consider using light and dark shades of the same color when choosing body and trim colors.
Residential Additions

Construction of an addition to an existing home involves not only budget considerations and technical issues such as building codes, permits, and zoning; it also involves important design considerations, since an addition can have a significant impact on the original house and on neighboring properties as well. Keep the following considerations in mind when planning an addition.

**Recommendations**

A. Use exterior materials traditionally used in Worthington. New materials used on an addition do not necessarily have to match the original materials of an older building -- a frame addition with beveled siding is appropriate for a brick house, for example -- but starkly modern materials such as diagonal rough-cut siding or painted concrete block should be avoided. Stone typically was not used in Worthington for additions, or for houses in general, and should also be avoided.

B. Be sure the addition is subordinate in appearance to the main building. This does not necessarily mean that the addition must be smaller than the original (though this is preferred), but it should be designed in a way that it does not overwhelm and dominate the original. It should be clear which structure is the original and which is the addition. A successful way to do this is to give the addition a lower height and roofline and smaller windows than the original.

C. Additions should be located as far as possible to the rear of the original building, and there should be a separation between the two to show that the addition did in fact come later. One approach is to use a small, low-roofed connector between the original building and the addition.

D. Some differentiation between old and new may be made in details such as window design and trim around openings and at eaves. For example, a simpler version of the trim and details of the original house could be used on an addition as a way of showing that one came later than the other.

E. Roofline additions such as skylights and dormers can be appropriate on rear elevations of existing buildings but generally should be avoided on sides and front elevations.
Residential Additions

* Maintain Similar Roof Forms
* Keep Additions to Rear and Sides of Existing Residence
* Additions should be subordinate to main house
* Set walls of addition back from corners of main house
existing development sites

existing development sites are infill sites that tend to occur as single lots scattered throughout the city. they are part of an existing streetscape and are undeveloped or unoccupied land parcels that either never were built upon or had a building removed for some reason. these sites should be developed in a way that is complementary to their neighborhoods and that integrates well with surrounding building designs and land uses. compatibility with the neighborhood should be the primary consideration.

new development sites

new development sites generally are larger than existing sites and may involve many building lots. they might include land that has never been developed, or that has some existing development that could be removed for new development.

these sites often have features -- sometimes man made and sometimes natural -- that can serve as unique enhancements to a development; or that can help a new development blend in well with the existing character of the city. man-made features might include fences, stone walls, gardens and plantings, and historic buildings. natural features might include watercourses, distinct topography, and mature trees.

planning for the development of a new site should include an inventory and evaluation of features, and the development should retain those that add scenic or historic value (historic buildings, topographical features, mature trees) or that help integrate the new development into the existing cityscape (existing landscaping, roads, paths, sidewalks).
New Residential Sites

New Development Sites Continued

Building placement and orientation are important design considerations. There are two primary considerations: 1) most main entrances should face the street; and 2) garages should avoid facing the street. The City of Worthington wants to avoid new development that turns main entrances inward or away from the street, and it wants to avoid dominance of the streetscape by garage doors.

At the same time, various site features such as landscaping, a watercourse, or a topographical feature may make it desirable to locate a building or to orient its side or rear elevations in a way that permits views or otherwise takes advantage of these features.

One additional consideration when planning new development is the issue of connectivity. In the past (generally prior to the suburban boom after World War II), new developments tended to be extensions of existing cities and villages.

New housing usually was built at the “edge of town,” on building lots immediately adjacent to already existing homes. The existing street grid and sidewalks were extended, and the new development immediately became part of the existing fabric of the community.

In Worthington, new developments should build upon the past excellence and successes of established neighborhoods. Efforts should be made to establish multiple connections to existing streets, to follow traditional grid street patterns and lot shapes, and to extend current neighborhoods’ amenities -- sidewalks, lawns, shade trees -- into new developments. At the same time, mixed-use developments should guard against placing the back sides of commercial properties -- where delivery or trash trucks may arrive at all hours -- immediately adjacent to residential properties.
**Form, Massing and Scale**

Form refers to the shape of a building -- square, rectangular, tall, short -- while massing refers to how the basic geometric shapes of buildings fit together. Simple massing may involve a single form such as a square or a rectangle, while more complex massing may combine two or more forms in shapes such as T’s or L’s.

Scale refers to the apparent size of a building and its components in relation to the size of a human being. Buildings that are small or intimate in scale generally communicate a sense of comfort and coziness, while large-scale, grand buildings usually are meant to impress or awe the viewer.

In Worthington most residential buildings have simple massing resulting in square, rectangular, T-shaped, L-shaped and irregular plans or “footprints.” Generally, buildings from the first half of the 19th century had simpler forms and massing than those from the second half of the century -- the Victorian period. The later buildings, in styles such as Queen Anne or French Second Empire -- often had complex massing involving many forms, as well as a rich variety of detail. As the 20th century progressed, and with a return to simpler architectural styles and ornamentation, form and massing again became simpler. Styles such as Colonial Revival often employed simple rectangular forms in uncomplicated T or L shapes.

The scale of Worthington residential buildings also showed certain patterns over time. Earlier buildings tended to have a more intimate sense of scale, while later 19th century buildings were larger and more grand. In the 20th century, the large scale of many buildings -- Colonial Revival style homes, for example -- gradually grew smaller and more intimate again in homes such as the ranch houses and Cape Cods common in the post–World War II period.

In designing new residential development in Worthington, it is important to keep the elements of form, massing, and scale in mind to ensure a final product that is as compatible as possible with what already exists in the community.
NEW RESIDENTIAL CONSTRUCTION
Form, Massing and Scale Recommendations

A. Observe the form, massing and scale of existing nearby houses and neighborhoods. Note that not all buildings will have the same characteristics. Scale, in particular, can vary considerably within a single block. In any new development, try to have a range of form, massing and scale similar to that found nearby and typical of Worthington.

B. When building a single house in an existing streetscape, note the general level of complexity of form and massing along the street; try to achieve a similar complexity in the new building. The same approach should be used in establishing the new building’s scale. If there is great diversity in the streetscape, a successful design could use as inspiration an average of the complexity level and scale of the whole street; or a particular existing building could be used as a model.

C. Avoid building houses higher than two-and-a-half stories in height, the typical maximum for Worthington homes.

D. If the needed square footage in a house would result in a building out of scale for its setting, consider breaking the house up into a series of smaller connected segments -- work with variations in massing in an effort to reduce the overall sense of scale. Wings and additions on the main block of the house can add square footage and keep the main portion from being too large. A similar gain in square footage can also be achieved by placing some space in outbuildings, but avoid building more than one or two such structures, and only do so if the lot size is adequate and building and zoning codes can be met.

E. Refer to the building and zoning codes regarding height limitations and minimum egress window sizes for new buildings.
New Residential Construction

Setbacks

Setback is the distance between the edge of the public right-of-way, or another demarcation line, and the facade of a building. To avoid an unsightly streetscape and a hodgepodge of building fronts blocking each other’s views, most communities establish various minimum setbacks in neighborhoods. Setbacks can vary from street to street, but the overall idea is to attain a sense of orderliness and regularity in the streetscape. Some projections beyond the setback line, such as front porches, are allowed on a case-by-case basis. In most of Worthington, setbacks at front and rear are 30 feet. Side setback requirements vary; check with the City of Worthington for the most up-to-date information.

Recommendations

A. Observe the setback of adjacent and nearby structures in the area where a new building or development will be placed. Many buildings are placed farther back than required by code; in such cases, the most appropriate setback is one that matches the prevailing setback along the streetscape.

B. Before planning any open or enclosed porch or other element that projects into the setback, be sure to check with the City of Worthington to see whether any variances are required.

C. Setback requirements are intended to encourage an orderly progression of building facades along a streetscape, but this is not intended to include a garage as part of a facade. Garages should be set back from the plane of the main building facade as much as possible, preferably as far to the rear of the lot as possible.
Scale

Scale is the apparent comparative size of a building and its components in relating to the size of a human being.

Components of Scale

Proportion, Balance, Spacing, Volume, Materials, Windows, Doors, Construction Details
In most architectural styles, the roof shape is an important character-defining feature. Often the shape of the roof is a critical component of a style, as in the case of the mansard roof typical of the French Second Empire style. Similarly, the steep roof slope of the Gothic Revival style and elements such as dormers and turrets typical of the Victorian period are major design features.

Many different roof shapes, all part of the overall architectural design, can be found in Worthington’s residential neighborhoods. Careful observation of various roof shapes, and the styles or designs with which they are associated, can be a good starting point for the design of a new residential building or development.

**Recommendations**

A. Roof shapes for new buildings should be appropriate to the style or design of the building. Refer to the architectural style guide for information. If a new building or development does not follow a particular style but is instead a vernacular design, then roof shapes and heights similar to those in the neighborhood or nearby would be most appropriate.

B. Developments with vernacular building designs can employ varying roof shapes for visual variety, but avoid using more than two or three basic shapes. Simple gable or hip roofs are usually the most appropriate.

C. Even with simple roof shapes, houses can have variety. Consider using dormers as one means. Another way is to orient the gable end to the street in some buildings and the "long" side in others.

D. Generally, flat roofs should be avoided. They were not typical on most of Worthington’s residential buildings, and they tend to have maintenance problems not associated with pitched roofs.
Roof Shapes

Pyramid
Salt-Box
Gable with Pediment
Gable
Mansard
Hip
Gambrel
Stepped Gable
Cross-Gable
New Residential Construction

Exterior Materials

Both for residential infill projects and in new developments, contemporary building materials should be used in traditional ways. For example, metal or vinyl siding that resembles wood beveled siding should only be used where beveled siding would have been used in the past: placed horizontally on the body of the building. A trip around the Architectural Review District can be very helpful since it has so many excellent examples of traditional exterior materials and the ways in which they were used.

Recommendations

A. Contemporary materials that simulate traditional ones are appropriate, but the preferred option is to use true traditional materials such as wood siding.

B. Incompatible contemporary materials should be avoided. These include rough-sawn siding, diagonal siding, plywood panel siding, and similar obviously modern materials.

C. Brick has long been a traditional material in Worthington. For newly-constructed buildings, the contemporary practice of applying a brick veneer over a frame structure is appropriate in Worthington.

D. Stuccoed surfaces generally are not typical of Worthington architecture and should be avoided. Also avoid coating foundations with stucco or using shaped stucco to simulate stone.

E. During project planning and before any final decisions are made on materials for a project, prepare a sample board. The Architectural Review Board can provide advice and guidance on the appropriateness of various materials.
New Residential Construction

Windows

Windows are a major character-defining feature of any building. As with other design elements, a look around Worthington’s neighborhoods will provide many examples of window types. Also, the architectural style guide section of the guidelines discusses which kinds of windows are appropriate for specific styles and periods.

Recommendations

A. For new buildings, multiple-paned windows generally are not appropriate. The exception is a building being built in a particular style -- such as Federal, Greek Revival or Colonial Revival -- that would have employed this window type. When in doubt, simple 1 over 1 double-hung sash windows are usually the simplest, least expensive and most appropriate choice.

B. When using multiple-paned windows, avoid designs with horizontally-proportioned panes. This type of window had panes with vertical proportions -- taller than they are wide -- and using panes that are wider than they are tall throws off the proportions of the entire window.

C. Using the excellent precedents of Worthington’s many historic structures, carefully design the pattern of window openings; window sizes and proportions (they must be appropriate for the size and proportions of the wall in which they are placed); pattern of window panes and muntins; and trim around the windows.

D. Good quality wood windows are more readily available and more affordable than in the past. True wood windows are always the first preference. Aluminum- or vinyl-clad windows can be appropriate, but primarily on secondary facades and less conspicuous locations. All-aluminum or vinyl windows are not prohibited but are not encouraged.

E. Avoid blank walls. In traditional residential building design, few if any walls had no windows at all, and windows usually were not located right at the corner of a house. Keep this in mind when designing new houses or developments, and avoid large blank walls with few or no windows.
Doors and entrances are major architectural elements because they are a focal point in the design of a building -- the place where people enter and leave. Because they were built over a long period of time, Worthington’s residential buildings have many different doors and entrances. As with other architectural elements, they varied over time, and some designs are more appropriate for specific styles and periods than others.

Early- to mid-19th century homes often had simple doors with four or six panels and no windows. Transoms were common, and some doors also had sidelights. By the Victorian period, doors were much more ornate, and they often had windows in their upper half.

Transoms were still common at this time, but sidelights were not used as much as in the earlier period. In the early 20th century, in styles such as the Colonial Revival, windowless paneled doors once again were common, as were transoms and sidelights.

**Recommendations**

A. As with other design considerations, study Worthington’s rich collection of 19th and 20th century architecture for design ideas for entrances and doors.

B. For newly-built buildings, simpler designs usually look better than more ornate ones. Avoid heavy ornamentation on doors and entrances.

C. Observe entry placement on existing buildings. Whether located symmetrically or asymmetrically, entries usually are aligned with a window on the second floor so that a regular rhythm of openings is maintained on both floors.

D. Entries should be located so they are easily visible, and they should be oriented toward the street. Make it easy for visitors (and emergency personnel) to find the front door.
New Residential Construction

Ornamentation

Ornamentation is a means of making a building more visually appealing and distinguishing it from other structures. Worthington’s residential buildings provide a good capsule history of ornamentation as it was used in the early 19th to the mid-20th centuries.

Early 19th century houses had little ornamentation, but as the mid-century came and went, the level of ornamentation increased. It tended to be confined to edges -- door and window trim, the edges of roofs, and cornices with brackets and frieze panels. Ornamentation reached a high point in the heavy Victorian compositions of the late 19th century and then became less pronounced and simpler in the early 20th century. By the 1930s ornamentation was disappearing almost entirely from homes, a trend continued into later designs such as ranch houses and Cape Cod cottages.

Recommendations

A. Observe Worthington’s excellent historic architecture for information on the kinds and amounts of ornamentation employed on various building styles and periods.

B. Use ornamentation conservatively. It will be most successful if used in traditional locations: around windows and doors; along a building’s cornice or at the corners; in gables; or on gates and fences.

C. Most ornamentation historically was made of simple forms built up to a desired level of complexity. When in doubt, follow the old rule that "less is more." Sometimes just a little ornamentation, well placed, can have a major impact without the need for more extensive (and expensive, and hard-to-maintain) ornamentation.

D. Use compatible materials in ornamental elements. Frame houses should have wood ornamentation, although in cases where the ornamental elements are some distance from the viewer it may be possible to use substitute materials such as fiberglass. Brick buildings usually had wood ornamentation, but substitute materials can be used to resemble the stone or metal ornamental elements often found on brick buildings.
**New Residential Construction**

**Color**

Color can have a significant impact upon a building’s design and appearance, and the Architectural Review Board encourages the use of colors appropriate to the buildings and the overall character of Worthington. There is a policy of flexibility in color use, and the Board can provide information on appropriate selections.

Compatibility is the watchword, along with using colors appropriate to residential buildings. There are no hard and fast requirements for particular colors or color combinations. Once again, however, it will be instructive to study Worthington’s existing residential building stock in the Architectural Review District to get a sense of appropriate colors and combinations of colors.

**Recommendations**

A. In general, avoid bright colors not typical in Worthington neighborhoods, such as various shades of purple or orange. For infill buildings being placed in an existing streetscape, select colors compatible with those already used along the streetscape.

B. Many buildings follow a pattern of light colors for the building body and darker colors for the trim. Following this pattern is encouraged. In Worthington, the use of white or cream-colored trim also is common and would be appropriate for new construction.

C. Avoid using too many colors. Usually one body color and one trim color are sufficient.

D. For new brick buildings, let the natural brick color be the body color, and select trim colors that are compatible with the color of the bricks.
Introduction

The heart of Old Worthington is a blend of commercial and institutional buildings in a distinctive physical setting. The Village Green, an important public space dating from the very founding of the community, together with High Street and Route 161, the primary north-south and east-west streets, is the “stage set” in which a rich blend of architectural styles and forms have been placed. Taken as a whole, the commercial district of Worthington, particularly from the Green southward, is a unique record of the community’s commercial and institutional growth and development.

The Village Green is a strong link to the New England roots of Worthington and is a feature shared by only a few other Midwestern communities. At the same time, the continuous rows of commercial storefronts lining High Street are typical of Midwestern commercial districts and were much less common in smaller New England towns. Worthington successfully blends these two traditions. Located close by are important local institutions such as the post office building, the New England Lodge, and St. John’s Church.

This section of the guidelines is focused on maintaining the character of Worthington’s Architectural Review District, which combines old and new in a unique historic area.
Parking is a critical issue in any commercial district. It is an important service any district must provide, but it can have a significant negative impact on the district’s character if it is not handled well. This is particularly true in pedestrian-oriented areas such as Old Worthington.

Public spaces along streets have always been the primary source of parking in most commercial districts. Off-street spaces and lots are a fairly recent development, dating largely from the days when misguided “urban renewal” demolition of downtown buildings made streetside lots available. Worthington, fortunately, has suffered very little of this in its historic downtown area.

Close spacing of buildings and lack of land in Worthington’s commercial district mean that new parking lots cannot easily be created. In areas of the district where conditions will permit creation of parking, though, consider placing it at the rear of the site, or as far back along the side as possible. The most appropriate form of off-street parking is where buildings are used to screen the parking from view from public streets.

**Recommendations**

A. Avoid putting parking or curb cuts in front of a building at the sidewalk. Try to reach parking from a side street or an alley rather than from the main street, and be sure that the availability of public parking is identified. Check the Codified Ordinances of Worthington for specific parking requirements.

B. Screen parking with landscaping such as low bushes, especially if site conditions require that you put parking near the front of the building. Historically and architecturally appropriate low fences or walls may also be effective.

C. Help maintain a healthy supply of parking for shoppers and visitors. Be sure that business owners and employees do not use up prime spaces.

D. Encourage sharing of parking spaces between businesses and land parcels. Rear parking lots can be consolidated and linked for use by multiple businesses.
Eliminate or Minimize Parking in Front of Larger Retail and Office Developments
While the architecture is of prime importance in a commercial district such as Worthington’s, landscaping of building sites is also important. Landscaping works with other site elements such as paving and street furniture to create the district’s sense of high quality.

Recommendations

A. A small amount of landscaping can have a positive impact; this is already easy to see in the many well-landscaped spots in Worthington’s commercial district. Small, well-executed and well-maintained landscaping is appropriate for the relatively small spaces here and provide relief from the “hardscape” of buildings, streets, and other man-made elements. Plant materials should be selected for appropriate size, shape, color, and “pedestrian friendliness” (avoid, for example, thorny species that can catch dresses or scratch children). Pots or planters permit moving plants and flowers around for best effect.

B. Have a regular maintenance program for landscaping, paving, furniture and other streetscape elements. Small details such as weed-filled planters or accumulated litter can give a strong negative impression. Do not plant any more than can be maintained easily. Fences may be helpful for screening transformers, gas meters, and communication equipment. Also consider using plantings for this purpose, but be sure they do not interfere with meter-reading or maintenance of equipment. Keep functional items such as trash containers, transformers and electrical boxes orderly and well screened.

C. Be sure that no landscaping elements block views of traffic, especially at intersections. Keep landscaping back enough from the street to permit easy access to parked cars.
**Existing Commercial/Institutional Sites**

**Fences and Walls**

Fences and walls are traditionally used as boundary markers and security features. In commercial districts they often are used to separate a storefront or an outdoor seating area from the activity of the street. Fences and walls can also be used and are strongly encouraged as effective screening for utility boxes, trash containers, and the like. Some businesses have placed seating and tables along the sidewalk for use by patrons having lunch or enjoying a cup of coffee. Such use of the community’s sidewalks makes the entire area feel more open and pedestrian-friendly, though business owners should be sure that movement is not obstructed.

**Recommendations**

A. Traditional types of fences and walls include masonry walls, cast and wrought iron fences, wood rail or board fences, rows of trees and shrubs, or a combination of these. Avoid non-traditional materials such as concrete, basket-weave, stockade and "cyclone" fencing.

B. Paint or opaque stain are the preferred finishes for wood fencing, but leaving it to weather naturally is also acceptable (the paint or stain will give it a more finished look). If pressure-treated lumber is used for structural elements, wait six months to one year before painting or staining. Fences are not permitted in front of the building line so the building and storefronts can remain visible. Side and rear fences may be as much as six feet in height, especially when concealing trash containers and utility boxes.

C. Set aside a maintenance budget for fencing and walls so they do not become deteriorated and unsightly.
Existing Commercial/Institutional Sites

Streetscape and Street Furniture

The older commercial district of Worthington has a pleasant system of sidewalks made of both brick and poured concrete, and well-designed items of street furniture such as benches, waste receptacles, planters, and street lights; these have been installed and are maintained by the City of Worthington. Sidewalks are generous, leaving adequate room for these extra amenities.

Recommendations

A. The primary goal should be to care for what is already in place and ensure that any replacements of existing elements are as appropriate as the originals. As with landscaping and plantings, a maintenance budget for these items is very important.

B. The current range of street furniture should be retained to the greatest extent possible. Few if any additional such items should be added to the streetscape, in order to avoid a cluttered look.

C. Any replacements or additions to the streetscape should be simple and unobtrusive in character. Items of street furniture should generally be dark in color and contemporary in design. If similar improvements are extended to areas of the Architectural Review District currently without such elements, designs similar to the existing should be used.
Existing Commercial/Institutional Sites

Lighting
As in residential areas, lighting fixtures in a commercial district need to be considered carefully and selected so they enhance the district’s historic character.

In Worthington’s commercial district, most light fixtures are of recent date rather than historic. They generally are quite compatible with the architecture and the historic setting.

Recommendations
A. Use of fairly small lighting fixtures, and as few as possible, is recommended.

B. Fixtures should not be overly ornate. Simple and smaller usually is better.

C. Keep maintenance in mind. For example, an anodized finish will likely require less maintenance than a shiny brass one.

D. Keep lighting at a pedestrian scale along the streetscape. Avoid lighting fixtures mounted high above the ground. Higher fixtures may be appropriate in parking lots in newer commercial areas.

E. Avoid excessive brightness. Extra-life incandescent or compact fluorescent lamps should be sufficient, especially if fixtures are mounted a little above head height, since their light will have to cover a more limited area.

F. Watch for excessive “spilling” of light onto adjacent properties and into nearby windows and storefronts, especially from parking lot lighting. Fixtures can include shades or screens to help with this.
Traditional Storefront Details in New Construction
Commercial/Institutional Rehabilitation

Storefronts

Commercial storefronts play a very large role in determining the character of Worthington’s Central Business District. They line the streets, and for both pedestrians and people passing in cars the district’s storefronts are the primary environmental feature. Well-maintained storefronts containing attractive visual displays are typical of Worthington and are a major part of its appeal.

The pathway along the street is enhanced by the changing series of storefronts and window displays.

Recommendations

A. Large storefront display windows should be kept and maintained. They should not be downsized or removed because this creates a “blank wall” appearance and detracts from the character of the building and the district.

B. Real or simulated multiple-paned storefronts can be found in many Worthington commercial buildings. This type of window is common in pre-Civil War buildings, when smaller glass panes were typical. Later storefronts, especially in the early 20th century, usually had large single panes of glass. In such buildings, the large panes should be retained and not replaced with multiple panes. In addition to being historically appropriate, this will lend variety to storefront design in the district.

C. If a commercial space is used as an office or some other use that does not require a display window for retail purposes, the window should nonetheless be retained. If privacy is important, this can be achieved by use of folding screens or drapes; avoid shutters or blinds that block off all views of the building interior. Remember, though, that retail uses are preferred on the first floor, and offices are preferable on upper floors.

D. For non-retail businesses, consider using window displays related to the business, to local history, or to some other subject so that the storefront contains something of visual interest for passing pedestrians.
This Worthington storefront, which dates from the early 20th century, has all the classic storefront elements: paneled metal bulkheads; large plate-glass display windows, a transom, and a fabric awning.

**Commercial/Institutional Rehabilitation**

*Storefront Recommendations Continued*

E. Especially in some early 20th century commercial storefronts, original elements have survived, including prism glass transom windows and bulkheads below the display windows. These and other original materials should be retained during any repair or rehabilitation.

F. Avoid materials not typical of historic storefront design. These include aluminum and vinyl siding, all-brick storefronts, fixed metal or wood canopies, and wood siding and shingles. Also avoid applying trim or ornamentation that a commercial storefront would not have originally had. In general, older storefronts had more details and trim than more recent ones, and this difference in design should be respected.

This well-preserved early 20th century storefront has shaped bronze sheet metal bulkheads and a transom of prism glass, which gathered natural light and projected it into the interior.

This Worthington storefront, which dates from the early 20th century, has all the classic storefront elements: paneled metal bulkheads; large plate-glass display windows, a transom, and a fabric awning.
Commercial building doors, both those leading into first-floor store fronts and those providing access to upper floors, usually were much plainer than doors in residential architecture. They seldom had heavy carvings or turnings, and they usually were painted rather than stained or varnished; varnished doors were more common in early 20th century buildings. They typically had windows that took up half or more of their surface area, sometimes with beveled glass, sometimes with plain, but only rarely with leaded or stained glass. Hardware could range from plain and utilitarian to heavy and ornate and included hinges, kickplates, door handles, and latches and locks.

On the upper floors of commercial buildings two or more stories in height, windows played both a functional and an aesthetic role, providing natural light but also playing an important role in the overall architectural design. Their size, spacing and proportions were carefully keyed to the design of the building and its storefronts.

Early commercial buildings usually had multiple-paned double-hung windows on their upper floors. Though many are of recent date, such windows are widely used in Worthington’s commercial district. As in residential buildings, later commercial structures had 4-over-4 or 2-over-2 windows, and eventually, in the late 19th century, 1-over-1 window sash became almost standard. This continued into the early 20th century, although some buildings had 6-over-1, 3-over-1, or other window designs for variety.

This well-preserved wood door is typical of the naturally-finished doors of the late 19th and early 20th centuries. Set in a recessed doorway, this example is glazed in more than two-thirds of its surface in order to admit natural light to the store’s interior.
A. Older doors should be retained instead of replaced. If they are in poor condition, they can usually be repaired; damaged or non-functional hardware can be repaired or replaced, but replacement hardware should be commercial and not a lighter residential grade. If new hardware is installed, it may have to comply with accessibility requirements; check with the City of Worthington for advice.

B. Doors should not be “dressed up” with heavy moldings, ornate carving, paneling, or other added decoration. On both 19th and early 20th century commercial buildings, doors generally were not highly ornamented and tended to be very plain. For new replacement doors, if needed, wood is the preferred material, and the design should be simple, perhaps with one or two lower panels and a window in the upper half.

C. Older doors that originally were painted should not be stripped, stained, and varnished; and originally varnished doors should not be painted. When re-doing a door, try to use the original finish technique.

D. Glass windows in doors should be retained. If they are broken or have been removed in the past, consider replacing them with new glass. If security is a concern, consider using wire glass or tempered glass. Remember that doors may have to meet certain requirements of the building code.
Commercial/Institutional Rehabilitation

Window and Door Recommendations Continued

E. Older upper floor windows should be retained rather than replaced; often repair of an existing window is less expensive than a new replacement window. Window openings should not be enlarged or downsized; maintaining their original size is an important part of preserving a building’s character.

F. If energy conservation is a concern, consider using interior or exterior storm windows rather than replacing old windows. It may also be possible to re-glaze existing windows with new insulated glass units, but avoid replacing historic “wavy” glass.

G. If windows are missing or must be replaced due to extensive deterioration, use new windows of the same size, design and profile (cross-section), to the greatest extent possible; wood windows are preferred. This means that if the old windows were 1-over-1 double-hung sash, the replacements should look the same. The new windows should fit the window openings exactly, without requiring extra wood or metal infill panels to fill the opening; and the dimensions of the framing, sash members, and other elements should match the old dimensions. Consider replacing only the sash if the old window frame is still sound. Remember that if replacement windows are not identical in size to the existing, this could trigger building code requirements for light and ventilation; call the City of Worthington for information.

H. Avoid adding colored or leaded glass in places it never was used; also avoid snap-in “multiple-paned” muntins or other non-original treatments.

The post office’s unusual 8 over 12 windows -- a product of the 1930s -- are a major part of the building’s character.
For a long time in commercial districts, awnings have shaded storefronts and provided weather protection for the storefront and for people on the sidewalk. Upper floor windows of commercial buildings, too, often had awnings, usually retractable ones like those on the storefront. Awnings typically were made of canvas or other heavy fabric and were mounted on metal pipe frames.

Color, patterns and details of awnings varied, but in overall design they were almost always the same: storefront awnings were flat, sloping fabric surfaces located just above the display window. They sloped downward to just above head height, projecting several feet out over the sidewalk. Sometimes they had triangular end panels and sometimes not; most were on retractable support pipes that could be raised and lowered with a mechanical cranking system. Awnings at upper floor windows were similar in shape but usually had the side panels. They usually were retracted or removed and stored during cold weather.

Sometimes canopies were mounted at building entrances to provide protection from sun and weather, but they were permanent and were fixed in place. Some canopies were original elements, but many today are recent additions to buildings that never had them.
**Commercial/Institutional Rehabilitation**

**Awning Recommendations**

A. Fabric awnings are appropriate but should have a matte rather than a glossy surface. Avoid fixed, permanent canopies unless it can be shown through research that a building had one in the past and that the canopy design was compatible with the original character of the building.

B. On storefronts that are divided by piers into distinct bays, each display window or door should have its own awning rather than a single full-width awning covering an entire facade.

C. Use traditional flat, sloping awnings. Avoid rounded or “bullnose” awnings, except at round-headed window openings, where the rounded awning shape is appropriate.

D. Manufacturers provide durable, long-lasting fabric for awnings in a wide range of colors. Awning colors should be compatible with historically appropriate colors used on the building, but avoid overly ornate patterns and too many colors. A simple pattern with no more than two colors is recommended.

E. Try to retain and reuse any surviving historic awnings or hardware. Sometimes a good oiling and some patching of the fabric is all that’s required. If retractable mechanisms cannot be repaired or are too expensive to fix, it might be possible to fix them in place as a permanent support.

F. Do regular maintenance such as washing your awning at least once a year. Retractable awnings should not be folded or rolled up while wet. Tears should be repaired quickly before they get larger.
In Worthington, most upper facades on commercial buildings are fairly plain, with little ornamentation. The upper floor windows usually are the primary feature of the facade. Above the upper floor windows, cornices and parapets are common. They are original components that “dress up” a building and give it a sense of style and character.

Cornices are the horizontal projections at the top of a building wall, and sometimes just above the storefront as well, that provide a visual break or termination of a wall. A parapet is an upward extension of a building wall, sometimes ornamented and sometimes plain, used to give a building a greater feeling of height or a better sense of proportion.

In Worthington these elements can be found on most commercial buildings. There is a great deal of variety, but most cornices are simple profiled projections, without much ornamentation. Parapets tend to be plain, without ornamentation, and are most common on later buildings.
Commercial/Institutional Rehabilitation

Upper Facades, Parapets & Cornices Recommendations

A. Avoid removing or covering ornamental elements, cornices, and parapets, which are important to a building’s overall character. If parts are damaged or missing, consider replacing them in kind or having new ones fabricated from alternate materials such as wood, fiberglass or some plastics.

B. Avoid adding ornamentation or other decorative elements, unless research shows that a building once had them. Dressing up a building with arbitrary pieces of ornamentation gives the building a false “history” or character it never had.

C. Parapet walls should not be altered. When they get deteriorated, there is sometimes a temptation to lower or remove them. Avoid doing this, however, because often the flashing for the roof is tied into the parapet, and disturbing it can cause moisture problems. In addition, alteration of a parapet may bring into play new building code items that an unaltered parapet would not require.

D. Inspect and maintain parapets on a regular basis. They are exposed to the weather more than other parts of the building, so watch for deterioration such as missing mortar or excessive moisture retention. However, avoid waterproofing treatments, which can interfere with the parapet’s natural ability to dry out quickly when it gets wet.

This design includes a projecting cornice and a distinctive parapet above that gives a small building greater street presence.
In most communities, commercial buildings usually have flat, sloping roofs that drain to the rear. In downtown Worthington, however, there are many buildings with gable roofs, and there are several mansard roofs, both older and more recent. These require gutters and downspouts in both the front and rear. The high visibility of the roofs, gutters and downspouts means they need to be well designed and well maintained.

Roofs, gutters and downspouts comprise an integrated system to collect and remove water from a building as quickly as possible. A failure or weakness in one component will hinder or prevent the others from doing their jobs. It is important to watch for signs of trouble and correct problems before they get out of hand.
A. Regular maintenance and cleaning is the best way to keep a roof system in good shape. Watch for blisters, breaks, tears, or holes in the roof surface, and check flashing for loose joints and open seams. Watch for problems such as loose or filled-up gutters and downspouts, and vegetation such as moss or grass which indicates accumulated dirt and retained moisture.

B. Be sure that water from downspouts is drained away properly. Downspouts should empty into underground drainpipes that take the water to a sewer or street and should not spill water onto sidewalks.

C. On masonry buildings, the straps that hold downspouts in place should be attached at mortar joints, not the masonry surface. Gutters held in place by straps should be nailed in place underneath roofing materials and not on the roof surface.

D. Watch for gutters that continue to drip long after rain has stopped; they may be retaining water in a low spot or in accumulated dirt. Check building walls for damp spots that might indicate gutter or downspout leaks.

E. When doing roof system repairs, retain historic materials as much as possible; when replacement is necessary, try to match the historic materials. Avoid heavy wood “shakes” or staggered-butt shingles that try to give a building a “historic” flavor.
In Worthington’s commercial district, as in its residential neighborhoods, building color is a major design element. Some colors are more appropriate than others, varying with a building’s age, style, and setting. The city has a flexible policy giving building owners freedom in color selection but recommends avoiding colors inappropriate for Worthington’s architecture.

Early- and mid-19th century buildings often were white. At the same time, bright colors such as red, blue, yellow, dark green and even orange were used both as body colors and on storefronts, windows, and cornices. After about 1860, colors included greens, reds, oranges, and olives. The body color was usually lighter, with storefronts and other elements painted in darker compatible colors. Usually only two colors were used.

Between about 1880 and 1900, color became more complex, with up to three colors on a building. Lighter colors such as pale yellow or light green reappeared. Combining these with darker colors created a varied visual effect suited to the prevailing complex building designs. Blues and grays saw some use as trim colors but generally were not used as body colors. As before, body color tended to be lighter, and darker colors were used on storefronts, windows, trim and ornamentation.

After about 1900 architects used simpler, plainer designs and turned to the classical forms of the past. Colors tended to be lighter and cooler, including creams, yellows, grays, and white.

In many commercial structures, the colors of unpainted brick walls are the base colors, and trim colors were selected to be compatible with the brick. For buildings with dark red brick walls, darker trim colors such as maroon or dark green are appropriate, while for lighter tan or buff-colored brick, yellow, cream, or white trim colors work well. As is the case with some of Worthington’s houses, the use of white or cream-colored trim on brick commercial buildings is a long tradition.
Commercial/Institutional Rehabilitation

Building Color Recommendations

A. Before re-painting, research original paint colors. Using scrapers, sandpaper, and paint remover, chip or scrape down through paint layers to expose earlier colors. Always observe safety precautions such as safety eyewear and protection from paint remover fumes; consider having a qualified contractor do this work. Once historic paint layers are exposed, match current color chips for color selection (most paint stores and manufacturers have “historic” paint palettes designed for older buildings). If original colors can’t be discovered or are unacceptable, then consider alternate colors chosen according to the time-period guidelines above. The Architectural Review Board does not require that colors be selected from approved color palettes, but the City of Worthington has some examples of appropriate colors for the Architectural Review District. Property owners may develop their own proposed color schemes but should have these reviewed by the Board or the City before buying any paint.

B. Paint only surfaces that have been painted before. Stone surfaces were seldom painted originally; painted brick surfaces tend to be more common on commercial buildings than residential. Poor weather resistance or damage to a wall were the usual reasons for painting brick, though sometimes it was just to change the building’s look. While unpainted brick or stone should not be painted, if such a surface has been painted in the past, consider re-painting rather than removing the old paint. Paint removal can be difficult, expensive and can damage the masonry.

C. Avoid using too many colors on a building. Late 19th century buildings should have a maximum of three different colors (the body color and two trim colors); those from earlier and later periods should have no more than two. Consider using light and dark shades of the same color when choosing body and trim colors.

D. Help keep a building’s design unified by using the same colors for the storefront and its details, the upper floor windows, and the cornice area.

E. Colors used on building additions should respect the color families of adjacent buildings as well as the original building.
Major New Additions
Placed in Rear of Existing Structure or on Secondary Street
Commercial/Institutional Additions

Construction of an addition to a commercial or institutional building should be approached in the same way as one for an existing home. Such a project involves important design considerations, since an addition can have a major impact on neighboring properties. Include the following considerations when planning an addition to a commercial or institutional building.

Recommendations

A. Use exterior materials traditionally used on commercial and institutional buildings in Worthington. These most commonly include brick; frame construction is less common. New materials used on an addition do not necessarily have to match the original materials of an older building -- a frame addition with beveled siding, for example, could be appropriate on a masonry building -- but starkly modern materials such as rough-cut siding, plastics, metal surfaces or painted concrete block should be avoided.

B. The addition should be subordinate to the main building. This does not necessarily mean that the addition must be smaller than the original, but it should be designed in a way that it does not overwhelm and dominate the original.

C. Some architectural review boards require that additions be designed so that they are easily distinguished from the original building. While this is acceptable in Worthington, the Architectural Review Board does not require it. Matching the original building’s design elements in an addition is acceptable. Note, however, that for projects using the Historic Rehabilitation Tax Credit, National Park Service design standards generally require differentiation between old and new construction. There may be instances where the design for an addition has been approved by the Architectural Review Board but may not be acceptable under federal tax credit design standards.
Commercial/Institutional Additions

Recommendations Continued

D. For projects where the addition is to be distinguished from the original, one way to do this is to give the addition a lower height and roofline and smaller windows than the original. In some cases it may be possible to break a given amount of new square footage into smaller blocks rather than using one large addition. Other techniques include designing a separation between the original and the addition to show that the addition did in fact come later, perhaps by using a small, low-roofed connector between the original building and the addition. Also, differentiation between old and new can occur in details such as window design and trim around openings.

E. Generally, additions should be located as far as possible to the rear of the original building. There may be some instances, however, where building an addition on the front of the original building may be a preferable option. This would especially be true when an addition could replace a front parking lot. See the first drawing in this section for some design options.

F. Additions may present the opportunity to use the structure to screen parking from public view; look for ways to do this while planning an addition.
New Commercial/Institutional Sites

Existing Development Sites
Existing commercial development sites are infill sites that tend to occur as single sites in the Central Business District and elsewhere along the commercial arteries of the community. They are part of an existing streetscape and are undeveloped or unoccupied land parcels that either never were built upon or had a building removed for some reason. These sites should be developed in a way that is complementary to the architecture and land uses around them and that integrates well with the existing community.

New Development Sites
New commercial development sites generally are larger than existing sites and may involve one large or many smaller land parcels. They might include land that has never been developed, or that has some existing development that could be removed for new development.

These sites often have natural and man-made features that serve as enhancements to a development or that blend in with the existing built environment of the city. Natural features include watercourses, distinct topography, and mature trees. Man-made features include fences, stone walls, gardens and plantings, and historic buildings. Planning for the development of a new site should include an inventory and evaluation of features, and the development should retain those that add scenic or historic value or that help integrate the new development into the existing cityscape.

Connecting new development with what has come before is an important consideration. In the past, new commercial development tended to extend the urban fabric, building at the edges of existing development. Most development after the mid-20th century, which had an automobile orientation, went to the edge of town and grew as separate shopping centers or individual buildings with little to connect them physically.

In Worthington, new developments should build upon and extend the pedestrian scale and walkability of the city’s commercial heart. Efforts to establish this connection can include multiple pathways to existing streets, following traditional grid street patterns in commercial developments, and extending amenities such as sidewalks, lawns and shade trees into new developments.
Commercial - Outside Old Worthington
Minimizing Scale

"Breaking up the Big Box"
Scale, Form and Massing

Scale refers to the apparent size of a building and its components in relation to the size of a human being and in comparison to adjacent buildings. Buildings are often referred to as being either grand or intimate in scale. The city of Worthington, with few exceptions, expresses an intimate scale -- especially in Old Worthington’s Central Business District -- that contributes to a sense of comfort and friendliness attractive to residents or visitors.

Outside Old Worthington, larger commercial developments present different issues. An intimate scale that works in Old Worthington may not necessarily apply in a new development. At the same time, some other characteristics, such as setbacks, materials and forms, tend to be consistent with historic patterns of development and help to continue traditional patterns into new development areas such as the northern part of High Street.

Form and massing are related concepts. The combination of various geometric forms leads to the overall massing of a building. A rectangular wing attached to a square building, for example, might result in a T-shaped or L-shaped form.

In Old Worthington, the form and massing of every building is not always apparent because there are so many shared walls. Generally, commercial and institutional buildings in this area are rectangular in form, with a simple massing as a result. Some properties, such as churches, have wings or additions that made their massing more complex.

Outside Old Worthington, the form and massing of various developments tends to vary. Some buildings are square, some rectangular, some L-shaped; no one form or massing is predominant.
Commercial Façade Development

For New Construction in Old Worthington
New Commercial/Institutional Construction
Scale, Form and Massing

Recommendations -- Old Worthington
A. New construction in Old Worthington should take special care to employ scale, form, and massing that are similar to and compatible with existing building designs.

B. To maintain the predominant sense of scale in Old Worthington, most buildings should be two stories in height; in some instances, two-and-a-half stories may be appropriate but this must be evaluated on a case-by-case basis.

C. Rectangular forms and simple massing, designed to resemble the characteristics of existing buildings, are the most appropriate in Old Worthington.

Recommendations -- Other Commercial Areas
A. Extension of the pleasant scale of Old Worthington into new areas is desirable. Consider breaking down larger buildings into a series of smaller masses with connectors between them. Inclusion of sidewalks, pedestrian-scaled signage, and planting and lawn areas will help communicate a sense of a walkable pedestrian scale.

B. Simple geometric forms and uncomplicated massing tend to make buildings more user-friendly and help to extend the character of Old Worthington into the newer development areas.

C. Carefully designed building facades that employ traditional storefronts -- or similarly-sized windows on the first floor -- will help make new buildings more pedestrian-friendly.
Setbacks in Old Worthington tend to be consistent, with most commercial facades lining up in the same plane along the edge of the sidewalk -- long a traditional development pattern in Midwestern downtowns, where rows of continuous facades create a distinct and consistent streetscape. At the same time, many institutional structures in the area have different setbacks intended to distinguish them from surrounding structures.

In other commercial areas, development generally avoids continuous facades -- except in some shopping centers -- and has varying setbacks that often place parking in front of each building.

**Recommendations -- Old Worthington**

A. Any construction of new commercial buildings should maintain the same setback as adjacent buildings. Retention of the area’s continuous commercial facades is a high priority.

B. In designing new institutional structures, study existing buildings of this type. Select a setback that is consistent with code requirements but that also is appropriate for the size, shape and scale of the new structure.

**Recommendations -- Other Commercial Areas**

A. Parking areas should be located toward the rear and not in the front setbacks if at all possible. Unimpeded pedestrian access to the front building facade from the sidewalk should be a primary goal.

B. Building up to the required setback is desirable as means of getting pedestrians closer to the building and into the main entrance as easily as possible.
Roofs have always been a major character-defining feature in architectural design. Their shapes are strongly related to building form and massing, as well as being indicative of architectural style.

In Old Worthington, many roofs are flat, but there also are gable and mansard roofs. This variety in roof shape helps give the area its character. Outside Old Worthington there is a similar variety in newer commercial and institutional structures.

**Recommendations -- Old Worthington**

A. New infill structures should employ roof shapes typical of Old Worthington and selected specifically for compatibility with the roof shapes of immediately adjacent structures.

B. Roof heights of new buildings should approximate those of existing buildings and should not be significantly higher or lower.

**Recommendations -- Other Commercial Areas**

A. Generally, a traditional roof shape such as gable or hip is preferable to a flat roof on a new building. Roof shapes in a development do not have to be identical but can vary -- just as in Old Worthington -- to provide visual variety. However, avoid using more than two or three different shapes.

B. Roof shapes should be in scale with the buildings on which they are placed. Study traditional building designs in Old Worthington to get a sense of how much of the facade composition is wall surface and how much is roof.
Brick is the predominant building material in Old Worthington, but wood can also be found. Traditionally, these were the materials used by builders in downtown districts. There are some modern materials, but the historic ones are the most apparent; some of the brick has been painted and some remains unpainted.

Outside Old Worthington, wood is less common. Brick is the primary building material, and the newer buildings in these areas employ modern materials such as metal and plastic.

**Recommendations -- Old Worthington**

A. New buildings in this area should employ only traditional wood and brick. Contemporary materials that simulate wood can be acceptable if done well, and brick veneer construction over a wood frame also is acceptable.

B. Observe existing historic buildings to see how materials are used: brick patterns; types of wood surfaces; and decorative uses of these materials in wall surfaces. Consider using similar techniques to provide visual interest and variety in a new building.

**Recommendations -- Other Commercial Areas**

A. Traditional materials such as wood and brick are desirable in newer areas, but other materials are also acceptable. These include various metals and plastics; poured concrete and concrete block should be confined primarily to foundation walls.

B. Large areas of glass are appropriate for the first floors of new buildings, where they resemble the commercial storefronts typical of older buildings. On upper floors, avoid large areas of glass in favor of a more traditional pattern of window openings spaced regularly across the building’s wall. Avoid any use of glass with highly reflective coatings. Some of these may have a blue, orange, or silver color and can be as reflective as mirrors; they generally are not compatible with other development in Worthington.

C. Before making a final selection of materials, prepare a sample board with preferred and optional materials. The Architectural Review Board encourages concept reviews early in the design process.
Windows in commercial/institutional buildings are important elements in architectural compositions. This is especially so in the case of commercial storefront windows, which create a connection between the interior of a retail space and the exterior space outside.

Upper floor windows are also important, since they help define the pattern of solids and voids along the streetscape. This is particularly true in Old Worthington, where these patterns have long been a part of the area’s character.

**Recommendations -- Old Worthington**

A. New buildings built in Old Worthington should follow traditional window patterns on the first and the upper floors. Traditional storefront design should prevail on the first floor, with individual windows on upper floors.

B. Observe the size, proportions, and spacing of storefront and upper floor windows on Old Worthington buildings. Use these as a guide in developing a new building design to enhance the new structure’s compatibility with existing buildings.

C. For new buildings, simple 1 over 1 double-hung sash are the most appropriate (and usually least expensive) for upper floor use. Avoid multiple-paned effects and ornamental windows such as stained glass.

**Recommendations -- Other Commercial Areas**

A. On long facades, consider breaking the composition down into smaller “storefront” units, with some variation in first and upper floor window design.

B. Use traditional sizes, proportions and spacing for first and upper floor windows. Doing so will help link Old Worthington and newer areas through consistent design elements.
Doors and the entrances surrounding them — entries — are significant elements in a building design. Traditionally they were focal points of building facades, often located symmetrically and made easily visible so it was readily apparent where people should enter a building.

More recent building designs often downplay the entry to the point that it becomes simply a slight variation in a continuous facade.

**Recommendations -- Old Worthington**

A. In new infill construction, follow traditional door and entrance design that can be found throughout Old Worthington.

B. Entries may be symmetrically or asymmetrically placed; doors should be solid wood or glazed in the upper half. Simple trim around the entrance will help distinguish it as the point of entry to the building.

C. Simple paneled doors are the most appropriate; avoid heavily ornate doors.

**Recommendations -- Other Commercial Areas**

A. Primary building entrances should be on the street-facing principal facade. Rear or side entries from parking lots are desirable, but primary emphasis should be given to the street entry.

B. Use simple door and trim designs compatible with both the building and with adjacent and nearby development.
Ornamentation makes a building more visually appealing and distinguishes it from other structures. Worthington's commercial buildings display ornamentation trends from the early 19th century to the early 20th. This was a period of increasingly ornate ornamentation as the 19th century progressed, and increasing simplicity during the early 20th century. The variety of ornamentation and detail in Old Worthington shows how much variety could be achieved among buildings that otherwise were fairly plain and followed traditional commercial design concepts.

Outside Old Worthington, newer commercial structures generally have little ornamentation, a function both of budget and of later 20th century design practices.

**Recommendations -- Old Worthington**

A. Observe Worthington’s historic architecture for information on the kinds and amounts of ornamentation employed on various commercial/institutional building styles and periods.

B. When designing a new commercial building in Old Worthington, use ornamentation conservatively. Use it in traditional locations around windows and doors and along the cornice.

C. Use simple forms to create ornamentation. A reflection or simulation of complex 19th century ornamentation usually is more successful than trying to duplicate the actual appearance. Sometimes just a little ornamentation can have a major impact.

**Recommendations -- Other Commercial Areas**

A. Use ornamentation sparingly in new developments. Decorative treatments at entries, windows and cornices can work well in distinguishing a building and giving it character, but only a few such elements can achieve the desired effect.

B. Traditional wood ornamentation is the simplest to build, but on new buildings it is possible to use substitute materials such as metal and fiberglass. On brick buildings substitute materials can be used to resemble the stone or metal ornamental elements traditionally found on older brick buildings. As with all ornamentation, simple designs and limited quantities give the best results.

The Kilbourne School’s design includes pilasters, swags, pediments and other classically-inspired ornamentation. These elements were common in early 20th century institutional building design and were intended to impart a sense of sophistication and stability.
New Commercial/Institutional Construction  

Color

Color can have a significant impact upon a building’s design and appearance, and the Architectural Review Board encourages the use of colors appropriate to the buildings and the overall character of Worthington. There is a policy of flexibility in color use, and the Board can provide information on appropriate selections.

There are no hard and fast requirements for particular colors or color combinations. Once again, however, it will be instructive to study Worthington’s existing commercial/institutional building stock to get a sense of appropriate colors and combinations of colors.

Recommendations -- Old Worthington

A. Avoid removing paint from older painted brick walls, since paint removal processes can damage soft older bricks.

B. Unpainted brick walls should remain unpainted, the better to reflect their historic character.

C. In general, avoid bright colors not typical on Worthington commercial buildings. For new infill buildings select colors compatible with those already used along the streetscape.

D. Most buildings use light colors for the building body and darker colors for the trim. Following this pattern is encouraged.

E. Avoid using too many colors. Usually one body color and one trim color are sufficient.

Recommendations -- Other Commercial Areas

A. For new brick buildings, consider letting the natural brick color be the body color, and select trim colors that are compatible with the color of the bricks.

B. It may be acceptable to paint new brick walls. Generally, lighter colors should be used for this purpose, with darker colors for trim.

C. Prepare a color board showing proposed colors. The Architectural Review Board encourages early reviews of such elements before planning goes very far.
Signage is governed by Chapter 1170 of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Worthington. Be sure to get a copy and become familiar with these provisions before proceeding with any sign work.

An integral part of commercial architecture is signage for the businesses that occupy the buildings. Styles and designs of signage have evolved over time, but its purpose has always been the same -- to tell people what a business does and where to find it.

Early 19th century signs usually were painted directly on the building or were painted on wooden signboards. These were both flush on the building wall and suspended over the sidewalk, perpendicular to the building. Some were supported by the building at one end and a wooden post at the other. Some early signs included three-dimensional objects symbolizing the business’s product or service.

By the late 19th century there was a greater variety of signage designs. They generally were larger than before, in order to compete for attention in increasingly crowded cities.

In addition to being mounted on the building in traditional ways, some signs were incorporated as part of the storefront design, often using leaded or stained glass. Signs painted on the inside of display windows were common.

Electrically-lighted signs became popular after the turn of the century and gave a new dimension to signage. Electric lights became even more important as automobile use increased, since lights were good at drawing the attention of fast-moving drivers. Externally-lighted signs, where light fixtures shined on the sign surface, were among the most common type of electrically-lighted sign, and they remain the most appropriate type for historic districts.

In many signs today, the lighting and the sign are indistinguishable. Plastics have permitted great flexibility and low cost, with the result that in many commercial areas signs have grown ever larger in competition with adjacent signs, and interior-lighted signs are the most common type.
Signage

As noted above, the City of Worthington has sign regulations, the purpose of which is to keep commercial signage from overwhelming the city’s traditional architecture and its human scale. The regulations also address safety issues.

The following guidelines are meant to be flexible and to work hand-in-hand with the sign regulations. They allow creativity and imagination in signage, while recommending against some practices that would not be appropriate in Worthington.

Recommendations -- Old Worthington

A. Keep and repair any historic signage that is appropriate to Old Worthington.

B. Be efficient in using signs. Consider the audience -- small signs can cater to pedestrians and can provide plenty of information in a small area. Try to use as few and as small signs as are necessary to get the business message across to the public.

C. Use traditional sign materials and lighting. Traditional sign types most appropriate for Old Worthington include projecting, wall, awning and non-illuminated window signs. Painted wood, or material that looks like painted wood, is the most appropriate material for projecting and wall signs, with external lighting.

D. Sign regulations permit signs that project up to three feet from a building wall. This traditional type of sign is appropriate in Old Worthington and can easily be made visible to both pedestrians and people in cars. Sidewalk signs are permitted in the Central Business District.

E. Colors for signs in Old Worthington should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings with which they are associated. Signs must be distinctive enough to be readily visible but should avoid incompatible modern colors. Bright color shades generally are discouraged in favor of more subtle and toned-down shades.
Signage

Recommendations -- Other Commercial Areas

A. Keep and repair any historic signage that is appropriate to the Architectural Review District.

B. While the regulations permit a certain maximum square footage of signs for a business, try to minimize the size and number of signs. Place only basic names and graphics on signs along the street so that drive-by traffic is not bombarded with too much information.

C. Free-standing signs should be of the “monument” type (standing vertically, mounted on a ground-level base and not on a pole); they should be as low as possible. Such signs should have an appropriate base such as a brick planting area with appropriate landscaping or no lighting.

D. Colors for signs should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings they serve, whether placed on the ground or mounted on the building. Signs must be distinctive enough to be readily visible, but avoid incompatible modern colors such as "fluorescent orange" and similar colors. Bright color shades generally are discouraged in favor more subtle and toned-down shades.

Subject to certain limitations, projecting signs work well for attracting the attention of pedestrians and also of people in cars. Because of their generally small size, such signs can employ a wide variety of colors and designs without disrupting the overall character of the commercial streetscape.
Moving/Demolition Considerations

A move to a new location is generally regarded as a “last resort” for saving a historic building. This is because the building’s association with its original site is a significant component of its character. However, moving is always preferable to losing a building if there is no other choice.

The new site should resemble the old as closely as possible, and the building should be oriented on its new site the same way it was on the old. Sometimes features such as porches and wings must be removed to make a building fit a new site, but whenever possible the building should be moved intact or re-assembled into the form it had before the move if it must be partially disassembled.

Demolition, of course, is final. Because it is an irreversible act, full or partial demolition must be carefully considered before any decision is made.

A decision on whether a particular demolition is appropriate must be made in light of several factors, including whether the demolition is full or partial; the age of the structure; the level of integrity of the structure being demolished (has it been extensively altered?); the impact of the demolition on Worthington’s character; and plans for the site following demolition (is the proposed replacement appropriate for Worthington? Does it follow the design guidelines for new structures?)

Recommendations

A. Generally, demolition of pre-1950s buildings should be avoided. These tend to contribute the most to a community’s character. However, it may be desirable to avoid demolishing a newer building, depending on what is proposed to replace it.

B. For projects in which demolition of an older structure is proposed, the applicant should contact the City of Worthington as early as possible. The city may be able to help with evaluating alternatives to demolition. In all cases where demolition is proposed, applicants should be prepared to explain and to document the financial and technical reasons why it is not feasible to accomplish their goals while retaining the existing building.
Moving/Demolition Considerations

C. It may be acceptable to demolish an older building that has been so altered over the years that its integrity is low and it has lost most or all of its historic character. This does not, however, always apply, since even altered buildings can sometimes be important placeholders along the streetscape.

D. Because of age or design, some building additions may be nearly as important as an original building. Removing these elements might affect the building’s character, and this should be taken into account when demolition is proposed.

E. Demolition to create parking lots should be avoided, particularly along the dense streetscape of High Street. Loss of buildings here would permanently alter the character of the whole district.

F. Demolition to combine lots for larger developments is strongly discouraged. Small-scale buildings on closely-spaced sites characterize much of Worthington’s older areas. Assembly of land in these areas for large lots and construction of large buildings, especially involving demolition of existing structures, is not appropriate.

G. When full or partial demolition of an existing structure is proposed, the applicant should be prepared to present detailed plans for the replacement building. Demolition may not proceed until it has been determined that the structure conforms to the new construction design guidelines.
A. Glossary of Terms

Architrave: In classical architecture, a horizontal element resting on columns or piers; in current usage, the trim elements around window and door openings.

Baluster: Vertical member, usually of wood, which supports the railing of a porch or the handrail of a stairway.

Balustrade: Railing or parapet consisting of a handrail on balusters; sometimes also includes a bottom rail.

Bay: 1) A spatial structural unit of a building facade; 2) A structure protruding out from a wall.

Beveled siding: Tapered wood siding that overlaps for weather protection. It is applied horizontally to buildings of frame construction.

Board and Batten: A type of wood siding that consists of wide vertical boards with narrow strips (battens) concealing the joints between the boards.

Bracket: A projecting member, often decorative, which supports an overhanging element such as a cornice.

Casement: A type of window with side hinges and a sash that swings outward.

Clapboard: Large wood boards which taper slightly (they are a type of beveled siding) so they overlap and lie flat; applied horizontally on buildings of frame construction.

Column: A post found on storefronts, porches, and balconies; may be fluted or smooth.

Cornerboard: A board used to cover the exposed ends of wood siding to give a finished appearance and make the building watertight.

Cornice: The projecting uppermost portion of a wall, often treated in a decorative manner with brackets.

Dormer: A structural extension of a building’s roof, intended to provide light and headroom in an attic space; usually contains a window or windows on its vertical face.

Double-hung: A window with two balanced sashes, with one sliding over the other vertically to open.

Eaves: The lower portion of the sloping surface of a roof, especially the part that overhangs the building’s wall.

Facade: The “face” of the building; usually refers to the main side of the building, though it can be applied to all sides.

Fascia: A flat horizontal wooden member used as a facing at the ends of roof rafters or in the cornice area.

Fenestration: Pattern of door and window openings in a wall.

Flashing: Flat metal or other material that is used to keep water from penetrating the joint between different surfaces and materials such as around the chimney on a roof.

Flush Siding: A type of horizontal wood siding where the individual boards are fitted closely together, which creates a flat appearance with a barely visible joint between the boards.

Gable: The “end” as opposed to the “side” of a building. The most common gable is triangular in shape, consisting of the area of wall defined by the sloping roof. A gambrel or double-pitch roof forms a non-triangular gable.

Glazing: Glass fitted into windows or doors.

Hipped Roofline: A roof formed by four angled roof surfaces.
**In-Kind:** Replacement of one element of a building with another of the same material, design, size, and appearance.

**Mullion:** A wooden vertical piece that divides window sash, doors or panels set close together in a series.

**Muntin:** The wooden pieces that make up the small subdivisions in a multiple-paned glass window.

**Pediment:** The triangular face of a roof gable; or a gable which is used in porches, or as decoration over windows, doors, and dormers.

**Pilaster:** A flat pier which is attached to the surface of the wall and has a slight projection; the pier may be given a base and cap, and may be smooth or fluted. Also called an "engaged column."

**Portico:** An entrance porch, usually supported by columns and sheltering only the entry.

**Return:** The continuation of a projection or cornice in a different direction, usually around a corner at a right angle.

**Rock-faced:** A rough-cut finish on a piece of stone or a manufactured product such as concrete block or ceramic tile.

**Sash:** The framework of the window that supports the glass. Sash may be fixed, sliding, hinged or pivoted.

**Sill:** The framing member that forms the lower part of a window or door opening.

**Setback:** The distance between the front of a land parcel and the facade of a building.

**Sheathing:** A sub-surface material, usually wood, which covers exterior walls or roofs before application of siding or roofing materials.

**Shiplap Siding:** Horizontal wood siding that has both top and bottom edges finished to form a close-fitting joint and the appearance of a narrow recessed band between two flat boards.

**Sidelight:** A glass panel, usually of multiple panes, to either side of a door; often used in conjunction with a transom.

**Soffit:** A flat wood member used as a finished undersurface for any overhead exposed part of a building, such as a cornice. Commonly found on the underside of the eaves.

**Splashblock:** A piece of stone or clay material with a channel in it, which when placed on the ground under a downspout carries water away from the foundation.

**Transom:** A glass panel, which is placed over a door or window to provide additional natural light to the interior of the building. Used on both residential and commercial buildings.

**Vernacular:** Architecture that draws more on traditional forms and functionalism, rather than on design principles or ornamentation of high-style architecture.
B. Worthington Architectural Review Ordinance

Chapter 1177
Architectural District

1177.01 Purpose
The Purpose of this chapter is to maintain a high character of community development, to protect and preserve property, to promote the stability of property values and to protect real estate from impairment or destruction of value for the general community welfare by regulating the exterior architectural characteristics of structures and preservation and protection of buildings of architectural or historical significance throughout the hereinafter defined Architectural District. It is the further purpose of this chapter to recognize and preserve the distinctive historical and architectural character of this community which has been greatly influenced by the architecture of an earlier period in this community’s history. These purposes shall be served by the regulation of exterior design, use of materials, the finish grade line, landscaping and orientation of all structures hereinafter altered, constructed, reconstructed, erected, enlarged or remodeled, removed or demolished in the hereinafter defined Architectural District.

1177.02 District Boundaries
There is hereby established an Architectural District which shall include all lots within the area of the original Village of Worthington as laid out in 1803, bounded on the north by North Street, on the south by South Street, on the east by Morning Street, and on the west by Evening Street including all lots abutting on the aforesaid named streets and additionally the lot on the southeast corner of East South Street and Granby Street and to the south along Granby Street.

The Architectural Review District shall also include all lots abutting High Street within the corporate limits of the City on both the east and west sides commencing at North Street and extending north to the northernmost corporation line and commencing at South Street and extending to the southernmost corporation line; and all lots abutting Granville Road within the corporate limits of the City on both the north and south sides commencing at Morning Street and extending east to the easternmost corporation line and commencing at Evening Street and extending west to the westernmost corporation line; plus the lot at the northwest corner of Pingree Drive and East Dublin-Granville Road and the lot immediately adjacent thereto to the north along Pingree Drive; plus all lots within the Kenyon Brook Subdivision, the Bellebrooke Subdivision, Rehe’s Subdivision, the Maxton Place Subdivision, the lot at the northeast corner of High Street and East Wilson Bridge Road and the two lots immediately adjacent thereto to the east along East Wilson Bridge Road and the resubdivision of Lots 21 and 22 of the Morris Addition (Greenwich Street East Subdivision). The boundaries of the above described Architectural District are additionally set forth on the map of the City which is attached hereto and made a part hereof. (Ord. 129-92. Passed 1-11-93; Ord. 15-87. Passed 3-9-87.)
1177.03 Application and Notice

(a) Whenever a structure, as defined by this Zoning Ordinance, whether public or private, within the above described district is proposed to be constructed or erected and whenever an existing structure is proposed to be altered, reconstructed, enlarged or remodeled, if such alteration, reconstruction, enlargement or remodeling involves the exterior design, material, finish grade line, landscaping or orientation of the structure, an application for a certificate of appropriateness shall be filed with the City Clerk together with a fee based upon the following schedule:

(1) If the cost of the proposed project is to be two thousand dollars (\$2,000) or less the applicant shall pay a fee of two dollars ($2.00).

(2) If the cost of the proposed project exceeds two thousand dollars ($2,000) a fee of one dollar ($1.00) for each one thousand dollars ($1,000) or fraction thereof of the estimated total cost shall be paid. In no case shall the fee be less than two dollars ($2.00) or more than two hundred dollars ($200.00).

(b) The application shall be accompanied by a site plan and building elevations drawn to scale indicating at a minimum, the lot dimensions, size, shape and dimensions of the structure, the location and orientation of the structure on the lot and the actual or proposed building setback lines. In addition, the application shall be accompanied by a detailed narrative description of the proposed design or change of design, use of materials, finish grade line, landscaping and orientation of the structure. Except in single-family residential zoning districts, applications for structures to be constructed or remodeled, which remodeling would increase or decrease the total gross building area by fifty percent (50%) or more, shall be accompanied by appropriate, relevant colored elevations showing at a minimum, the design, use of materials, finish grade line, landscaping and orientation of buildings and any significant architectural features. In addition, the Board of Architectural Review may require the submission of colored perspectives or architectural renderings in applications where the Board feels it is required.

(c) Upon receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness, which is accompanied by the material required by the provision of subsection (b) hereof, the City Clerk shall place the application on the agenda for the Board at its next regular meeting following ten days from the date the application is filed. The Clerk shall further cause to be published in a newspaper of general circulation in the City, a public notice of the scheduled hearing date of the application together with a general description of the nature of the application. The applicant shall be notified by mail of the date of the hearing and the property in question is to be posted with a placard stating the date and location of the hearing. At this hearing, any party may appear in person or by attorney.

1177.04 Board of Architectural Review

The Board of Architectural Review shall consist of members of the Municipal Planning Commission and two additional members annually appointed by Council. These two additional members shall represent the Architectural Review District and one or both of them shall be a resident or freeholder of such District.
1177.05 Standards for Review: Certificate of Appropriateness

(a) The Board of Architectural Review, in deciding whether to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness, shall determine that the application under consideration promotes, preserves and enhances the distinctive historical village character of the community and would not be at variance with existing structures within that portion of the district in which the structure is or is proposed to be located as to be detrimental to the interests of the District as set forth in Section 1177.01. In conducting its review, the Board shall make examination of and give consideration to the elements of the application including, but not necessarily limited to:

(1) Height, which shall include the requirements in Chapter 1149;

(2) Building massing, which shall include in addition to the requirements in Chapter 1149, the relationship of the building width to its height and depth, and it relationship to the viewer’s and pedestrian’s visual perspective;

(3) Window treatment, which shall include the size, shape and materials of the individual window units and the overall harmonious relationship of window openings;

(4) Exterior detail and relationships, which shall include all projecting and receding elements of the exterior, including but not limited to, porches and overhangs and the horizontal or vertical expression which is conveyed by these elements;

(5) Roof shape, which shall include type, form and materials;

(6) Materials, texture and color, which shall include a consideration of material compatibility among various elements of the structure;

(7) Compatibility of design and materials, which shall include the appropriateness of the use of exterior design details;

(8) Landscape design and plant materials, which shall include, in addition to requirements of this Zoning Code, lighting and the use of landscape details to highlight architectural features or screen or soften undesirable views;

(9) Pedestrian environment, which shall include the provision of features which enhance pedestrian movement and environment and which relate to the pedestrian’s visual perspective; and

(10) Signage, which shall include, in addition to requirements of Chapter 1170, the appropriateness of signage to the building;

(11) Sustainable Features, which shall include environmentally friendly details and conservation practices such as solar energy panels, bike racks, and rain barrels.

(b) In conducting its inquiry and review, the Board may request from the applicant such additional information, sketches and data as it shall reasonably require. It may call upon experts and specialists for testimony and opinion regarding the matters under examination. It may recommend to the applicant changes in the plans that it considers desirable and may accept a voluntary amendment to the application to include or reflect such changes. The Board shall keep a record of its proceedings and shall append to the application copies of information, sketches and data needed to clearly describe any amendment to it.
When its review is concluded, the Board will determine by a vote of its members, whether the application for a certificate of appropriateness shall be approved. If approved by four or more of its members, the Board shall return the application and appended material to the Clerk with the instruction that the certificate of appropriateness be issued, provided all other requirements for a building permit, if applicable, are met. The certificate of appropriateness shall be valid for eighteen months from the date of approval, or such extension as may be granted by the Board. If not approved, the Board shall return the application and appended material to the applicant with a notice that the certificate of appropriateness shall not be issued because the application did not meet the criteria and standards set forth herein.

II77.06 Demolition of a Building

(a) Whenever a building within the District is proposed to be demolished, partially demolished, or removed, an application for such a certificate of appropriateness shall be filed with the city Clerk as provided in this chapter. Such application shall set forth the intent to demolish.

(b) The Board of Architectural Review shall hear the request not sooner than twelve days nor later than sixty days from the date the application is filed and shall advertise such hearing to provide time for public comment. The Board shall request a statement from the City’s Division of Building Inspection on the structural condition of the building and the conformity of the building to the applicable building codes. In addition, the Board may request at the City’s expense a written statement concerning the proposed demolition by a registered architect, historical conservator or other professional having experience with historic structures. Such statement shall be taken into consideration in determining the appropriateness of the request. The applicant may provide at his or her expense any evidence or testimony from a registered architect, historical conservator or other professional having experience with historic structures. The Board of Architectural Review shall act on the request not later than thirty days after the initial hearing on the application. The applicant may waive this requirement by filing with the Clerk of the Board of Architectural Review a written statement waiving the right to have his or her application acted upon within such thirty-day period.

(c) The Board of Architectural Review shall determine by a vote of its members whether to issue a certificate of appropriateness based on the determination:

(1) That such building is not historically or architecturally significant;

(2) That if the building is found to be historically or architecturally significant, there is no feasible or prudent alternative or change that would allow preservation of the building; and

(3) The proposal for grading, landscaping and other design treatment once the structure is removed meets the standards of this chapter.

(d) In any circumstance, the Board shall not deny a request for a certificate of appropriateness if it determines either:

(1) That such denial will deny all reasonable use of the property or

(2) That such denial shall result in an unsafe condition because of the structural or physical condition of the building.
(e) No building shall be demolished or removed in the Architectural Review District without the owner or his representative first obtaining a certificate of appropriateness approving such removal or demolition, unless such building presents an immediate danger to public health and safety in the opinion of the City’s Chief Building Official, in which event, the Chief Building Inspector may order removal or demolition of such building in order to protect public health and safety.

1177.07 Repair or Maintenance Exception

Nothing in this chapter shall be construed to prevent any ordinary repair or maintenance of an exterior architectural feature or any ordinary planting and landscaping now in the District.

1177.08 Appeals

The Board of Architectural Review shall decide all applications for architectural review not later than thirty days after the first hearing thereon.

(a) Any person, firm or corporation, or any officer, department, board or agency of the City who has been aggrieved by any decision of the Board involving an application for architectural review approval may appeal such decision to Council by filing notice of intent to appeal with the Clerk within ten days from the date of the decision, setting forth the facts of the case.

(b) Council may then elect to hold a public hearing on the appeal by the affirmative vote of a majority of its members, or failing to so elect, shall reject the application for appeal. In the event Council elects to hold a public hearing on the request for appeal, the hearing shall be held not later than sixty days after a final decision has been rendered by the Board. Council, by a majority vote of its members, shall decide the matter and the decision shall be final.

(c) If no notice of intent to appeal is filed with the Clerk within the period specified in subsection (a) hereof, Council may at the option of a majority of its members and not later than ten days following the expiration of the appeal period, elect to review any architectural review decision of the Board. Council shall schedule a public hearing on the matter, which shall not be held more than sixty days after a final decision was rendered by the Board. At a public hearing, Council by a majority vote of its members, shall decide the matter and its decision shall be final.
Worthington has a long history of architectural review. The publication of these guidelines is intended to make the architectural review process operate more efficiently in the future. All meetings of the Architectural Review Board are advertised and open to the public. If you are just beginning to plan a project in the Architectural Review District of Worthington, you are encouraged to attend one of these meetings to learn more about the process. In fact, you are also encouraged to bring ideas at the conceptual stage to the Architectural Review Board for discussion. This early planning, along with the use of these guidelines, will maximize the chances for a quick approval when your project is reviewed by the Architectural Review Board.

You will need to obtain a certificate of appropriateness from the Architectural Review Board before you can receive a building permit to make any exterior alteration or change or for any new construction in the designated Architectural Review District. The owner may designate another person (such as an attorney, tenant, architect or builder) to file the application and to serve as the applicant, but the property owner’s signature is required.

Application Form

The Architectural Review Board has a one-page cover sheet that must accompany your application for a Certificate of Appropriateness. It includes information about the property including location; current and future use; current and future zoning; applicant and owner contact information; a summary of project details including the approximate cost and expected completion date; and the applicant and property owner signatures. Only one cover form must be filed along with the appropriate support documentation described below. Applications are available online at: www.worthington.org/city/architecturalreviewboardapplication.pdf or at the Municipal Building at 6550 North High Street in Worthington.

Support Documentation

The following information must also be included for the application to be considered complete:

- Detailed Supporting Statement describing the project.
- Site Plan drawn to scale. The site plan must show all lot lines and building dimensions (including outbuildings and garages) with the size, shape, orientation and dimensions clearly stated.
  - Site plans for new structures and additions must show the dimensions of all structures on the lot and distances from lot lines.
  - Site plans for fences must show the fence location on the lot and distances from lot lines.
  - Site plans for signs must show where all freestanding signs are located and distances from lot lines.
• Elevations (scaled drawings showing all sides, features and dimensions of a structure) must be included for construction of a building, building addition, fence, shed, garage, sign or any change to a structure such as roof, shutters, doors and windows. Sign elevations must also show the size of lettering and logos and all other dimensions of the sign.

• Lighting Cuts are required for non-residential projects that contain exterior lighting and all lights must be shown. Wall-mounted lights must be shown on elevations and freestanding lights must be shown on site plans. Cuts of lighting fixtures must be submitted, along with a photometric plan for site lighting. All external and internal sign illumination must be detailed.

• Floor Plan or Landscape Plan must be submitted if determined by staff to be a necessary part of your request.

• Samples of all materials and colors must be submitted. Colors must be shown on chips or on actual material rather than on paper.

• A List of Names and Complete Mailing Addresses of all neighbors whose properties abut your property and are located across the street from your property must be submitted. This information may be obtained from the Franklin County Auditor’s office at (614) 462-3445 or online at www.co.franklin.oh.us/auditor under GIS Search, or by talking to your neighbors.

• For proposed Building Demolitions, special requirements may apply. The applicant should contact City staff for guidance.

If you have any questions about what you need to include with your application, City staff is able to assist you.

Review Process

For planning purposes, the architectural review process is summarized below. For detailed information, please refer to the City Ordinance establishing the Architectural District, which is also included in this Appendix.

Once the City has received your completed application and the application fee, your application can be scheduled for review. The City Clerk will place your application on the agenda for the next regularly scheduled meeting of the Board of Architectural Review if the application is received at least ten days before that meeting. The agenda for the Board of Architectural Review is advertised in newspapers in general circulation in the city; the applicant will also be notified by mail of the date of the hearing; and a placard with the date and location of the hearing will be placed at the property.

A vote of four or more members of the Architectural Review Board is required to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for a project. The Board also has the option of tabling the application pending further information or modifications, or it may deny the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

If your Certificate of Appropriateness is denied, you may file an appeal with the Worthington City Council within ten days of the decision, setting forth the facts in the case. Council may elect to hold a public hearing on the appeal and must do so no later than sixty days after the final decision by the Board of Architectural Review. Council must decide the matter, by majority vote, at the scheduled public hearing.
D. Sources of Information and Assistance

The City of Worthington maintains a small library of information that is useful for people with property in the Architectural Review District. Included are the following items:

**Books:**

- *House Styles in America.* James Massey and Shirley Maxwell.
- *How to Complete the Ohio Historic Inventory.* Stephen C. Gordon, Ohio Historic Preservation Office.

**Design Guideline Forum Information:**

- “Discovering Architecture in Worthington.” Barbara Powers, Ohio Historic Preservation Office
- “Discovering Ohio Architecture.” Barbara Powers, Ohio Historic Preservation Office
- “Section 3408 of Chapter 34, Important Tool in Redevelopment of Older Buildings.” M. Laik Ali and Jonathan Sandvick
- “Styles and Structures of Old Worthington, A Photographic Survey.” (Four Quadrants)

**Timeline Suggestions**

**Videotapes:**

- “Worthington - Celebrate the Architecture” (with script)
- “Worthington - Celebrate the Discovery”

**Photographs:**

Photographs with descriptions of many of the structures in Worthington

**Website:**

www.Worthington.org (look under History and Historic District)

A number of other sources of information are readily available to those interested in historic architecture and the care and maintenance of older buildings. A listing of useful sites is included below.
Organizations:

For assistance on historic preservation matters generally, you may contact Ohio’s official state preservation agency, which is a division of the Ohio Historical Society.

Ohio Historic Preservation Office
567 East Hudson Street
Columbus, Ohio 43211-1030
(614) 298-2000
www.ohiohistory.org

At the national level, the National Trust for Historic Preservation is a non-profit preservation organization that conducts conferences and has published numerous books and pamphlets about preservation issues. The Trust’s publications on tax incentives and the economic aspects of preserving old buildings are especially helpful.

National Trust for Historic Preservation
1785 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Washington, D.C. 20036
(202) 673-4000

or

National Trust for Historic Preservation
Midwest Regional Office
53 West Jackson Boulevard, Suite 350
Chicago, IL 60604
(312) 939-5547
www.nationaltrust.org

For information about downtown and commercial district revitalization, Downtown Ohio, Inc. manages Ohio’s Main Street program, offers educational and training programs for those involved with downtown revitalization and provides technical assistance to communities as they plan for the future.

Downtown Ohio, Inc.
846 ½ East Main Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
(614) 258-6200
www.heritageohio.org

Websites:

www.ag.ohio-state.edu/~barn/historic.htm
An order form on this site makes it possible to order any or all of the 41 Preservation Brief titles (listed in selected reading material in this appendix) from the Ohio Historic Preservation Office.

www.ohiohistory.org/resource/histpres
This Website includes information about the Ohio Historic Preservation Office, the National Register program and a list of National Register properties in Ohio.

www.preservenet.cornell.edu/preserve.html
This Website contains information about conferences, educational programs and an extensive list of links to other preservation Websites.

www2.cr.nps.gov/tps/briefs
All of the 41 Preservation Briefs are available online at this site and can be printed in text form.

www2.cr.nps.gov/freepubs.html
This National Park Service site provides a list of free Heritage Preservation Services publications that can be ordered online.

www2cr.nps.gov
This site is about the Heritage Preservation Services offered by the National Park Service including information about programs such as the Investment Tax Credit for the Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings; training and conferences; preservation legislation; and a preservation bookstore. It also has an interactive class on the use of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings designed for use by, historic building owners, architects, contractors, developers and members of design review boards.
Publications:

Several excellent publications -- books, magazines, and pamphlets -- are available to assist you in understanding the technology of older buildings and in learning about appropriate repair and rehabilitation treatments and techniques. These include the following:

Caring for Your Old House: A Guide for Owners and Residents by Judith Kitchen

For ordering information contact:
Preservation Press
John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
Professional, Reference and Trade Group
605 Third Avenue
New York, NY 10158

Old Building Owners Manual by Judith Kitchen

Available for purchase:
Ohio Historical Center
Gift Shop
1982 Velma Avenue
Columbus, Ohio 43211
(614) 297-2357

These publications offer useful guidance for planning repairs, restoration, or rehabilitation of older buildings. Techniques and principles can be applied to both commercial and residential structures. These and other publications may be used on a reference (non-circulating) basis at the Ohio Historic Preservation Office.

The Old-House Journal
2 Main Street
Gloucester, MA 01930
(800) 234-3797

Historic Preservation Briefs are technical pamphlets, which are produced by the National Park Service. There are currently 41 titles available, although new ones are being added every year. These briefs are available online at www2.cr.nps.gov/tps/briefs/presbhom.htm or by filling out an order form prepared by the Ohio Historic Preservation Office and available at www.ag.ohio-state.edu/~barn/historic.htm or by calling the office at (614) 298-2000.

A list of the currently available Preservation Briefs is listed below.

1. The Cleaning and Waterproof Coating of Masonry Buildings SINCE 1885
2. Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Brick Buildings
3. Conserving Energy in Historic Buildings
4. Roofing for Historic Buildings
5. The Preservation of Adobe Buildings
6. Dangers of Abrasive Cleaning to Historic Buildings
7. The Preservation of Historic Glazed Architectural Terra-Cotta
8. Aluminum and Vinyl Siding on Historic Buildings
9. The Repair of Historic Wooden Windows
10. Exterior Paint Problems on Historic Woodwork
11. Rehabilitating Historic Storefronts

Originally published by the founder of The Old-House Journal (the two publications are unrelated), this periodical is technically oriented and is a great help in finding suppliers and specialists in the field of old building preservation.

Traditional Building
69A Seventh Avenue
Brooklyn, NY 11217
(718) 636-0788

This is a monthly magazine oriented toward the do-it-yourself owner of an old building. Each issue contains several hands-on articles about appropriate repair, restoration, and rehabilitation techniques for buildings of all historical eras.
12. The Preservation of Historic Pigmented Structural Glass (Vitrolite and Carrara Glass)
13. The Repair and Thermal Upgrading of Historic Steel Windows
14. New Exterior Additions to Historic Buildings: Preservation Concerns
15. Preservation of Historic Concrete: Problems and General Approaches
16. The Use of Substitute Materials on Historic Building Exteriors
17. Architectural Character: Identifying the Visual Aspects of Historic Buildings as an Aid to Preserving Their Character
18. Rehabilitating Interiors in Historic Buildings
19. The Repair and Replacement of Historic Wooden Shingle Roofs
20. The Preservation of Historic Barns
21. Repairing Historic Flat Plaster – Walls and Ceilings
22. The Preservation and Repair of Historic Stucco
23. Preserving Historic Ornamental Plaster
24. Heating, Ventilating and Cooling Historic Buildings
25. The Preservation of Historic Signs
26. The Preservation and Repair of Historic Log Buildings
27. The Maintenance and Repair of Architectural Cast Iron
28. Painting Historic Interiors
29. The Repair, Replacement, and Maintenance of Historic Slate Roofs
30. The Preservation and Repair of Historic Clay Tile Roofs
31. Mothballing Historic Buildings
32. Making Historic Properties Accessible
33. The Preservation and Repair of Historic Stained and Leaded Glass Windows
34. Applied Decoration for Interiors: Preservation of Historic Composition Ornament
36. Protecting Cultural Landscapes: Planning, Treatment and Management of Historic Landscapes
37. Appropriate Methods for Reducing Lead-Paint Hazards in Historic Housing
38. Removing Graffiti from Historic Masonry
39. Holding the Line: Controlling Unwanted Moisture in Historic Buildings
40. Preserving Historic Ceramic Tile Floors
41. Seismic Retrofit of Historic Buildings: Keeping Preservation in the Forefront
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.
**Sustainability:**

Sustainability can be achieved by ensuring the economic, environmental and social concerns of Worthington are addressed in a balanced manner. The City of Worthington and its Architectural Review Board are interested in encouraging sustainable design and building practices, while preserving the character and integrity of the Architectural Review District. The Design Guidelines as a whole work toward that end; and this section addresses additional measures for sustainability.

**Recommendations:**

A. Energy conservation methods are encouraged. Making use of the existing buildings inherent efficiency features should occur first. Maintaining building components in good condition helps preserve energy, as well as retaining the integrity of the property. Landscape concepts often complement energy conservation and should be maintained and replenished. Utilize indigenous plant materials, trees, and landscape features, especially those which perform passive solar energy functions such as sun shading and wind breaks. Preserve and enhance green/open spaces wherever practicable.

B. Manage storm water run-off through the use of rain gardens, permeable forms of pavement, rain barrels and other such means that conserve water and filter pollutants.

C. Place solar panels in a location that minimizes the visual impact as seen from the right-of-way and surrounding properties. Generally, panels should be located on roofs in the following manner: the rear 50% of the roof of the main building; the rear inside quadrant of the roof of a main building on a corner lot; or on accessory structures in the rear yard. On sloped roofs, place panels flush along the roof unless visibility is decreased with other placement. With flat roofs, keep panels at least 5' from the edge of the roof, or place at the edge if a building parapet exists that will screen the panels.

Solar panels at another location on a building or site may be acceptable if their placement does not have an adverse effect on the architecture of the building, or the character of the site or Architectural Review District.

The equipment to support solar panels should be screened from view.

D. Bike racks and other methods of facilitating alternative transportation should be utilized.

E. Streetscape elements should be of a human scale.

F. Make use of recycled materials; rapidly renewable materials; and energy efficient materials.

G. Use of natural and controlled light for interior spaces and natural ventilation is recommended.

H. Minimize light pollution.